

## Index

- 9/11. *See* terrorist attacks of 11 September 2011
- abuse of rights doctrine. *See* ECHR Article 17; ICCPR, Article 5
- abuse of rights, influence on ICCPR drafting, 67, 72
- African Charter for Human and Peoples' Rights (ACHPR), 114
- African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (ACCommHR), 115
- African group (at the UN), 134
- American Convention on Human Rights (ACHR), 114
- anti-Semitism
- analogy with Islamophobia, 149
  - jurisprudence of HRCttee, 94
  - resistance to equating with Islamophobia, 151
- Article 19 (NGO), 29, 139
- Bhatti, Shahbaz (assassination of), 166
- blasphemy laws
- abolition in England and Wales, 145
  - criticism of, 57
  - decline and abolition in the West, 145, 183
  - defamation of religion as attempt to reintroduce, 146
  - position of EU institutions on, 146
  - position of HRCttee on, 146
  - position of UN Special Rapporteurs on, 147
- Camden Principles on Freedom of Expression and Equality, 21
- causation
- between hate advocacy and harms, 31, 36, 57, 58, 77
  - causality standards applied by EctHR, 120
  - differing perceptions between Islamic and Western states, 175
- CERD. *See* UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
- cold war. *See also* travaux préparatoires
- collective rights. *See* group rights
- communitarian approach to human rights. *See* human rights, communitarian approach to
- complementary standards to Article 20(2) of ICCPR
- Ad Hoc Committee on the Elaboration of Complementary Standards, 128, 134, 138, 182
  - arguments in favour of, 134
  - NGOs, position on, 139, 171
  - opposition to, 136
  - UN Special Rapporteurs, position on, 138
- critical race theorists, views of, 30
- cultural diversity. *See* multiculturalism
- cyber hate, 3, 4
- Danish cartoon controversy, 4, 129, 153
- Declaration on the Elimination of Religious Intolerance, 141
- defamation of Islam, 129, 183
- defamation of religion, 133. *See also* complementary standards to Article 20(2) of ICCPR
- annual resolutions at UN, 148–149
  - conceptual criticism, 132–133
  - correlation with incitement, 56–57, 147
  - freedom of expression, relationship with, 130–132
  - position of NGOs, 139, 171
- demonization of minority groups. *See* stigmatization of minority groups
- Doudou Diène, 151, 157. *See also* UN Special Rapporteurs
- egalitarian approach to human rights. *See* human rights, egalitarian approach to
- emotive component of norm against incitement*, 15

- as controversial issue during ICCPR drafting, 73–80
- definitional complexities, 21–24
- relativist challenge, 24–25, 185
- equality
  - and individualist conception of rights, 47
  - formal conception of, 43, 181
  - substantive conception of, 43, 60, 181
- European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR)
  - Art. 9, 119
  - Arts 10 & 17, 115–116
  - lack of an incitement clause, 114
- European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR)
  - criticisms of hate speech jurisprudence, 119–120, 123–124
  - margin of appreciation, application of, 25, 117–119, 121–122, 144
  - protection of morals, approach to, 25, 118
  - recognition of hate speech against groups, 121
  - restrictions on hate speech, 121
  - the right to protection of religious feelings, 118
- fascist propaganda, 14, 62, 182
- free marketplace of ideas. *See* marketplace of ideas
- freedom of expression
  - and communitarian approach to rights, 49
  - and individualist approach to rights, 47
  - egalitarian interpretation of, 39, 41, 43, 44, 60, 73, 87, 126, 181, 185
  - libertarian interpretation of, 39–40, 60, 72, 126, 171, 185
  - rationale for restriction of, 43
  - relationship with freedom of religion, 140
  - relationship with right to protection from incitement, 38
  - silencing effect, 41–43, 180
- freedom of religion
  - and the right to be protected from incitement, 53
  - attempts to expand normative scope, 142
  - international standards on, 141–142
  - relationship between state and religion, 54, 146
  - relationship with freedom of expression, 140
  - tension between expressive and collective identity, 53
  - unique characteristics of, 54
- genocide, 66
  - links to hate speech, 14
  - modern instances of, 14
- globalization
  - global hate speech crises, 4–5
  - impact on incitement to hatred, 1–5
  - information and communication technologies, 3–4
- group hatred, 50
- group identity component of norm prohibiting incitement*, 15
- group libel laws, 49–51
  - criticism of, 47
- guidance to states
  - technical and procedural, 184. *See also* Rabat Plan of Action
- harm
  - likelihood of, 32, 101, 188
  - proof of, for enforcing legal rights, 33–34
- hate
  - definition of, 21–22
- hate crime, 23
- hate speech
  - links to human rights violations, 14
  - standard-setting efforts, 60, 128, 140–146, 170–175, 182–184
- hate speech regulation
  - debate over, 4
  - declaratory nature of, 42
  - legal moralism in, 107, 185
  - maximalist approach towards, 25, 31, 36–37, 38, 41–42, 43–44, 49
  - minimalist approach towards, 25–26, 29, 35–36, 37–39, 43–44
  - silencing of, 41–43
- hostility. *See also* incitement to hostility
  - definitional challenges, 22–24
- human rights
  - communitarian approach to, 46, 50, 87, 181
  - egalitarian approach to, 41, 43–44, 60
- Human Rights Commission
  - ninth session of, 82
- human rights violations
  - as background to ICCPR negotiations, 62
- ICCPR
  - Article 14, 102
  - Article 18, 53
  - Article 27, 102
  - Article 40, 92
  - Article 5, 9, 10
  - Article 6, 102
  - Articles 7 & 8, 9
  - First Optional Protocol of, 92
  - influence of Second World War on, 66, 87, 182
- ICCPR Article 19
  - and group libel laws, 52
  - drafting history, 67–68, 70, 80
  - in international human rights jurisprudence, 93–98
  - relationship with Article 20(2), 43–44, 86

