

"A path-breaking set of essays that examines the driving forces and consequences of the transnationalization of criminal justice law and policy, with reference to criminalizing global social problems, tackling impunity for serious international crimes, and efforts to build human rights penal standards. The work is guided by a coherent theory of the varying roles of states in transnational legal orders. No student of contemporary criminal justice should miss the chance to learn from the theory and case studies."

David Nelken, King's College London

"Norms of criminal justice, no less than crime itself, refuse to remain neatly contained within national jurisdictions. Gregory Shaffer and Ely Aaronson's collection of essays illustrates the ways in which a reasonably distinct transnational order has developed, become elaborated, and in some cases encountered contradiction and resistance. One of the book's great insights is that the transnational legal ordering of criminal law has in some ways empowered the state to reclaim its own legal authority. Read this book, and you will appreciate the impossibility of dichotomizing the study of modern 'national' and 'international' criminal law."

Beth A. Simmons, Andrea Mitchell University Professor of Law, Political Science and Business Ethics, University of Pennsylvania

"The norms, institutions, and practices of criminal justice systems around the world have been deeply transformed in the last few decades by globalization and many new international and transnational legal regimes. Criminal justice, comparative law, and international law scholars are still grappling with these changes. By applying the illuminating theory of transnational legal ordering to criminal justice, this impressive group of top scholars gathered in this book provides crucial insights to make sense of these changes. This book is an essential tool for anyone interested in them."

Máximo Langer, Professor of Law and Director of the Transnational Program on Criminal Justice, UCLA School of Law





TRANSNATIONAL LEGAL ORDERING OF CRIMINAL JUSTICE

Hard and soft law developed by international and regional organizations, transgovernmental networks, and international courts increasingly shape rules, procedures, and practices governing criminalization, policing, prosecution, and punishment. This dynamic calls into question traditional approaches that study criminal justice from a predominantly national perspective or that dichotomize the study of international from national criminal law. Building on socio-legal theories of transnational legal ordering, this book develops a new approach for studying the interaction between international and domestic criminal law and practice. Distinguished scholars from different disciplines apply this approach in ten case studies of transnational legal ordering that address transnational crimes such as money laundering, corruption, and human trafficking; international crimes such as mass atrocities; and human rights abuses in law enforcement. The book provides a comprehensive treatment of the changing transnational nature of criminal justice policy making and practice in today's globalized world.

GREGORY SHAFFER is Chancellor's Professor at the University of California, Irvine. His publications include seven books and more than one hundred articles and book chapters, including Constitution-Making and Transnational Legal Order (with Ginsburg and Halliday, 2019), Transnational Legal Orders (with Halliday, 2015), and Transnational Legal Ordering and State Change (2013).

ELY AARONSON is Associate Professor at the University of Haifa, Faculty of Law. His main areas of scholarship include legal history, sociolegal theory, criminal justice, and comparative and transnational legal theory. He is the author of *From Slave Abuse to Hate Crime: The Criminalization of Racial Violence in American History* (2014).



CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN LAW AND SOCIETY

Founded in 1997, Cambridge Studies in Law and Society is a hub for leading scholarship in socio-legal studies. Located at the intersection of law, the humanities, and the social sciences, it publishes empirically innovative and theoretically sophisticated work on law's manifestations in everyday life: from discourses to practices, and from institutions to cultures. The series editors have longstanding expertise in the interdisciplinary study of law, and welcome contributions that place legal phenomena in national, comparative, or international perspective. Series authors come from a range of disciplines, including anthropology, history, law, literature, political science, and sociology.

Series Editors

Mark Fathi Massoud, *University of California*, *Santa Cruz* Jens Meierhenrich, *London School of Economics and Political Science* Rachel E. Stern, *University of California*, *Berkeley*

A list of books in the series can be found at the back of this book.



TRANSNATIONAL LEGAL ORDERING OF CRIMINAL JUSTICE

Edited by

Gregory Shaffer University of California, Irvine

Ely Aaronson University of Haifa





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108836586

DOI: 10.1017/9781108873994

© Cambridge University Press 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Shaffer, Gregory C., 1958– editor. | Aaronson, Ely, 1973– editor.

