

CHRISTIANITY AND THE LAWS OF CONSCIENCE

This book explores Christian theological, legal, constitutional, historical, and philosophical meanings of *conscience*. It surveys the term in the New Testament text and excavates its meaning for Christian understandings of natural law, the early church Fathers, St. Thomas Aquinas, and the Magisterial Reformers. It explores how conscience has interacted with evangelical political aspirations, rights to sexual expression, and objections to fighting in war. It surveys how the term has been deployed in state and federal constitutional law and how it might be distinguished from related concepts such as religious freedom or religious exercise. It also presents how contemporary Roman Catholic theology and evangelical and Reformed theology understand the term.

Jeffrey B. Hammond is an associate professor of law at Faulkner University, Thomas Goode Jones School of Law in Montgomery, Alabama, where he specializes in the intersection of law and Christian theology, constitutional law, and health law.

Helen M. Alvaré is a professor of law at the Antonin Scalia Law School, George Mason University in Arlington, Virginia, where she specializes in law and religion and family law. Her books include *Putting Children's Interests First in U.S. Family Law and Policy: With Power Comes Responsibility* (Cambridge University Press, 2018) and *The Conscience of the Institution* (editor).

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-83538-1 — Christianity and the Laws of Conscience
 Edited by Jeffrey B. Hammond, Helen M. Alvare
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

LAW AND CHRISTIANITY

Series Editor

John Witte, Jr., Emory University

Editorial Board

Nigel Biggar, University of Oxford
 Marta Cartabia, Italian Constitutional Court / University of Milano-Bicocca
 Sarah Coakley, University of Cambridge
 Norman Doe, Cardiff University
 Rafael Domingo, Emory University / University of Navarra
 Brian Ferme, Marcianum, Venice
 Richard W. Garnett, University of Notre Dame
 Robert P. George, Princeton University
 Mary Ann Glendon, Harvard University
 Kent Greenawalt, Columbia University
 Robin Griffith-Jones, Temple Church, London / King's College London
 Gary S. Hauk, Emory University
 R. H. Helmholz, University of Chicago
 Mark Hill QC, Inner Temple, London / Cardiff University
 Wolfgang Huber, Bishop Emeritus, United Protestant Church of Germany / Universities of
 Heidelberg, Berlin, and Stellenbosch
 Michael W. McConnell, Stanford University
 John McGuckin, Union Theological Seminary
 Mark A. Noll, University of Notre Dame
 Jeremy Waldron, New York University
 Michael Welker, University of Heidelberg

The Law and Christianity series publishes cutting-edge work on Catholic, Protestant, and Orthodox Christian contributions to public, private, penal, and procedural law and legal theory. The series aims to promote deep Christian reflection by leading scholars on the fundamentals of law and politics, to build further ecumenical legal understanding across Christian denominations, and to link and amplify the diverse and sometimes isolated Christian legal voices and visions at work in the academy. Works collected by the series include groundbreaking monographs, historical and thematic anthologies, and translations by leading scholars around the globe.

Books in the Series

Christianity and the Laws of Conscience

edited by Jeffrey B. Hammond and Helen M. Alvare

Infidels and Empires in a New World Order: Early Modern Spanish Contributions to International Legal Thought

David Lantigua

The Possibility of Religious Freedom: Early Natural Law and the Abrahamic Faiths

Karen Taliaferro

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-83538-1 — Christianity and the Laws of Conscience
Edited by Jeffrey B. Hammond, Helen M. Alvare
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Catholic Social Teaching: A Volume of Scholarly Essays
edited by Gerard Bradley and E. Christian Brugger

The Immortal Commonwealth: Covenant, Community, and Political Resistance in Early Reformed Thought
David P. Henreckson

Great Christian Jurists in American History
edited by Daniel L. Dreisbach and Mark David Hall

Great Christian Jurists and Legal Collections in the First Millennium
edited by Philip L. Reynolds

English Ecclesiastical Lawyers: A History of Their Life and Work
R. H. Helmholz

Law, Love and Freedom: From the Sacred to the Secular
Joshua Neoh

Great Christian Jurists in French History
edited by Olivier Descamps and Rafael Domingo

Church Law in Modernity: Toward a Theory of Canon Law Between Nature and Culture
Judith Hahn

Common Law and Natural Law in America: From the Puritans to the Legal Realists
Andrew Forsyth

Care for the World: Laudato Si' and Catholic Social Thought in an Era of Climate Crisis
edited by Frank Pasquale

Church, State, and Family: Reconciling Traditional Teachings and Modern Liberties
John Witte, Jr.

