

## GOVERNING SMART CITIES AS KNOWLEDGE COMMONS

The rise of “smart” – or technologically advanced – cities has been well documented, while governance of such technology has remained unresolved. Integrating surveillance, AI, automation, and smart tech within basic infrastructure as well as public and private services and spaces raises a complex set of ethical, economic, political, social, and technological questions. The Governing Knowledge Commons (GKC) framework provides a descriptive lens through which to structure case studies examining smart tech deployment and commons governance in different cities. This volume deepens our understanding of community governance institutions, the social dilemmas communities face, and the dynamic relationships between data, technology, and human lives. For students, professors, and practitioners of law and policy dealing with a wide variety of planning, design, and regulatory issues relating to cities, these case studies illustrate options to develop best practice. Available through Open Access, the volume provides detailed guidance for communities deploying smart tech.

BRETT M. FRISCHMANN is Charles Widger Endowed University Professor in Law, Business and Economics at Villanova University.

MICHAEL J. MADISON is Senior Scholar with the University of Pittsburgh Institute for Cyber Law, Policy, and Security, and Faculty Director of the Future Law Project and a John E. Murray Faculty Scholar at the University of Pittsburgh School of Law.

MADelyn ROSE SANFILIPPO is Assistant Professor in the School of Information Sciences, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign.

## CAMBRIDGE STUDIES ON GOVERNING KNOWLEDGE COMMONS

The mission of the series is to provide an authoritative space for high quality scholarship on the governance of knowledge commons. Following the path pioneered by Elinor Ostrom, recipient of the Nobel Prize in Economics for her work on institutional analysis of commons regimes in the natural environment, and the editors' work in *Governing Knowledge Commons*, this series uses a similar framework to systematically study knowledge commons in various sectors. Readers seeking more information on knowledge commons and this series can visit <http://knowledge-commons.net>, a repository for scholarship produced by an international, interdisciplinary group of knowledge commons researchers.

### *Series Editors*

Katherine J. Strandburg  
Brett M. Frischmann  
Michael J. Madison  
Madelyn Rose Sanfilippo

### *Other Books in the Series*

Katherine J. Strandburg, Brett M. Frischmann and Michael J. Madison (eds.)  
Governing Medical Knowledge Commons  
Madelyn Rose Sanfilippo, Brett M. Frischmann and Katherine J. Strandburg (eds.)  
Governing Privacy in Knowledge Commons  
Erwin Dekker and Pavel Kuchař (eds.) Governing Markets as Knowledge  
Commons

# Governing Smart Cities as Knowledge Commons

Edited by

**BRETT M. FRISCHMANN**

Villanova University, Pennsylvania

**MICHAEL J. MADISON**

University of Pittsburgh School of Law

**MADelyn ROSE SANFILIPPO**

University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-108-83717-0 — Governing Smart Cities as Knowledge Commons  
Edited by Brett M. Frischmann, Michael J. Madison, Madelyn Rose Sanfilippo  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,  
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of  
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108837170](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108837170)  
DOI: 10.1017/9781108938532

© 2023 Cambridge University Press & Assessment

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of  
relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link  
for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without  
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at [doi.org/10.1017/9781108938532](https://doi.org/10.1017/9781108938532) under a Creative Commons  
Open Access license CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any  
medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may  
not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this license, visit [https://  
creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0)

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties.

Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI [10.1017/9781108938532](https://doi.org/10.1017/9781108938532)

First published 2023

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress*

ISBN 978-1-108-83717-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence  
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this  
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will  
remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page vii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xi
<b>Introduction</b>	1
<i>Madelyn Rose Sanfilippo, Michael J. Madison, and Brett M. Frischmann</i>	
<b>1 Smart Cities and Knowledge Commons</b>	6
<i>Michael J. Madison, Madelyn Rose Sanfilippo, and Brett M. Frischmann</i>	
<b>PART I SOCIAL DILEMMAS AROUND URBAN DATA</b>	
<b>2 The Challenge for Cities of Governing Spatial Data Privacy</b>	29
<i>Feiyang Sun and Jan Whittington</i>	
<b>3 Open Governments, Open Data: Moving toward a Digital Commons Framework</b>	58
<i>Anjanette H. Raymond and Inna Kouper</i>	
<b>PART II POLYCENTRICITY AND URBAN DATA</b>	
<b>4 Community Land Trusts as a Knowledge Commons: Challenges and Opportunities</b>	83
<i>Natalie Chyi and Dan Wu</i>	

5	<b>Smart Tech Deployment and Governance in Philadelphia</b> <i>Brett M. Frischmann and Marsha Tonkovich</i>	112
6	<b>The Kind of Solution a Smart City Is: Knowledge Commons and Postindustrial Pittsburgh</b> <i>Michael J. Madison</i>	157
<b>PART III PRIVATE INFLUENCE ON DECISION-MAKING</b>		
7	<b>Technofuturism in Play: Privacy, Surveillance, and Innovation at Walt Disney World</b> <i>Madelyn Rose Sanfilippo and Yan Shvartzshnaider</i>	223
8	<b>Can a Smart City Exist as Commons? The Case of Automated Governance in Sidewalk Toronto</b> <i>Anna Artyushina</i>	248
9	<b>From Thurii to Quayside: Creating Inclusive Blended Spaces in Digital Communities</b> <i>Richard Whitt</i>	267
<b>PART IV LESSONS FOR SMART CITIES</b>		
10	<b>A Proposal for Principled Decision-Making: Beyond Design Principles</b> <i>Madelyn Rose Sanfilippo and Brett M. Frischmann</i>	295
	<b>Conclusion</b> <i>Brett M. Frischmann, Michael J. Madison, and Madelyn Rose Sanfilippo</i>	309

