

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-83756-9 — The Right to Protection from Incitement to Hatred
Mona Elbahtimy
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

THE RIGHT TO PROTECTION FROM INCITEMENT TO HATRED

Against the backdrop of the new globalized hate speech dynamics, the nature and scope of States' obligations pursuant to international human rights law on prohibiting incitement to hatred have taken on increased importance and have become a controversial issue within multilateral human rights diplomacy. Key questions being posed in the ongoing debates over how best to respond to the new wave of hatred include whether the international legal norm against incitement to hatred, as it currently stands, is suitable to address the contemporary challenges of this phenomenon. Alternatively, does it need to be developed further? This book traces the journey of this norm in three analytical domains; its emergence, relevant supranational jurisprudence; and the recent standard-setting attempts within the UN. The book argues that five internal features of the norm had a strong influence on its difficult path within international human rights law.

Dr Mona Elbahtimy holds a PhD from the University of Cambridge and has long practical experience in multilateral human rights diplomacy.

The Right to Protection from Incitement to Hatred

AN UNSETTLED RIGHT

MONA ELBAHTIMY



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-83756-9 — The Right to Protection from Incitement to Hatred
Mona Elbahtimy
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108837569

DOI: 10.1017/9781108946490

© Mona Elbahtimy 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-83756-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-83756-9 — The Right to Protection from Incitement to Hatred
Mona Elbahtimy
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For Selim and Nour

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Table of International Law</i>	x
<i>Table of International Cases</i>	xi
<i>Table of International Materials</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xx
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Incitement to Hatred in a Globalized World	1
1.2 The Right to Protection from Incitement to Discrimination, Hostility or Violence	5
1.3 A Note on Terminology	12
1.4 Main Argument	14
1.5 Methodology and Sources	16
1.6 Outline	18
2 The Right to Protection from Incitement to Hatred: An Analysis of Five Internal Features	20
2.1 Introduction	20
2.2 The ‘Emotive’ Component	20
2.3 The Incitement Component	31
2.4 The Tensions between Equality and Liberty Rights of Speakers and Members of Targeted Groups	37
2.5 The Group Identity Component	45
2.6 The ‘Religion’ Component	53
2.7 Concluding Remarks	58

3	The Difficult Birth of the Right to Protection from Incitement to Hatred in International Human Rights Law	61
3.1	Introduction	61
3.2	The Historical and Political Context of Negotiations	62
3.3	Freedom of Expression: The Dual Use of the Logic of Abuse	67
3.4	The Emotive Component: A Major Dividing Line	73
3.5	Group Rights and Religious Freedoms: Another Dividing Line	80
3.6	The Drafts Leading to the Adoption of Article 20(2)	82
3.7	Concluding Remarks	87
4	The Norm Prohibiting Incitement to Hatred through the Lens of Supranational Monitoring and Adjudicatory Bodies	90
4.1	Introduction	90
4.2	The Jurisprudence of the UN Human Rights Committee	92
4.3	The Jurisprudence of the UN Committee on Elimination of Racial Discrimination	109
4.4	Regional Jurisprudence: The Hate Speech Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights	114
4.5	Concluding Remarks	124
5	Recent Normative Battles within the UN on Hate Speech	128
5.1	Introduction	128
5.2	UN Resolutions on Defamation of Religions	128
5.3	Polarized Positions on the Need for Complementary Standards to Article 20(2) of the ICCPR	134
5.4	The Proposed Standards' Interaction with the Scope of Freedom of Religion	140
5.5	The Proposed Standards' Interaction with the Notion of Racism	148
5.6	The Characteristics of Supporters and Opponents of Standard-Setting Attempts on Hate Speech	158
5.7	Concluding Remarks	173
6	Conclusions	177
6.1	The Right to Protection from Incitement to Hatred under IHRL: A Summary of the Journey	177
6.2	The Way Ahead	184
	<i>Bibliography</i>	190
	<i>Index</i>	206

Acknowledgements

This monograph is the revised and updated version of my doctoral thesis submitted to the University of Cambridge. While preparing my thesis for publication, I have benefited from the great support of my family. I would like to first thank my beloved husband Mohamed for his invaluable, long-lasting, and ongoing support and patience. I am really grateful to my children, Selim and Nour, for their understanding, despite their young age, that I needed to dedicate considerable time to work on my book during the remarkably difficult year of 2020 (against the backdrop of the COVID-19 pandemic). I am deeply indebted to my brother Dr Hassan Elbahtimy; he has been an excellent and inspirational mentor, who offered important insights during the long discussions we had about the topic of this book. Words cannot express the depth of my gratitude to my dear parents, Ahmed and Amany, for their limitless love and encouragement throughout the years of my life.

