

## The Making of Song Dynasty History

In this ambitious work of political and intellectual history, Charles Hartman surveys the major sources that survive as vestiges of the official dynastic historiography of the Chinese Song dynasty (960–1279). Analyzing the narratives that emerge from these sources as products of Song political discourse, Hartman offers a thorough introduction to the texts and the political circumstances surrounding their compilation. Distilling from these sources a “grand allegory of Song history,” he argues that the embedded narratives in these sources reflect tension between a Confucian model of political institutionalism and the Song court’s preference for a non-sectarian, technocratic model. Fundamentally rethinking the corpus of texts that have formed the basis of our understanding of the Song and of imperial China more broadly, this far-reaching account of historiographical process and knowledge production illuminates the relationship between official history writing and political struggle in China.

CHARLES HARTMAN is Professor of Chinese Studies in the Department of East Asian Studies at the University at Albany, State University of New York.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-83483-4 — The Making of Song Dynasty History  
Charles Hartman  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-83483-4 — The Making of Song Dynasty History  
Charles Hartman  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

# The Making of Song Dynasty History

*Sources and Narratives, 960–1279 CE*

---

Charles Hartman

*University at Albany, State University of New York*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-83483-4 — The Making of Song Dynasty History  
Charles Hartman  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108834834](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108834834)

DOI: 10.1017/9781108877176

© Charles Hartman 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

ISBN 978-1-108-83483-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To the memory  
of  
Friedrich A. Bischoff (1928–2009),  
Professor of East Asian Languages and Literatures,  
Indiana University  
1964–1982

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-83483-4 — The Making of Song Dynasty History  
Charles Hartman  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page x
<i>List of Tables</i>	xi
<i>Preface</i>	xiii
<i>A Note on the Text</i>	xv
Introduction: Toward a Dynamic Historiography of the Song Dynasty	1
Sources	3
Narratives	14
<b>Part I Sources</b>	
1 <i>The Song State Compendium</i>	23
Introduction	23
The Origins and Distinctiveness of the Song Dynasty <i>Huiyao</i>	24
The First and Second Collections	28
A Hundred-Year Hiatus	30
Resumption under Emperor Xiaozong	31
New Paradigms	34
The <i>Recovered Draft</i>	40
Understanding the <i>Recovered Draft</i>	41
Conclusion	46
2 Li Tao and the <i>Long Draft</i>	49
Introduction	49
The Historian from Sichuan	51
The Origins of the <i>Long Draft</i>	56
The Reign of Emperor Xiaozong and the Politics of the <i>Long Draft</i>	61
Method and Message in the <i>Long Draft</i>	79
The Fate of a Masterpiece	94
Conclusion	100
3 Li Xinchuan and the <i>Chronological Record</i>	103
Introduction	103
The Life of Li Xinchuan	105
	vii

Cambridge University Press  
 978-1-108-83483-4 — The Making of Song Dynasty History  
 Charles Hartman  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

viii Contents

	<i>Corrections of Errors in Old Accounts</i>	110
	The <i>Chronological Record</i>	113
	Facts and Sources	119
	Constructing Narratives	125
	Creating a Political Discourse	130
	The <i>Diverse Notes</i>	132
	<i>The Record of the Way and Its Fate</i>	139
	Conclusion	141
4	The <i>Daoxue</i> Historians	143
	Zhu Xi	145
	Chen Jun	148
	Lü Zhong's <i>Lectures on Song History</i>	155
	<i>Daoxue</i> Historiography	166
5	The <i>Song History</i>	172
	Introduction: A Flawed History?	172
	The Project and the Committee	175
	Structure and Meaning	185
	The Imperial Eulogies	185
	The Prefaces and Evaluations	195
	Cyclical Structure and Meaning in the <i>Song History</i>	206
	Politics and Message	208
 <b>Part II Narratives</b>		
6	Political Precedents and the Origins of Historical Narrative	223
	The Power of Precedent	223
	The Policies of the Ancestors	229
	Precedents in Southern Song	233
7	Song History as Grand Allegory: An Introduction	242
8	An Empire of Benevolence	248
	Yuanyou Origins	248
	Luo Congyan's <i>Record of Revering Yao</i>	252
	New History for a New Regime	255
	Hu Anguo's "Plans for the Restoration" and the Return of Qin Gui	258
	Zhao Ding, Fan Chong, and the Yuanyou Legacy	261
9	From Soldier to Sage: Deifying the Prime Ancestor	274
	Fighting over Chen Bridge	287
	A Banquet for the Generals	295
	The Song Military Problem	295
	The Restoration Context	299
	Sima Guang Again	303



Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-83483-4 — The Making of Song Dynasty History  
Charles Hartman  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

Contents	ix
10 The Lineage of Evil: Benevolence Undermined	312
11 The Rhythms of Song History	329
<i>Bibliography</i>	334
<i>Index</i>	360

Figures

0.1	The Song official historiographical compilation process	page 5
0.2	Timeline of major historiographical works	9
1.1	Frequency of <i>State Compendium</i> citations in the <i>Long Draft</i>	32
1.2	Unique datable entries, per year, in the <i>Recovered Draft Compendium</i>	43
1.3	Evolution of the <i>Recovered Draft Compendium</i>	47
2.1	Coverage per year: <i>Long Draft</i> versus <i>Recovered Draft Compendium</i>	87
3.1	Coverage per year: <i>Chronological Record</i> versus <i>Recovered Draft Compendium</i>	118
4.1	Zhu Xi, <i>Outline and Details for the Comprehensive Mirror</i> , first 1219 edition, Wenling	152
4.2	Chen Jun, <i>Chronologically Arranged Complete Essentials in Outline and Details of the August Courts</i> , first 1229 edition	153
4.3	Coverage per year: Chen Jun versus <i>Long Draft</i>	154
4.4	Theoretical and historical fields of inquiry in Lü Zhong, “On the Essence of Governance”	162
4.5	Relative coverage per Northern Song reign in the <i>Recovered Draft Compendium</i> , <i>Long Draft</i> , Chen Jun, and Lü Zhong	169
4.6	Coverage per year: <i>Complete Texts of Song History</i> versus <i>Recovered Draft Compendium</i>	171
9.1	Attributed to Qian Xuan, <i>Kickball</i> .	294

Tables

---

1.1	<i>State Compendium</i> categories	page 27
1.2	Primary <i>huiyao</i> compilations	35
2.1	<i>Long Draft</i> major source utilization for the period 1070–1085 ( <i>juan</i> 210–363): number of citations	92
3.1	Sources cited in Li Xinchuan’s autocommentary to the <i>Chronological Record</i>	122
3.2	The thirteen subject categories in Li Xinchuan’s <i>Diverse Notes on Court and Province since 1127</i>	135
5.1	A comparison of the biographical sections in the <i>Eastern Capital Miscellany</i> and the <i>Song History</i>	196

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-83483-4 — The Making of Song Dynasty History  
Charles Hartman  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

## Preface

---

This book is the first volume in a projected two-volume study of the Chinese Song dynasty (960–1279). *The Making of Song Dynasty History: Sources and Narratives* surveys the major sources that survive as vestiges of official dynastic historiography. It then constructs the master narratives that emerge from these sources and frames these narratives as products of Song political discourse. A subsequent volume on the structures of governance in Song will study the political and social realities behind that discourse.

This book has been a long time in the making, and many people have helped along the way. Paul Smith has been for over two decades a faithful scholarly companion, an erudite sounding board, a friend, and an endless source of stimulating encouragement. Valerie Hansen regularly invited me to address her class in Song documents at Yale, and I have learned much from her and her students. Ari Daniel Levine, a consummate scholar and editor, gave the manuscript a close read, and the finished book is much better for his meticulous attention to all issues, large and small. Friends among the American community of Song scholars – Maggie Bickford, Beverly Bossler, John Chaffee, Hugh Clark, Pat Ebrey, Bob Hymes, Anna Shields, Hoyt Tillman, and Hilde De Weerd – have all helped to solve research problems and to bring this volume to completion.

