

Disorder Contained

Disorder Contained is the first historical account of the complex relationship between prison discipline and mental breakdown in England and Ireland. Between 1840 and 1900 the expansion of the modern prison system coincided with increased rates of mental disorder among prisoners, exacerbated by the introduction of regimes of isolation, deprivation and hard labour. Drawing on a range of archival and printed sources, the authors explore the links between different prison regimes and mental distress, examining the challenges faced by prison medical officers dealing with mental disorder within a system that stressed discipline and punishment and prisoners' own experiences of mental illness. The book investigates medical officers' approaches to the identification, definition, management and categorisation of mental disorder in prisons, and varied, often gendered, responses to mental breakdown among inmates. The authors also reflect on the persistence of systems of punishment that often aggravate rather than alleviate mental illness in the criminal justice system up to the current day. This title is also available as Open Access.

CATHERINE COX is Associate Professor of History at University College Dublin and director of UCD Centre for the History of Medicine in Ireland. She is the author of *Negotiating Insanity in the Southeast of Ireland, 1820–1900* (2012) and with Susannah Riordan edited *Adolescence in Modern Irish History* (2015).

HILARY MARLAND is Professor of History at the University of Warwick and founder director of Warwick's Centre for the History of Medicine. She is the author of *Dangerous Motherhood: Insanity and Childbirth in Victorian Britain* (2004) and *Health and Girlhood in Britain 1874–1920* (2013).

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-83455-1 — Disorder Contained
Catherine Cox , Hilary Marland
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Disorder Contained

*Mental Breakdown and the Modern Prison
in England and Ireland, 1840–1900*

Catherine Cox

University College Dublin

Hilary Marland

University of Warwick



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-83455-1 — Disorder Contained
Catherine Cox , Hilary Marland
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108834551

DOI: 10.1017/9781108993586

© Catherine Cox and Hilary Marland 2022

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781108993586 under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this license, visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0>

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties. Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781108993586

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Cox, Catherine, 1970- author. | Marland, Hilary, 1958- author.

Title: Disorder contained : mental breakdown and the modern prison in England and Ireland, 1840-1900 / Catherine Cox, University College Dublin, Hilary Marland, University of Warwick.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2022. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021044723 (print) | LCCN 2021044724 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108834551 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108995191 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108993586 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Prisoners–Mental health–England–History–19th century. | Prisoners–Mental health–Ireland–History–19th century. | Mentally ill prisoners–England–History–19th century. | Mentally ill prisoners–Ireland–History–19th century. | BISAC: MEDICAL / History

Classification: LCC RC451.4.P68 C695 2022 (print) | LCC RC451.4.P68 (ebook) | DDC 365/.608740941–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021044723>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021044724>

ISBN 978-1-108-83455-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-83455-1 — Disorder Contained
Catherine Cox , Hilary Marland
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To our families

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-83455-1 — Disorder Contained
Catherine Cox , Hilary Marland
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page viii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
1 Introduction: Mental Disorder and the Modern Prison in England and Ireland, 1840–1900	1
2 The Making of the Modern Prison System: Reformation, Separation and the Mind, 1840–1860	23
3 The Prison Medical Officer: Deterrence, Dual Loyalty and the Production of Psychiatric Expertise, 1860–1895	77
I: The Hardening of Penal Policy and Practices	88
II: Medical Expertise and Knowledge Production	116
4 Criminal or Lunatic, Prisoner or Patient?: Confining Insanity in the Late Nineteenth Century	149
I: Provision for Criminal Lunatics and Lunatic Criminals	154
II: Criminal or Lunatic? Prisoner or Patient?: Places and Practices of Confinement	174
5 ‘He Puts on Symptoms of Incoherence’: Feigning and Detecting Insanity in Nineteenth-Century Prisons	203
6 Conclusion: The Decline of the Separate System, the Prisoner Patient and Enduring Legacies	243
<i>Bibliography</i>	263
<i>Index</i>	294