Further back chronologically, it has been a pleasure to write my doctoral thesis under the supervision of Dr Barbra Metzger. She has provided valuable academic guidance and important feedback on my work throughout the three years of conducting my research. The Citadel Capital Scholarship Foundation contributed the funding that allowed me to undertake my doctoral studies at the University of Cambridge, which I immensely appreciate. Also, I would like to extend my gratitude to Ambassadors Dr Ibrahim Salama, Wael Aboulmagd, and Dr Ahmed Ihab Gamal Eldin for the valuable support they have provided me. I also appreciate the assistance of the staff of UN library in Geneva and the University of Cambridge Library. Special thanks go to the lovely couple Dr Tristram and Louisa Riley-Smith – I was lucky to write considerable parts of my doctoral thesis in their beautiful house in Fen Ditton-Cambridge.

It has been a pleasure working with Cambridge University Press, where Tom Randall has been a very supportive editor, both during the proposal stage and since then. I am also indebted to the anonymous reviewers for their constructive and helpful comments and suggestions on the proposal for this book. Special thanks go to Alan O'Dowd, who provided very expeditious and to-the-point copy-editing.

International Law

- 1981 African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 27 June 1981, 1520 UNTS 245
1969 American Convention on Human Rights, 22 November 1969, 1144 UNTS 144
1972 Charter of the Organization of the Islamic Conference, 4 March 1972, 914 UNTS 103
2008 Charter of the Organization of the Islamic Conference, 14 March 2008, OIC Doc. OIC-CHARTER-FINAL-miscdoc-ah-o8
1950 European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, 4 November 1950, CETS 5
1966 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 16 December 1966, 999 UNTS 172
1965 International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 21 December 1965, 660 UNTS 212

International Cases

UN HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE

- Faurisson v. France*, Communication no. 550/1993, UN Doc. CCPR/C/58/D/550/1993 (8 November 1996)
J. R. T. and the W. G. Party v. Canada, Communication no. 104/1981, UN Doc. CCPR/C/18/D/104/1981 (6 April 1983)
Mohamed Rabbae, A. B. S and N. A. v. Netherlands, Communication no. 2124/2011, UN Doc. CCPR (14 July 2016)
Ross v. Canada, Communication no. 736/1997, UN Doc. CCPR/C/70/D/736/1997 (26 October 2000)

UN COMMITTEE ON THE ELIMINATION OF RACIAL DISCRIMINATION

- The Jewish Community of Oslo et al. v. Norway*, Communication no. 30/2003, UN Doc. CERD (15 August 2005)
L. K. v. The Netherlands, Communication no. 4/1991, UN Doc. CERD (16 March 1993)
Mohammed Hassan Gelle v. Denmark, Communication no. 034/2004, UN Doc. CERD (6 March 2006)
P. S. N. v. Denmark, Communication no. 36/2006, UN Doc. CERD/C/71/D/36/2006 (8 August 2007)

EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND EUROPEAN COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS

- Aydin Tatlav v. Turkey*, Application no. 50692/99, ECtHR (2 May 2006)
Erbakan v. Turkey, Application no. 59405/00, ECtHR (6 June 2006)
Feret v. Belgium, Application no. 15615/07, ECtHR (16 July 2009)
Giniewski v. France, Application no. 64016/00, ECtHR (31 January 2006)
Glimmverveen and Hagenbeck v. Netherlands, Application nos. 8348/78, 8406/78, ECommHR (11 October 1979)
Gunduz v. Turkey, Application no. 4870/02, ECtHR (4 December 2003)

