

# Development, (Dual) Citizenship and Its Discontents in Africa

Drawing on rich oral histories from over two hundred in-depth interviews in West Africa, Europe, and North America, Robtel Neajai Pailey examines socio-economic change in Liberia, Africa's first black republic, through the prism of citizenship. Marking how historical policy changes on citizenship and contemporary public discourse on dual citizenship have impacted development policy and practice, she reveals that as Liberia transformed from a country of immigration to one of emigration, so too did the nature of citizenship, thus influencing claims for and against dual citizenship.

In this engaging contribution to scholarly and policy debates about citizenship as a continuum of inclusion and exclusion, and development as a process of both amelioration and degeneration, Pailey develops a new model for conceptualising citizenship within the context of crisis-affected states. In doing so, she offers a postcolonial critique of the neoliberal framing of diasporas and donors as *the* panacea to post-war reconstruction.

ROBTEL NEAJAI PAILEY is Assistant Professor in International Social and Public Policy at the London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE). A Liberian academic, activist, and author, she was previously Mo Ibrahim Foundation PhD Scholar at SOAS, University of London, and Leverhulme Early Career Fellow at the University of Oxford. Her core areas of research and policy expertise include the political economy of development, migration, race, citizenship, conflict, post-war recovery, and governance.



# African Studies Series

The African Studies series, founded in 1968, is a prestigious series of monographs, general surveys, and textbooks on Africa covering history, political science, anthropology, economics, and ecological and environmental issues. The series seeks to publish work by senior scholars as well as the best new research.

#### Editorial Board

David Anderson, The University of Warwick
Catherine Boone, The London School of Economics and Political Science
Carolyn Brown, Rutgers University, New Jersey
Christopher Clapham, University of Cambridge
Michael Gomez, New York University
Richard Roberts, Stanford University, California
David Robinson, Michigan State University
Leonardo A. Villalón, University of Florida

Other titles in the series are listed at the back of the book.



## Development, (Dual) Citizenship and Its Discontents in Africa

The Political Economy of Belonging to Liberia

ROBTEL NEAJAI PAILEY

London School of Economics and Political Science





## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108836548

DOI: 10.1017/9781108873871

© Robtel Neajai Pailey 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Pailey, Robtel Neajai, author.

Title: Development, (dual) citizenship and its discontents in Africa: the political economy of belonging to Liberia / Robtel Neajai Pailey.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Series: African studies series | Includes bibliographical references and index

Identifiers: LCCN 2020022762 | ISBN 9781108836548 (hardback) |

ISBN 9781108873871 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Economic development – Liberia. | Citizenship – Liberia. |

Liberia - Economic conditions.

Classification: LCC HC1075 .P35 2021 | DDC 338.96662-dc23

 $LC\ record\ available\ at\ https://lccn.loc.gov/2020022762$ 

ISBN 978-1-108-83654-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



#### **Contents**

List of Figures and Tables		page vi	
Li	st of Acronyms	vii	
Αc	cknowledgements	X	
	Introduction	1	
1	Methodological, Theoretical, and Biographical Reflections	22	
2	The Political Economy of Belonging to Liberia	50	
3	Dual Citizenship and Its Discontents in Africa	84	
4	Give Me Your Land or I'll Shoot!	110	
5	Between Rootedness and Rootlessness	142	
6	The Dichotomy of Diasporic Developmentalism	179	
	Conclusion	221	
Appendix I		236	
Appendix II		243	
Appendix III		246	
References		249	
Index		266	



## Figures and Tables

Figur	es	
I.1	Liberia's official seal	page 2
C.1	Liberian citizenship triad	230
Table	es	
1.1	Gender and age distribution of 181 unofficial	
	respondents	28
1.2	Highest education levels of 181 unofficial respondents	29
1.3	Place of birth/country of citizenship of 181 unofficial	
	respondents	32
2.1	Top ten conceptions of what constitutes a Liberian	
	citizen	53
2.2	Top ten ways of practising Liberian citizenship	
	transnationally	67
2.3	Top ten ways of practising Liberian citizenship	
	domestically	73
3.1	Africa's dual citizenship trends as of 20 December 2019	90
3.2	Catalogue of pros and cons of dual citizenship for Liberia	ı 100
5.1	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees	
	(UNHCR) refugee/asylum/IDPs population statistics for	
	Liberia	149
5.2	Newly registered Liberian-born US permanent residents	/
	citizens/refugees/asylees from 1960 to 2012	151
5.3	First-time migration patterns of 163 unofficial	
	Liberian-born respondents	153
5.4	Citizenship status of 181 unofficial respondents	161
6.1	Summary of Lift Liberia deliverables and final	
	completion rates	187
6.2	World Bank remittances data for Liberia (2004–2017)	207
6.3	Central Bank of Liberia remittances data (2005–2017)	211

vi



## Acronyms

ABA American Bar Association

ACDL Association for Constitutional Democracy in Liberia

ACS American Colonisation Society
AfCFTA African Continental Free Trade Area

AFL Armed Forces of Liberia
AfT Agenda for Transformation

AU African Union

BIN Bureau of Immigration and Naturalisation

CBL Central Bank of Liberia

CCL Coalition of Concerned Liberians
CDFs County Development Funds

CEDAW Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of

Discrimination against Women

CENTAL Centre for Transparency and Accountability in Liberia

CIA Central Intelligence Agency
CPA Comprehensive Peace Agreement

CSA Civil Service Agency

CWIQ Core Welfare Indicators Questionnaire

DEA Drug Enforcement Agency
DED Deferred Enforced Departure

DV Diversity Visa

ECOMOG Economic Community of West African States

Monitoring Group

ECOWAS Economic Community of West African States EFLA European Federation of Liberian Associations

