FEMINIST JUDGMENTS: REWRITTEN PROPERTY OPINIONS

How would a feminist lens transform the development of property law? Using feminist legal theories and methods, the authors in this volume present rewritten opinions of fifteen foundational and other property law cases. By reimagining these cases with a feminist lens, while staying within the precedent of the time the cases were decided, the authors demonstrate that the use of feminist perspectives and methodologies could have made a significant difference in the development of property law.

Eloisa C. Rodriguez-Dod is Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law, Florida International University College of Law.

Elena Maria Marty-Nelson is Associate Dean for Diversity, Inclusion, and Public Impact and Professor of Law, Nova Southeastern University Shepard Broad College of Law.
Feminist Judgments Series

Editors

Bridget J. Crawford
Elizabeth Haub School of Law at Pace University

Kathryn M. Stanchi
University of Nevada, Las Vegas, William S. Boyd School of Law

Linda L. Berger
University of Nevada, Las Vegas, William S. Boyd School of Law
Advisory Panel for Feminist Judgments Series

**Kathryn Abrams**, Herma Hill Kay Distinguished Professor of Law, University of California, Berkeley, School of Law

**Katharine T. Bartlett**, A. Kenneth Pye Professor Emerita of Law, Duke University School of Law

**Mary Anne Case**, Arnold I. Shure Professor of Law, The University of Chicago Law School

**Margaret E. Johnson**, Professor of Law, University of Baltimore School of Law Sonia Katyal, Chancellor’s Professor of Law, University of California, Berkeley, School of Law

**Nancy Leong**, Professor of Law, University of Denver Sturm College of Law

**Rachel Moran**, Michael J. Connell Distinguished Professor of Law and Dean Emerita, UCLA School of Law

**Angela Onwuachi-Willig**, Dean and Professor of Law, Boston University School of Law

**Nancy D. Polikoff**, Professor of Law, American University Washington College of Law

**Daniel B. Rodriguez**, Dean and Harold Washington Professor, Northwestern University School of Law

**Susan Deller Ross**, Professor of Law, Georgetown University Law Center

**Verna L. Williams**, Dean and Nippert Professor of Law, University of Cincinnati College of Law
Feminist Judgments: Rewritten Property Opinions

Edited by

ELOISA C. RODRIGUEZ-DOD
Florida International University College of Law

ELENA MARIA MARTY-NELSON
Nova Southeastern University Shepard Broad College of Law
To my mother and sister, whom I miss dearly, to all the strong and independent women in my family who have always given me so much love and support, to my beautiful sister-friends (you know who you are), and to my husband, Jose, for being my guiding light. —ERD

To my husband, David, and our sons, Scott and Matt, for their unflagging support and fabulous sense of humor, to Dr. Aileen Marty, my feminist star, and to my lifelong coauthor. —EMN
Contents

Advisory Panel for Feminist Judgments: Rewritten Property Opinions page xiii
Notes on Contributors xv
Preface xix
Acknowledgments xi
About the Cover Art xxiii

PART I INTRODUCTION

1 Introduction to Feminist Judgments: Rewritten Property Opinions 3
   Eloisa C. Rodriguez-Dod and Elena Maria Marty-Nelson

2 Property Law Revolution, Devolution, and Feminist Legal Theory 10
   Lolita Buckner Inniss

3 Incorporating Feminist Perspectives throughout Law School Curriculum 19
   Hannah Brenner Johnson

PART II ALLOCATION OF RIGHTS

4 Johnson v. M’Intosh, 21 U.S. 543 (1823) 35
   Commentary: Stacy L. Leeds
   Judgment: Alexandra Flynn

5 Botiller v. Dominguez, 130 U.S. 238 (1889) 61
   Commentary: Marc-Tizoc González
   Judgment: Guadalupe T. Luna
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Pierson v. Post, 3 Cai. R. 175 (N.Y. Sup. Ct. 1805)</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Commentary: Jill M. Fraley</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Judgment: Angela Fernandez</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>PART III PATENTS, PUBLICITY RIGHTS, AND TRADEMARKS</strong></td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Association for Molecular Pathology v. Myriad Genetics, Inc., 569 U.S. 576 (2013)</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Commentary: Dan L. Burk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Judgment: Kali Murray and Erika George</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>White v. Samsung Electronics America, Inc., 971 F.2d 1395 (9th Cir. 1992)</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Commentary: Brian L. Frye</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Judgment: Jon M. Garon</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>PART IV CONDEMNATION AND ADVERSE POSSESSION</strong></td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Commentary: Julia D. Mahoney</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Judgment: Olympia Duhart</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Commentary: Hannah Haksgaard</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Judgment: Meghan Hottel-Cox</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>PART V GIFTS AND FUTURE INTERESTS</strong></td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Commentary: Richard Chused</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Judgment: Stephanie M. Stern</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>PART VI TENANCY IN COMMON, JOINT TENANCY, AND TENANCY BY THE ENTIRETY</strong></td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Sawada v. Endo, 561 P.2d 1291 (Haw. 1977)</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Commentary: Susan Etta Keller</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Judgment: Donna Litman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Commentary: Diane Klein</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Judgment: Carrie Anne Hagan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

