

THE ECOLOGY OF WAR AND PEACE

The connection between ecology and conflict has been the object of extensive study by political scientists and economists. From the contribution of natural resource 'scarcity' to violent unrest and armed conflict; to resource 'abundance' as an incentive for initiating and prolonging armed struggles; to dysfunctional resource management and environmental degradation as obstacles to peacebuilding, this literature has exerted a huge influence upon academic discussions and policy developments. While international law is often invoked as the solution to the socio-environmental challenges faced by conflict-affected countries, its relationship with the ecology of war and peace remains undertheorised. Drawing upon environmental justice perspectives and other theoretical traditions, the book unpacks and problematises some of the assumptions that underlie the legal field. Through an analysis of the practice of international courts, the UN Security Council, and Truth Commissions, it shows how international law silences and even normalises forms of structural and slow environmental violence.

Eliana Cusato is a Marie Curie Postdoctoral Fellow at the Amsterdam Centre for International Law, University of Amsterdam. She holds a PhD in Law from the National University of Singapore. Previously, she was a lecturer at Essex Law School. She serves on the editorial board of the Asian Journal of International Law.



The Ecology of War and Peace

MARGINALISING SLOW AND STRUCTURAL VIOLENCE IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

ELIANA CUSATO

University of Amsterdam





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108837521 DOI: 10.1017/9781108939812

© Eliana Cusato 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-83752-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Acknowledgements			
1	Intro	oduction: International Law, Violence, and Visibility	1
	1.1	International Law, Violence, and Visibility: War's	
		Hidden Socio-ecological Legacy	1
	1.2	Pushing the Conversation Forward	8
	1.3	'New Wars' and the Environment	13
	1.4	Slow and Structural Violence	19
	1.5	Overview of Arguments	25
	PART	TI CONCEPTS, THEORIES, AND DEBATES	
2	The	Ecology of War and Peace: Unpacking the Assumptions	31
	2.1	Introduction	31
	2.2	The Place of the Environment within Peace	
		and Conflict Studies	32
		2.2.1 Of Scarcity, Greed, and Grievances: Nature	
		and the Root Causes of Violent Conflict	36
		2.2.2 'Illicit' Trade in Natural Resources and the Politica	al
		Economy of Civil Wars	44
		2.2.3 Environmental Peacebuilding and the Spectre	
		of 'Liberal Peace'	48
	2.3	Adding Environmental Justice to the Picture	52
	2.4	Conclusion	58
3	Orig	ins and Evolutions of Legal Debates	
	on tl	ne Environment-Conflict 'Nexus'	60
	3.1	Introduction	60

V



4

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-83752-1 — The Ecology of War and Peace Eliana Cusato Frontmatter More Information

vi Contents

3.2		Grotius to the Contemporary <i>Jus in Bello</i> : Necessity, etion, and Proportionality as the Standards for	
		onmental Protection	64
3.3	Adding	ng to Ecocide Perpetrated in the Vietnam War: g the 'Environment' to the Laws of Armed Conflict	71
3.4	War C	990–1 Gulf War and the Codification of Environmental Crime in the Statute of the International Criminal	
	Court	D D (III L) D	76
3.5	-	retative Routes to Restrain 'Illegal' Resource	0
_	-	tation during Armed Conflict and Occupation	81
3.6	•	d the Laws of Armed Conflict	88
	3.6.1	Multilateral Environmental Agreements and Principles of Environmental Law: 'Greening'	
		the Jus in Bello?	88
	3.6.2	International Human Rights Law	00
	3.0.2	and the Environment: A Complicated Relationship	93
3.7	Concl		101
,			
PART	'II TH	E PRACTICE OF INTERNATIONAL LAW	
		Tribunals and the International Court of Justice: een Property Protection and Humanitarian	
	cerns		105
4.1	Introd	uction	105
4.2		ational and Hybrid Criminal Tribunals	107
4.2	4.2.1	Post–World War II Tribunals and the Prosecution	10 /
	4	of Property Crimes	107
	4.2.2	The NATO Bombing Campaign in Former	,
	•	Yugoslavia: The Environment as a 'Casualty'	
		of Warfare	111
	4.2.3	The Environment as the Means to Commit	
		Humanitarian Atrocities	116
	4.2.4	The Special Court for Sierra Leone, Natural	
		Resources, and the Economic Motives for Armed	
		Struggle	119
4.3		Different Paradigms of Justice: The Tension between	
		ational Criminal Justice and Environmental Justice	122
4.4		nternational Court of Justice	130
	4.4.1	The Nuclear Weapons Advisory Opinion: Slow	
		Violence and Non Liquet	120



		Contents	vii
	4.5	4.4.2 The Armed Activities Case (Congo v. Uganda) Conclusion	137 151
5	Reso	United Nations Security Council: From 'Conflict urces' to Climate Change as a 'Threat' to International	
	Peac	e and Security	153
	5.1	Introduction	153
	5.2	Sanctions and Resource-Driven Armed Conflict	156
		5.2.1 A Few Words on Sanctions	156
		5.2.2 The Evolving Objectives of Sanctions Targeting	
		'Conflict Resources': From Conflict Termination	
		to Governance Interventions	159
	5.3	The UNSC and the Global Regulation of Resource Extraction in Conflict Zones	160
	- 1	Implementing Sanctions: Peacekeeping Operations	163
	5.4	and Panels of Experts	169
		5.4.1 Securitising Resource Extraction	169
		5.4.2 'Naming and Shaming' and Corporate Due	109
		Diligence	173
	5.5	A Narrow and Short-Term Approach to Peace	178
).)	5.5.1 Ignoring Conflict Root Causes	178
		5.5.2 Overlooking Sustainability Challenges	182
	5.6	Climate Change and International Peace and Security	186
		5.6.1 Different Accounts of 'Climate Security'	186
		5.6.2 Rethinking the Powers of the UNSC and Orthodox	
		Approaches to Peace and Security	190
	5.7	Conclusion	195
6	Trut	h Commissions: Conflicts over Extractive Resources	
O		the Battle for Different Views of Nature	197
	6.1	Introduction	
	6.2	A Brief Overview of Truth Commissions	197 201
	6.3	Constructing the 'Truth' about Resource-Driven Wars	201
	0.3	in Sierra Leone, Liberia, and Timor-Leste	203
		6.3.1 Setting the Stage: Natural Resources and Conflict	203
		Causes and Dynamics	203
		6.3.2 Human Rights Abuses and 'Illegal' Resource	-~5
		Extraction	210
	6.4	Three Paradigms of Responsibility	217