Figures

2.1 The chapel, on the ‘separate system’, in Pentonville Prison during divine service	<i>page</i> 42
2.2 Cell with prisoner at ‘crank labour’ in the Surrey House of Correction	50
2.3 First floor plans of additions, Armagh Jail, William Murray, Architect, January 1846	60
2.4 Thomas A. Larcom, Photographs Collection, Volume 1, ‘Some of the More Serious Offenders Confined Under Penal and Reformatory Discipline in Mountjoy Government Cellular Prison in Dublin’, August 1857	67
3.1 Interior of East Wing, Kilmainham Gaol, Dublin by Thomas Flewett, Deputy Governor, 1860s	91
3.2 Middlesex House of Correction: male prisoners on treadmill	94
3.3 Woking Convict Invalid Prison: a woman prisoner in solitary confinement	128
4.1 The Criminal Lunatic Asylum, Dundrum, Dublin	163
4.2 Asylum for Criminal Lunatics, Broadmoor, Berkshire, taken from <i>Illustrated London News</i> , 1867	164
5.1 Doctor examining prisoner, Wormwood Scrubs, c. 1891	211
6.1 Sunday in cell, Wormwood Scrubs, c. 1891	255

Acknowledgements

Writing this book has been a fascinating and troubling process, one that has led us into many archives and libraries and involved numerous interactions with scholars from many disciplines. Our research and writing took place alongside many public engagement activities, which brought us into contact with people in prison or who have been in prison, making us ever more aware of the enduring nature of many of the issues that we discuss in this book. It has led us to reflect on the continuing high rates of mental illness in prisons, and, despite the efforts of prison services and organisations working to reform prisons and improve care and conditions, the ongoing challenges of providing effective responses and treatment. We have also been made aware of the obstacles involved – both current and historical – in removing prisoners experiencing mental ill health from the prison system and of preventing them entering the system in the first place. One of our intentions in writing this book was to offer the backstory of the emergence of prison psychiatry and an exploration of the experiences of prisoners suffering from mental disorders in the past. It also provides an examination of the impact of prison disciplines in the modern prison, initially introduced under a banner of reform and effective rehabilitation, on the minds of those experiencing these regimes and on the medical staff tasked with implementing them.

First and foremost, we would like to acknowledge the generous support of the Wellcome Trust in funding our Investigator Award, ‘Prisoners, Medical Care and Entitlement to Health in English and Irish Prisons, 1840–2000’ (1003341/Z/13/Z and 1003351/Z/13/Z), which provided support for the research that underpins this book and allowed us the time to write it. It also gave us the opportunity to work with an exceptional team of scholars. Fiachra Byrne, Oisín Wall and Holly Dunbar at University College Dublin (UCD), Margaret Charleroy, Rachel Bennett, Max Hodgson and Becky Crites at the University of Warwick, William Murphy at Dublin City University, and Virginia Berridge and Janet Weston at the London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, offered feedback, evidence and leads discovered

x Acknowledgements

while conducting their own research and enabled us to build a strong sense of community and collaboration around the project. Nicholas Duvall worked at both Warwick and UCD, and ably assisted us in our archival research during the first two years of the project. Henrietta Ewart, Louise Hide and David Durnin provided research support in the early stages of our project, while Lynn Kilgallon conducted additional research as we neared the end of the book project. Our wonderful public engagement officers, Flo Swann at Warwick and Sinead McCann at UCD, gave truly outstanding support, advice and expertise in developing our public engagement projects in tandem with the book. They enriched our experiences of public engagement, as did our many partners in the arts, policy, prison reform and prisons. Much of our public engagement was based on our research on mental illness in prison, which in turn fed back into the framing of our ideas for the book.

We have also both been fortunate in having excellent support beyond the project team from our two host research centres and universities. Colleagues at UCD's Centre for the History of Medicine and School of History provided ongoing practical support and expert knowledge as well as great enthusiasm and interest in our work: thanks to Sarah Feehan, Roy Fletcher, Robert Gerwarth, James Grannell, Mary Hatfield, Sara Honarmand Ebrahimi, Jen Keating, Emma Lyons, Alice Mauger, Ciarán McCabe, Ivar McGrath, William Mulligan, Elizabeth Mullins, Tadhg Ó hAnnracháin, Susannah Riordan, Michael Staunton, Fionnuala Walsh, Jennifer Wellington and Sandy Wilkinson. Beyond the UCD Centre and the School of History, Ian O'Donnell and Deirdre Healy in Law, Lynsey Black, now in Law at Maynooth University, and Justin Synnott, Máire Coyle and colleagues in UCD Research and Innovation engaged with and supported our work with great interest. Colleagues at Warwick's Centre for the History of Medicine have been a source of knowledge, expertise, and ongoing support and conviviality: Roberta Bivins, Andrew Burchell, Michael Bycroft, Tania Cleaves, Jennifer Crane, Kelly-Ann Couzens, Faby Creed, Angela Davis, Hannah Elizabeth, Jane Hand, Sheilagh Holmes, Sophie Mann, Gareth Millward, Michelle Nortey, James Poskett, Claire Sewell, Claire Shaw, Chris Sirrs, Elise Smith, Claudia Stein and Mathew Thomson, and our fantastic PhD community, and beyond our Centre for the History of Medicine, Anna Hájková, Sarah Hodges, Maria Luddy and Charles Walton in History, Jackie Hodgson in Law, Ana Chamberlen in Sociology, and David Duncan, James Green, Katie Klaassen, Liese Perrin and Emma Roberts in Research and Impact Services.

