### PRAISE FOR TOXIC POLITICS

"Dr. Huang has animated a dry subject and brought it to life. He elegantly combines environmental science, public health, political science, organizational behavior, and his own family and hometown experiences. The writing style is approachable and yet also very careful and precise. The book is a tremendous read. It is a worthy successor or update of Liz Economy's *The River Runs Black* of 2004. Moreover, this is much more than a scholarly work. The subject and analysis elucidate the conditions that at least 1.4 billion Chinese citizens face every day. The spillover effects of the problem-set that he so eloquently unpacks here will have obvious global consequence. I only hope that the book is translated into many languages. But, most importantly, I hope that it is translated into Chinese and read widely by members of the Chinese public as well as the political establishment in China."

– Craig Allen, President, US Ambassador (ret), US–China Business Council

"This book addresses a key question as to how a major environmental health crisis may influence China's rise. The book systematically reviews the fundamental economic, sociopolitical, foreign policy and health implications of the crisis and its policy response. The book also offers an intriguing assessment of the evolvement and implementation of environmental health policies in China. It is a must-read for those who are interested in global environmental health and policy issues."

> – Xi Chen, Associate Professor at Yale University; President, China Health Policy and Management Society

"Bringing well-researched data to life through poignant personal narratives, Huang documents devastating air, water, and soil pollution – and the Party's conflicted approach to acknowledging and addressing its toll on citizens' health. To understand some of

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-84191-7 — Toxic Politics Yanzhong Huang Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

China's most pressing challenges now and in the future, read this book!"

– Dr. Andrew S. Erickson, Professor, Naval War College; Visiting Scholar, Harvard Fairbank Center

"*Toxic Politics* does not hedge or equivocate. China must first heal its body politic before it will effectively address its environmental slide and heal its people. Willing participation by citizens in environmental and health action, as well as in overall governance, is necessary for a healthy environment and a sustainable great power."

 David M. Lampton, Oksenberg-Rohlen Fellow at the Asia-Pacific Research Center, Stanford University, and former director of China Studies, Johns Hopkins –SAIS

"Yanzhong Huang has accomplished a remarkable achievement: he offers us a comprehensive, truly interdisciplinary study of interrelated Chinese political, economic, and societal dynamics through a deep dive into the relationship between two vitally important policy areas, environmental degradation and its effects on citizens' health."

> Andrew Mertha, George and Sadie Hyman Professor and Director of China Studies, Johns Hopkins University

### TOXIC POLITICS

Environmental degradation in China has not only brought a wider range of diseases and other health consequences than previously understood, it has also taken a heavy toll on Chinese society, the economy, and the legitimacy of the Party-state. In *Toxic Politics*, Yanzhong Huang presents new evidence of China's deepening health crisis and challenges the widespread view that China is winning the war on pollution. Although government leaders are learning, stricter and more centralized policy enforcement measures have not been able to substantially reduce pollution or improve public health. Huang connects this failure to pathologies inherent in the institutional structure of the Chinese Party-state, which embeds conflicting incentives for officials and limits the capacity of the state to deliver public goods. *Toxic Politics* reveals a political system that is remarkably resilient but fundamentally flawed. Huang examines the implications for China's future, both domestically and internationally.

Yanzhong Huang is a senior fellow for global health at the Council on Foreign Relations. He is also a professor at the School of Diplomacy and International Relations at Seton Hall University, where he developed the first academic concentration among US schools of international affairs to explicitly address the security and foreign policy aspects of global health issues. His writing has appeared in outlets including *Foreign Affairs, Foreign Policy*, the *New York Times*, and the *Washington Post*.

### A COUNCIL ON FOREIGN RELATIONS BOOK

The Council on Foreign Relations (CFR) is an independent, nonpartisan membership organization, think tank, and publisher dedicated to being a resource for its members, government officials, business executives, journalists, educators and students, civic and religious leaders, and other interested citizens in order to help them better understand the world and the foreign policy choices facing the United States and other countries. Founded in 1921, CFR carries out its mission by maintaining a diverse membership, including special programs to promote interest and develop expertise in the next generation of foreign policy leaders; convening meetings at its headquarters in New York and in Washington, DC, and other cities where senior government officials, members of Congress, global leaders, and prominent thinkers come together with CFR members to discuss and debate major international issues; supporting the Studies Program that fosters independent research, enabling CFR scholars to produce articles, reports, and books and hold roundtables that analyze foreign policy issues and make concrete policy recommendations; publishing Foreign Affairs, the preeminent journal of international affairs and US foreign policy; sponsoring Independent Task Forces that produce reports with both findings and policy prescriptions on the most important foreign policy topics; and providing up-to-date information and analysis about world events and American foreign policy on its website, www.cfr.org.

The CFR takes no institutional positions on policy issues and has no affiliation with the US government. All views expressed in its publications and on its website are the sole responsibility of the author or authors.