As indistinct visions of this book first began to take shape in the early 2000s, I was able to invite three graduate students from Harvard to come to Albany. Over a four-year period, I read with Sung Chia-fu, Li Cho-ying, and Liu Guanglin many of the primary texts that form the backbone of this book. They will recognize our conversations on every page, and their scholarship, erudition, and friendship are among the lasting memories of my research on Song history.

I am grateful to Dr. Tseng Shu-Hsien and the staff of the Center for Chinese Studies at the National Central Library, Taipei for research support during autumn 2012. Writing of this book began in 2013 during a term at the Institute for Advanced Study in Princeton, and I am grateful to Nicola di Cosmo and the IAS staff for providing the optimal environment for academic work. Christian Lamouroux's kind invitation enabled me in the spring of 2016

to present the essential arguments of this book in four lectures at the *École des hautes études en sciences sociales* in Paris.

My thanks also to Deng Xiaonan of Peking University and Bao Weimin of Renmin University for their sustained interest and support for my research among the community of Song scholars in China. In Taiwan, I am grateful to Huang K'uan-ch'ung at Academia Sincia, Fang Cheng-Hua at National Taiwan University, and Li Cho-ying at National Tsing Hua University for invitations to present research from this book. Lectures on Song issues given at Cornell, Harvard, Princeton, the University of Pennsylvania, the University of Michigan, Rutgers, and Yale enabled me to garner helpful suggestions from scholars at these institutions and their students.

I am especially grateful to Luo Yinan and Chang Wei-ling for many years of sustained, fruitful conversations on problems of Song history. Likewise, my interaction with Ho Koon-wan and a generation of younger scholars in Hong Kong – Lincoln Tsui, Chu Mingkin, and Jack Cheung – has strengthened the arguments in this book. Thanks also go to Chen Yunru, Hans van Ess, Lee Tsong-han, Victor Mair, Freda Murck, Julia Murray, Joanna Handlin Smith, and Xu Yongming for many years and many forms of advice and support.

To my longest-standing friend in sinology, Bill Nienhauser of the University of Wisconsin, may the dedication to this volume bring back memories of a time and place, gone but not forgotten, that continues to inspire.

My colleagues at the University at Albany, James Hargett, Anthony DeBlasi, Susanna Fessler, Fan Pen Chen, and Andrew Byon have quietly assumed more than their share of the chores of local university life in order to afford me more time for “Charles’s book.” I could not have written this book in Albany without their support and that of Chen Yu-hui, bibliographer for East Asian studies, and the interlibrary loan office of the UAlbany Library. My colleague John Person helped with issues of Japanese romanization.

Finally, my wife Li-yun and my daughter Katy have lived with this book as long as I have. Neither could I have written this book without them. My gratitude to them is as great as their patience and love.

## A Note on the Text

---

Chinese characters are given for proper names, places, book titles, and technical terms upon their first mention in the text. Dates for persons follow Chang Bide, Wang Deyi, et al., *Songren zhuanji ziliao suoyin* (Taipei, 1976) and Li Yumin, *Songren shengzu xingnian kao* (Beijing, 2010). Dates follow the traditional Chinese lunar calendar converted into Western notation. Thus, for example, 1144/3/18 corresponds to the eighteenth day of the third month of the fourteenth year of the Shaoxing 紹興 reign period. Equivalencies between Chinese and Western years follow P. Hoang, *Concordance des chronologies néoméniques chinoise et européenne* (Shanghai, 1910). The beginning of the bibliography contains a list of abbreviations for primary sources that are cited frequently in the notes.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-83483-4 — The Making of Song Dynasty History  
Charles Hartman  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---