The connection between ecology and conflict has been the object of extensive study by political scientists and economists. From the contribution of natural resource ‘scarcity’ to violent unrest and armed conflict; to resource ‘abundance’ as an incentive for initiating and prolonging armed struggles; to dysfunctional resource management and environmental degradation as obstacles to peacebuilding, this literature has exerted a huge influence upon academic discussions and policy developments. While international law is often invoked as the solution to the socio-environmental challenges faced by conflict-affected countries, its relationship with the ecology of war and peace remains undertheorised. Drawing upon environmental justice perspectives and other theoretical traditions, the book unpacks and problematises some of the assumptions that underlie the legal field. Through an analysis of the practice of international courts, the UN Security Council, and Truth Commissions, it shows how international law silences and even normalises forms of structural and slow environmental violence.

Eliana Cusato is a Marie Curie Postdoctoral Fellow at the Amsterdam Centre for International Law, University of Amsterdam. She holds a PhD in Law from the National University of Singapore. Previously, she was a lecturer at Essex Law School. She serves on the editorial board of the Asian Journal of International Law.
The Ecology of War and Peace

MARGINALISING SLOW AND STRUCTURAL VIOLENCE IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

ELIANA CUSATO

University of Amsterdam
Contents

Acknowledgements ix

1 Introduction: International Law, Violence, and Visibility 1
   1.1 International Law, Violence, and Visibility: War’s Hidden Socio-ecological Legacy 1
   1.2 Pushing the Conversation Forward 8
   1.3 ‘New Wars’ and the Environment 13
   1.4 Slow and Structural Violence 19
   1.5 Overview of Arguments 25

PART I CONCEPTS, THEORIES, AND DEBATES

2 The Ecology of War and Peace: Unpacking the Assumptions 31
   2.1 Introduction 31
   2.2 The Place of the Environment within Peace and Conflict Studies 32
      2.2.1 Of Scarcity, Greed, and Grievances: Nature and the Root Causes of Violent Conflict 36
      2.2.2 ‘Illicit’ Trade in Natural Resources and the Political Economy of Civil Wars 44
      2.2.3 Environmental Peacebuilding and the Spectre of ‘Liberal Peace’ 48
   2.3 Adding Environmental Justice to the Picture 52
   2.4 Conclusion 58

3 Origins and Evolutions of Legal Debates on the Environment-Conflict ‘Nexus’ 60
   3.1 Introduction 60
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>From Grotius to the Contemporary <em>Jus in Bello</em>: Necessity, Distinction, and Proportionality as the Standards for Environmental Protection</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Reacting to Ecocide Perpetrated in the Vietnam War: Adding the 'Environment' to the Laws of Armed Conflict</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>The 1990–1 Gulf War and the Codification of Environmental War Crime in the Statute of the International Criminal Court</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Interpretative Routes to Restrain ‘Illegal’ Resource Exploitation during Armed Conflict and Occupation</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Beyond the Laws of Armed Conflict</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.1</td>
<td>Multilateral Environmental Agreements and Principles of Environmental Law: ‘Greening’ the <em>Jus in Bello</em>?</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.2</td>
<td>International Human Rights Law and the Environment: A Complicated Relationship</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PART II THE PRACTICE OF INTERNATIONAL LAW**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>War Crimes Tribunals and the International Court of Justice: Nature between Property Protection and Humanitarian Concerns</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>International and Hybrid Criminal Tribunals</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1</td>
<td>Post–World War II Tribunals and the Prosecution of Property Crimes</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2</td>
<td>The NATO Bombing Campaign in Former Yugoslavia: The Environment as a ‘Casualty’ of Warfare</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3</td>
<td>The Environment as the Means to Commit Humanitarian Atrocities</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4</td>
<td>The Special Court for Sierra Leone, Natural Resources, and the Economic Motives for Armed Struggle</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Two Different Paradigms of Justice: The Tension between International Criminal Justice and Environmental Justice</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>The International Court of Justice</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1</td>
<td>The Nuclear Weapons Advisory Opinion: Slow Violence and <em>Non Liquet</em></td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

4.4.2 The Armed Activities Case (Congo v. Uganda) 137
4.5 Conclusion 151

5 The United Nations Security Council: From ‘Conflict Resources’ to Climate Change as a ‘Threat’ to International Peace and Security 153
5.1 Introduction 153
5.2 Sanctions and Resource-Driven Armed Conflict 156
  5.2.1 A Few Words on Sanctions 156
  5.2.2 The Evolving Objectives of Sanctions Targeting ‘Conflict Resources’: From Conflict Termination to Governance Interventions 159
5.3 The UNSC and the Global Regulation of Resource Extraction in Conflict Zones 163
5.4 Implementing Sanctions: Peacekeeping Operations and Panels of Experts 169
  5.4.1 Securitising Resource Extraction 169
  5.4.2 ‘Naming and Shaming’ and Corporate Due Diligence 173
5.5 A Narrow and Short-Term Approach to Peace 178
  5.5.1 Ignoring Conflict Root Causes 178
  5.5.2 Overlooking Sustainability Challenges 182
5.6 Climate Change and International Peace and Security 186
  5.6.1 Different Accounts of ‘Climate Security’ 186
  5.6.2 Rethinking the Powers of the UNSC and Orthodox Approaches to Peace and Security 190
5.7 Conclusion 195

