Index

9/11. See terrorist attacks of 11 September 2001
abuse of rights doctrine. See ECHR Article 17;
ICCPR, Article 5
abuse of rights, influence on ICCPR drafting,
67, 72
African Charter for Human and Peoples’ Rights
(ACHPR), 114
African Commission on Human and Peoples’
Rights (ACommHPR), 115
African Commission on Human Rights
(ACHR), 114
anti-Semitism
analogy with Islamophobia, 149
jurisprudence of HRCttee, 94
resistance to equating with Islamophobia, 151
Article 19 (NGO), 29, 139
Bhatti, Shahbaz (assassination of), 166
blasphemy laws
abolition in England and Wales, 145
criticism of, 57
decline and abolition in the West, 145, 183
defamation of religion as attempt to reintrodu-
cer, 146
position of EU institutions on, 146
position of HRCttee on, 146
position of UN Special Rapporteurs on, 147
Camden Principles on Freedom of Expression and
Equality, 21
causation
between hate advocacy and harms, 31, 36, 57,
58, 77
causality standards applied by EctHR, 120
differing perceptions between Islamic and
Western states, 175
CERD. See UN Committee on the Elimination of
Racial Discrimination
cold war. See also travaux preparatoires
collective rights. See group rights
communitarian approach to human rights. See
human rights, communitarian approach to
complementary standards to Article 20(2) of
ICCPR
Ad Hoc Committee on the Elaboration of
Complementary Standards, 128, 134, 138, 182
arguments in favour of, 134
NGOs, position on, 139, 171
opposition to, 136
UN Special Rapporteurs, position on, 138
critical race theorists, views of, 32
cultural diversity. See multiculturalism
cyber hate, 3, 4
Danish cartoon controversy, 4, 129, 153
Declaration on the Elimination of Religions
Intolerance, 141
defamation of Islam, 129, 183
defamation of religion, 133. See also complemen-
tary standards to Article 20(2) of ICCPR
annual resolutions at UN, 148–149
conceptual criticism, 132–133
correlation with incitement, 56–57, 147
freedom of expression, relationship with,
130–132
position of NGOs, 139, 171
demonization of minority groups. See stigmatiza-
tion of minority groups
Doudou Diène, 151, 157. See also UN Special
Rapporteurs
egalitarian approach to human rights. See human
rights, egalitarian approach to
emotive component of norm against incitement, 15
as controversial issue during ICCPR drafting, 73–80
definitional complexities, 21–24
relativist challenge, 24–25, 185
equality
and individualist conception of rights, 47
formal conception of, 43, 181
substantive conception of, 43, 60, 181
European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR)
Art. 9, 119
Arts 10 & 17, 115–116
lack of an incitement clause, 114
European Court of Human Rights (ECHR)
criticisms of hate speech jurisprudence, 119–120,
123–124
margin of appreciation, application of, 25,
117–119, 121–122, 144
protection of morals, approach to, 25, 118
recognition of hate speech against groups, 121
restrictions on hate speech, 121
the right to protection of religious feelings, 118
fascist propaganda, 14, 62, 182
free marketplace of ideas. See marketplace of ideas
freedom of expression
and communitarian approach to rights, 49
and individualist approach to rights, 47
egalitarian interpretation of, 39, 41–43, 44, 60, 73–
87, 126, 181, 185
libertarian interpretation of, 39–40, 60, 72, 126,
171, 185
rationalization for restriction of, 43
relationship with freedom of religion, 140
relationship with right to protection from
incitement, 38
silencing effect, 41–43, 180
freedom of religion
and the right to be protected from incitement, 53
attempts to expand normative scope, 142
international standards on, 141–142
relationship between state and religion, 54, 146
relationship with freedom of expression, 140
tension between expressive and collective iden-
tity, 53
unique characteristics of, 54

Index

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-83756-9 — The Right to Protection from Incitement to Hatred
Mona Elbahtimy
Index