Great Jurists in Spanish History
edited by Rafael Domingo and Javier Martínez-Torrón

Under Caesar's Sword: How Christians Respond to Persecution
edited by Daniel Philpott and Timothy Samuel Shah

God and the Illegal Alien
Robert W. Heimbürger

Christianity and Family Law
edited by John Witte, Jr. and Gary S. Hauk

Christianity and Natural Law
edited by Norman Doe

Great Christian Jurists in English History
edited by Mark Hill, QC and R. H. Helmholz

Agape, Justice, and Law: How Might Christian Love Shape Law?
edited by Robert F. Cochran, Jr. and Zachary R. Calo

Calvin's Political Theology and the Public Engagement of the Church
Matthew J. Tuininga

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-83538-1 — Christianity and the Laws of Conscience
 Edited by Jeffrey B. Hammond, Helen M. Alvare
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

God and the Secular Legal System
 Rafael Domingo

How Marriage Became One of the Sacraments
 Philip L. Reynolds

Christianity and Freedom (Volume I: Historical Perspectives, Volume II: Contemporary Perspectives)
 edited by Timothy Samuel Shah and Allen D. Hertzke

The Western Case for Monogamy Over Polygamy
 John Witte, Jr.

The Distinctiveness of Religion in American Law
 Kathleen A. Brady

Pope Benedict XVI's Legal Thought: A Dialogue on the Foundation of Law
 edited by Marta Cartabia and Andrea Simoncini

Introductions to Christianity and Law

John Witte, Jr. and Frank S. Alexander, eds. *Christianity and Law: An Introduction*. Cambridge University Press, 2008.

John Witte, Jr. and Frank S. Alexander, eds. *Christianity and Human Rights: An Introduction*. Cambridge University Press, 2010.

John Witte, Jr. and Gary Hauk, eds. *Christianity and Family Law: An Introduction*. Cambridge University Press, 2017.

Norman Doe, ed. *Christianity and Natural Law: An Introduction*. Cambridge University Press, 2017.

R. H. Helmholz, ed. *The Profession of Ecclesiastical Lawyers: An Historical Introduction*. Cambridge University Press, 2019.

Rafael Domingo and John Witte, Jr., eds. *Christianity and Global Law*. Routledge and CRC Press, 2020.

Mark Hill, Norman Doe, R. H. Helmholz and John Witte, Jr., eds. *Christianity and Criminal Law*. Routledge and CRC Press, 2020.

Forthcoming volumes:

Daniel Crane and Samuel Gregg, eds. *Christianity and Economic Law*. Cambridge University Press, 2021.

Pamela Slotte and John Haskell, eds. *Christianity and International Law*. Cambridge University Press, 2021.

Nicholas Aroney and Ian Leigh, eds. *Christianity and Constitutionalism*. Oxford University Press, 2021.

Silas W. Allard, Kristin E. Heyer and Raj Nadella, eds. *Christianity and the Law of Migration*. Routledge and CRC Press, 2021.

Robert F. Cochran Jr. and Michael P. Moreland, eds. *Christianity and Private Law*. Routledge and CRC Press, 2021.

We aim to commission other such volumes on Christianity and bankruptcy law, ecclesiastical law, education law, elder law, environmental law, health law, labor law, procedural law, remedies, and other familiar legal topics.

Christianity and the Laws of Conscience

AN INTRODUCTION

Edited by

JEFFREY B. HAMMOND

Faulkner University

HELEN M. ALVARÉ

George Mason University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-83538-1 — Christianity and the Laws of Conscience
Edited by Jeffrey B. Hammond, Helen M. Alvaré
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108835381

DOI: 10.1017/9781108883856

© Jeffrey B. Hammond and Helen M. Alvaré 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Hammond, Jeffrey B., 1975– editor. | Alvaré, Helen, editor.

