

The 'Ulama in Contemporary Pakistan

In this book, Mashal Saif explores how contemporary 'ulama, the guardians of religious knowledge and law, engage with the world's most populated Islamic nation-state: Pakistan. In mapping these engagements, she weds rigorous textual analysis with fieldwork and offers insight into some of the most significant and politically charged issues in recent Pakistani history. These include debates over the rights of women; the country's notorious blasphemy laws; the legitimacy of religiously mandated insurrection against the state; sectarian violence; and the place of Shi'as within the Sunni majority nation. These diverse case studies are knit together by the project's most significant contribution: a theoretical framework that understands the 'ulama's complex engagements with their state as a process of both contestation and cultivation of the Islamic Republic by citizen-subjects. This framework provides a new way of assessing state-'ulama relations not only in contemporary Pakistan but also across the Muslim world.

Mashal Saif is an assistant professor in the Department of Philosophy and Religion at Clemson University, South Carolina.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-83973-0 — The 'Ulama in Contemporary Pakistan
Mashal Saif
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

The 'Ulama in Contemporary Pakistan

Contesting and Cultivating an Islamic Republic

MASHAL SAIF
Clemson University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-83973-0 — The 'Ulama in Contemporary Pakistan
Mashal Saif
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108839730

DOI: 10.1017/9781108885034

© Cambridge University Press 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-83973-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-83973-0 — The 'Ulama in Contemporary Pakistan
Mashal Saif
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For my mother, Dr. Shahla Saif

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-83973-0 — The 'Ulama in Contemporary Pakistan
Mashal Saif
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

| | |
|--|------------------|
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | <i>page</i> viii |
| <i>Note on Translation and Transliteration</i> | xii |
| Introduction | I |
| 1 The Clerics and the Council: Contesting Religious Authority | 37 |
| 2 Sovereignty between God and the State: Debating Muhammad's Honor and Blasphemy | 76 |
| 3 Questioning State Identity and Legitimacy: A Case for Religiously Mandated Insurrection | 138 |
| 4 Seeking Security: Shi'a 'Ulama and State Formation | 186 |
| 5 Minority Aspirations and the State: Shi'a Political Theology | 236 |
| Conclusion | 279 |
| <i>Bibliography</i> | 291 |
| <i>Index</i> | 310 |

Acknowledgments

Without my mentors – graduate and undergraduate – I would never have become interested in Religious Studies, let alone Pakistani *'ulama*. My interest in South Asian Islam was sparked by a class with Jim Laine at Macalester. It is a testimony to his inspirational teaching and mentorship that I pursued a career in Religious Studies. At Macalester I also studied with Paula Cooley, Ahmad Atif Ahmad, Khaldoun Samman and Alexandra Cuffel – all of whom cemented my interest in the study of Islam. I remain grateful to Jim, Paula and Macalester's Religious Studies Department for their continued support.

My graduate experience at Duke was defined by the ever-present figure of my adviser, Dr. Ebrahim Moosa. Dr. Moosa's magisterial scholarship needs no introduction. His brilliance as a scholar is matched by his excellence as a mentor. He taught me everything from the theory and the framework that informs this book to the languages and the specifics of the *'ulama* tradition in Pakistan. Without him this book would not exist. I am privileged to have Bruce Lawrence as a mentor. His knowledge of Islam knows no bounds; his tutelage has made me a better scholar and enriched this work in more ways than I can enumerate. I was similarly lucky to have studied with Carl Ernst, a towering figure in the study of South Asian Islam. Leela Prasad was a constant source of warm mentorship and support as I thought through my interviews and the ethnographic elements of my research. Her vast experience in the anthropological study of religion in India was a source of unending insights. If not for her, the primary sources in this book would have been exclusively textual. I cannot thank her enough. Kalman Bland taught me far more than he possibly realized; he modeled meticulous writing, careful

Acknowledgments

ix

questioning and using theory in ways that don't obfuscate. While he is not still with us, I hope that he would have thought that this book does his mentorship justice.

I am immensely grateful to the *'ulama* who facilitated my research and allowed me into their *madrasas*, homes and lives. Among them 'Ammar Khan Nasir and Zahid ur-Rashidi deserve special mention; they and their families hosted me in their home in Gujranwala multiple times. 'Ammar Khan Nasir also provided important references to his works and others' and was always just an email away whenever I had a question. Ayatollah Najafi and everyone at Jami'a al-Muntazar modeled unparalleled generosity. Without Ayatollah Najafi's permission to use the library and to interview him and other *'ulama* at the seminary, I could not have written Chapter 4. I owe a similarly substantial debt to Khalil ur-Rahman Qadri and others affiliated with Jami'a Islamiyya. Among other guidance and assistance, Khalil ur-Rahman provided key primary sources for Chapter 2. Mufti Hanif Qureshi hosted me at his seminary and his home in Rawalpindi multiple times and shared with me his views and works which feature in Chapter 2. Raghbir Naeemi allowed me access, for over a decade, to the library and seminary premises of Jami'a Na'imiyya. He was also always open to meeting with me for informal conversation and structured interviews. Mufti 'Imran at Jami'a Na'imiyya let me observe the daily workings of the *dar al-ifta'* for months at a time and answered numerous questions over the years. I am indebted to all of these *'ulama*. I am also grateful to Muhammad Khan Sherani, Hanif Jalandhari and Siddique Hazarvi for letting me interview them. I am similarly indebted to the *'ulama* and *madrasas* who are mentioned by pseudonyms in this work.