6 Truth Commissions: Conflicts over Extractive Resources and the Battle for Different Views of Nature 197
6.1 Introduction 197
6.2 A Brief Overview of Truth Commissions 201
6.3 Constructing the ‘Truth’ about Resource-Driven Wars in Sierra Leone, Liberia, and Timor-Leste 203
  6.3.1 Setting the Stage: Natural Resources and Conflict Causes and Dynamics 203
  6.3.2 Human Rights Abuses and ‘Illegal’ Resource Extraction 210
6.4 Three Paradigms of Responsibility 217
Contents

6.4.1 The Sierra Leonean TC: The Post-conflict State as the ‘Main Agent of Change’ 217
6.4.2 The Liberian TC: The ‘Economic Crimes’ Lens 222
6.4.3 The Timor-Leste TC: A Progressive Reading of Socio-economic and Nature Rights 226

6.5 Conclusion 229

7 Conclusion: Towards a Political Ecology of International Law 231

7.1 Reframing ‘the Environment’ and Its Relation to Humanity in Rules Governing War 235
7.2 Embracing Complexity: Rethinking the ‘Nexus’ between Nature, Conflict, and Peace 238
7.3 Towards a Political Ecology of International Law 240

Bibliography 243
Index 278
Acknowledgements

Considerate la vostra semenza:
fatti non foste a viver come bruti,
ma per seguir virtute e canoscenza.¹

Writing this book has been a journey, of the kind that Ulysses undertook in The Odyssey. I crossed oceans and moved to another continent far away from home, Italy, to find the inspiration, ideas, and focus needed to pursue a PhD at the National University of Singapore (NUS). This book expands upon my doctoral dissertation and was completed during my first year as a lecturer at Essex Law School. It was not an easy journey, but I learned immensely from the challenges that I had to face. Yet, I could not have reached my ‘intellectual destination’ without the support of different institutions, communities, and inspiring individuals, whom I wish to thank here.

First and foremost, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to Vincent-Joël Proulx; without his excellent supervision during my PhD and continued support this book would not have been possible. He not only helped me develop my own approach to the issues examined, providing essential advice and engaging in thought-provoking discussions, but has been a mentor and a friend, fuelling my interest in research and academia. I wish to thank wholeheartedly the members of the PhD examining committee, Antony Anghie, Simon Chesterman, and Phoebe Okowa for their insightful comments on my dissertation and encouragement to pursue the publication of this monograph. I am also indebted to many Law Faculty members at NUS for their teaching and advice during the years spent there: Cheah Wui Ling, Simon Chesterman, Michael Dowdle, Gerardine Goh, Victor Kattan, Koh

¹ D. Alighieri, The Divine Comedy: Inferno, Canto XXVI, also known as Ulysses’ Canto. ‘Consider ye the seed from which ye sprang: Ye were not made to live like unto brutes, But for pursuit of virtue and of knowledge.’
x

Acknowledgements

Kheng Lian, Lye Lin-Heng, Jolene Lin, James Penner, Tan Hsien-Li, and Thio Li-Ann. Antony Anghie deserves a special mention. His lectures and scholarship have been truly eye-opening and helped me realise the kind of teacher and scholar I hope to become one day.

I am truly grateful for the friendship and support of fellow doctoral students and post-doc researchers at NUS: Benoit Mayer, Prabhakar Singh, Diego Mejia-Lemos, Harisankar K. S., Wilson Tay, Katherine Gallup Southwick, Rebecka Koziomtzis, Inga Martinkute, Ronnakorn Bunmee, Francine Hug, Jayson Lamechek, Marija Jovanovic, and Kim Heejin. They will always hold a special place in my heart.

The ideas advanced in this book benefited from fruitful exchanges with participants and faculty at several conferences, including King’s College Transnational Law Summer Institute (2017); Harvard Institute for Global Law and Policy Scholars Workshop (2018 and 2019); Doctoral Forum on Legal Theory at Melbourne University (2018); and LSE Workshop Gender, Peace, and Nature (2019). My capacity to think about and beyond the law was greatly enhanced thanks to interactions with amazing critical scholars, including Julia Dhem, Vidya Kumar, Fleur Johns, Sundhya Pahuja, and Fabia Vecoso. During my time as a visiting fellow at the Grotius Centre of Leiden University, I benefited from discussions with Daniella Dam-de Jong, and Larissa van den Herik. At the Lauterpacht Centre, Cambridge University, I had enriching conversations with Sarah Nouwen and Surabhi Ranganathan, as well as other visiting scholars. I am also genuinely grateful to Karen Hulme, who read this monograph and provided invaluable feedback. I received helpful comments from the two anonymous reviewers from Cambridge University Press, whom I would like to thank in addition to Tom Randall, for bringing this project to fruition. I am also indebted to Alice Stoakley, who was the copy editor for this book, for her commitment and close readings of the chapters.

Last, but not least, I am fortunate to have enjoyed the unconditional support of my family and friends, in Italy, Singapore, the UK, and elsewhere. I could not have pursued a PhD and written this book without the love, encouragement, and generosity of my parents, Leonardo and Maria Grazia. Finally, I owe special thanks to the person who instilled in me the passion for travelling and discovery, Mickael, without whom I would never have started the life-changing journey to Asia, which brought me here today.

The drafting of this book was completed in December 2020.