

DEBATING CLIMATE LAW

What role could or should the law play in dealing with the climate emergency? In this innovative volume, leading scholars explore fundamental debates at the frontier of climate change law scholarship. They address the key areas of scholarly disagreement about what climate change law is, the legal rules it consists of, and how these rules could be implemented in the real world. The first eleven topics are debated by teams of scholars expressing diametrically opposite points of view on each topic, in traditional debating style; the last seven chapters are presented as an individual author's own reflection on a topic that cannot readily be reduced to a binary debate. Each section is written in an accessible and thought-provoking way, emphasizing clear lines of argumentation. The debating-style format is designed to stimulate students to think critically and logically about the law and to fire up debate in and out of class.

BENOIT MAYER is Associate Professor at The Chinese University of Hong Kong. He is the author of *The International Law on Climate Change* (Cambridge University Press, 2018).

ALEXANDER ZAHAR is Professor of International Law at Southwest University of Political Science and Law, Chongqing, China. He is the founder and editor of the journal *Climate Law*.



DEBATING CLIMATE LAW

Edited by

BENOIT MAYER

The Chinese University of Hong Kong

ALEXANDER ZAHAR

Southwest University of Political Science and Law





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025. India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108840156 DOI: 10.1017/9781108879064

© Cambridge University Press 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

Cover photo: Copyright © Hellenic Ministry of Culture and Sports – Archaeological Receipts Fund) (N. 3028/2002).

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-84015-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

List of Contributors	page ix
Acknowledgements	xvi
List of Abbreviations	xvii

Introduction 1
BENOIT MAYER AND ALEXANDER ZAHAR

DEBATE 1 Customary Law 15

- A The No-Harm Principle as the Foundation of International Climate Law 15
 SANDRINE MALJEAN-DUBOIS
- B The Significant Transboundary Harm Prevention Rule and Climate Change: One-Size-Fits-All or One-Size-Fits-None? 29 CHRISTOPHER CAMPBELL-DURUFLÉ

DEBATE 2 The ILC's Role 40

- A The International Law Commission's Role in Developing International Law to Protect the Earth's Atmosphere As It Relates to Climate Change 40
- B Why the ILC Should Not Seek to Codify Climate Law 50 GÉRAUD DE LASSUS ST-GENIÈS

DEBATE 3 CBDR Principle 63

A In Defence of the Principle of Common but Differentiated Responsibilities and Respective Capabilities 63



vi CONTENTS

B The Notion of Common but Differentiated Responsibilities and Respective Capabilities: A Commendable but Failed Effort to Enhance Equity in Climate Law 76

THOMAS LEGLERC

DEBATE 4 Compliance 86

- A In Defence of the Paris Agreement's Compliance System:
 The Case for Facilitative Compliance 86
 MEINHARD DOELLE
- B The Paris Agreement's Article 15 Mechanism: An Incomplete Compliance Strategy 99

 ANNA HUGGINS

DEBATE 5 Climate Litigation 111

- A The Essential Role of Climate Litigation and the Courts in Averting Climate Crisis 111
 CINNAMON PIÑON CARLARNE
- B Climate Litigation: A Red Herring among Climate Mitigation Tools 128 GUY DWYER

DEBATE 6 Human Rights 145

- A Human Rights Law Can Drive Climate Change Mitigation 145 NICOLA PAIN
- B The Absurdity of Relying on Human Rights Law to Go After Emitters 159
 FANNY THORNTON

DEBATE 7 Historical Responsibility 170

A Redressing Historical Responsibility for the Unjust Precarities of Climate Change in the Present 170 SARAH MASON-CASE AND JULIA DEHM



CONTENTS vii

B Historical Responsibility for Climate Change Is Political Propaganda 190
ALEXANDER ZAHAR

DEBATE 8 Climate Migration 206

- A 'Climate Mobility' Is a Proper Subject of Research and Governance 206
 INGRID BOAS
- B 'Climate Mobility' Is Not a Proper Subject of Research and Governance 215 CALUM TM NICHOLSON

DEBATE 9 Negative-Emission Technologies 227

- A An Emission-Reduction Commitment Is a Plan for the Future: Developing and Using New NETs Should Be at the Heart of That Plan 227
- B It Would Be Irresponsible, Unethical, and Unlawful to Rely on NETs at Large Scale Instead of Mitigation 241

 DUNCAN MCLAREN AND WIL BURNS

DEBATE 10 Solar Radiation Management 257

- A Solar Geoengineering Could Be Consistent with International Law 257
 JESSE L REYNOLDS
- B Solar Geoengineering Is Prohibited under International Law 274 KERRYN ANNE BRENT