Many non-*'ulama* interlocutors and experts also aided my research. Former Council of Islamic Ideology (CII) chairperson, Dr. Muhammad Khalid Masud allowed me to interview him several times over the years in Pakistan. He also read and commented on sections of Chapter 1 and furthered my understanding of the CII. Dr. S. M. Zaman, another former CII chairperson, was also gracious in welcoming me to his home and sharing his experience on the council. Several CII members and employees, as well as other state officials, who remain unnamed in this work, were also instrumental to aiding my research. Additionally, I benefited tremendously from the friendship and guidance of the independent scholar Zuhur ud-Din Sahib. The detailed feedback of three anonymous reviewers has also improved this book.

Research for this book has been supported by the American Academy of Religion's International Dissertation Research Grant and three North

Carolina Consortium for South Asia Studies' Travel and Research Awards. At Duke University, where this project began, my work was supported by two Arcapita Graduate Research Fellowships, a Summer Research Fellowship and a Julian Price Graduate Fellowship. At Clemson, this project has received three summers of support from the Faculty Research Development Program. A Lightsey Fellowship early into my time at Clemson also provided assistance for research in Pakistan in 2015. I am grateful to the Graduate School at Duke and my department at Clemson for funding my many conference travels. Early versions of chapters were presented at various academic venues, most notably several American Academy of Religion Annual Meetings and several Annual Conference on South Asia meetings. The questions and feedback of the audience at those panels have helped shape this book. An earlier version of Chapter 5 was published in the *Journal of Shia Islamic Studies* vol. 7, no. 1 (January 2014). I appreciate the journal permitting the reprint. And, of course, thanks to my editor Beatrice Rehl and everyone at Cambridge University Press who shepherded this work to production.

Other individuals and institutions who have enriched my work and life also deserve mention. My childhood and college friends Tayyaba Baig, Zainab Hassan, Nazia Sherazad Hamit, Ceradwen Bacon, Sid Jha and others, continue to make my life better. Yoknyam Dabale, Rubaina Anjum, Dave Grace, Michaela Margida and Oshri Hakak were a source of joy in graduate school and remain so. I am grateful for Ali Altaf Mian's abiding friendship and encouragement as well as his unparalleled generosity in sharing a wealth of information about South Asian *'ulama* and critical theory. I am especially thankful to SherAli Tareen for his friendship and for charting a path that I could follow, while guiding me along the way.

Our thriving new Religious Studies program at Clemson has been an excellent academic home. Steven Grosby, my senior colleague in Religion, showed an abiding interest in my research from the moment I arrived on campus for an interview. Over the years Steven has modeled not just academic excellence, but also exemplary teaching and mentorship in addition to unparalleled decency, integrity and generosity. Ben White has been an excellent director of the Religious Studies program and a model senior colleague. I am immensely grateful for Elizabeth Jemison's camaraderie and support; I could not have asked for a better colleague. Among the philosophers in our Department of Philosophy and Religion, Todd May deserves special mention. He has exceeded every expectation of mine in terms of friendship, support and encouragement from a senior colleague.

Acknowledgments

xi

My family – immediate and extended – has assisted my research in numerous ways. My father, Saifuddin, drove me to, and facilitated my entry into, many of the *madradas* that feature in this work. My late grandfather, Kamal Matinuddin, helped me take one of my earliest steps into a seminary. He accompanied me to Jami'a Haqqaniyya, a seminary he had already visited multiple times for his own research. Given their familiarity with him, several of the seminary's leading '*ulama* greeted us with special generosity and warmth and took the time to answer my questions. My grandparents' home in Rawalpindi was always open to me. That home base and access to my grandparents' car enabled me to conduct the Rawalpindi-Islamabad segment of my research.

Finally, my foremost gratitude is to my mother, Shahla Saif. She retired early from her career in medicine in Pakistan and practically moved to the United States to care for my children so I could devote my energies to this book. No words are enough to thank her. My father also helped with childcare during his visits to the United States. My in-laws, Susie and Cary Wood also graciously and frequently assumed childcare duties.

My partner, Jeremy, has been reading and commenting on sections of this work from the time that they were drafts in a dissertation. Over the years, he has helped with everything from content and editing to all-things technological. Most recently he helped with indexing. I am grateful for this assistance, but much more so for the joy that Jeremy, and our children, Inaya and Layla bring.

Note on Translation and Transliteration

All conversations with the *'ulama* were conducted in Urdu, unless indicated otherwise. The same is true for all video and audio recordings of the *'ulama* quoted in this work. The translations into English are mine.

To aid readability, I do not use diacritics. The exceptions are ‘ and ’ to indicate *ayn* and *hamza* respectively. I have also eschewed the use of ’ when the *hamza* occurs at the end of the word. I sometimes pluralize foreign words using English norms instead of Urdu and Arabic ones (for example, *madrasas* instead of *madaris*).

I largely follow the IJMES transliteration style. Some exceptions include proper nouns (the names of people, publishing houses, etc.), that are spelled in English in the original text. For example, Taqi Usmani, *Islam and Modernism*, trans. Shakir Rizwani (Lahore: Idara-e-Islamiyat, 1995). In this instance, Usmani is not spelled ‘Uthmani. I also make an exception for English words used in Urdu texts; I spell the English words using their conventional English spelling. Urdu and Arabic names that are commonly spelled in English by the named individuals and entities themselves are also not transliterated. For example, Pervez Musharraf, Muhammad Khalid Masud, Syed Afzal Haider, Quaid-i-Azam University, Federal Shariat Court, etc. I also make exceptions for some words and names (especially those in Urdu), which I spell in ways that best reflect their pronunciation in Pakistan. When quoting English-language works, I preserve the spelling and transliteration used by those works.