## Figures

Figure 1.1 The GKC framework. <i>Source</i> : Madison, Frischmann, and Strandburg (2010)	<i>page</i> 17
Figure 2.1 The internal structure of an action situation (Ostrom 2011)	31
Figure 2.2 Organization chart of the Privacy Program and related areas (Whittington, Young, and Ambruster 2018)	39
Figure 2.3 Criteria of a surveillance technology under surveillance ordinance	45
Figure 3.1 Public record request form	74
Figure 3.2 Number of rental properties by zip code in Bloomington, Indiana	75
Figure 5.1 City of Philadelphia Metadata Catalog website	122
Figure 5.2 City of Philadelphia SmartCityPHL Roadmap (p. 5), Survey of Existing Assets and Initiatives	127
Figure 5.3 City of Philadelphia SmartCityPHL Roadmap (p. 8), Governance Structure	128
Figure 5.4 City of Philadelphia DataBridge	130
Figure 5.5 City of Philadelphia SmartCityPHL Roadmap (p. 16), decision-making process	132
Figure 5.6 City of Philadelphia SmartCityPHL Roadmap (p. 18), Pitch + Pilot	133
Figure 6.1 Smart city action arenas in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania	173
Figure 7.1 Categorical perceptions of action arenas	231
Figure 9.1 Screens, scenes, and unseens, GLIA Foundation	273
Figure 9.2 “SEA” cycle flows, GLIA Foundation	274
Figure 9.3 “SEAMs” cycle flows, GLIA Foundation	274
Figure 9.4 Digital fiduciary and data trusts, GLIA Foundation	287

## Tables

Table 1.1	The GKC framework	<i>page</i> 19
Table 2.1	Privacy taxonomy and action situations	41
Table 2.2	Relevant state and federal legislative activities (compiled from Privacy Program Annual Report 2019)	42
Table 2.3	Action situations and rule configurations	47
Table 2.4	Development of the City of Seattle's Privacy Program (Privacy Office 2018)	49
Table 2.5	Number of assessments by type of privacy review (compiled from Privacy Program Annual Report (Seattle Information Technology Department, 2018, 2019)	50
Table 2.6	Number of technologies reviewed by the surveillance ordinance (compiled from Surveillance Technology Determination Report 2017–21, <a href="http://www.seattle.gov/tech/initiatives/privacy/surveillance-technologies/additional-surveillance-reports#2018">www.seattle.gov/tech/initiatives/privacy/surveillance-technologies/additional-surveillance-reports#2018</a> )	51
Table 2.7	List of technologies determined as surveillance technology (compiled from Surveillance Technology Determination Report 2017–21, <a href="http://www.seattle.gov/tech/initiatives/privacy/surveillance-technologies/additional-surveillance-reports#2018">www.seattle.gov/tech/initiatives/privacy/surveillance-technologies/additional-surveillance-reports#2018</a> )	51
Table 2.8	Number of public meetings held by departments or groups from 2018 to 2020 (compiled from the City's Event Calendar, City of Seattle 2018–20)	52
Table 2.9	Selected results from the City of Seattle's Technology Access and Adoption Survey, 2013 and 2018	53
Table 5.1	Socioeconomic background Philadelphia	114
Table 5.2	Pitch and Pilot programs	134
Table 5.3	Smart tools for vacant property management	143
Table 5.4	Codes per document group statistics	151



Table 5.5 Percentage of codes used across document groups	151
Table 6.1 Infrastructure	197
Table 6.2 Citizen access to public processes	202
Table 6.3 Public ICTs for citizen utility	204
Table 6.4 Public ICTs for data-based decision-making	206
Table 6.5 Public support of ICTs in education and business	209
Table 6.6 Community data production	210

## Contributors

**Anna Artyushina** is a research fellow in data governance and a PhD candidate in Science and Technology Studies at York University, Canada.

**Natalie Chyi** is a fellow with the Future of Property Rights at New America and a policy manager at Facebook and Oculus.

**Brett M. Frischmann** is Charles Widger Endowed University Professor in Law, Business, and Economics at Villanova University Charles Widger School of Law, Pennsylvania.

**Inna Kouper** is a research scientist at Indiana University Bloomington.

**Michael J. Madison** is Professor of Law and Faculty Director of the Future Law Project at the University of Pittsburgh School of Law, Pennsylvania.

**Anjanette H. Raymond** is a PhD candidate at the Centre for Commercial Law Studies, Queen Mary, University of London, an associate professor at the Kelley School of Business, Indiana University Bloomington, and an adjunct associate professor of law at Maurer Law School, Indiana University Bloomington.

**Madelyn Rose Sanfilippo** is an assistant professor in the School of Information Sciences at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign.

**Yan Shvartzshnaider** is an assistant professor and faculty fellow in the Courant Institute of Mathematical Sciences at New York University.

**Feiyang Sun** is a PhD candidate and research assistant at the University of Washington.

**Marsha Tonkovich** is an associate professor in the political science department of the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences at Villanova University, Pennsylvania.

**Richard Whitt** is a corporate strategist and technology policy attorney, Fellow in Residence with the Mozilla Foundation, and Senior Fellow with the Georgetown Institute for Technology Law and Policy, Washington.

**Jan Whittington** is an associate professor in the Department of Urban Design and Planning at the University of Washington.

**Dan Wu** is a senior project manager at Immuta.