- ICCPR Article 20(2)  
 critiques of, 6–7  
 polarized debates on, 173–176  
 relationship with Article 19, 43–44, 86  
 reservations to, 86  
 states' obligations, mandatory nature of, 9  
 unique characteristics of, 6
- ICERD. *See* International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
- identity politics, 2
- IHL. (International Human Rights Law)  
 factors inhibiting developing countries from influencing, 161  
 ideological and philosophical foundations of, 159  
 language used to codify human rights, 90  
 perceived bias towards Western states, 159
- incitement component of norm prohibiting incitement, 15
- incitement to discrimination, 22
- incitement to hatred. *See also* incitement to racial hatred; incitement to religious hatred  
 contextual test for proving, 35  
 definitional challenges of, 32  
 dropped from consideration by Ad Hoc Committee, 140  
 incitement against religious ideas and religious adherents distinguished, 57  
 legal threshold of, 21, 32, 39, 53–56, 59, 101, 169, 184
- incitement to hostility, 22–23  
 victims of, 52
- incitement to racial hatred  
 legal offence in England and Wales, 144
- incitement to religious hatred  
 conflation with defamation of religion, 57  
 incitement against religious ideas and religious adherents distinguished, 143–144  
 legal offence in England and Wales, 155  
 regulatory challenges, 54–56
- incitement to violence, 23
- individualist approach to rights, 46–48, 51, 52, 57,  
*See also* libertarian approach to rights
- information and communication technologies.  
*See* cyber hate
- Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, 115
- Inter-American Court on Human Rights, 115
- International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD), 5, 91, 149  
 Article 1, 152  
 Article 2, 110
- Article 4, 13, 94, 109, 110–111, 112–113, 116, 138, 157  
 Article 4, comparison with ICCPR Article 20(2), 152  
 Article 5, 152
- International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. *See* ICCPR
- International Refugee Organization. *See* Preparatory Commission for the International Refugee Organization
- Islamophobia, 113  
 analogy with anti-Semitism, 149  
 and anti-Muslim racism, 151  
 as justification for resolutions at UN on defamation of religion, 160  
 post-9/11 intensification of, 129, 150, 160, 173, 182
- Istanbul Process, 168–170
- Jahangir, Asma, 65, 132, 143, *See also* UN Special Rapporteurs
- La Rue, Frank, 148, *See also* UN Special Rapporteurs
- legal moralism. *See* morality
- libel. *See* group libel laws
- libertarian approach to rights, 7–8, 26–27, 29, 39, 45, 57, 87, 174, 179, 181, *See also* individualist approach to rights
- marketplace of ideas, 40, 41, 44, 69–70
- maximalist approach to hate speech regulation.  
*See* hate speech regulation, maximalist approach towards
- Mill, John Stuart, 26–27, 36, 39, *See also* Waldron, Jeremy
- minimalist approach to hate speech regulation.  
*See* hate speech regulation, minimalist approach towards
- morality. *See also* protection of morals  
 legal moralism, 24, 26, 27, 31, 74, 125, *See also* hate speech regulation, legal moralism in  
 moral neutrality, 26, 31  
 state neutrality, 40–42
- multiculturalism, 1–2, 49, 160, 183
- Nazi propaganda, 14, 62–64
- non-governmental organizations (NGOs), 104, 162, 166–167, *See also* Article 19 (NGO)  
 criticism of standard-setting efforts at UN, 132, 140
- norm prohibiting incitement, five internal features of, 58–60, 87, 91, 107, 124, 125, 174, *See also* emotive component, group identity component, incitement component, religion component, tensions between equality and liberty rights of speakers