DEBATE 11 Climate Assessment 285

- A The Emergence of Climate Assessment as a Customary Law Obligation 285
 BENOIT MAYER
- B Environmental Impact Assessment for Greenhouse Gas Emissions Is Pie in the Sky 297 ALEXANDER ZAHAR



viii CONTENTS

REFLECTION 1 Adaptation 310

Climate Change Adaptation Law: Is There Such a Thing? 310
BENOIT MAYER

REFLECTION 2 Loss and Damage 329

Legal Claims for Reparation of Loss and Damage 329
ALICE VENN

REFLECTION 3 Disappearing States 349

State Extinction Through Climate Change 349
ORL SHARON

REFLECTION 4 Climate Finance 365

A Legal Perspective on Climate Finance Debates:
How Constructive Is the Current Norm Ambiguity?

365
YULIA YAMINEVA

REFLECTION 5 Non-State Actors 379

The Role of Non-State Actors in Climate Law
MIKKO RAJAVUORI

REFLECTION 6 Regime Inconsistency 398

Climate Law and Environmental Law: Is Conflict between Them Inevitable? 398 OLIVIA WOOLLEY

REFLECTION 7 Aesthetics 412

Climate Change Law and Aesthetics: A Primer 412 BENJAMIN J RICHARDSON

Conclusion 431
BENOIT MAYER AND ALEXANDER ZAHAR

Index 435



CONTRIBUTORS

INGRID BOAS is Associate Professor at the Environmental Policy Group of Wageningen University. Ingrid does research in the fields of environmental change, mobilities, and governance. In 2016, she was awarded a personal grant from the Netherlands Scientific Organization to study environmental migration in the digital age. Ingrid's work has appeared in journals such as Global Environmental Politics, Environmental Politics, Geoforum, The Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, Nature Climate Change, and in a monograph on Climate Migration and Security: Securitization as a Strategy in Climate Change Politics (Routledge 2015).

KERRYN ANNE BRENT is Lecturer at the University of Adelaide Law School. Kerryn teaches climate change, environmental law, and planning law. She holds a PhD from the University of Tasmania and Bachelor Degrees in Arts and Law from the University of Newcastle, Australia. Kerryn researches climate change law, focusing on the governance of solar geoengineering and carbon-dioxide removal proposals. She is Deputy Director of the Australian Forum for Climate Intervention Governance, and a member of the Centre of Innovation for Recovery of Climate, Australia.

WIL BURNS is founding Co-Director of the Institute for Carbon Removal Law and Policy, a think tank at American University's School of International Service in Washington, DC, that focuses on legal, political, and ethical issues associated with carbon-dioxide removal geoengineering. Prior to this, he served as the Director of the Energy Policy and Climate program at Johns Hopkins University. He is the former President of the US Association of Environmental Studies and Sciences. His research agenda focuses on climate geoengineering governance, including the role of human-rights-based approaches to ensure that equitable considerations are taken into account in



X LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

governance, and how to operationalize the loss-and-damage provisions of the Paris Agreement.

CHRISTOPHER CAMPBELL-DURUFLÉ is a researcher and a lawyer specializing in international environmental and human rights law. He is a doctoral candidate at the University of Toronto, where he holds a Pierre Elliott Trudeau Foundation scholarship. His thesis assesses the implementation mechanisms adopted in the Paris Agreement from the perspective of state accountability. He was officially accredited to the UN climate negotiations from COP 21 through to COP 25, and is Associate Fellow at the Center for International Sustainable Development Law.

CINNAMON PIÑON CARLARNE is the Associate Dean for Faculty and Intellectual Life and the Alumni Society Designated Professor of Law at the Moritz College of Law, Ohio State University. Her research interests are in domestic and international environmental law and climate change law. Her published work on climate change law includes the *Oxford Handbook of International Climate Change Law*, a Foundation Press textbook on climate law, and an Oxford University Press monograph on comparative climate change law. She is Co-Chair of the American Society of International Law's Signature Topic on International Law and Climate Change.

GARETH DAVIES is Professor of European law at the Vrije Universiteit in Amsterdam. His research addresses conflicts of interests in transnational law and regulation. Themes include the social and democratic effects on Europe of free movement, and the challenges of responding rationally to climate change.

JULIA DEHM is Senior Lecturer at the School of Law, La Trobe University, Australia, and Co-Editor-in-Chief of the *Journal of Human Rights and the Environment*. Her research addresses international climate change law and regulation, transnational carbon markets, and the governance of natural resources, as well as the relationship between human rights and economic inequality.