- Handyside v. United Kingdom*, Application no. 5493/72, ECtHR, Plenary (7 December 1976), Series A no. 24
- Jersild v. Denmark*, Application no. 15890/89, ECtHR, Grand Chamber (23 September 1994), Series A no. 298
- Kuhnen v. Federal Republic of Germany*, Application. no. 12194/86, ECommHR (12 May 1988)
- Le Pen v. France*, Application no. 18788/09, ECtHR (20 April 2010)
- Murphy v. Ireland*, Application no. 44179/98, ECtHR (10 July 2003), ECHR Reports 2003-IX
- Otto-Preminger-Institut v. Austria*, Application no. 13470/87, ECommHR (13 January 1993)
- Otto-Preminger-Institut v. Austria*, Application no. 13470/87, ECtHR (20 September 1994)
- Pavel Ivanov v. Russia*, Application no. 35222/04, ECommHR (20 February 2007)
- Schimanek v. Austria*, Application no. 32307/96, ECtHR (1 February 2000)
- Soulas and Others v. France*, Application no. 15948/03, ECtHR (10 July 2008)
- Vejdeland and Others v. Sweden*, Application no. 1813/07, ECtHR (9 February 2012)
- Vona v. Hungary*, Application no. 35943/10, ECtHR (9 December 2013).
- Wingrove v. United Kingdom*, Application no. 17419/90, ECtHR (25 November 1996)
- Witzsch v. Germany*, Application no. 7485/03, ECtHR (13 December 2005)
- X v. Federal Republic of Germany*, Application no. 9235/81, ECommHR (16 July 1982)

International Materials

- UN DOCUMENTS ON TRAVAUX PRÉPARATOIRES OF ARTICLE 20(2) OF THE ICCPR
- A/C.3/SR.289 – General Assembly, Fifth Session (19 October 1950)
 - A/C.3/SR.291 – General Assembly, Fifth Session (20 October 1950)
 - A/C.3/SR.568 – General Assembly, Ninth Session (1 November 1954)
 - A/C.3/SR.570 – General Assembly, Ninth Session (2 November 1954)
 - A/C.3/SR.571 – General Assembly, Ninth Session (2 November 1954)
 - A/C.3/SR.575 – General Assembly, Ninth Session (5 November 1954)
 - A/C.3/SR.580 – General Assembly, Ninth Session (10 November 1954)
 - A/5000 – General Assembly, Sixteenth Session (5 December 1961)
 - A/C.3/SR.1079 – General Assembly, Sixteenth Session (20 October 1961)
 - A/C.3/SR.1080 – General Assembly, Sixteenth Session (23 October 1961)
 - A/C.3/L.932 – General Assembly, Sixteenth Session (20 October 1961)
 - A/C.3/SR.1071 – General Assembly, Sixteenth Session (12 October 1961)
 - A/C.3/SR.1072 – General Assembly, Sixteenth Session (12 October 1961)
 - A/C.3/SR.1073 – General Assembly, Sixteenth Session (13 October 1961)
 - A/C.3/SR.1078 – General Assembly, Sixteenth Session (19 October 1961)
 - A/C.3/SR.1081 – General Assembly, Sixteenth Session (23 October 1961)
 - A/C.3/SR.1082 – General Assembly, Sixteenth Session (25 October 1961)
 - A/C.3/SR.1083 – General Assembly, Sixteenth Session (25 October 1961)
 - A/C.3/SR.1084 – General Assembly, Sixteenth Session (26 October 1961)
 - E/CN.4/NGO/39 – Commission on Human Rights, Eighth Session (20 November 1952)
 - E/CN.4/223 – Commission on Human Rights, Fifth Session (23 May 1949)
 - E/CN.4/SR.123 – Commission on Human Rights, Fifth Session (14 June 1949)
 - E/CN.4/SR.379 – Commission on Human Rights, Ninth Session (19 October 1953)
 - E/CN.4/L.269 – Commission on Human Rights, Ninth Session (7 May 1953)
 - E/CN.4/SR.377 – Commission on Human Rights, Ninth Session (19 October 1953)
 - E/CN.4/SR.378 – Commission on Human Rights, Ninth Session (19 October 1953)
 - E/CN.4/41 – Commission on Human Rights, Second Session (1 December 1947)

- E/CN.4/52 – Commission on Human Rights, Second Session (6 December 1947)
 E/CN.4/SR.174 – Commission on Human Rights, Sixth Session (8 May 1950)
 E/CN.4/Sub.2/21 – Commission on Human Rights (26 November 1947)
 E/CN.4/365 – Commission on Human Rights (1950)
 E/CN.4/SR.320 – Commission on Human Rights (18 June 1952)
 E/CN.4/82 – Drafting Committee, Second Session (16 April 1948)
 E/CN.4/82/Add.12 – Drafting Committee, Second Session (3 June 1948)
 E/CN.4/AC.1/SR.28 – Drafting Committee, Second Session (18 May 1948)
 E/SR.438 – Economic and Social Council, Twelfth Session (21 February 1951)