Over the years we have been researching and writing the book we have had many opportunities to present at seminars, workshops and

conferences, and to share and discuss our work with colleagues from many institutions. We would like to thank the audiences at these events for their questions, comments and feedback, particularly Clare Anderson, Catharine Coleborne, Ian Cummins, Margot Finn, Barry Godfrey, Louise Hide, James Kelly, Laura Kelly, Kathleen Kendall, Hamish Maxwell-Stewart, Alice Mills, James Moran, Laura Sellers, Sonu Shamdasani, Len Smith, Matt Smith, Barbara Taylor, Nancy Tomes and David Wright.

We would like to thank many archivists and librarians for supporting our research on visits to the Modern Records Centre at Warwick University, particularly Helen Ford and Elizabeth Wood, The National Archives, the National Archives of Ireland, particularly Brian Donnelly and Gregory O'Connor, who sadly passed away in December 2020, the Wellcome Library, the British Library, the National Library of Ireland, the London Metropolitan Archives, Dublin City Archives, Royal College of Physicians of Ireland, Liverpool Record Office, Berkshire County Record Office, Lancashire Archives and Wakefield County Record Office.

Our research and public engagement activities have brought us into contact with many outstanding organisations and individuals working in prison reform and the arts, too many to list here, but including Anita Dockley at the Howard League, Kimmett Edgar at the Prison Reform Trust, Fiona Ní Chinnéide and all the team at the Irish Penal Reform Trust, Annie Bartlett at St George's, University of London, Sharon Shalev at the Oxford Centre for Criminology, Derek Nisbett, Peter Cann and the actors and production team of Talking Birds Theatre Company, Feidlim Cannon and Gary Keegan of Brokentalkers Theatre Company and their production team and cast, including Rachel Bergin and Willie White, Saul Hewish at Rideout and his colleagues, theatre maker Helena Enright, Andy Watson, Liz Brown and the rest of the team at Geese Theatre Company, Kate McCrath, Molly Sharpe and their colleagues at Fuel, the team at the Bridge Project, Dublin, who supported the artistic work of Sinead McCann, Anne Costello and her colleagues at the Education Unit, Mountjoy Prison, Dublin, the governors at Mountjoy Prison, the team at PACE, and Brian Crowley and Niall Bergin at Kilmainham Gaol Museum, Dublin. Many thanks too to the staff at HMP Hewell, HMP Peterborough and HMP Stafford, in particular Governor Gareth Sands, Governor Ralph Lubkowski and Fran Southall, and to the men and women in prison who contributed so much to our projects. In addition to support from the Wellcome Trust, our public engagement work was awarded further funding from UCD Research Seed Funding and Warwick University's Impact Fund.

xii Acknowledgements

We would like to thank Lucy Rhymer, Rachel Blaifeder, Stephanie Taylor and Dhanuja Ragunathan and the rest of the team at Cambridge University Press for guiding us through the production process, Matthew Seal for his meticulous copyediting and Kate McIntosh for compiling such a comprehensive index, and the anonymous referees for their insightful comments and feedback on our manuscript. We would like to acknowledge the British Library, Howard League for Penal Reform, Irish Architectural Archive, The National Archives, New York Public Library and Wellcome Collection for permission to reproduce illustrative material.

Last, and most importantly, we would like to thank our families, Sebastian, Sam, Daniel and Catherine, and William, Damian and Michelle for their enormous support, advice and encouragement.