

SKEPTICISM IN EARLY MODERN ENGLISH LITERATURE

This ambitious account of skepticism's effects on major authors of England's Golden Age shows how key philosophical problems inspired literary innovations in poetry and prose. When figures like Spenser, Shakespeare, Donne, Herbert of Cherbury, Cavendish, Marvell, and Milton question theories of language, degrees of knowledge and belief, and dwell on the uncertainties of perception, they forever change English literature, ushering it into a secular mode. While tracing a narrative arc from medieval nominalism to late seventeenth-century taste, the book explores the aesthetic pleasures and political quandaries induced by skeptical doubt. It also incorporates modern philosophical views of skepticism: those of Stanley Cavell, Ludwig Wittgenstein, Roland Barthes, and Hans Blumenberg, among others. The book thus contributes to interdisciplinary studies of philosophy and literature as well as to current debates about skepticism as a secularizing force, fostering civil liberties and religious freedoms.

ANITA GILMAN SHERMAN is Associate Professor of Literature at American University, Washington, DC. She is the author of *Skepticism and Memory in Shakespeare and Donne* (2007) and has published articles on Montaigne, Garcilaso de la Vega, Thomas Heywood, W. G. Sebald, and others.





SKEPTICISM IN EARLY MODERN ENGLISH LITERATURE

The Problems and Pleasures of Doubt

ANITA GILMAN SHERMAN

American University





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108842662
DDI: 10.1017/9781108903813

© Anita Gilman Sherman 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-84266-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Davis





Contents

Acknowledgments	<i>page</i> viii
Introduction: Secularizing Skepticism?	I
1 Visionary, Interrupted: Spenser's Skeptical Artwork	32
2 Fantasies of Private Language: Shakespeare's "The F Turtle" and Donne's "The Ecstasy"	Phoenix and 74
3 Conformity / Neutrality in Lord Herbert of Cherbu	ıry 92
4 The Skeptical Fancies of Margaret Cavendish: Reoc	ccupation 137
5 The Enchantments of Andrew Marvell: Skepticism	and Taste 176
Afterword: Experience in Crisis: Milton's Samson Ago.	nistes 225
Bibliography Index	235 263



Acknowledgments

This book has been so long in the making that it is doubtful I can remember all those who had a hand in its formation. That said, it is a pleasure to review in memory the individuals and institutions that have helped me. I am most grateful to those who read portions of the book at various intermediate stages: Brandi Adams, Reid Barbour, William M. Hamlin, Rebeca Helfer, Eugene Hill, Ben LaBreche, Greg Miller, Debapriya Sarkar, and above all Theodore Leinwand who read the entire typescript. The readers for Cambridge University Press also made invaluable suggestions; they will recognize their contributions.

The National Endowment for the Humanities sponsored a Summer Institute on Medieval and Early Modern Philosophy in 2015 that mixed rigor and collegiality in exemplary fashion; I owe thanks to Peter King, Marcy Lascano, Calvin Normore, and Robert Pasnau. The Shakespeare Association of America hosted seminars in which I drafted various ideas in this book; I give special thanks to Judith Anderson, James Bednarz and Jennifer Vaught. The National Humanities Center hosted a Summer Institute on the lyric poetry of Andrew Marvell in 2012; Nigel Smith presided over a week of scholarship and interchange that continues to inform my work. The Texas Institute for Literary and Textual Studies (TILTS) held a symposium in 2010 on religious conflict and violence in early modern England during which I presented my initial pages on Herbert of Cherbury. The Folger Shakespeare Library awarded me a short-term fellowship in 2014 for work on Cavendish. I will not soon forget holding those beautiful folios in the cool penumbra of the Paster reading room during that steamy July.

I also want to thank audiences at various venues where I delivered papers: the International Milton Congress in 2004, the Southeastern Renaissance Conference in 2006, the University of Maryland in 2008, the Sixteenth-Century Society Conference in 2009, the Rocky Mountain Renaissance and Medieval Association Conference in 2011, and the



Acknowledgments

ix

Renaissance Society of America and the George Herbert Society in 2017. Angela Balla, Douglas Bruster, Daryl Gless, Andrew Hadfield, Anne-Marie Miller-Blaise, Gerard Passanante, Robert L. Reid, Andrew Shifflet, and Richard Strier stand out in memory for having helped me refine my ideas after those talks. Others whose advice I took include William Rogers Brubaker, Lara Dodds, Christopher Highley, David Lawrence, Jonathan Loesberg, Julie Park, David Pike, David Sacks, Matthew Seal, and Richard C. Sha. I also want to credit those who participated in the special session on skepticism in the seventeenth century that I organized at the Modern Languages Association Convention in 2013 and those who attended the seminar on theatrical skepticism that Lauren Robertson and I co-hosted at the Shakespeare Association of America in 2019.

Thanks to the University of Texas Press for permission to reprint a revised version of what became Chapter 3, first published as "The Politics of Truth in Herbert of Cherbury" by Anita Gilman Sherman from Texas Studies in Literature and Language, vol. 54, no. 1 (Spring 2012), pp. 189-215 (Copyright © by the University of Texas Press. All rights reserved). Thanks to Fordham University Press for permission to reprint "Fantasies of Private Language in Shakespeare's 'Phoenix and Turtle' and Donne's 'Ecstasy'" from Shakespeare and Donne: Generic Hybrids in the Cultural Imaginary, ed. Judith Anderson and Jennifer Vaught (Fordham University Press, 2013), pp. 169-184. Thanks to Taylor & Francis for permission to reprint a portion of "The Sceptic's Surrender: Believing Partly" from The Routledge Companion to Shakespeare and Philosophy, ed. Craig Bourne and Emily Caddick Bourne (Routledge, 2019), pp. 350-359. Thanks to the Folger Shakespeare Library for permission to reprint the engraved frontispiece of Margaret Cavendish's 1668 Playes and a woodcut illustration from Jan Van der Noot's 1569 A Theatre for Worldlings. No set of acknowledgments would be complete without thanking the extraordinary libraries that make this kind of academic work possible: not only the Folger Shakespeare Library, but also The Bender Library at American University, my home institution, and the Milton S. Eisenhower Library at The Johns Hopkins University.

I miss the brilliance, the sense of humor, and the unflagging support of the late Marshall Grossman whose graduate seminars introduced me to many wonderful poems, among them, Andrew Marvell's "Upon Appleton House."

Finally, thanks are due to my wonderful family whom I tried not to neglect while immersed in this project.