ERU Emergency Response Unit

EU European Union

GAC General Auditing Commission
GC Governance Commission
GDP gross domestic product

vii



More Information

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-83654-8 — Development, (Dual) Citizenship and Its Discontents in Africa Robtel Neajai Pailey Frontmatter

viii List of Acronyms

GEMAP Governance and Economic Management Assistance

Programme

GSA General Services Agency

HIPC Heavily Indebted Poor Countries

ICERD International Convention on the Elimination of All

Forms of Racial Discrimination

IDPs internally displaced persons

IGNU Interim Government of National Unity

IMF International Monetary Fund

INCHR Independent National Commission on Human Rights
INPFL Independent National Patriotic Front of Liberia

LAA Liberia Airport Authority

LACC Liberia Anti-Corruption Commission

LACOSC Liberian American Community Organisation of

Southern California

LAMCO Liberian American Swedish Mining Company
LECBS Liberia Emergency Capacity Building Support
LEITI Liberia Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative

LFF Liberian Frontier Force

LISGIS Liberia Institute of Statistics and Geo-Information

Services

LNP Liberia National Police
LRA Liberia Revenue Authority
LSA Liberian Studies Association

LTA Liberia Telecommunications Authority

LURD Liberians United for Reconciliation and Democracy

MODEL Movement for Democracy in Liberia
MOJA Movement for Justice in Africa

MoS Ministry of State for Presidential Affairs

MRU Mano River Union

NEC National Elections Commission NGOs non-governmental organisations NPFL National Patriotic Front of Liberia

NSA National Security Agency

NTGL National Transitional Government of Liberia

OAU Organisation of African Unity OTC Oriental Timber Company PAL Progressive Alliance of Liberia

PAPD Pro-poor Agenda for Prosperity and Development



List of Acronyms ix

PPCC Public Procurement and Concessions Commission

PPP Progressive People's Party
PRC People's Redemption Council
PRS Poverty Reduction Strategy

RFTF Results-Focused Transitional Framework

RIA Roberts International Airport SES Senior Executive Service

TOKTEN Transfer of Knowledge through Expatriate Nationals

TPS Temporary Protected Status

TRC Truth and Reconciliation Commission

TWP True Whig Party

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights

UK United Kingdom

ULAA Union of Liberian Associations in the Americas

ULAG United Liberian Association in Ghana

ULO-UK Union of Liberian Organisations in the United

Kingdom

UN United Nations

UNDP United Nations Development Programme

UNHCR United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

UNIBOA United Bassa Organisation in the Americas

UNMIL United Nations Mission in Liberia

UNPOL United Nations Police
UPP United People's Party

US United States

USD United States Dollars

WHO World Health Organization



## Acknowledgements

Nearly a decade in the making, this book represents one of my most challenging professional endeavours to date. When I embarked on a doctorate at SOAS, University of London, in 2011, little did I know that what began as an overly ambitious PhD project would eventually morph into a monograph. For this, I thank my strong network across the globe, including God, family, funders, advisors, friends, and associates.

My mother and father, Ethel Neajai Johnson Pailey and Abraham Robert Pailey, gifted me with an insatiable love of knowledge and drive to succeed which anchored me in times of uncertainty. I am indebted to my mother in particular for her prayers, positive energy, and phone calls. Six weeks of hibernating in her house – where I was fed heaps of home-cooked Liberian food – fortified me with the energy and headspace to complete this manuscript.

Without the Mo Ibrahim Foundation's generous three-year PhD funding, this book would still be an idea in my head. While the SOAS Department of Development Studies provided partial funding for PhD fieldwork, the Leverhulme Trust and Oxford Department of International Development fully financed my postdoctoral data collection. Additionally, the International Development Research Centre (IDRC)-funded project 'Diasporas as Neglected Agents of Change' facilitated data collection and gave me access to researchers in Haiti, Liberia, Sri Lanka, the United Kingdom, and the United States.

My PhD supervisor, Laura Hammond, and external examiner, JoAnn McGregor, were steadfast in their guidance and support, often telling me what I needed rather than wanted to hear. Academic mentors George Klay Kieh Jr, D Elwood Dunn, and Carl Patrick Burrowes offered crucial direction on aspects of Liberian political, economic, and social history, while my cousin Edward Emmett Dillon helped me access and interpret Liberian historical and contemporary legal documents. Young professionals Kortu M Ndebe, Gerald Yeakula,



Acknowledgements

xi

Mahmud Johnson, and Ciata Stevens were exceptional as transcribers, wading through hundreds of hours of audio recordings to capture the authenticity of my field-based interviews.

Bronwen Manby and Beth Elise Whitaker set the bar high with their groundbreaking research on citizenship and dual citizenship trends in Africa, respectively, and shared valuable suggestions of how I could carve out my own scholarly niche. Maria Marsh, Daniel Brown, Atifa Jiwa, Natasha Whelan, Richards Paul, Anitha Nadarajan, and the entire Cambridge University Press African Studies series team gave of their time generously, while three anonymous reviewers delivered incisive feedback on an early draft of the book. With patience and perseverance, visual storyteller Chase Walker worked hard to generate the beautifully rendered, final cover image. And my closest friends – especially Amy Niang, Bukola Kpotie, Courtney Mosby, Ella Mankon Pailey, Genevieve Woods, Simidele Dosekun, Yen Pham, and Yvonne Nsiah – remained cheerleaders every step of the way in matters of the head and heart.

Last, but certainly not least, 202 Liberian and 7 Sierra Leonean respondents – speaking in official and unofficial capacities – were the lifeblood of my empirical analysis. They welcomed me into their worlds and revealed some of their innermost thoughts about a topic that is both personal and political. I can only hope that I have done them justice, and remain convinced more than ever that a better Liberia is possible.