UN RESOLUTIONS

- A/Res/1780 (XVII) – GA Res. 1780 (XVII), Preparation of a Draft Declaration and a Draft Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, GA, 17th sess., 1187th mtg (7 December 1962)
 A/HRC/Dec/3/103 – HRC Dec. 3/103, Global Efforts for the Total Elimination of Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance and the Comprehensive Follow-up to the World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance and the Effective Implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action, UN Human Rights Council, 3rd sess., 14th mtg (8 December 2006)
 A/HRC/Res/10/22 – HRC Res. 10/22, Defamation of Religions, Human Rights Council, 10th sess., 43rd mtg (26 March 2009)
 A/HRC/Res/12/16 – HRC Res. 12/16, Freedom of Opinion and Expression, UN Human Rights Council, 12th sess., 31st mtg (2 October 2009)
 A/HRC/Res/16/18 – HRC Res. 16/18, Combating Intolerance, Negative Stereotyping and Stigmatization of, and Discrimination, Incitement to Violence, and Violence against Persons Based on Religion or Belief, Human Rights Council, 16th sess., 46th mtg (24 March 2011)
 A/HRC/Res/4/9 – HRC Res. 4/9, Combating Defamation of Religions, UN Human Rights Council, 4th sess., 31st mtg (30 March 2007)
 A/HRC/Res/6/21 – HRC Res. 6/21, Elaboration of International Complementary Standards to the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, UN Human Rights Council, 6th sess., 22nd mtg (28 September 2007)
 A/HRC/Res/7/19 – HRC Res. 7/19, Defamation of Religions, UN Human Rights Council, 7th sess., 40th mtg (27 March 2008)
 E/CN.4/Res/1999/82 – CHR Res. 1999/82, Defamation of Religions, UN Commission on Human Rights, 55th sess., 62nd mtg (30 April 1999)
 E/CN.4/Res/2000/84 – CHR Res. 2000/84, Defamation of Religions, UN Commission on Human Rights, 56th sess., 67th mtg (26 April 2000)

- E/CN.4/Res/2001/4 – CHR Res. 2001/4, Combating Defamation of Religions as a Means to Promote Human Rights, Social Harmony and Religious and Cultural Diversity, UN Commission on Human Rights, 57th sess., 61st mtg (18 April 2001)
- E/CN.4/Res/2002/9 – CHR Res. 2002/9, Combating Defamation of Religions, UN Commission on Human Rights, 58th sess., 39th mtg (15 April 2002)
- E/CN.4/Res/2003/4 – CHR Res. 2003/4, Combating Defamation of Religions, UN Commission on Human Rights, 59th sess., 47th mtg (14 April 2003)
- E/CN.4/Res/2004/6 – CHR Res. 2004/6, Combating Defamation of Religions, UN Commission on Human Rights, 60th sess., 45th mtg (13 April 2004)
- E/CN.4/Res/2005/3 – CHR Res. 2005/3, Combating Defamation of Religions, UN Commission on Human Rights, 61st sess., 44th mtg (12 April 2005)
- A/Res/60/150 – GA Res. 60/150, Combating Defamation of Religions, GA, 60th sess., 64th plen. mtg (16 December 2005)
- A/Res/60/164 – GA Res. 60/164, Respect for the Principles of National Sovereignty and Diversity of Democratic Systems in Electoral Processes as an Important Element for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights, GA, 60th sess., 64th plen. mtg (16 December 2005)
- A/Res/62/154 – GA Res. 62/154, Combating Defamation of Religions, GA, 62nd sess., 76th plen. mtg (18 December 2007)
- A/Res/63/171 – GA Res. 63/171, Combating Defamation of Religions, GA, 63rd sess., 70th plen. mtg (18 December 2008)
- A/Res/64/156 – GA Res. 64/156, Combating Defamation of Religions, GA, 65th plen. mtg (18 December 2009)
- A/Res/65/224 – GA Res. 65/224, Combating Defamation of Religions, GA, 65th sess., 71st plen. mtg (21 December 2010)

UN REPORTS

- A/48/18 – CERD, General Recommendation no. 15: Organized violence based on ethnic origin (Art. 4) (23 March 1993)
- A/32/18 – Concluding Observations of the Committee on Elimination of Racial Discrimination: Germany, Committee on Elimination of Racial Discrimination (April 1977)
- A/61/335 – Doudou Diène, Report by the Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia, and Related Intolerance, UN Human Rights Council (17 September 2006)
- A/32/18 – Report of the Committee on Elimination of Racial Discrimination: Official Records: Thirty-Second Session (April 1977)
- A/33/18 – Report of the Committee on Elimination of Racial Discrimination: Official Records: Eighteenth Session (1978)