TITLE: Christianity and the laws of conscience : an introduction / edited by Helen M. Alvaré, George Mason University, Arlington, Virginia; Jeffrey B. Hammond, Faulkner University, Montgomery, Alabama.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY, USA : Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Series: Law and Christianity | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2020012374 (print) | LCCN 2020012375 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108835381 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108793315 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108883856 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Liberty of conscience–Philosophy. | Conscience–Religious aspects–Christianity. | Freedom or religion–United States.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KB2472 .C47 2021 (print) | LCC KB2472 (ebook) | DDC 241/.1–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2020012374>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2020012375>

ISBN 978-1-108-83538-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-83538-1 — Christianity and the Laws of Conscience
Edited by Jeffrey B. Hammond, Helen M. Alvare
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

*For Susan
and
for Catherine, Julian, and Robert Paul*

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	page xiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xv
Introduction	1
<i>Helen M. Alvaré and Jeffrey B. Hammond</i>	
PART I THEMES IN UNDERSTANDINGS OF CONSCIENCE IN CHRISTIANITY	
1 Conscience in the New Testament	23
<i>Wendell Willis</i>	
2 Conscience and Natural Law in Scripture	39
<i>David VanDrunen</i>	
3 Conscience in Early Christian Thought	57
<i>John Anthony McGuckin</i>	
4 <i>Sensus Fidei</i>, the Magisterium, and the Formation of Conscience	71
<i>E. Christian Brugger</i>	
PART II CONSCIENCE ACCORDING TO MAJOR FIGURES AND TRADITIONS	
5 Conscience in the Early Church Fathers	93
<i>Alexis Torrance</i>	
6 St. Thomas Aquinas on Conscience	112
<i>Cajetan Cuddy OP</i>	

- | | | |
|---|--|-----|
| 7 | Reforming the Conscience: Magisterial Reformers on the Theory and Practice of Conscience
<i>John L. Thompson</i> | 132 |
| 8 | Toward a Theology of a Redeemed Conscience
<i>Jeffrey B. Hammond</i> | 152 |
| 9 | Pierre Bayle: An Enlightened Alternative to John Locke
<i>Edward Andrew</i> | 170 |
| 10 | Freedom of Conscience and Its Right to Constitutional Protection: The Contribution of Roger Williams
<i>David Little</i> | 187 |
| 11 | Jonathan Edwards on Conscience
<i>Michael McClymond</i> | 208 |
| 12 | Obeying God Rather Than Men: Uneasy Evangelicals, Conscience, and Politics
<i>Micah Watson</i> | 227 |
| 13 | Mormonism and Conscience
<i>Rosalynde Welch and Nathan B. Oman</i> | 245 |
| 14 | Culture and Conscience in the Thought of Joseph Ratzinger, Pope Benedict XVI
<i>Peter J. Casarella</i> | 265 |
| PART III APPLIED TOPICS IN LAW AND CONSCIENCE | | |
| 15 | Liberty of Conscience, Free Exercise of Religion, and the US Constitution
<i>Nathan S. Chapman</i> | 287 |
| 16 | Religious Conscience Protections in American State Constitutions
<i>Michael J. DeBoer</i> | 305 |
| 17 | Forced Conformity or Accommodation? Reconciling Conscience and Difference in a Pluralistic Democracy
<i>Mark Rienzi</i> | 336 |

<i>Contents</i>		xi
18	Christian Conscience and Sexual Expression Rights <i>Helen M. Alvaré</i>	354
19	Conscience and the Roman Catholic “Just War” Tradition <i>Joseph E. Capizzi</i>	375
20	Institutional Conscience, Corporate Persons, and <i>Hobby Lobby</i> <i>Christopher Tollefsen</i>	395
21	Religion, Conscience, and the Law: Reasons, Bases, and Limits for Exemptions <i>R. Kent Greenawalt</i>	414
	<i>Index</i>	435

Contributors

Helen M. Alvaré is a professor of law at George Mason University, Antonin Scalia Law School, Arlington, Virginia.

Edward Andrew is a professor of political science, *emeritus*, at the University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario.

E. Christian Brugger is a moral theologian and former Dean of the School of Theology and Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame, Sydney, Australia.

Joseph E. Capizzi is Ordinary Professor of Moral Theology/Ethics at the Catholic University of America School of Theology and Religious Studies, Washington, DC.

Peter J. Casarella is a professor of theology at Duke Divinity School, Durham, North Carolina.

Nathan S. Chapman is an associate professor of law at the University of Georgia School of Law, Athens, Georgia.

Cajetan Cuddy OP is of the Couvent Saint-Albert-le-Grand (Albertinum), Fribourg, Switzerland.

Michael J. DeBoer is an associate professor of law at Faulkner University, Thomas Goode Jones School of Law, Montgomery, Alabama.