GÉRAUD DE LASSUS ST-GENIÈS IS Assistant Professor in Environmental Law at the Law Faculty of Laval University, Québec, Canada. He holds an LLM from Panthéon-Sorbonne University and an LLD from Laval University and Panthéon-Sorbonne University. He was a



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

χi

postdoctoral fellow at the Law Faculty of McGill University and at the Centre for International Governance Innovation. His areas of interest include different aspects of international and domestic climate law, including the link between culture and climate change.

MEINHARD DOELLE is the Canadian Chair, Marine Environmental Protection, at the World Maritime University in Malmö, Sweden, and Professor of Law at the Schulich School of Law, Dalhousie University, Halifax, Canada. He holds an LLM from Osgoode Hall Law School and a PhD from Dalhousie University. His research interests include a range of issues related to climate change, environmental law, and environmental impact assessment. He has published numerous books on the UN climate regime, including on the Kyoto Protocol (Carswell 2005), on compliance (Cambridge University Press 2012), and on the Paris climate regime (Oxford University Press 2017). His next climate-related book deals with loss and damage (Elgar 2021).

GUY DWYER is Senior Associate at the law firm Baker McKenzie, at its office in Sydney, Australia. He practises in environmental, planning, and climate change law. Guy also maintains an interest in academic research, serving as an associate of the Centre for Environmental Law at Macquarie University in Sydney. His current research interests include the operation of administrative law in environmental decision-making, environmental dispute resolution, climate law, and maritime law. His academic works in these areas have been published in numerous journals.

ANNA HUGGINS is Associate Professor in the School of Law at Queensland University of Technology, Australia. She holds a PhD from the University of New South Wales, for which she received a PhD Excellence Award. Anna's primary research interests lie in the areas of environmental law and regulatory compliance at the international and domestic levels. Her published work includes *Multilateral Environmental Agreements and Compliance: The Benefits of Administrative Procedures* (Routledge 2018). Anna is Assistant Editor of the journal *Transnational Environmental Law* (Cambridge University Press).

THOMAS LECLERC is Associate Professor at the University of Western Brittany, in Brest, France. He holds a PhD from the University of Bordeaux and the International Institute of Air and Space Law, Leiden University. His PhD research addressed the interaction between air law



xii

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

and climate change law. His current research focuses on a comparative analysis of legal regimes governing areas beyond national jurisdiction. He has participated in many academic events, published several articles in French and in English, and lectured on various topics of public and international law. Since 2016, he has been Visiting Lecturer at the University of Leiden.

SANDRINE MALJEAN-DUBOIS is a Researcher at CNRS and teaches international environmental law at the Faculty of Law and Political Sciences of Aix-Marseille University, France. Her research focus is on international environmental law, in particular on biodiversity and climate change law. She is the author of several books and numerous articles on these topics. She has been Visiting Professor at Senghor University (Alexandria, Egypt), Laval University (Quebec, Canada), CEUB University and University of Brasilia (Brazil), Catholic University of Louvain (Belgium), and The Hague Academy of International Law.

SARAH MASON-CASE is a Fulbright visiting researcher at Harvard Law School, where she is affiliated with the Institute for Global Law and Policy. She is also Adjunct Professor at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law, where she is completing her doctorate. Sarah teaches and writes in the areas of international law, environment, critical race theory, and Third World Approaches to International Law (TWAIL).

BENOIT MAYER is Associate Professor at the Chinese University of Hong Kong, where he teaches climate law, environmental law, and international law. He holds an LLM from McGill University and a PhD from the National University of Singapore. His research addresses various aspects of the international law on climate change. He is the author of a monograph on climate migration (Edward Elgar 2016) and a textbook on international climate law (Cambridge University Press 2018). His next book, *International Law Obligations on Climate Change Mitigation*, will be published by Oxford University Press.

DUNCAN MCLAREN is Professor in Practice and Research Fellow at Lancaster University, and a visiting researcher at Linköping University, Sweden. His research interests focus on the justice implications of technological and social change, with current work considering geoengineering, smart urbanism, and circular economies from a perspective of cultural political ecology. In his previous career,



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

xiii

Duncan worked as an environmental researcher and campaigner, most recently as Chief Executive of Friends of the Earth Scotland, from 2003 to 2011.

CALUM TM NICHOLSON read Social Anthropology at Trinity College, Cambridge, and holds an MPhil in Migration Studies from St Antony's College, Oxford. He received his PhD in Human Geography in 2016. Through a close examination of the literature on 'climate migration', his research seeks to examine the relationship between research and policy, and reveal the contours of the culture that has given the topic such cachet despite its stubbornly equivocal nature.