14 Coggan v. Coggan, 239 So. 2d 17 (Fla. 1970) 293
Commentary: Phyliss Craig-Taylor
Judgment: Natasha N. Varyani and Stevie Leahy

PART VII EXCLUSIONARY ZONING 309

15 Moore v. City of East Cleveland, 431 U.S. 494 (1977) 311
Commentary: Berta Esperanza Hernández-Truyol
Judgment: Danaya C. Wright

PART VIII EVICTIONS 343

Commentary: Lua Kamál Yuille
Judgment: Pamela A. Wilkins

Commentary: Andrea B. Carroll
Judgment: Meredith Render

PART IX LANDLORD–TENANT PREMISES LIABILITY 397

18 Bartley v. Sweetser, 890 S.W.2d 250 (Ark. 1994) 399
Commentary: Lindsey P. Gustafson
Judgment: Taja-Nia Y. Henderson

Index 415
Advisory Panel for *Feminist Judgments: Rewritten Property Opinions*

**Kristen Barnes**, Professor of Law, Syracuse University College of Law

**Rashmi Dyal-Chand**, Professor of Law and Associate Dean for Research and Interdisciplinary Education, Northeastern University School of Law

**Lee Fennell**, Max Pam Professor of Law, University of Chicago School of Law

**Angela Gilmore**, Associate Dean of Academic Affairs and Professor of Law, North Carolina Central University School of Law

**Stacy L. Leeds**, Foundation Professor of Law and Leadership, Sandra Day O’Connor College of Law, Arizona State University

**Amy J. Nelson**, Esq., PhD

**Eduardo Peñalver**, Allan R. Tessler Dean and Professor of Law, Cornell Law School

**Kalyani Robbins**, Morris I. Leibman Professor of Law, Loyola University School of Law

**Ezra Rosser**, Professor of Law and Associate Dean of the Part-Time and Evening Division, American University Washington College of Law

**Rebecca Tushnet**, Frank Stanton Professor of the First Amendment, Harvard Law School

**Darryl C. Wilson**, Associate Dean for Faculty and Strategic Initiatives, Attorneys' Title Insurance Fund Professor of Law and Co-Director of the Institute for Caribbean Law and Policy, Stetson University College of Law
Notes on Contributors

Dan L. Burk, Chancellor’s Professor of Law and Faculty Director for the AI Global Public Policy Institute, University of California, Irvine School of Law

Andrea B. Carroll, C. E. Laborde, Jr. Professor of Law, Donna W. Lee Professor of Law, Rosemary Slattery Davis & Jackson B. Davis Professorship, and Associate Dean for Student and Academic Affairs, Louisiana State University Paul M. Hebert Law Center

Richard Chused, Professor of Law, New York Law School

Phyliss Craig-Taylor, Professor of Law, North Carolina Central University

Olympia Duhart, Associate Dean for Faculty Development and Professor of Law, Nova Southeastern University Shepard Broad College of Law

Angela Fernandez, Professor, University of Toronto Faculty of Law and Department of History

Alexandra Flynn, Assistant Professor, Peter A. Allard School of Law, University of British Columbia

Jill M. Fraley, Professor of Law, Washington and Lee University School of Law

Brian L. Frye, Spears-Gilbert Professor of Law, University of Kentucky College of Law

Jon M. Garon, Director of Intellectual Property, Cybersecurity and Technology Law Program and Professor of Law, Nova Southeastern University Shepard Broad College of Law

Erika George, Samuel D. Thurman Professor of Law, University of Utah College of Law
Marc-Tizoc González, Professor of Law, The University of New Mexico School of Law

Lindsey P. Gustafson, Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Arkansas Bar Foundation Professor of Law, University of Arkansas Little Rock William H. Bowen School of Law

