



## *Contesting Pluralism(s)*

*Contesting Pluralism(s)* challenges a widespread tendency to limit studies of Turkish – and Muslim – politics to “Islamist vs. secularist” or “Islam vs. democracy” debates. Instead, Nora Fisher-Onar’s innovative argument centers on coalitions for and against pluralism. Retelling Turkey’s story from the late Ottoman Empire to the present as a tale of pluralizing vs. anti-pluralist coalitions, this book offers an alternative explanation for major outcomes from elections and coup d’états to revolutions. Here, cross-camp alliances pit those who are willing to coexist with “Other(s)” against those who champion a unitary, national project in which everyone speaks, believes, looks or loves as they do. Drawing on a rich array of primary and secondary data, Fisher-Onar introduces an analytical framework for capturing causal complexity in political contestation. This study rejects Orientalist exceptionalism, rereading the relationship between political religion, pluralism, and populism via a framework that travels across and beyond the Muslim-majority world.

NORA FISHER-ONAR is Associate Professor of International Studies at the University of San Francisco. Her research combines tools from comparative politics, international relations, and area studies to rethink the relationship between religion, politics, and pluralism, challenging Orientalism in how we read Muslim-majority states and societies. Previous publications include *Istanbul: Living with Difference in a Global City* (2018).

# Contesting Pluralism(s)

Islamism, Liberalism, and Nationalism  
in Turkey and Beyond

NORA FISHER-ONAR  
*University of San Francisco*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-108-83870-2 — Contesting Pluralism(s)  
Nora Fisher-Onar  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,  
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of  
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108838702](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108838702)

DOI: 10.1017/9781108976183

© Nora Fisher-Onar 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions  
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take  
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781108976183

First published 2025

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Fisher, Nora, 1976- author.

Title: Contesting pluralism(s) : Islamism, liberalism and nationalism in Turkey and  
beyond / Nora Fisher-Onar, University of San Francisco.

Other titles: Islamism, liberalism and nationalism in Turkey and beyond

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press,  
2024. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2024022034 (print) | LCCN 2024022035 (ebook) | ISBN  
9781108838702 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108972253 (paperback) | ISBN  
9781108976183 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Nationalism–Turkey–History. | Liberalism–Turkey–History. | Islam and  
politics–Turkey–History. | Pluralism. | Turkey–Politics and government.

Classification: LCC DR471 .F57 2024 (print) | LCC DR471 (ebook) | DDC 320.509561–  
dc23/eng/20240712

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2024022034>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2024022035>

ISBN 978-1-108-83870-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence  
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this  
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will  
remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	viii
<i>Note on Spelling</i>	xii
By Way of Introduction: Capturing Complexity, Contesting Pluralism	1
<b>Part I Theory</b>	
1 Hard Binaries and Their Discontents	5
2 Pluralizers and Anti-Pluralists: An Alternative Key to Politics in Turkey and Beyond	30
<b>Part II History</b>	
3 Long Nineteenth Century: From Ottoman Universalism to Turkish Nationalism	61
4 Short Twentieth Century: Between Embedded Liberalism and Ethno(-Religious) Nationalism	95
<b>Part III Twenty-First Century</b>	
5 EU-niversalism, the Islamo-Liberal Moment, and Ethno-Nationalist Backlash	141
6 Neo-Ottomanism: From Pluralizing Promise to Religious Populism	179
7 Turkey Turns: Of Clashing Islamists, Contesting Kurds, and a Coup Attempt	218

vi	<i>Contents</i>
8 Turkish-Islamist Synthesis 2.0 and the New Pluralizers	254
Conclusion: Learning from Turkey’s Transformation: Lessons for (Comparative) Area Studies, Politics, and International Relations	300
<i>Index</i>	323