R. Kent Greenawalt is University Professor at Columbia University Law School, New York, New York.

Jeffrey B. Hammond is an associate professor of law at Faulkner University, Thomas Goode Jones School of Law, Montgomery, Alabama.

David Little is the T. J. Dermot Dunphy Professor of the Practice in Religion, Ethnicity, and International Conflict, *Emeritus*, at Harvard University Divinity School, Cambridge, Massachusetts.

Michael McClymond is a professor of modern Christianity at St. Louis University, St. Louis, Missouri.

John Anthony McGuckin is a professor on the Faculty of Theology at the University of Oxford, Oxford, United Kingdom.

Nathan B. Oman is the Rollins Professor of Law at The College of William & Mary, Marshall-Wythe School of Law, Williamsburg, Virginia.

Mark Rienzi is a professor of law at the Catholic University of America, Columbus School of Law, Washington, DC.

John L. Thompson is Senior Professor of Historical Theology and Gaylen and Susan Byker Professor *Emeritus* of Reformed Theology at Fuller Theological Seminary, Pasadena, California.

Christopher Tollefsen is the College of Arts and Sciences Distinguished Professor at the University of South Carolina, Columbia, South Carolina.

Alexis Torrance is the Archbishop Demetrius Associate Professor of Byzantine Theology at the University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, Indiana.

David VanDrunen is the Robert B. Strimple Professor of Systematic Theology and Christian Ethics at Westminster Seminary California, Escondido, California.

Micah Watson is an associate professor of political science at Calvin University, Grand Rapids, Michigan.

Rosalynde Welch is an independent scholar, St. Louis, Missouri.

Wendell Willis is a retired professor of New Testament at Abilene Christian University, Abilene, Texas.

Acknowledgments

Jeff Hammond would like to thank his mentor and friend, John Witte, Jr., for commissioning this project and for facilitating the co-editors working together. It has been a joy to work with Professor Alvaré, and I thank her for her wise counsel, keen judgment, and upbeat approach to working on this book. I would also like to thank my colleague, Adam MacLeod, for organizing a conference on the subject of conscience, held in January of 2016 at our home institution in Montgomery, Alabama. That conference was sponsored by the Acton Institute, and the paper I presented there was developed into my chapter in this book. Further, I thank my good friend and colleague, Michael DeBoer, who wrote the excellent chapter on conscience and state constitutions in this collection. Professor DeBoer and I have had many conversations about conscience over the years, and I thank him for his abiding friendship. I dedicate my work on this project to my dear wife, Dr. Susan Hammond. Susan is a busy academic herself, but she has never failed to encourage me in my work, including that on this book.

Helen Alvaré would also like to thank John Witte, Jr. for his encouragement and support at the start and throughout this project. His inspiration to pair with Jeff Hammond proved very fruitful as Professor Hammond is a devoted scholar, a tireless worker, and blessed with kindness and discernment.

Professor Alvaré is also immensely grateful to her research assistant Sarah Christensen, librarians Esther Koblenz and Peter T. Vay, and to her husband and family for their patience during the long drafting and editing process.

Together, the editors would first like to thank Amy Wheeler and Anita Mann of the Emory Center for the Study of Law and Religion for their expert handling of all sorts of details concerning the production, publication, and funding of the book. Second, we thank John Berger, formerly of Cambridge University Press, and now of Fordham University, for his sage shepherding of this project in its early stages. And we also thank Jackie Grant of the Press for

providing oversight of the book as it was produced. The editors humbly acknowledge and thank each chapter author for their contributions to this volume. Each author worked through four or more rounds of edits with notable patience, acumen, and good cheer.

The editors thank the University of Notre Dame Press (USA) for allowing Peter Casarella's chapter, "Culture and Conscience in the Thought of Joseph Ratzinger, Pope Benedict XVI," to be reprinted in this volume from a prior University of Notre Dame Press collection, with revisions. The editors also thank Cambridge University Press for allowing David Little's chapter, "Roger Williams and Conscience," to be reprinted in this volume from a prior Cambridge University Press collection, with revisions.

The editors thank Brian Miller for his exceptional technical work on this book. Brian was our expert on all matters having to do with the *Chicago Manual of Style*, and he did his job brilliantly. This book would not have been published without Brian's contribution. Thank you, Brian!

Finally, the editors are profoundly grateful to the McDonald Agape Foundation for its generous funding of this project. In particular, we thank the late Ambassador Alonzo L. McDonald and Peter McDonald.