## TOXIC POLITICS

China's Environmental Health Crisis and Its Challenge to the Chinese State A Council on Foreign Relations Book

### Yanzhong Huang

Council on Foreign Relations and Seton Hall University



© in this web service Cambridge University Press

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-84191-7 — Toxic Politics Yanzhong Huang Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>



University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108841917 DOI: 10.1017/9781108895132

© Yanzhong Huang 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-84191-7 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-81528-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-84191-7 — Toxic Politics Yanzhong Huang Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

> To my father, Huang Yujin, and to the memory of my mother, Yan Weiying (1939–2016)

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-84191-7 — Toxic Politics Yanzhong Huang Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

### Contents

List of Figures	x			
List of Tables				
Acknowledgments xi				
List of Abbreviations xv				
Introduction	1			
PART I THE HEALTH AND NONHEALTH IMPACTS				
1 Health Effects of Environmental Degradation	25			
2 Economic, Sociopolitical, and Foreign Policy Impacts	54			
PART II THE GOVERNMENT RESPONSE				
3 Evolving Environmental Health Policy	35			
4 Implementing Environmental Health Policy 11	Ι7			
5 An Assessment of Policy Effectiveness	19			
Conclusion	35			
Notes 19	94			
Index 25	58			

## Figures

1.1	Rising cancer mortality in China, per 100,000 population
	(1973–2015)
1.2	Mean deaths attributable to PM2.5 exposure in China,
	by source of emissions in 2013
2.1	Number of environment-related petition letters and complaints
	(1995–2015)
4.1	Soil pollution prevention and control: number of policy areas
	with only one central lead agency
5.1	Annual average of PM2.5 concentration (2013–2017)
5.2	Percentage of days with mean average PM2.5 concentration
	higher than 75 (2008–2017)
5.3	Percentage of winter days with bad air quality (Beijing, 2009–2016) $$ . . 154
5.4	Steel output (2001–2017, in million tons)
5.5	Coal production, consumption, and percentage share
	of the energy mix (2010–2017)
5.6	Pollution level before and after the "Two Sessions" in 189 cities $\ldots$ 177
5.7	Number of households that have completed the conversion
	from coal to cleaner fuel in the BTH region $\ldots \ldots \ldots \ldots \ldots \ldots 181$

## Tables

2.1	Major environmental health-related mass incidents (2005–2017) 70
3.1	Designations for air quality in China and the United States 114
4.1	Water pollution prevention and control goals, and lead
	and participating central agencies
4.2	Beijing air quality improvement: target management

### Acknowledgments

When I started preparing this book five years ago, I set the goal of completing the project in two years, without knowing that eventually it would be the events and developments in the environmental and political worlds that drove the book-writing process. Venturing into uncharted territory, I have been privileged to receive encouragement and support from a lot of people. They include my colleagues at Seton Hall University's School of Diplomacy and International Relations: Courtney Smith, Andrea Bartoli, Benjamin Goldfrank, and Martin Edwards, who gave me considerable latitude and support when I was working on the book.

I have benefited immensely from the help and support of many of my current and former colleagues at the Council on Foreign Relations: Alyssa Ayres, Tom Bollyky, Liz Economy, Laurie Garrett, Josh Kurlantzick, Shannon O'Neil, Adam Segal, Varun Sivaram, Sheila Smith, and Benn Steil. As a leading voice on China and director of CFR's Asia Studies Program, Liz has offered invaluable advice and support from the very beginning of the book project. CFR Director of Studies James Lindsay also deserves a special mention because he patiently read all versions of the project proposal and manuscript and offered extensive advice and suggestions, from which I benefited enormously. CFR President Richard Haass took the time to read the manuscript carefully, and his feedback pushed me to make the arguments more focused and coherent. I would also like to extend my profound gratitude to Patricia Dorff, who shepherded me through the book publication process. Amy Baker, Dominic Bocci, Jean-Michel Oriol, and Shira Schwartz also provided important support for the project.

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am grateful to the outside reviewers for their comments and suggestions on the book manuscript and Sara Doskow for her flexibility and guidance in publishing the book. Jonathan Landreth and Tom Redburn read through the entire manuscript in different stages of the project and provided excellent help in making this book accessible to a broader readership.

Throughout the process of research and writing, I was fortunate to receive research and editorial assistance from many graduate students at Seton Hall and young professionals at CFR: Erik Crouch, Lauren Greenwood, Kirk Lancaster, Gabriella Meltzer, Alex Miller, Ariella Rotenberg, Ben Silliman, Aaron Steinberg, Meagan Torello, and Dylan Yalbir. Gabriela Hasaj assembled the various components of the book, and Ebelle Ong Wei Shan provided critical support in data analysis.

I would also like to thank the Smith Richardson Foundation for the generous financial support and Allan Song for guiding me through the grant-seeking process. The funding enabled me to conduct fieldwork research and organize a series of meetings on China's environmental health. Through a CFR study group chaired by Jeffrey Sachs, I was able to collect constructive feedback on earlier versions of the book's chapters from a number of scholars and experts, including Frances Beinecke, Dan Fox, Mark Frazier, Joan Kaufman, Steve Morse, Steve Orlins, Deliang Tang, Yang Gonghuan, and Yu Zhou.