Figures

2.1 Pluralizing/anti-pluralist orientations vis-à-vis public religion	page 38
2.2 The causal interplay of ideational, agential, and structural parameters in a political system	47
3.1 Lithograph celebrating the Ottoman constitution	88
3.2 Long nineteenth-century (anti-)pluralist alignments	94
4.1 Populist center-right leader Adnan Menderes engaging with mesmerized crowds (Alamy)	115
4.2 Short twentieth-century (anti-)pluralist alignments	135
5.1 (Anti-)pluralist alignments, 2000s	177
6.1 (Anti-)pluralist alignments, 2010–2013	216
7.1 A larger-than-life image of President Recep Tayyip Erdoğan flies from a highway, evoking the populist leader’s developmentalist and law and order synthesis that he fused with Islamist and neo-Ottoman motifs (Shutterstock)	230
7.2 (Anti-)pluralist alignments, 2013–2016	252
8.1 Graffiti from a derelict structure in a central Istanbul neighborhood featuring an anguished woman (Alamy)	280
8.2 Opposition alliance leaders gathered in the build-up to May 2023 elections (Alamy)	294
8.3 (Anti-)pluralist alignments, 2016–2023	299
C.1 Interdisciplinary learning from Turkey’s transformation	313
C.2 How to comparatively map cases using a complexity approach	319

## *Acknowledgments*

This book spans two centuries redolent with drama, including the transformation – these twenty plus years – of Turkey, its region(s), and the world. Writing such a book, you become aware of accretions and rupture. You sense history percolating in patterned ways, even as fissures – subtle and dramatic – transform all that you (think you) know. If this dynamic describes states and societies, writing about it has also been a journey of continuity and rupture.

It has been eight years or so since I properly began producing this monograph. It has evolved against a backdrop blurred by change. We traversed continents, countries, and states, taking on a dozen jobs and as many homes. Throughout this, at times, painful process, mentors and colleagues, friends, and family have been my vital source of continuity. I am indebted, in fact, to so many people that I cannot possibly do justice to all the names and ways. As such, the acknowledgments below are limited to those who were directly engaged in the preparation of this manuscript or components thereof or provided support that significantly advanced this particular project.

First and foremost, I am indebted to the incredibly kind and brilliant souls who took on the entire text at various stages in its development: Şebnem Gümüşçü, Soli Özel, and Halil İbrahim Yenigün. Hearty thanks also to my tireless and thoughtful research assistants, Sinan Ekim and Brian Anderson. I cannot sufficiently express, moreover, my most sincere gratitude to the anonymous reviewers for their thorough and constructive comments.

I am further indebted to those who shared precious time and insights on one or several chapters: Karabekir Akkoyunlu, Ayça Alemdaroğlu, Zeynep Atalay, Nicholas Danforth, Seda Domaniç, Berk Esen, Pelin Ayan Musil, Ahmet Erdi Öztürk, Christine Philliou, Orçun Selçuk, Matthew Specter, Alp Eren Topal, and Jeremy Walton.

I have strived to do justice to the rich feedback thus received. Any remaining problems are mine alone.

## *Acknowledgments*

ix

More holistically, there would be no book – or me in current form – if it weren't for Sabri Sayarı and Charles King, who have nurtured my scholarship ever since I took their classes as a Georgetown undergrad. Across the Atlantic, Kalypso Nicolaïdis – advisor extraordinaire and treasured friend – parts of this book were produced under your watch. But all of it is inspired by your matchless model of interdisciplinary creativity and interpersonal generosity. Also reverberating in my head since Oxford days are the eloquent voices of Othon Anastasakis, Dimitar Bechev, Ayşe Kadioğlu, and Kerem Öktem.

Substantial primary research for the book's contemporary section was conducted as an early career scholar at Sabancı and Bahçeşehir universities in Istanbul. It was a joy to work with and/or learn from Meltem Müftüler-Baç, Selma Bardakçı, Başak Kale Lack, Fuat Keyman, Hande Parker, Meriç and Neslihan Özgüneş, Kristen Biehl Öztuzcu, Susan C. Pearce, Özdem Sanberk, Joshua Walker, and Gündüz Vassaf, among many valued interlocutors. During this period, a generative conversation with James Liu and Mark Woodward laid the groundwork for this book's complexity-inspired framework. I am also grateful to the German Marshall Fund (GMF) – especially Ian Lesser, Corinna Horst, Özgür Ünlühisarcıklı, and Ceylan Akman Canbilek – for their support during and long after my 2012–2013 Ronald Asmus, nonresidential fellowship – which helped to conduct many of the 100+ interviews that inform this work. I am humbled, moreover, by all those I interviewed for so thoughtfully opening windows onto their worlds.