viii		Contents	
		6.4.1 The Sierra Leonean TC: The Post-conflict State	
		as the 'Main Agent of Change'	217
		6.4.2 The Liberian TC: The 'Economic Crimes' Lens	222
		6.4.3 The Timor-Leste TC: A Progressive Reading of	
		Socio-economic and Nature Rights	226
	6.5	Conclusion	229
7	Con	clusion: Towards a Political Ecology of International Law	231
	7.1	Reframing 'the Environment' and Its Relation to Humanity	
	,	in Rules Governing War	235
	7.2	Embracing Complexity: Rethinking the 'Nexus' between	
	•	Nature, Conflict, and Peace	238
	7.3	Towards a Political Ecology of International Law	240
Bibl	iogra <u>f</u>	phy	² 43
Inde	2x	•	278



Acknowledgements

Considerate la vostra semenza: fatti non foste a viver come bruti, ma per seguir virtute e canoscenza.¹

Writing this book has been a journey, of the kind that Ulysses undertook in *The Odyssey*. I crossed oceans and moved to another continent far away from home, Italy, to find the inspiration, ideas, and focus needed to pursue a PhD at the National University of Singapore (NUS). This book expands upon my doctoral dissertation and was completed during my first year as a lecturer at Essex Law School. It was not an easy journey, but I learned immensely from the challenges that I had to face. Yet, I could not have reached my 'intellectual destination' without the support of different institutions, communities, and inspiring individuals, whom I wish to thank here.

First and foremost, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to Vincent-Joël Proulx; without his excellent supervision during my PhD and continued support this book would not have been possible. He not only helped me develop my own approach to the issues examined, providing essential advice and engaging in thought-provoking discussions, but has been a mentor and a friend, fuelling my interest in research and academia. I wish to thank wholeheartedly the members of the PhD examining committee, Antony Anghie, Simon Chesterman, and Phoebe Okowa for their insightful comments on my dissertation and encouragement to pursue the publication of this monograph. I am also indebted to many Law Faculty members at NUS for their teaching and advice during the years spent there: Cheah Wui Ling, Simon Chesterman, Michael Dowdle, Gerardine Goh, Victor Kattan, Koh

D. Alighieri, The Divine Comedy: Inferno, Canto XXVI, also known as Ulysses' Canto. 'Consider ye the seed from which ye sprang: Ye were not made to live like unto brutes, But for pursuit of virtue and of knowledge.'



x

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-83752-1 — The Ecology of War and Peace Eliana Cusato Frontmatter More Information

Acknowledgements

Kheng Lian, Lye Lin-Heng, Jolene Lin, James Penner, Tan Hsien-Li, and Thio Li-Ann. Antony Anghie deserves a special mention. His lectures and scholarship have been truly eye-opening and helped me realise the kind of teacher and scholar I hope to become one day.

I am truly grateful for the friendship and support of fellow doctoral students and post-doc researchers at NUS: Benoit Mayer, Prabhakar Singh, Diego Mejia-Lemos, Harisankar K. S., Wilson Tay, Katherine Gallup Southwick, Rebecka Koziomtzis, Inga Martinkute, Ronnakorn Bunmee, Francine Hug, Jayson Lamchek, Marija Jovanovic, and Kim Heejin. They will always hold a special place in my heart.

The ideas advanced in this book benefited from fruitful exchanges with participants and faculty at several conferences, including King's College Transnational Law Summer Institute (2017); Harvard Institute for Global Law and Policy Scholars Workshop (2018 and 2019); Doctoral Forum on Legal Theory at Melbourne University (2018); and LSE Workshop Gender, Peace, and Nature (2019). My capacity to think about and beyond the law was greatly enhanced thanks to interactions with amazing critical scholars, including Julia Dhem, Vidya Kumar, Fleur Johns, Sundhya Pahuja, and Fabia Vecoso. During my time as a visiting fellow at the Grotius Centre of Leiden University, I benefited from discussions with Daniella Dam-de Jong, and Larissa van den Herik. At the Lauterpacht Centre, Cambridge University, I had enriching conversations with Sarah Nouwen and Surabhi Ranganathan, as well as other visiting scholars. I am also genuinely grateful to Karen Hulme, who read this monograph and provided invaluable feedback. I received helpful comments from the two anonymous reviewers from Cambridge University Press, whom I would like to thank in addition to Tom Randall, for bringing this project to fruition. I am also indebted to Alice Stoakley, who was the copy editor for this book, for her commitment and close readings of the chapters.

Last, but not least, I am fortunate to have enjoyed the unconditional support of my family and friends, in Italy, Singapore, the UK, and elsewhere. I could not have pursued a PhD and written this book without the love, encouragement, and generosity of my parents, Leonardo and Maria Grazia. Finally, I owe special thanks to the person who instilled in me the passion for travelling and discovery, Mickael, without whom I would never have started the lifechanging journey to Asia, which brought me here today.

The drafting of this book was completed in December 2020.