© in this web service Cambridge University Press
www.cambridge.org

Cambridge

Cambridge

Index

207

as controversial issue during ICCPR drafting, 73–80
definitional complexities, 21–24
relativist challenge, 24–25, 185
equality
and individualist conception of rights, 47
formal conception of, 43, 181
substantive conception of, 43, 60, 181
European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR)
Art. 9, 119
Arts 10 & 17, 115–116
lack of an incitement clause, 114
European Court of Human Rights (ECHR)
criticisms of hate speech jurisprudence, 119–120,
123–124
margin of appreciation, application of, 25,
117–119, 121–122, 144
protection of morals, approach to, 25, 118
recognition of hate speech against groups, 121
restrictions on hate speech, 121
the right to protection of religious feelings, 118
fascist propaganda, 14, 62, 182
free marketplace of ideas. See marketplace of ideas
freedom of expression
and communitarian approach to rights, 49
and individualist approach to rights, 47
egalitarian interpretation of, 39, 41–43, 44, 60, 73–
87, 126, 181, 185
libertarian interpretation of, 39–40, 60, 72, 126,
171, 185
rationalization for restriction of, 43
relationship with freedom of religion, 140
relationship with right to protection from
incitement, 38
silencing effect, 41–43, 180
freedom of religion
and the right to be protected from incitement, 53
attempts to expand normative scope, 142
international standards on, 141–142
relationship between state and religion, 54, 146
relationship with freedom of expression, 140
tension between expressive and collective iden-
tity, 53
unique characteristics of, 54
genocide, 66
links to hate speech, 14
modern instances of, 14
globalization
global hate speech crises, 4–5
impact on incitement to hatred, 1–5
information and communication technolo-
gies, 3–4
group hatred, 50
group identity component of norm prohibiting
incitement, 15
group libel laws, 49–51
criticism of, 47
guidance to states
technical and procedural, 184. See also Rabat
Plan of Action
harm
likelihood of, 32, 101, 188
proof of, for enforcing legal rights, 33–34
hate
definition of, 21–22
hate crime, 23
hate speech
links to human rights violations, 14
standard-setting efforts, 60, 128, 140–146,
170–175, 182–184
hate speech regulation
debate over, 4
declaratory nature of, 42
legal moralism in, 107, 185
maximalist approach towards, 25, 31, 36–37, 38,
41–48, 43–44, 49
minimalist approach towards, 25–26, 29, 35–36,
37–39, 43–44
silencing of, 41–43
hostility. See also incitement to hostility
definitional challenges, 22–24
human rights
communitarian approach to, 46, 50, 87, 181
egalitarian approach to, 41, 43–44, 60
Human Rights Commission
ninth session of, 82
human rights violations
as background to ICCPR negotiations, 62
ICCPR
Article 14, 102
Article 18, 53
Article 27, 102
Article 40, 92
Article 5, 9, 10
Article 6, 102
Articles 7 & 8, 9
First Optional Protocol of, 92
influence of Second World War on, 66, 87, 182
ICCPR Article 19
and group libel laws, 52
drafting history, 67–68, 70, 80
in international human rights jurisprudence,
93–98
relationship with Article 20(2), 43–44, 86
Index

ICCPR Article 20(2) critiques of, 6–7 polarized debates on, 173–176 relationship with Article 19, 43–44, 86 reservations to, 86 states’ obligations, mandatory nature of, 9 unique characteristics of, 6 ICERD See International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination identity politics, 2 IHRL (International Human Rights Law) factors inhibiting developing countries from influencing, 161 ideological and philosophical foundations of, 159 language used to codify human rights, 90 perceived bias towards Western states, 159 incitement component of norm prohibiting incitement, 15 incitement to discrimination, 22 incitement to hatred. See also incitement to racial hatred; incitement to religious hatred contextual test for proving, 35 definitional challenges of, 32 dropped from consideration by Ad Hoc Committee, 140 incitement against religious ideas and religious adherents distinguished, 57 legal threshold of, 21, 32, 39, 53–56, 59, 101, 169, 184 incitement to hostility, 22–23 victims of, 52 incitement to racial hatred legal offence in England and Wales, 144 incitement to religious hatred conflation with defamation of religion, 57 incitement against religious ideas and religious adherents distinguished, 143–144 legal offence in England and Wales, 155 regulatory challenges, 54–56 incitement to violence, 23 individualist approach to rights, 46–48, 51, 52, 57. See also libertarian approach to rights information and communication technologies See cyber hate Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, 115 Inter-American Court on Human Rights, 115 International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD), 5, 91, 149 Article 1, 152 Article 2, 110

