Growing public discontent with the performance and quality of many contemporary democracies makes them vulnerable to popular pressures to profoundly transform or replace their constitutions. However, there is little systematic academic discussion on the legal and political challenges that these events pose to democratic principles and practices. This book, a collaborative effort by legal scholars and political scientists, analyzes these challenges from an interdisciplinary and comparative perspective. It fills a theoretical vacuum by examining the possibility that constitutions might be replaced within a democratic regime, while exploring the conditions under which these processes are more compatible or less compatible with democratic principles. It also calls attention to the real-world political importance of the phenomenon, because recent episodes of constitutional redrafting in countries including Kenya, Poland, Venezuela, and Hungary suggest that some aspects of these processes may be associated with either the improvement or the gradual erosion of democracy.

Gabriel L. Negretto is Associate Professor, Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile. Specializing in comparative constitutional politics, institutional change, and democratization, he is the author of Making Constitutions: Presidents, Parties, and Institutional Choice in Latin America (2013). Negretto has been a consultant to various international organizations and has held visiting appointments at several universities in the United States, Europe, and Latin America.
COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW AND POLICY

Series Editors
Tom Ginsburg University of Chicago
Zachary Elkins University of Texas at Austin
Ran Hirschl University of Toronto

Comparative constitutional law is an intellectually vibrant field that encompasses an increasingly broad array of approaches and methodologies. This series collects analytically innovative and empirically grounded work from scholars of comparative constitutionalism across academic disciplines. Books in the series include theoretically informed studies of single constitutional jurisdictions, comparative studies of constitutional law and institutions, and edited collections of original essays that respond to challenging theoretical and empirical questions in the field.

Books in the Series
From Parchment to Practice: Implementing New Constitutions Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Z. Huq
The Failure of Popular Constitution Making in Turkey: Regressing Towards Constitutional Autocracy Edited by Felix Petersen and Zeynep Yanaşmayan
A Qualified Hope: The Indian Supreme Court and Progressive Social Change Edited by Gerald N. Rosenberg, Sudhir Krishnaswamy and Shishir Bail
Constitutions in Times of Financial Crisis Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Mark D. Rosen, Georg Vanberg
Reconstructing Rights: Courts, Parties, and Equality Rights in India, South Africa, and the United States Stephan Stohler
Constitution-Making and Transnational Legal Order Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Terence C. Halliday and Gregory Shaffer
Hybrid Constitutionalism: The Politics of Constitutional Review in the Chinese Special Administrative Regions Eric C. Ip
The Politico-Legal Dynamics of Judicial Review: A Comparative Analysis Theunis Roux
The Invisible Constitution in Comparative Perspective Edited by Rosalind Dixon and Adrienne Stone
Constitutional Courts in Asia: A Comparative Perspective Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen and Andrew Harding
Judicial Review in Norway: A Bicentennial Debate Anine Kierulf
Constituent Assemblies Edited by Jon Elster, Roberto Gargarella, Vatsal Naresh, and Bjorn Erik Rasch
The DNA of Constitutional Justice in Latin America: Politics, Governance, and Judicial Design Daniel M. Brinks and Abby Blass
The Adventures of the Constituent Power: Beyond Revolutions? Andrew Arato
Constitutions, Religion and Politics in Asia: Indonesia, Malaysia and Sri Lanka Dian A. H. Shah
Canada in the World: Comparative Perspectives on the Canadian Constitution Edited by Richard Albert and David R. Cameron
Courts and Democracies in Asia Po Jen Yap
Proportionality: New Frontiers, New Challenges Edited by Vicki C. Jackson and Mark Tushnet
Constituents before Assembly: Participation, Deliberation, and Representation in the Crafting of New Constitutions Todd A. Eisenstadt, A. Carl LeVan, and Tofigh Maboudi
Assessing Constitutional Performance Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Huq
Buddhism, Politics and the Limits of Law: The Pyrrhic Constitutionalism of Sri Lanka Benjamin Schonthal
Engaging with Social Rights: Procedure, Participation and Democracy in South Africa’s Second Wave Brian Ray
Constitutional Courts As Mediators: Armed Conflict, Civil–Military Relations, and the Rule of Law in Latin America Julio Ríos-Figueroa
Perils of Judicial Self-Government in Transitional Societies David Kosař
Making We the People: Democratic Constitutional Founding in Postwar Japan and South Korea Chaihark Hahm and Sung Ho Kim
Radical Deprivation on Trial: The Impact of Judicial Activism on Socioeconomic Rights in the Global South César Rodríguez-Garavito and Diana Rodríguez-Franco
Unstable Constitutionalism: Law and Politics in South Asia Edited by Mark Tushnet and Madhav Khosla
Magna Carta and Its Modern Legacy Edited by Robert Hazell and James Melton
Constitutions and Religious Freedom Frank B. Cross
International Courts and the Performance of International Agreements: A General Theory with Evidence from the European Union Clifford J. Carrubba and Matthew J. Gabel
Reputation and Judicial Tactics: A Theory of National and International Courts Shai Dothan
Social Difference and Constitutionalism in Pan-Asia Edited by Susan H. Williams
Constitutionalism in Asia in the Early Twenty-First Century Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen
Constitutions in Authoritarian Regimes Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Alberto Simpser
Presidential Legislation in India: The Law and Practice of Ordinances Shubhankar Dam
Social and Political Foundations of Constitutions Edited by Denis J. Galligan and Mila Versteeg
Consequential Courts: Judicial Roles in Global Perspective Edited by Diana Kapiszewski, Gordon Silverstein, and Robert A. Kagan
Comparative Constitutional Design Edited by Tom Ginsburg
In memory of Ana María Bejarano
Contents

