Contents

Preface xi
Acknowledgements xiii
Table of Cases xv
List of Abbreviations and Acronyms xx

1 Introduction 1
  1.1 Scope of Research 7
  1.2 Sources and Research Method 12
  1.3 Book Structure 14

PART I THE LEGAL FOUNDATIONS OF THE INTERNATIONAL RESPONSIBILITY OF THE EUROPEAN UNION 17

2 The Governing Law 21
  2.1 Introduction 21
  2.2 The ILC Framework – (In)sufficient? 22
  2.3 Attribution versus Allocation of International Responsibility 25
    2.3.1 The Purpose and Subject Matter of the Rules of Attribution 26
    2.3.2 Rules of Attribution Apply Only to Separate Legal Persons 27
    2.3.3 Rules of Attribution Do Not Govern Allocation of Responsibility 29
    2.3.4 The Notion of Allocation of International Responsibility 30
  2.4 The Rules of Organization 34
  2.5 Conclusion 38
Contents

3 Independent Responsibility of the EU and Its Member States 39
  3.1 Introduction 39
  3.2 Competence-based International Responsibility 39
  3.3 The Non-transferability of International Obligations 43
    3.3.1 The Rule of Non-circumvention 44
    3.3.2 The ECtHR Case Law 46
    3.3.3 The ECT Case Law 51
    3.3.4 Binding Decisions of an Organization 53
    3.3.5 The Principle of Joint Obligations 57
    3.3.6 The WTO Case Law 58
    3.3.7 The CJEU Case Law 62
  3.4 The Principle of Independent Responsibility 66
  3.5 Conclusion 68

4 The Concept of an Organ and Agent of the EU 70
  4.1 Introduction 70
  4.2 ILC Doctrine 72
    4.2.1 The ARSIWA Framework 72
    4.2.2 The ARIO Framework 75
  4.3 A De Facto Organ of the EU 79
  4.4 Conclusion 90

PART II FUNCTIONAL INTERNATIONAL RESPONSIBILITY 93

5 The Nature of Remedies in International Economic Law 95
  5.1 Introduction 95
  5.2 Remedies in International Law 96
    5.2.1 The System of Remedies in International Law 97
    5.2.2 The Function of Remedies in International Law 99
    5.2.3 The Liability Rule in International Economic Law 102
  5.3 Remedies under the WTO Regime 108
    5.3.1 The WTO’s Liability Rule 108
    5.3.2 Compliance 110
    5.3.3 Retaliation 111
    5.3.4 The Primacy of Compliance over Retaliation 113
  5.4 Remedies under Investment Treaties 116
  5.5 Conclusion 120

6 Identification of the Proper Respondents 121
  6.1 Introduction 121
Contents

6.2 Mapping the Normative Framework 123
6.3 The Positive Solution Test in WTO Disputes 126
   6.3.1 Efficient Breach 129
   6.3.2 Limitation to Necessary Persons 129
   6.3.3 Limitation to Necessary Measures 134
   6.3.4 Timing of the Determination of the Proper Respondent 137
   6.3.5 Procedural Techniques 138
6.4 The Proximate Cause in Investment Disputes 141
   6.4.1 The Concept of Proximate Cause 142
   6.4.2 Proximate Cause in Practice 147
      6.4.2.1 First Category: Binding EU Decisions 147
      6.4.2.2 Second Category: Authorized by the EU 150
      6.4.2.3 Third Category: Required by EU Law 152
   6.4.3 Regulatory Compliance Claims 156
6.5 Conclusion 158
7 The Optimal Respondent 160
   7.1 Introduction 160
   7.2 The EU as the Optimal Respondent in WTO Disputes 161
      7.2.1 The EU’s Exclusive Competence in Trade 164
      7.2.2 The Internal Interdependency under Mixed Agreements 167
      7.2.3 The WTO as a Mixed Treaty 168
      7.2.4 The EU–Member StatesBloc 170
      7.2.5 The Duty of Cooperation 172
   7.3 Member States as the Primary Respondent in Investment Disputes 175
      7.3.1 Fair and Equitable Treatment 177
      7.3.2 Denial of Justice and Due Process 179
      7.3.3 Arbitrary and Discriminatory Treatment 181
      7.3.4 Legitimate Expectations 182
      7.3.5 Expropriation 185
      7.3.6 Umbrella Clauses 190
   7.4 Conclusion 192
8 Multiple Respondents in WTO Dispute Settlement 194
   8.1 Introduction 194
   8.2 Correlation of Claims and Remedies 196
   8.3 Claims ‘As Such’ and Claims ‘As Applied’ 199
Table of Contents

8.4 Identification of Multiple Respondents 203
  8.4.1 Customs Disputes 206
  8.4.2 Subsidies Disputes 210
  8.4.3 Regulatory Measures 213
8.5 Conclusion 217

9 Normative Implications for the EU’s Free Trade Agreements 218
  9.1 Introduction 218
  9.2 Application of the Normative Findings to the New-generation FTAs 220
    9.2.1 The Question of Mixity 220
    9.2.2 Application of the Normative Findings to Trade Disputes 223
    9.2.3 Application of the Normative Findings to Investment Disputes 225
  9.3 The Mechanism for the Determination of Respondents under the New-generation FTAs 226
  9.4 Procedural Safeguards under the New-generation FTAs 229
    9.4.1 Safeguards against Inadmissibility Defence 230
    9.4.2 Safeguards against Micula-type Situations 231
    9.4.3 The Internal Code of Conduct under Regulation No. 914/2014 237
  9.5 Conclusion 243

10 Conclusions 245

Bibliography 251
Index 262