Title: Transnational legal ordering of criminal justice / edited by Gregory Shaffer, University of California, Irvine [and] Ely Aaronson, University of Haifa, Israel.

of California, Irvine [and] Ely Aaronson, University of Haifa, Israel.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University

Press, 2020. | "This book arose out of a series of workshops we held on the topic at the annual meeting of the Law and Society Association in Toronto and a two-day exchange at the University of California, Irvine, in 2018" – ECIP acknowledgements. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019060069 (print) | LCCN 2019060070 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108836586 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108873994 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Transnational crime – Law and legislation – Congresses. Classification: LCC K5014.8 . T73 2020 (print) | LCC K5014.8 (ebook) |

DDC 345/.0235-dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2019060069

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2019060070

ISBN 978-1-108-83658-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> Gregory Shaffer would like to dedicate this book to Michele, Brooks, and Sage Ely Aaronson would like to dedicate this book to Karin, Daniel, and Yahli





CONTENTS

	t of Figures	page xi
Lis	t of Tables	xii
Lis	t of Contributors	xiii
Ac	knowledgments	xv
PΑ	RT I INTRODUCTION	
1	The Transnational Legal Ordering of Criminal Justice	
	ELY AARONSON AND GREGORY SHAFFER	3
PΑ	RT II TRANSNATIONAL LEGAL ORDERING	
	AND TRANSNATIONAL CRIMES	
2	Why Do Transnational Legal Orders Persist? The Curious	
	Case of Money-Laundering Controls	
	TERENCE HALLIDAY, MICHAEL LEVI, AND PETER REUTER	51
3	Transnational Criminal Law or the Transnational Legal	
	Ordering of Corruption? Theorizing Australian Corporate	
	Foreign Bribery Reforms	
	RADHA IVORY	84
4	Transnational Criminal Law in a Globalized World: The	
	Case of Trafficking	
	PRABHA KOTISWARAN	120
5	The Criminalization of Migration: A Regional Transnationa	1
	Legal Order or the Rise of a Meta-TLO?	
	VANESSA BARKER	154
6	The Strange Career of the Transnational Legal Order	
	of Cannabis Prohibition	
	ELY AARONSON	176

ix



CONTENTS

PA	RT III	TRANSNATIONAL LEGAL ORDERING AND INTERNATIONAL CRIMES	
7	Rights:	nti-impunity Transnational Legal Order for Human Formation, Institutionalization, Consequences, e Case of Darfur	
	JOACHI	M J. SAVELSBERG	205
8	Colombian Transitional Justice and the Political Economy of the Anti-impunity Transnational Legal Order		
	MANUE	L ITURRALDE	234
PΑ	RT IV	TRANSNATIONAL LEGAL ORDERING AND HUMAN RIGHTS STANDARDS IN CRIMINAL JUSTICE	
9	Interna Justice	ational Prison Standards and Transnational Criminal	
	DIRK V	AN ZYL SMIT	261
10		ransnational Legal Ordering of the Death Penalty	293
11	Performance, Power, and Transnational Legal Ordering: Addressing Sexual Violence as a Human Rights Concern		
	RON LE	VI AND IOANA SENDROIU	333
PA	RT V (CONCLUSION	
12	Conclu Legal (usions: A Processual Approach to Transnational Orders	
	SALLY I	ENGLE MERRY	369
Inde	ex		381

X



FIGURES

(.1	Number of articles on Darfur by country by year	page 22 4
7.2	Competing frames over stages marked by intervention	
	points	225
7.3	Use of the term "genocide" in media reports on Darfur	
	across countries	227
10.1	National abolition laws enacted	297
10.2	Death penalty abolition in national constitutions	297
10.3	National death penalty law, 2017	298
10.4	Abolition and retention by region, 2017	299
10.5	NGO documents mentioning the death penalty	308
10.6	Death penalty phrase matches in NGO documents	308
10.7	Likelihood of abolition: coefficient plot	311
11.1	MCA of recommendation characteristics	347
11.2	Stylized MCA	347
11.3	Support for recommendations, predicted estimates per ye	ar
	based on piecewise Model E	354
11.4	Support for recommendations by state under review leve	el
	of freedom, predicted estimates per year based on piecewi	se
	Models F and G	355
11.5	Support for recommendations by recommending state	
	freedom level, predicted estimates per year based on pie-	-
	cewise Models H and I	355