NICOLA PAIN has been a judge at the Land and Environment Court of New South Wales (Sydney, Australia) since 2002. Early in her career, she completed an SJD on the topic of environmental rights in the Asia-Pacific region. Justice Pain is Adjunct Professor at University of Sydney Law School. In addition to hundreds of judgments, she has published numerous articles and presented many papers around the world on a wide range of environmental-law topics, including human rights and the environment.

MIKKO RAJAVUORI is Academy of Finland Post-Doctoral Fellow at the Center for Climate Change, Energy and Environmental Law, University Eastern Finland Law School. Mikko holds an LLM and LLD from University of Turku, Faculty of Law. His research focuses on the interactions between international law and corporate law as well as on various aspects of sustainability regulation. His scholarship has appeared in leading international journals such as the *European Journal of International Law* and *Energy Policy*.

JESSE L REYNOLDS is an Emmett/Frankel Fellow in Environmental Law and Policy at the Emmett Institute on Climate Change and the Environment of the University of California, Los Angeles, School of Law. He researches how norms, rules, and institutions can manage environmental opportunities and challenges, particularly those involving new technologies. He has degrees from Tilburg University, the University of California, Berkeley, and Hampshire College. Dr Reynolds is the author of *The Governance of Solar Geoengineering: Managing Climate Change in the Anthropocene* (Cambridge University Press 2019). His website is jreynolds.org.



xiv

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

BENJAMIN J RICHARDSON is Professor of Environmental Law at the University of Tasmania, Australia. His peripatetic career has spanned similar positions in universities in Canada, England, the Netherlands, and New Zealand. His recent research work focuses on theoretical enquiries into aesthetics and time in relation to environmental governance. Beyond academia, he is a member of the Tasmanian Independent Science Council and is active in Extinction Rebellion and in climate justice movements.

PETER H SAND has taught international environmental law at the University of Munich since 1995. Formerly, he was Associate Professor of Law at McGill University, Montreal, Chief of UNEP's Environmental Law Unit in Nairobi, and World Bank Legal Adviser for Environmental Affairs, in Washington, DC. He is the author or co-author of nine books and over 100 articles on international environmental law and governance and associate editor of the journal International Environmental Agreements: Politics, Law and Economics (Springer).

DARIA SHAPOVALOVA is Lecturer in Energy Law at the University of Aberdeen. Her main research interests are in the role of law in regulating upstream and downstream energy sectors while addressing environmental protection and human rights. Her current work is on the regulatory challenges of a just transition to low-carbon energy systems, with a focus on climate change law and effective public participation.

ORI SHARON is Associate Professor at the Faculty of Law and at the Program in Regulation and Environmental Policy at Bar-Ilan University, Israel, where he teaches property and environmental law. He holds an LLM (cum laude) in Environmental Law as well as an SJD, both from Duke University School of Law. His scholarship engages in normative, conceptual, and doctrinal analyses of failures of environmental equity as manifested through disproportionate climate change impacts.

FANNY THORNTON is Associate Professor in Law at the University of Canberra, Australia, where she teaches human rights law, international law, and legal theory. She holds an MA from Sussex University and a PhD from the Australian National University. Her research focuses on how various actors respond to mobility pressures stemming from climate change. It analyses how law and policy develops in this area and, broadly, how courts and tribunals increasingly play a role in resolving



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

XV

issues of climate change loss and damage. She is the author of *Climate Change and People on the Move: International Law and Justice* (Oxford University Press 2018).

ALICE VENN is Lecturer in Law at the University of Exeter specializing in international climate law and policy. Her research and teaching expertise span the areas of environmental law, international law, public law, human rights, and climate justice. She has published in the areas of climate law and climate justice and has a particular interest in interdisciplinary climate research.

OLIVIA WOOLLEY is Associate Professor in Biolaw at Durham University Law School. Her research explores law's role in addressing global ecological deterioration, including by responding to climate change. Her monograph *Ecological Governance* (Cambridge University Press 2014) proposes a governance system for socio-economic transition towards ecological sustainability. She also has research interests in law relating to a low-carbon-energy transition with particular focuses on renewable energy law and decarbonization in the European Union.

YULIA YAMINEVA is Senior Researcher (docent) at the Centre for Climate, Energy and Environmental Law at University of Eastern Finland Law School. Her research addresses various aspects of climate change, air pollution, and the science-policy interface from the perspectives of international law and political science. Her work has been published in *Transnational Environmental Law, Environmental Science and Policy*, and *Nature Climate Change*, among other journals. Previously she was with the UNFCCC Secretariat and the International Institute for Sustainable Development. She holds a PhD in International Studies from the University of Cambridge.