- A/62/280 – Asma Jahangir, Interim Report by the Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Religion or Belief, UN Human Rights Council (20 August 2007)
- A/67/537 – Frank La Rue, Report by the Special Rapporteur on the Promotion and Protection of the Right to Freedom of Opinion and Expression, UN Human Rights Council (7 September 2012)
- A/CONF.119/10 – Study on Positive Measures Designed to Eradicate All Incitement to, or Acts of, Racial Discrimination: Implementation of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, Committee on Elimination of Racial Discrimination (May 1986)
- A/CONF.189/PC.1/7 – Abdelfattah Amor, Study of Special Rapporteur on Religious Intolerance (13 April 2000)
- A/CONF.211/PC.4/5 – Report on Implementation of the Durban Declaration and Programme of Action and Proposal for its Enhancement, Report of the UNHCHR (24 February 2009)
- A/CONF.211/PC.3/4 – Report of the Regional Preparatory Meeting for Africa for the Durban Review Conference (3 September 2008)
- A/HRC/2/3 – Asma Jahangir and Doudou Diène, Report Further to Human Rights Council Decision 1/107 on Incitement to Racial and Religious Hatred and the Promotion of Tolerance, Report by the Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Religion or Belief and the Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance, UN Human Rights Council (20 September 2006)
- A/HRC/2/6 – Incitement to Racial and Religious Hatred and the Promotion of Tolerance, Report of the UNHCHR, UN Human Rights Council (20 September 2006)
- A/HRC/4/19 – Doudou Diène, Report by the Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance (12 January 2007)
- A/HRC/4/WG.3/6 – Report on the Study by the Five Experts on the Content and Scope of Substantive Gaps in the Existing International Instruments to Combat Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance (27 August 2007)
- A/HRC/5/10 – Doudou Diène, Report by the Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance on Political Platforms Which Promote or Incite Racial Discrimination, UN Human Rights Council (25 May 2007)
- A/HRC/6/6 – Doudou Diène, Manifestations of Defamation of Religions and in Particular on the Serious Implications of Islamophobia on the Enjoyment of all Rights, Report of the Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance, UN Human Rights Council (21 August 2007)

- A/HRC/7/19 – Doudou Diène, Report by the Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance (20 February 2008)
- A/HRC/9/7 – The Implementation of Human Rights Council Resolution 7/19 Entitled ‘Combating Defamation of Religions’, Report of the UNHCHR, UN Human Rights Council (12 September 2008)
- A/HRC/9/12 – Doudou Diène, Manifestations of Defamation of Religions and in Particular on the Serious Implications of Islamophobia on the Enjoyment of All Rights, Report of the Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance, UN Human Rights Council (2 September 2008)
- A/HRC/9/25 – Study Compiling Existing Legislations and Jurisprudence Concerning Defamation of and Contempt for Religions, UNHCHR (5 September 2008)
- A/HRC/10/88 – Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on the Elaboration of Complementary Standards on Its First Session (24 February 2009)
- A/HRC/12/38 – Githu Muigai, Report by the Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance on the Manifestations of Defamation of Religions, and in Particular on the Serious Implications of Islamophobia on the Enjoyment of All Rights by Their Followers (1 July 2009)
- A/HRC/13/58 – Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on the Elaboration of Complementary Standards on Its Second Session (21 January 2010)
- A/HRC/14/43 – Githu Muigai, Report by the Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance, UN Human Rights Council (30 March 2010)
- A/HRC/15/53 – Githu Muigai, Manifestations of Defamation of Religions, and in Particular on the Ongoing Serious Implications of Islamophobia, for the Enjoyment of All Rights by Their Followers, Report of the Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance, UN Human Rights Council (12 July 2010)
- A/HRC/18/36 – Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on the Elaboration of Complementary Standards on Its Third Session (6 September 2011)
- A/HRC/22/17/Add.4 – Report of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights on the Expert Workshops on the Prohibition of Incitement to National, Racial or Religious Hatred (11 January 2013)
- CCPR/C/OP/3 – Selected Decisions of the Human Rights Committee under the Optional Protocol Thirty-third to Thirty-ninth Sessions (July 1988–July 1990)
- CCPR/CO/84/SVN – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights Committee: Slovenia, Human Rights Committee (25 July 2005)
- CCPR/C/AUT/CO/4 – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights Committee: Austria, Human Rights Committee (30 October 2007)