TABLES

1.1	Variations across types of criminal justice TLOs	page 20
7.1	Analytic dimensions of the Darfur conflict and their	
	use by holders of different positions in three social fields	223
10.1	Abolition in law, by decade	298
10.2	Death penalty abolition for all crimes: main models	321
10.3	Death penalty abolition for all crimes: additional variable	es 323
10.4	Top country-specific INGO death penalty references	
	(country year)	326
11.1	Growth curve models of recommendation acceptance	349
11.2	Piecewise growth curve models of recommendation	
	acceptance	353

xii



CONTRIBUTORS

The Editors

Gregory Shaffer is Chancellor's Professor at the University of California, Irvine, School of Law.

Ely Aaronson is Associate Professor at the University of Haifa, Faculty of Law.

The Authors

Vanessa Barker is Professor of Sociology at Stockholm University.

Terence Halliday is Research Professor, American Bar Foundation, and Honorary Professor, School of Regulation and Global Governance, the Australian National University.

Manuel Iturralde is Associate Professor at the Law Department, University of Los Andes (Colombia).

Radha Ivory is Senior Lecturer at the TC Beirne School of Law, University of Queensland, Australia.

Prabha Kotiswaran is Professor of Law and Social Justice at King's College London.

Michael Levi is Professor of Criminology at Cardiff University.

Ron Levi is Associate Professor and the holder of the George Ignatieff Chair of Peace and Conflict Studies at the Munk School of Global Affairs and the Department of Sociology, with cross-appointments in Law and in Political Science, at the University of Toronto.

Sally Engle Merry is Silver Professor and Professor of Anthropology at New York University.

Stefanie Neumeier is a PhD student in Political Science and International Relations at the University of Southern California.

Peter Reuter is Professor in the School of Public Policy and in the Department of Criminology at the University of Maryland.

xiii



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Wayne Sandholtz is the John A. McCone Chair in International Relations and Professor in the School of International Relations and Gould School of Law at the University of Southern California.

Joachim J. Savelsberg is Professor of Sociology and Law and holder of the Arsham and Charlotte Ohanessian Chair, University of Minnesota.

Ioana Sendroiu is a doctoral student in the Department of Sociology at the University of Toronto.

Dirk van Zyl Smit is Professor of Comparative and International Penal Law and Head of the School of Law at the University of Nottingham.



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The moment of saying "thank you" is always a pleasure. We are delighted to express our appreciation and gratitude to the outstanding group of scholars who joined us in this collaborative project. The opportunity to exchange ideas and learn from each other's work has been deeply enlightening and enjoyable. The substantial effort each of the contributors devoted to this project has helped sharpen the arguments that run through this book and develop new ways of thinking about the larger theoretical questions concerning the globalization of criminal law.

This book arose out of a series of workshops we held on the topic at the annual meeting of the Law and Society Association in Toronto and a two-day exchange at the University of California, Irvine, in 2018. We thank the participants in these events for the rich and stimulating discussions, including the commentators for the different papers: Eve Darian-Smith, Terence Halliday, Manuel Iturralde, Prabha Kotiswaran, Maximo Langer, Ron Levi, Felix Lüth, Mona Lynch, Sally Merry, Keramet Reiter, Wayne Sandholtz, and Joachim Savelsberg.

For funding for the two-day workshop at the University of California, Irvine, we thank the Center on Globalization, Law, and Society (GLAS). We also thank the Israeli Science Foundation for the support received under the terms of Ely Aaronson's research grant on the globalized dimensions of criminalization processes (grant no. 1281/14).

We are grateful to Finola O'Sullivan, Marianne Nield, and the editorial team at Cambridge University Press for their support and guidance through the editorial and publishing process. We also thank the series editors of Cambridge Studies in Law and Society (Mark Fathi Massoud, Jens Meierhenrich, and Rachel Stern) and two anonymous reviewers for their valuable suggestions.

Finally, we take great pleasure in thanking our families – Michele, Brooks, and Sage (for Greg), and Karin, Daniel, and Yahli (for Ely) – for their support. It is with love and gratitude that we dedicate this book to them.

χv