List of Tables ............................... xi
List of Contributors ....................... xiii
Acknowledgments ......................... xv

1 New Constitutions in Democratic Regimes ................................. 1
   Gabriel L. Negretto

PART I CONCEPTUAL, NORMATIVE, AND EMPIRICAL ISSUES .......................... 31

2 Constitution Making through Law ............................................... 33
   Joel I. Colón-Ríos

3 Expanding Revision Clauses in Democratic Constitutions ................. 53
   William Partlett

4 Courts and Constitution Making in Democratic Regimes: A Contextual
   Approach ................................................................. 78
   David Landau

5 Replacing Constitutions in Democratic Regimes: Elite Cooperation
   and Citizen Participation .................................................. 101
   Gabriel L. Negretto

PART II CASE STUDIES ...................................................... 129

6 The Difference Power Diffusion Makes: Explaining Divergent
   Ana María Bejarano and Renata Segura

ix
Gabriel L. Negretto and Solongo Wandan

Thailand’s Democratic Moment: The Constitution of 1997 175
Tom Ginsburg

Christina Murray

The Anatomy of Constitution Making: From Denmark in 1849 to Iceland in 2017 217
Thorvaldur Gylfason

Index 241
# Tables

| 1.1 | Constitutional replacements in democratic regimes, 1900–2015 | 5 |
| 1.2 | Features of constitution making in democratic regimes, 1900–2015 | 9 |
| 1.3 | Constitutional replacements and democracy after enactment, 1900–2015 | 21 |
| 4.1 | Functions and justifications of judicial intervention during constitution making | 83 |
| 5.1 | Democratic constitution making, liberal principles, and liberal democracy (A) | 115 |
| 5.2 | Democratic constitution making, liberal principles, and liberal democracy (B) | 117 |
| 6.1 | Colombian constituent assembly (1991) | 138 |
| 6.2 | Venezuelan constituent assembly (1999) | 146 |
| 7.1 | Hungary’s shift in electoral support and institutional resources across the main parties, 2006–2010 | 159 |
| 7.2 | Poland’s shift in electoral support and institutional resources across the main parties, 1991–1993 | 164 |
Contributors

Ana María Bejarano (†) was Associate Professor of Political Science, University of Toronto.

Joel I. Colón-Ríos is Professor of Law, Victoria University of Wellington.

Tom Ginsburg is Leo Spitz Professor of International Law and Professor of Political Science, University of Chicago.

Thorvaldur Gylfason is Professor of Economics, University of Iceland.

David Landau is Mason Ladd Professor of Law and Associate Dean for International Programs, Florida State University.

Christina Murray is Professor of Constitutional and Human Rights Law, University of Cape Town.

Gabriel L. Negretto is Professor of Political Science, Instituto de Ciencia Política, Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile.

William Partlett is Associate Professor of Law, Melbourne Law School.

Renata Segura is Deputy Director for Latin America and the Caribbean, International Crisis Group.

Solongo Wandan was Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of Oklahoma and currently works as Advisor in Energy and Climate Policy.
Acknowledgments

This book grew out of a panel I organized for the American Political Science Association Meeting in September 2015 in San Francisco entitled “Constitution Making in Democratic Constitutional Orders.” This event was followed by an international conference on the same topic held in August 2016 at the Centro de Investigación y Docencia Económicas (CIDE) in Mexico City. I would like to thank Joel Colón-Ríos, Todd Eisenstadt, Zachary Elkins, Juan F. González-Bertomeu, Thorvaldur Gylfason, David Landau, William Partlett, Xisca Pou, Andrea Pozas-Loyo, Julio Ríos-Figueroa, and Solongo Wandan for their important initial contributions to this project. I would also like to extend my appreciation for the financial support that CIDE provided for the conference as well as the personal encouragement of its Director General, Sergio López Ayllón. Jorge Olmos Camarillo provided research assistance and Cirenia Hernández Romero invaluable logistic support. Finally, I wish to thank the editors of the International Journal of Constitutional Law, who published material from Chapter 5 in Volume 18, Issue 1, 2020.