Carrie Anne Hagan, Director, Civil Practice Clinic and Clinical Associate Professor of Law, Indiana University Robert H. McKinney School of Law

Hannah Haksgaard, Associate Professor, University of South Dakota Knudson School of Law

Taja-Nia Y. Henderson, Professor of Law and Dean of Rutgers Graduate School Newark, Rutgers Law School

Berta Esperanza Hernández-Truyol, Stephen C. O’Connell Chair, University of Florida Research Foundation Professor, University Term Professor, and Professor of Law, University of Florida Levin College of Law

Meghan Hottel-Cox, Professorial Lecturer in Law, George Washington University Law School

Lolita Buckner Inniss, Dean and Provost’s Professor, University of Colorado Law School

Hannah Brenner Johnson, Vice Dean for Academic and Student Affairs and Professor of Law, California Western School of Law

Susan Etta Keller, Professor of Law, Western State College of Law

Diane Klein, Lecturer, Dale E. Fowler School of Law, Chapman University

Stevie Leahy, Assistant Teaching Professor, Northeastern University School of Law

Stacy L. Leeds, Foundation Professor of Law and Leadership, Sandra Day O’Connor College of Law, Arizona State University

Donna Litman, Professor of Law, Nova Southeastern University Shepard Broad College of Law

Guadalupe T. Luna, Professor Emerita, Northern Illinois University College of Law

Julia D. Mahoney, John S. Battle Professor of Law, University of Virginia School of Law
Notes on Contributors

Elena Maria Marty-Nelson, Associate Dean for Diversity, Inclusion, and Public Impact and Professor of Law, Nova Southeastern University Shepard Broad College of Law

Kali Murray, Professor of Law, Marquette University Law School

Meredith Render, Professor of Law, University of Alabama School of Law

Eloisa C. Rodriguez-Dod, Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law, Florida International University College of Law

Stephanie M. Stern, Professor of Law, Chicago Kent College of Law

Natasha N. Varyani, Associate Professor of Law, New England Law

Pamela A. Wilkins, Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Associate Professor of Law, Mercer University School of Law

Danaya C. Wright, Clarence J. TeSelle Endowed Professor of Law, University Term Professor, and Professor of Law, University of Florida Fredric G. Levin College of Law

Lua Kamál Yuille, Professor of Law, University of Kansas School of Law
Preface

Could feminist perspectives and methods change the shape of property law? To answer this question, we brought together a group of scholars and practitioners to rewrite significant property law cases from a feminist perspective.

This volume, like all of the books in Cambridge University Press’s Feminist Judgments Series, demonstrates that judges with feminist viewpoints could have changed the law and the reasoning underlying the law, even though based only on the precedent and law in effect at the time of the original decision. It also demonstrates how rewritten opinions from a feminist perspective could have made property law more just and equitable for women and marginalized groups.

This book shows how property law is not neutral but rather shaped by the society that produces it and the judges who apply it. At the same time, this book offers the hope that property law can be transformed to be an instrument of greater justice and equality for all people.
Acknowledgments

This book would not have been possible without the support of Cambridge University Press, which so enthusiastically endorsed a series of books following the publication of Feminist Judgments: Rewritten Opinions of the United States Supreme Court (2016). We are grateful to the original editors of the Feminist Judgments project, Kathryn M. Stanchi, Linda L. Berger, and Bridget J. Crawford, for their leadership and guidance. We are also indebted to Deborah S. Gordon for her invaluable insights and support throughout this property project.

We wish to thank the members of the Advisory Panel who helped us select the cases and embraced this project with zeal. We are also so grateful to our editor, Matt Gallaway, for his patience, kindness, and insights. For research assistance, we thank Noah Leopold, Paula Melo, and Carolina Sanchez.

We also wholeheartedly thank all our wonderful contributors for their dedication and enthusiasm.
About the Cover Art

On the cover, Assembly © Jose Rodriguez-Dod

Jose Rodriguez-Dod is a Cuban artist, poet, and attorney. He prefers watercolor as a medium because a painter can directly manipulate the pigment’s unpredictability to configure an object. The process of painting, thus, acts as a natural force in the stream of life where chance and intention interact to create humnscapes.

Commentary on Assembly

Assembly is both a window and mirror to property law. The inspiration for Assembly comes from the method of combining lots for development. The multicolored panels offer a window to the varied perspectives on the development of property law and also reflect on both those who benefit from property rights and those who have not had the same access.

– Jose Rodriguez-Dod 2021