- Obama, Barack, 163, 167
- Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR), 104, 133, 186–187
- online hate. *See* cyber hate
- Organization of the Islamic Conference (OIC), 129, 130, 168, 176
- OIC Group in the UN, 133, 162, 167
- political parties, racist and xenophobic, 2
- Preparatory Commission for the International Refugee Organization, 80
- procedural development. *See* guidance to states
- profiling
- negative profiling of religious adherents, 140, 142, 148–149, 168, 173, 174, 183
  - profiling of Muslims, 150, 173
  - racial and religious, 2, 105, 129, 130, 135
- protection of morals
- approach of supranational human rights–monitoring bodies, 185
  - in jurisprudence of ECtHR, 25
  - in jurisprudence of HRCttee, 25
- Rabat Plan of Action, 187–188
- Race Relations Act 1976 (UK). *See* incitement to racial hatred, legal offence in England and Wales
- racial profiling. *See* profiling
- racio-religious intolerance, 149–150
- racist hate speech
- international norm prohibiting, 152
- religion component of norm prohibiting incitement, 15
- religious discrimination, 53
- contemporary manifestations of, 135
  - difficulty in distinguishing from racial discrimination, 157
  - incitement to, 147
  - right to be free from, 140
- religious freedom. *See* freedom of religion
- religious hate speech
- comparison with racism, 152
  - conflation with hate speech against religious adherents, 143
- religious hatred. *See* incitement to religious hatred
- religious incitement, right to protection from, 54, 142
- religious profiling. *See* profiling
- right to protection from incitement
- collective dimension of, 45, 59
  - dualities of, 10
  - interpretation and enforcement of, 58–59
  - states' obligations, 43
- Second World War, 62–66. *See also* travaux préparatoires. *See also* International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), influence of Second World War on
- social media. *See* cyber hate
- societies
- differing cultural and legal traditions, 25, 71, 88, 90, 185
- Special Rapporteurs. *See* UN Special Rapporteurs; *see also* Diène, Doudou; Jahangir, Asma; La Rue, Frank
- standard-setting. *See* hate speech, standard-setting efforts
- stigmatization of minority groups, 2, 160
- supranational monitoring and adjudicatory bodies, 90
- critique of hate speech jurisprudence, 127, 179
- tensions between equality and liberty rights of speakers, 15
- terrorist attacks of 11 September 2001, 2, 129
- travaux préparatoires of ICCPR Article 20(2)
- cold war-related conflict in debates, 66, 88
  - four-power amendment, 82–84
  - nine-power amendment, 83–84
  - sixteen-power amendment, 84–86
  - Western states' position, 87
- UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD)
- comparison of approach to racist hate speech with HRCttee's approach, 113–114
  - concluding observations, 112–113
  - General Recommendation No. 15, 111–112, 149
  - General Recommendation No. 35, 35, 111–112, 113, 132, 153
  - individual communications on racist hate speech, 109–111
  - reluctance to sufficiently address religious hatred, 113
- UN High Commissioner for Human Rights. *See* Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR)
- UN Human Rights Committee (HRCttee), 13, 134
- concluding observations on Article 20(2), 104–108
  - criticisms of hate speech jurisprudence, 106–109
  - General Comments, 102–104
  - holocaust denial case, 94–95
  - individual communications on Article 20(2), 92–102
  - mandate, 92
- UN Human Rights Council (HRC), 128, 136, 148, 162–167

- UN Resolution 16/18 (on defamation of religion), 168, 169–170, 176
- UN Resolutions on defamation of religion, submitted by OIC, 128–133
- UN Special Rapporteurs, 22, 104, 105, 132–133, 140, 142–143, 151, 171, 188
- Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), 5–6, 9, 71
- USA. *See also* Obama, Barack
  - policy towards HRC, 163
  - position on resolutions on defamation of religion, 164
  - role in suspension of resolutions on defamation of religion, 164–166
  - stance on prohibition of hate propaganda, 69
- victim status. *See* incitement to hostility
- violence. *See* incitement to violence
- vulnerability of target groups, 35, 49–50
- Waldron, Jeremy, 37, 51, 56, *See also* Mill, John Stuart
- World Jewish Congress, 81