- CCPR/C/BEL/CO/5 – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights Committee:
 Belgium, Human Rights Committee (16 November 2010)
- CCPR/C/79/Add.41 – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights Committee:
 Burundi, Human Rights Committee (8 March 1994)
- CCPR/C/79/Add.118 – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights Committee:
 Congo, Human Rights Committee (27 March 2000)
- CCPR/CO/72/CZE – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights Committee:
 Czech Republic, Human Rights Committee (27 August 2001)
- CCPR/C/ESP/CO/5 – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights Committee:
 Spain, Human Rights Committee (5 January 2009)
- CCPR/C/CHE/CO/3 – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights
 Committee: Switzerland, Human Rights Committee (3 November 2009)
- CCPR/C/HUN/CO/5 – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights
 Committee: Hungary, Human Rights Committee (5 December 2010)
- CCPR/C/IDN/CO/1 – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights Committee:
 Indonesia, Human Rights Committee (21 August 2013)
- CCPR/C/ITA/CO/5 – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights Committee:
 Italy, Human Rights Committee (24 April 2006)
- CCPR/CO/69/KWT – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights Committee:
 Kuwait, Human Rights Committee (27 July 2000)
- CCPR/C/MNG/CO/5 – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights
 Committee: Mongolia, Human Rights Committee (1 April 2011)
- CCPR/C/POL/CO/6 – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights Committee:
 Poland, Human Rights Committee (27 October 2010)
- CCPR/CO/79/RUS – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights Committee:
 Russian Federation, Human Rights Committee (6 November 2003)
- CCPR/C/SWE/CO/6 – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights
 Committee: Sweden, Human Rights Committee (2 April 2009)
- CCPR/C/TGO/CO/4 – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights
 Committee: Togo, Human Rights Committee (8 March 2011)
- CCPR/C/USA/CO/3 – Concluding Observations of the Human Rights Committee:
 USA, Human Rights Committee (15 September 2006)
- CCPR/C/GC/34 – CCPR, General Comment no. 34 on Article 19
 (12 September 2011)
- CCPR/C/21/Rev.1/Add.4 – CCPR, General Comment no. 22: The Right to Freedom
 of Thought, Conscience and Religion (Art. 18) (30 July 1993)
- CCPR, General Comment no. 11: Prohibition of Propaganda for War and Inciting
 National, Racial or Religious Hatred (Art. 20) (29 July 1983)
- CCPR/C/21/Rev.1/Add.6 – CCPR, General Comment no. 24: Issues Relating to
 Reservations Made upon Ratification or Accession to the Covenant or the
 Optional Protocols Thereto, or in Relation to Declarations under Article 41 of
 the Covenant (4 November 1994)

- CCPR/C/21/Rev.1/Add.11 – CCPR, General Comment no. 29: States of Emergency (Article 4) (31 August 2001)
- CCPR/C/21/Rev.1/Add.13 – CCPR, General Comment no. 31: Nature of the General Legal Obligation on States Parties to the Covenant (26 May 2004)
- CERD/C/AUT/CO/17 – Concluding Observations of the Committee on Elimination of Racial Discrimination: Austria, Committee on Elimination of Racial Discrimination (21 August 2008)
- CERD/C/GC/35 – CERD, General Recommendation no. 35: Combating Racist Hate Speech (26 September 2013)
- CERD/C/UKR/CO/18 – Concluding Observations of the Committee on Elimination of Racial Discrimination: Ukraine, Committee on Elimination of Racial Discrimination (8 February 2007)
- E/CN.4/2001/64 (Annex V) – Joint Declaration by the UN Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Opinion and Expression, the OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media and the OAS Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Expression (13 February 2001)
- E/CN.4/2006/WG.21/BP.2 – Frans Viljoen and Tshepo Madlingozi, Taking Stock of the Debates on Complementary International Standards to Strengthen and Update International Legal Instruments against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance (6 June 2006)
- E/CN.4/2006/17 – Doudou Diène, Situation of Muslims and Arab Peoples in Various Parts of the World, Report by the Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance, UN Commission on Human Rights (13 February 2006)

Abbreviations

ACHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
ACommHPR	African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights
Ad Hoc Committee	UN Ad Hoc Committee on the Elaboration of Complementary Standards
CERD	UN Committee on Elimination of Racial Discrimination
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
GA	General Assembly
HRC	Human Rights Council
HRCtee	Human Rights Committee
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
ICL	International Criminal Law
IHRL	International Human Rights Law
OHCHR	The Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
OIC	Organization of Islamic Cooperation
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights