

Understanding Intelligence

Have you ever wondered why psychologists still can't agree on what intelligence is? Or felt dismayed by debates around individual differences? Criticising the pitfalls of IQ testing, this book explains the true nature of intelligent systems, and their evolution from cells to brains to culture and human minds.

Understanding Intelligence debunks many of the myths and misunderstandings surrounding intelligence. It takes a new look at the nature of the environment and the development of 'talent' and achievement. This brings fresh and radical implications for promoting intelligence and creativity, and prompts readers to reconsider their own possibilities and aspirations.

Providing a broad context to the subject, the author also unmasks the ideological distortions of intelligence in racism and eugenics, and the suppressed expectations across social classes and genders.

This book is a must-read for anyone curious about our own intelligence.

Ken Richardson is a former senior lecturer at the Open University, UK, and an independent researcher, consultant, and author. After completing a doctorate in brain biochemistry he became interested in cognitive systems, chiefly developmental, and how these areas, as intelligent systems, are inter-related through evolution.





> The *Understanding Life* series is for anyone wanting an engaging and concise way into a key biological topic. Offering a multidisciplinary perspective, these accessible guides address common misconceptions and misunderstandings in a thoughtful way to help stimulate debate and encourage a more in-depth understanding. Written by leading thinkers in each field, these books are for anyone wanting an expert overview that will enable clearer thinking on each topic.

Series Editor: Kostas Kampourakis http://kampourakis.com

Published titles

i dononea titles		
Understanding Evolution	Kostas Kampourakis	9781108746083
Understanding Coronavirus	Raul Rabadan	9781108826716
Understanding Development	Alessandro Minelli	9781108799232
Understanding Evo-Devo	Wallace Arthur	9781108819466
Understanding Genes	Kostas Kampourakis	9781108812825
Understanding DNA Ancestry	Sheldon Krimsky	9781108816038
Understanding Intelligence	Ken Richardson	9781108940368
Understanding Metaphors in	Andrew S. Reynolds	9781108940498
the Life Sciences		
Forthcoming		
Forthcoming		
Understanding Creationism	Glenn Branch	9781108927505
Understanding Species	John S. Wilkins	9781108987196
Understanding the Nature–	Eric Turkheimer	9781108958165
Nurture Debate		
Understanding How Science	Kevin McCain	9781108995504
Explains the World		
Understanding Cancer	Robin Hesketh	9781009005999
Understanding Forensic DNA	Suzanne Bell and	9781009044011
-	John Butler	
Understanding Race	Rob DeSalle and	9781009055581
~	Ian Tattersall	
Understanding Fertility	Gab Kovacs	9781009054164





Understanding Intelligence

KEN RICHARDSON Formerly of the Open University, UK





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108837132

DOI: 10.1017/9781108937757

© Ken Richardson 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ Books Limited, Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Richardson, Ken, author.

Title: Understanding intelligence / Ken Richardson, Formerly of the Open University, UK. Description: 1 Edition. | r, New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Series: Understanding life | Includes index.

 $\label{logocharacter} Identifiers: LCCN 2021022821 (print) \mid LCCN 2021022822 (ebook) \mid ISBN 9781108837132 (hardback) \mid ISBN 9781108940368 (paperback) \mid ISBN 9781108937757 (ebook) Subjects: LCSH: Eugenics. | Intellect. | Intelligence levels. | BISAC: MEDICAL / Neuroscience Classification: LCC HQ751 .R53 2021 (print) | LCC HQ751 (ebook) | DDC 363.9/2–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021022821$

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021022822

ISBN 978-1-108-83713-2 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-94036-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



'Ken Richardson has written a masterful book about intelligence. In contrast to what leading behavioural geneticists and psychometrically oriented psychologists see as the moderately or highly heritable trait of general intelligence (IQ), Richardson explains why psychometric and behavioural genetic arguments fail, and how intelligence should be seen as a socially acquired characteristic. A longstanding expert on intelligence, he writes in a manner that can be understood by both academic and general readers. I strongly recommend this book as an accessible and important counterweight to mainstream descriptions of intelligence in the fields of psychology and behavioural genetics, and in the media.' Jay Joseph, Psy.D., psychologist and author, Oakland, California, USA

'Ken Richardson's *Understanding Intelligence* is a timely and important addition to Cambridge University Press's groundbreaking Understanding Life series. Richardson provides a "natural history of intelligence", and no facet of that complex topic goes untouched – adaptive evolution, embryology, endocrinology, circadian rhythms, neural networks, cooperative hunting. In our current moment, where scholars and politicians alike are calling for gene-guided education and appealing to innate differences as the cause of racial disparities, Richardson debunks myth after myth about cognitive ability: that the brain is best conceptualised as a machine, that IQ tests measure intelligence, that different racial groups have naturally different intellectual aptitudes, that the genome is a programme for cognitive development. The esteemed psychologist, in exchange, offers a vision of intelligence as a dynamic, interactive, developing, adaptive system – a system that allows every person to intellectually flourish, if only they are given the opportunity.'

James Tabery, Professor of Philosophy, University of Utah, USA

'For decades, Ken Richardson has been a leading voice within the critical approaches to intelligence in psychology. He patiently and determinedly interrogated the often taken for granted assumptions – and myths – about the meaning of intelligence, about how it can be measured and tested, about its heritability or its applicability as a measure of intellectual ability in the school or the workplace. *Understanding Intelligence* provides a thoroughly researched and persuasively argued up-to-date overview of this important work. It is sure to become an indispensable resource for both academics and practitioners, and indeed for anyone interested in one of psychology's most controversial, and flawed, concepts.'

Jovan Byford, Senior Lecturer in Psychology, The Open University, UK





Contents

	Foreword	page xv
	Preface	xvii
1	Testing, Testing	1
	An Unnatural Measure	2
	Physiological Testing	4
	'We Classify'	5
	Original Mental Endowment	6
	Mass Testing	7
	And in Britain	8
	Validity Vacuum	8
	Score Patterns	9
	Scores Agree – It Must Be 'g'	11
	Predictive Validity	13
	Differences in What?	14
	Real-Life Complexity	18
	Familiarity and Class	19
	Not Intelligence	19
	Other Ideas	20
	Use of IQ Tests	22
	Back to Physiology	23
2	In the Genes?	25
	An Agricultural Model	26
	Cyril Burt's Twin Correlations	30
	Other Twins Reared Apart	31
	Really Reared Apart?	32



x CONTENTS

	'Classical' Twin Studies	32
	More False Assumptions	33
	Make-Do Data	35
	Adopted Children's IQs	35
	DNA: The Genie Out of the Bottle?	37
	Polygenic Scores	39
	Or Just Another Damp Squib?	40
	Precision Science?	43
3	Intelligent Systems	44
	In the Beginning	45
	Then There Was Life	47
	They Became Systems	48
	Intelligent Life	49
	The Environment	51
	Why No Genes?	52
	We've Had It All Wrong	53
	Sensing Change	54
	Networks, Loops, and Tunes	55
	Intelligent Behaviour	57
	How Genes Are (Intelligently) Used	58
	Strange Codes: Impossible Programmes	61
	Heritability Futility	63
4	Intelligence Evolving	66
	Change and Complexity	67
	Cells Get Together	68
	Multicellular Systems	70
	Physiology: The Intelligence of Multicellular Organisms	72
	Not a Machine	73
	Hormones Work in Concert	75
	Coordinated Adaptability	75
	Rhythms	77
	Behaviour	79
	Nervous Systems	80



		CONTENTS	Хİ
	Network Function		82
	A New Intelligence: Why?		84
5	Intelligent Development		86
	Why Development?		87
	One Becomes Many		88
	Knowing What to Become		90
	Morphogen Harmonies		91
	Sticking to a Course		93
	Choosing Alternatives		94
	Developing Brains		96
	Life-Long Development		97
	Developmental Maps?		98
	Innate or Developed?		100
	Genetic Causes		101
	Development and Evolution		103
6	Intelligent Machine?		105
	What the Brain Is For		107
	The Intelligent Solution		108
	Brain Structure		112
	Senses Together		116
	Cognitive Intelligence		117
	Experience-Dependence		119
	Intelligence with Feeling		120
	MRI: Seeing Intelligence?		122
7	Becoming Human		126
•	Swarm Intelligence		127
	Shoals, Flocks, and Herds		128
	Mammal Intelligence		129
	Cooperative Hunting		130
	Cooperative Apes?		132
	Human Evolution		133
	Homo sapiens		134
	Fit for Social Life		135



xii CONTENTS

	The Social Brain	137
	Culture	139
	Cultured Intelligence	141
	Incorporation into a Social World	142
	Thinking and Reasoning	142
	Language	144
	Memory	145
	Science Is a Cultural Tool	146
	A Brain for Culture	146
8	Individual Differences	148
	Order and Control	148
	Robert Plomin's Genie	149
	Charles Murray's Human Diversity	150
	Kevin Mitchell's Account	151
	Passive Variation	152
	Individual and Social	153
	Class Systems Emerged	155
	Top of the Pile	156
	The Other End	156
	The Missing Environment	158
	Genius	160
	'Race' and Racism	162
	Controversies	164
	Human 'Races' Don't Exist	166
9	Promoting Intelligence	168
	The Intelligence in Education	168
	What Does IQ Predict?	170
	What Do School Attainments Predict?	171
	And in Real Life?	173
	Learning Ability Evaporates	175
	Testing for Social Class Not Ability	176
	What Alternatives?	178
	Compensatory Programmes	180
	Cognitive Enhancement	182



	CONTENTS	xiii
Artificial Intelligence		183
Intelligence for All		184
Summary of Common Misunderstandings		188
Summary of the Book		194
References		198
Index		211





Foreword

What is intelligence? People often take the answer to this question as simple and straightforward. It seems to be about how 'smart' one is, and to be considered something that can be easily and objectively measured, for example, by how good at math one is, or by how well one does in problem-solving. There even exist smartphone apps that claim to measure one's intelligence. Or so the story goes. Intelligence is an attribute that is considered a good one, yet it is one of the most used ones to support discrimination. This was most prominently shown during the era of eugenics, when people described as 'feebleminded' might even be sterilised in order to be precluded from reproducing. But this is not over. Several prominent people nowadays still argue about the intellectual superiority of men over women; of 'white' people over 'black' people; of humans over other species. This is based on an important assumption: that we can accurately and unbiasedly measure intelligence. In this magnificent book Ken Richardson shows that it is far from simple and straightforward not only to measure intelligence, but also to define it. The author explains the biases of the widely known IQ tests, and their validity problems. Most importantly, he advances a broader conceptualisation of intelligence that will make you realise that it is a lot more than the narrow set of skills measured by IQ tests. It is a property of life, one that we should admire and not use for discrimination. To paraphrase a famous saying: several decades of unwarranted discrimination are enough.

Kostas Kampourakis, Series Editor





Preface

Superficially, intelligence seems so easy to understand. It's what most separates us from all other animals; as defining of humanity as flying is of birds or swimming is of fish. It's also one of the first things we note in distinguishing people from one another. You may mention to friends that so-and-so is 'intelligent', perhaps using a common word such as 'smart' or 'bright'. They will tend to nod as if we all know what we mean.

What we really mean will usually be rather vague, though. In spite of a constant presence in our lives and institutions, it comes with variable connotations. What we mean divides left and right in politics; legitimises people's places on social ladders; raises daunting issues about equality and social justice; and has long been used to justify different treatments of genders, social classes, and 'races', as well as some appalling acts done in the name of this concept.

How are we to understand it then? What is it, really? Scholars, from Ancient Greece to modern times, have wrestled with that question. Today, psychologists often think they've cracked it by presenting us with 'definitions' of intelligence. Take the recent example of Richard Haier (author of *The Neuroscience of Intelligence*, 2016) and Stuart Ritchie (author of *Intelligence: All that Matters*, 2018). Both adopt Linda Gottfredson's definition (from an article in 1997):

[Intelligence] ... involves the ability to reason, plan, solve problems, think abstractly, comprehend complex ideas, learn quickly and learn from experience. It is not merely book learning, a narrow academic skill,



xviii PREFACE

or test-taking smarts. Rather it reflects a broader and deeper capability for comprehending our surroundings – 'catching on', 'making sense' of things, or 'figuring out' what to do.

I hope you've got that – 'catching on', 'making sense', or 'figuring out' are hardly pristine scientific concepts. Nor (as we shall see) is there a lot of agreement about the real nature of reasoning, problem-solving, and so on. The problem is that definitions only sketch the *boundaries* of a function; outlining what it does or does not do, without describing the function itself. Definitions *ad nauseum* do not tell us much about intelligent functions, how they originated, develop, and materialise in such splendid and variable forms. Telling us all the things that a machine or computer can do does not tell us how they do it.