Leaving Turkey was an anguished decision. But it would not have been possible without the National Humanities Center. During my 2013–2014 residency, NHC fellows and members of the broader Duke/UNC Chapel Hill communities – especially Cemil Aydın, Banu Gökarişel, Erdağ Gökner, Enseng Ho, and Sarah Shields – graciously taught me the ropes of North American academe, as did Amitav Acharya and Rudra Sil in ensuing years.

The following year, the Transatlantic Academy of the GMF tasked me with making sense of “Religion and the Liberal Order” – and Turkey's role therein. Research and relationships thus generated permeate this book. Enormously kind Stephen Szabo and Michael Barnett supported my efforts during and after the fellowship. Clifford Bob and Lucian Leustean engaged generously, as did fellow fellows from the wider TA orbit, especially Şeyla Benhabib, Janice Stein, and Sarah Wolff. A shout out also to Ted Reinert for his superb editorial contributions.



Subsequently, George Washington University's Institute for Middle East Studies (IMES) and the Project on Middle East Political Science (POMEPS) and their respective gurus Nathan Brown and Marc Lynch provided calm waters to carry on producing. Lauren Baker's editorial eye – and camaraderie – infuse this book's treatment of Istanbul. Many thanks also to the Brookings Institution and Kemal Kirişçi for supporting my preliminary work on populism, which figures so centrally in the book's argument.

Presenting the first, (semi-)baked version of the project at a 2018 Southeast Regional Middle East and Islamic Studies Society (SERMEISS) retreat was transformative: Curtis Ryan, Krista Wiegand, and Dylan Baun set me on the path that led to a book contract. I will always be grateful, moreover, for the engagement of Coastal Carolina University colleagues like Pamela Martin, Suheir Daoud, Miriam Dekanozishvili, and Richard Kilroy.

At the University of San Francisco, these pages have been hammered out at every possible writing event convened by the Center for Research, Artistic and Scholarly Excellence (CRASE) and the Dean of Arts & Sciences – including two magical, multiday retreats. Ken Yoshioka of Education Technology Services kindly helped to format the figures. My department stoically bore with me through the push to publication despite pandemic and associated delays. A very sincere thank you, as such, to Brian Dowd-Urbe, Ilaria Giglioli, Quynh Pham, John Zarobell, and Dana Zartner. I also thank Sadia Saeed for the delightful commiseration regarding the substance and craft of writing.

Ozan Ceyhan of *Muteferrika*, an invaluable online Ottoman Turkish research portal, was knowledgeable and generous in helping to find historical images.

This book has benefited from the feedback of insightful colleagues and audiences at the American Political Science Association (APSA); European Union Studies Association (EUSA); International Studies Association (ISA); Middle East Studies Association (MESA); Stanford University's Center on Democracy, Development and the Rule of Law (CDDRL) and its Abbasi Program in Islamic Studies; Southeast European Studies at Oxford (SEESOX); and UNC Chapel Hill's Center for Slavic, Eurasian, and East European Studies.

Finally, I could not have begun, much less completed, this process without my beloved family. Alan Fisher left us in 2017. But his love of

*Acknowledgments*

xi

words and the (post-)Ottoman world mark every page. So does *rahmetli* Ataman Onar's supple sense of modern Turkey's swirling energies. I have been buoyed through many stages of this process by the bottomless strength and active help of Patricia Fisher and Nuran Abdullah. For their respective ways of showing support throughout the writing process, I thank Aide Abdullah, Çağlayan Erendag, Çağla Inselbag, and Sedef Onar. Kaya and Aksel – my sweet babies who are babies no more – finally you will meet a version of mom who is not working on this book!

Last but actually first, I thank Levent. Your labor and wisdom pulsate through these pages and my ability to produce them. Prince among men, my island of hope in a stormy sea, this book is dedicated to you and the bedrock that is our love.

## *Note on Spelling*

When an author has used non-Turkish letters to render their name in a publication, I respect their preference in citations. Otherwise, I use modern Turkish letters to render people and places throughout the manuscript.

In 2022, the Turkish government asked the United Nations and other international organizations to officially change the country's name to "Türkiye," and this request was honored. Since the vast majority of this book's coverage regards the pre-2022 period, I have for the sake of stylistic consistency, retained the conventional English-language rendition of the country's name as "Turkey."