Article 4, 15, 94, 109, 110–111, 112–113, 116, 138, 157 Article 4, comparison with ICCPR Article 20(2), 152 Article 5, 152 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. See ICCPR International Refugee Organization. See Preparatory Commission for the International Refugee Organization Islamophobia, 113 analogy with anti-Semitism, 149 and anti-Muslim racism, 151 as justification for resolutions at UN on defamation of religion, 160 post-9/11 intensification of, 129, 150, 160, 173, 182 Istanbul Process, 168–170 Jahangir, Asma, 65, 132, 145. See also UN Special Rapporteurs La Rue, Frank, 148. See also UN Special Rapporteurs legal moralism. See morality label. See group libel laws libertarian approach to rights, 7–8, 26–27, 29, 39, 45, 57, 57, 174, 179, 181, See also individualist approach to rights marketplace of ideas, 40, 41, 44, 69–70 maximalist approach to hate speech regulation. See hate speech regulation, maximalist approach towards Mill, John Stuart, 26–27, 36, 39, See also Waldron, Jeremy minimalist approach to hate speech regulation. See hate speech regulation, minimalist approach towards morality. See also protection of morals legal moralism, 24, 26, 27, 31, 74, 125, See also hate speech regulation, legal moralism in moral neutrality, 26, 31 state neutrality, 40–42 multiculturalism, 1–2, 49, 160, 183 Nazi propaganda, 14, 62–64 non-governmental organizations (NGOs), 104, 162, 166–167, See also Article 19 (NGO) criticism of standard-setting efforts at UN, 122, 140 norm prohibiting incitement, five internal features of, 58–60, 87, 91, 107, 124, 125, 174. See also emotive component, group identity component, incitement component, religion component, tensions between equality and liberty rights of speakers
Index

Obama, Barack, 163, 167
Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR), 104, 133, 186–187
online hate. See cyber hate
Organization of the Islamic Conference (OIC), 129, 130, 168, 176
OIC Group in the UN, 133, 162, 167
political parties, racist and xenophobic, 2
Preparatory Commission for the International Refugee Organization, 80
procedural development. See guidance to states profiling
negative profiling of religious adherents, 140, 142, 148–149, 168, 173, 174, 183
profiling of Muslims, 150, 173
racial and religious, 2, 105, 129, 130, 135
protection of morals
approach of supranational human rights-monitoring bodies, 185
in jurisprudence of ECtHR, 25
in jurisprudence of HRCttee, 25
Rabat Plan of Action, 187–188
Race Relations Act 1976 (UK). See incitement to racial hatred, legal offence in England and Wales
racial profiling. See profiling
racio-religious intolerance, 149–150
racist hate speech
international norm prohibiting, 152
religion component of norm prohibiting incitement, 15
religious discrimination, 53
contemporary manifestations of, 135
difficulty in distinguishing from racial discrimination, 157
incitement to, 147
right to be free from, 140
religion freedom. See freedom of religion
religious hate speech
comparison with racism, 152
conflation with hate speech against religious adherents, 143
religion hatred. See incitement to religious hatred
religion incitement, right to protection from, 54, 142
religion profiling. See profiling
right to protection from incitement
collective dimension of, 45, 59
dualities of, 10
interpretation and enforcement of, 58–59
states’ obligations, 43
Second World War, 62–66, See also travaux préparatoires, See also International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), influence of Second World War on social media. See cyber hate societies
differing cultural and legal traditions, 25, 71, 88, 90, 185
Special Rapporteurs. See UN Special Rapporteurs; see also Diène, Doudou; Jahangir, Asma; La Rue, Frank
standard-setting. See hate speech, standard-setting efforts
stigmatization of minority groups, 2, 160
supranational monitoring and adjudicatory bodies, 90
critique of hate speech jurisprudence, 127, 179
tensions between equality and liberty rights of speakers, 15
terrorist attacks of 11 September 2001, 2, 129
traux préparatoires of ICCPR Article 20(2)
cold war-related conflict in debates, 66, 88
four-power amendment, 82–84
nine-power amendment, 83–84
sixteen-power amendment, 84–86
Western states’ position, 87
UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD)
comparison of approach to racist hate speech with HRCttee’s approach, 113–114
concluding observations, 112–113
General Recommendation No. 15, 111–112, 149
General Recommendation No. 35, 35, 111–112,
113, 132, 135
individual communications on racist hate speech, 109–112
reluctance to sufficiently address religious hatred, 113
UN High Commissioner for Human Rights. See Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR)
UN Human Rights Committee (HRCttee), 13, 134
concluding observations on Article 20(2), 104–108
criticisms of hate speech jurisprudence, 106–109
General Comments, 102–104
holocaust denial case, 94–95
individual communications on Article 20(2), 92–102
mandate, 92
UN Human Rights Council (HRC), 128, 136, 148, 162–167

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org
Index

UN Resolution 16/18 (on defamation of religion), 168, 169–170, 176
UN Resolutions on defamation of religion, submitted by OIC, 128–133
UN Special Rapporteurs, 22, 104, 105, 132–133, 140, 142–143, 151, 171, 188
Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), 5–6, 9, 71
USA. See also Obama, Barack
policy towards HRC, 163
position on resolutions on defamation of religion, 164
role in suspension of resolutions on defamation of religion, 164–166
stance on prohibition of hate propaganda, 69
victim status. See incitement to hostility
violence. See incitement to violence
vulnerability of target groups, 35, 49–50
Waldron, Jeremy, 37, 51, 56, See also Mill, John Stuart
World Jewish Congress, 81