ALEXANDER ZAHAR is Honorary Professor at Macquarie Law School, Sydney, Australia, and Professor of International Law at Southwest University of Political Science and Law, in Chongqing, China. His research interests are in international climate change law, as well as climate change law in China. He is the founder and editor of the journal *Climate Law* (Brill). His most recent book is an edited collection of essays, *Climate Change Law in China in Global Context* (Routledge 2020, with Hao Zhang and He Xiangbai).



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We would like to express our deepest appreciation to the contributors to this volume – we learned a lot from them! We would also like to thank the team at Cambridge University Press for their patience and kindness throughout the process. We are grateful to the Ephorate of Antiquities of Athens City, Ancient Agora, for permission to use the cover photo. The constant support of our families is also very gratefully acknowledged.

Benoit Mayer and Alexander Zahar



ABBREVIATIONS

For journal names, see Cardiff Index to Legal Abbreviations, <www.legalabbrevs.cardiff.ac.uk/>.

AOSIS Alliance of Small Island States

BAU Business As Usual

BECCS Bioenergy with Carbon Capture and Storage

C40 Cities 40

CA Climate Assessment

CBD Convention on Biological Diversity

CBDR Common but Differentiated Responsibilities

CBDR-RC+ Common but Differentiated Responsibilities and Respective

Capabilities in the Light of Different National Circumstances

CBDR-RC Common but Differentiated Responsibilities and Respective

Capabilities

CCS Carbon Capture and Storage CDR Carbon Dioxide Removal

CEDAW Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women

CEQ Council on Environmental Quality (United States)

CESCR Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (United

Nations)

CH₄ Methane

CIA Climate Impact Assessment

CIEL Center for International Environmental Law

CITES Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild

Fauna and Flora

CLRTAP Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution

CM Climate Migration

CMA Conference of the Parties to the UNFCCC serving as the Meeting of

the Parties to the Paris Agreement

CMP Conference of the Parties to the UNFCCC serving as the Meeting of

the Parties to the Kyoto Protocol

CO₂ Carbon Dioxide

CoM Covenant of Mayors for Climate and Energy

xvii



XVIII LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

COP Conference of the Parties to the UNFCCC

CSO Civil Society Organization
CVF Climate Vulnerable Forum

DACCS Direct Air Capture with Carbon Capture and Storage

EEZ Exclusive Economic Zone

EIA Environmental Impact Assessment

EIF Entry Into Force

ENMOD Convention on the Prohibition of Military or Any Other Hostile Use

of Environmental Modification Techniques

EPA Environmental Protection Agency (United States)

ERT Expert Review Team
EU European Union
GCF Green Climate Fund
GHG Greenhouse Gas
HE Historical Emissions
HR Historical Responsibility

IACtHR Inter-American Court of Human Rights ICAO International Civil Aviation Organization

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

ICJ International Court of Justice

ICL Intra-Climate Law

ILC International Law Commission

INDC Intended Nationally Determined Contribution
 IPCC Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
 ITLOS International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea
 L&D Loss and Damage (associated with climate change)

LDCs Least Developed Countries

LEC Land and Environment Court (New South Wales, Australia)

MCB Marine Cloud Brightening

MEA Multilateral Environmental Agreement

MSP Market Substitution Postulate
NDC Nationally Determined Contribution

NEEDS National Economic, Environment and Development Study NEPA National Environmental Protection Act (United States, 1969)

NET Negative Emission Technique / Technology

NGO Non-Governmental Organization

N₂O Nitrous Oxide NSA Non-State Actor NSW New South Wales

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

OHCHR Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights

PCIJ Permanent Court of International Justice



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

xix

SCRC Special Circumstances and Respective Capabilities

SEA Strategic Environmental Assessment
SEI Stockholm Environment Institute
SIDS Small Island Developing States
SRM Solar Radiation Management

STH Rule Significant Transboundary Harm (Prevention) Rule

TBSH Rule Transboundary Significant Harm Rule
TERT Technical Expert Review Team

TWAIL Third World Approaches to International Law

UK United Kingdom UN United Nations

UNCLOS UN Convention on the Law of the Sea

UN Doc UN Document (accessible at www.un.org/en/ga/documents/symbol

.shtml)

UNEP UN Environment Programme

UNFCCC UN Framework Convention on Climate Change

UNGA UN General Assembly

US United States

WIM Warsaw International Mechanism for Loss and Damage