I also owe a great debt to the following friends, scholars, officials, and activists who facilitated the book's preparation and writing: Jan Berris, Chen Ajiang, Dingding Chen, Xi Chen, Deng Guosheng, Dong Dong, Feng Yongfeng, Jennifer Holdaway, Hu Tao, Mike Lampton, Ken Lieberthal, Liguo Lin, Lican Liu, Ma Daoming, Miao Lu, Minxin Pei, Pu Xiaoyu, Shang Qi, Judith Shapiro, Susan Shirk, Henry Wang, Jock Whittlesey, Xue Lan, Dali Yang, and Jack Zhang. Numerous other friends, scholars and officials in China helped arrange my research and fieldwork in Beijing, Jiangsu, Shanghai, Shanxi, and Guangdong during various stages. Out of respect for their anonymity, I am unable to acknowledge their help individually.

Born into a family in rural China, I dared not dream of going to college, let alone the opportunity to travel across the ocean and find a home in a beautiful and bountiful land. I am deeply indebted to my parents, who not only taught me honesty and integrity in life but also

хш

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

showed their understanding and support of my pursuit of an academic career. My mother and my first teacher, Yan Weiying, passed away while I was working on the book. The experience of my father, Huang Yujin, who has worked hard all his life but still regrets not being able to provide a decent life for his children, reminds me not to lose touch with the less well-off in my research. I dedicate this book to my father and the memory of my mother.

### Abbreviations

$\mu g/m^3$	micrograms per cubic meter
ADB	Asian Development Bank
AHC	adjusted human capital
API	Air Pollution Index
AQSIQ	General Administration of Quality Supervision, Inspection,
	and Quarantine
AQI	Air Quality Index (instead of API)
ARGs	antibiotic-resistance genes
BLL	blood lead levels
BTH	Beijing–Tianjin–Hebei
CBCGDF	China Biodiversity Conservation and Green Development
	Foundation
CCG	Center for China and Globalization
CCP	Chinese Communist Party
CCTV	China Central Television
CFR	Council on Foreign Relations
CEPI	central environmental protection inspection
China CDC	China Center for Disease Control and Prevention
CPPCC	Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference
CNPC	China National Petroleum Corp
$CO_2$	carbon dioxide
COP21	2015 United Nations Climate Change Conference
COPD	chronic obstructive pulmonary disease
CVDs	cardiovascular diseases
DALYs	disability-adjusted life years
EIA	environmental impact assessment

#### LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

EPA	US Environmental Protection Agency
EPBs	Environmental Protection Bureaus
EPI	Environmental Performance Index
EPIL	environmental public interest litigation
EST	Environmental Supervision Talks
FGD	flue gas desulfurization
GBD	Global Burden of Disease
GW	gigawatts
HDI	Human Development Index
HEI	Health Effects Institute
IHME	Institute for Health Metrics and Evaluation
IOC	International Olympic Committee
IPE	Institute of Public and Environmental Affairs
LNG	liquefied natural gas
MEE	Ministry of Ecology and Environment (2018 successor of
	the MEP)
MEP	Ministry of Environmental Protection (the successor of
	SEPA)
MFA	Ministry of Foreign Affairs
MIIT	Ministry of Industry and Information Technology
MLR	Ministry of Land and Resources
MOF	Ministry of Finance
MOA	Ministry of Agriculture
MOFCOM	Ministry of Commerce
MOH	Ministry of Health
MOHURD	Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development
MOST	Ministry of Science and Technology
MOT	Ministry of Transport
MSW	municipal solid waste
MWR	Ministry of Water Resources
NCDs	noncommunicable diseases
NDRC	National Development and Reform Commission
NEA	National Energy Administration
NEMS	National Environment Monitoring Station
NGO	nongovernmental organization
NHFPC	National Health and Family Planning Commission

xvı

#### LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

Nimby	"not in my backyard"
$NO_2$	nitrogen dioxide
$NO_x$	nitrogen oxide
NPC	National People's Congress
NSFC	National Natural Science Foundation of China
$O_3$	ozone
PDP	pollutant discharge permit
PM	particulate matter
PPP	public–private partnerships
PRT	pollution rights trading
PX	paraxylene
REE	rare-earth elements
RSCs	regional supervision centers
SARS	severe acute respiratory syndrome
SASAC	State-owned Assets Supervision and Administration
	Commission
SEPA	State Environmental Protection Administration (succes-
	sor of State Environmental Protection Agency)
SEPA	State Environmental Protection Agency
SFDA	State Food and Drug Administration
Sinopec	China Petroleum & Chemical Corporation
$SO_2$	sulfur dioxide
SOA	State Oceanic Administration
TEC	total emission control
TVEs	township and village enterprises
UNCHE	UN Conference on the Human Environment
UNEP	United Nations Environment Program
VOCs	volatile organic compounds
VSL	value of a statistical life
WHO	World Health Organization
WTE	waste-to-energy

xvII

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-84191-7 — Toxic Politics Yanzhong Huang Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>