So the old joke still stands: ask a dozen psychologists what intelligence is and you'll get a dozen different answers. There's also that other one suggesting that 'intelligence is what intelligence tests test'. When it comes to describing what individual differences are differences *in*, we get simple mechanical metaphors – energy, power, strength, speed, capacity, and efficiency are common. Others are sharp, smart, bright, dull, and so on – again, hardly scientific. We *still* need to know what kind of function intelligence really is: not just what it does, but how it does what it does. Until we achieve that, the whole subject slips and slides like a wayward bar of soap under the shower.

Anyone might have expected objective (dare I say intelligent?) scientists to have solved the problem by now. Why not? Well, intelligence is not a neutral subject like liver functions or the immune system, researched dispassionately. Cutting across and smearing our streams of inquiry are other potent forces. The concept of intelligence, after all, has a huge bearing on social and political issues: as a supposed resource for a nation's economy; for selecting the right people for the right education, training, and jobs; and for justifying the ordering of people on a social ladder, with different treatments, powers, and privileges. That has stirred long-standing nature—nurture debates not entirely conducive to objective science.

Science is, of course, often funded and harnessed for socially practical ends. But different hunches or beliefs about intelligence reflect fundamentally different preconceptions of human nature. That is why intelligence has



PREFACE xix

often become an ideological football. That's a danger we should understand, because 'applied intelligence' can lead to dire consequences. Historically, IQ testing has been intertwined with eugenics movements, as well as proving the genetic inferiority of the working classes and different 'races'. Sad things have been said and done in its name.

Many scientists are currently fearful of a new wave of such things. Nightmarish elements of the designer baby industry were portrayed in the 1997 film *CATTACA* (see Kostas Kampourakis' discussion in *Understanding Genes*). In his blog in 2014, later UK government adviser Dominic Cummings wrote that, when a sufficient number of 'IQ genes' have been identified, then the state might consider subsidising suitable couples for selecting 'the egg that has the highest prediction for IQ'. Meanwhile, on the futility of intervention in what he sees as natural forces, Boris Johnson (now, in 2021, UK prime minister), was warning that, 'Whatever you may think of the value of IQ tests it is surely relevant to a conversation about equality that as many as 16% of our species have an IQ below 85 while about 2 per cent have an IQ above 130... The harder you shake the pack the easier it will be for some cornflakes to get to the top' (Third Margaret Thatcher Lecture, 2013).

Like a gale on a homing pigeon, such ideological forces have continuously blown objective inquiry off course and onto troubled reefs. Yet, intelligence remains a subject of genuine scientific interest to many biologists, psychologists, philosophers, sociologists, and anthropologists. For generations, they have asked genuine questions: What is it? How did it originate? How did it evolve? What form does it take in humans and in individuals? How does it vary, both across species and between humans as individuals?

Meanwhile, results pouring out from other fields – biophysics, genetics, molecular biology, physiology, evolutionary studies, brain sciences, cognitive psychology, and others – have been spinning out new strands needing to be pulled together. They are beginning to cohere into a compelling story. It says that intelligence is not something only in our brains and, thanks to their genes, good in only Johnson's top 2 per cent. Rather, it has been at the very roots of life from the beginning, impelling evolution, emerging further in brains and cognitive systems, and re-emerging in unsuspected, and sadly understated, forms in all humans.



XX PREFACE

Using those strands to bring intelligence to life is the ambition of this book. I try to present a kind of natural history of intelligence. My underlying message is: 'Intelligence is life; life is intelligence.' My hope in writing this book is that it will bring a better understanding of life's most wonderful phenomenon, and also that it will encourage people to banish fatalism and pessimism about their own abilities, and more confidently *create* their potential for democratic engagement.

One of the most exciting aspects of efforts such as this is that of working with the ideas of many other people. Those who have unwittingly helped are too numerous to name here, but I hope they recognise my thanks in these pages. A number of friends and colleagues did, however, take the trouble to plough through most or all of the pages to offer suggestions and criticism. I would like to particularly thank Mike Jones, Jay Joseph, Stephen Block, Meg Brown, Philip Thompson, Susan Richardson, and Annie Watt. They were probably more helpful than they know. I'm also grateful to series editor Kostas Kampourakis for being exceedingly detailed and thorough in helping to shape up the drafts. I can only hope the result is a worthy reflection of all that wisdom.