LOCAL MEANINGS OF PROPORTIONALITY

This book offers one of the rare empirical studies on the different meanings of proportionality as part of a global constitutional discourse. It develops and applies a theoretically informed comparative methodology for the study of differences in the use of legal transfers. Beyond the transplant versus culture controversy, it enriches our understanding of the relationship between law and its social context. Beyond the common law and civil law cleavage, it provides an in-depth comparison of French, English and Greek judicial review, rendering some core features of these systems accessible to non-initiated readers. The last part of the book provides insights as to the different visions of Europe underlying different phases of European integration and thus enriches our understanding of the process of integration through law.

Afroditi Marketou is a postdoctoral researcher in Law at the University of Luxembourg. She studied Law at the University of Athens, the University Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne (Master’s), and the European University Institute (PhD). She has taught Public Law in several French universities and regularly publishes in peer-reviewed academic journals in English and in French. Her research interests lie in public and European law and include the interplay between domestic and European legal systems, the reception of legal transfers, the local meanings of Europeanisation and globalisation, as well as the study of legal cultures from an anthropological perspective.
CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW

The aim of this series is to produce leading monographs in constitutional law. All areas of constitutional law and public law fall within the ambit of the series, including human rights and civil liberties law, administrative law, as well as constitutional theory and the history of constitutional law. A wide variety of scholarly approaches is encouraged, with the governing criterion being simply that the work is of interest to an international audience. Thus, works concerned with only one jurisdiction will be included in the series as appropriate, while, at the same time, the series will include works that are explicitly comparative or theoretical – or both. The series editor likewise welcomes proposals that work at the intersection of constitutional and international law, or that seek to bridge the gaps between civil law systems, the USA, and the common law jurisdictions of the Commonwealth.

Series Editors
David Dyzenhaus
Professor of Law and Philosophy, University of Toronto, Canada
Thomas Poole
Professor of Law, London School of Economics and Political Science

Editorial Advisory Board
T.R.S. Allan, Cambridge, UK
Damian Chalmers, LSE, UK
Sujit Choudhry, Berkeley, USA
Monica Claes, Maastricht, Netherlands
David Cole, Georgetown, USA
K.D. Ewing, King’s College London, UK
David Feldman, Cambridge, UK
Cora Hoexter, Witwatersrand, South Africa
Christoph Moellers, Humboldt, Germany
Adrienne Stone, Melbourne, Australia
Adam Tomkins, Glasgow, UK
Adrian Vermeule, Harvard, USA

Books in the series
Local Meanings of Proportionality
Afroditi Marketou
Property Rights and Social Justice: Progressive Property in Action
Rachael Walsh
Carl Schmitt’s Early Legal-Theoretical Writings: Statute and Judgment and the Value of the State and the Significance of the Individual
Lars Vinx and Samuel Garrett Zeitlin
Remedies for Human Rights Violations: A Two-Track Approach to Supranational and National Law
Kent Roach

A.W. Dicey and the Common Law Constitutional Tradition
Mark D. Walters

Europe’s Second Constitution: Crisis, Courts and Community
Markus W. Gehring

A.V. Dicey and the Common Law Constitutional Tradition: A Legal Turn of Mind
Mark D. Walters

Administrative Competence: Reimagining Administrative Law
Elizabeth Fisher and Sidney A. Shapiro

Legal Sabotage: Ernst Fraenkel in Hitler’s Germany
Douglas Morris

Proportionality in Action: Comparative and Empirical Perspectives on the Judicial Practice
Edited by Mordechai Kremnitzer, Tayla Steiner and Andrej Lang

Constitutional Dialogue: Democracy, Rights, Institutions
Edited by Geoffrey Sigalet, Grégoire Webber and Rosalind Dixon

The Veiled Sceptre: Reserve Powers of Heads of State in Westminster Systems
Anne Twomey

Vigilance and Restraint in the Common Law of Judicial Review
Dean Knight

The Alchemists: Questioning Our Faith in Courts as Democracy-Builders
Tom Gerald Daly

Australia’s Constitution after Whitlam
Brendan Lim

Building the Constitution: The Practice of Constitutional Interpretation in Post-Apartheid South Africa
James Fowkes

Dimensions of Dignity: The Theory and Practice of Modern Constitutional Law
Jacob Weinrib

Reason of State: Law, Prerogative, Empire
Thomas Poole

Bills of Rights in the Common Law
Robert Leckey

The Guardian of the Constitution: Hans Kelsen and Carl Schmitt on the Limits of Constitutional Law
Translated by Lars Vinx, with an introduction and notes by Lars Vinx

Parliamentary Bills of Rights: The Experiences of New Zealand and the United Kingdom
Janet L. Hiebert and James B. Kelly
Yoav Dotan

Balancing Constitutional Rights: The Origins and Meanings of Postwar Legal Discourse
Jacco Bomhoff

Judges on Trial: The Independence and Accountability of the English Judiciary
Shimon Shetreet and Sophie Turenne

Proportionality and Constitutional Culture
Moshe Cohen-Eliya and Iddo Porat

Theunis Roux

The New Commonwealth Model of Constitutionalism: Theory and Practice
Stephen Gardbaum

Searching for the State in British Legal Thought: Competing Conceptions of the Public Sphere
Janet McLean

Judging Social Rights
Jeff King

Proportionality: Constitutional Rights and Their Limitations
Aharon Barak

Parliamentary Sovereignty: Contemporary Debates
Jeffrey Goldsworthy
LOCAL MEANINGS OF PROPORTIONALITY

AFRODITI MARKETOU

University of Luxembourg
## CONTENTS

*Acknowledgements*  page viii

1  Proportionality as a Cultural Practice  1

**PART I**  Questioning the Success of Proportionality  37

2  Proportionality in French Public Law  45
3  Proportionality in English Public Law  75
4  Proportionality in Greek Public Law  105

**PART II**  Great Expectations  135

5  Searching for a Legal Science  143
6  Searching for an English Public Law  187
7  Searching for a ‘Species of Sympathetic Magic’  223

**PART III**  European Integrations  263

8  A Common European Culture of Rights  271
9  A Common Market  299
10  Disintegration  329

   Conclusion  360

*Bibliography*  370

*Index*  407
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work would have never been accomplished without the support, advice and valuable comments of Bruno De Witte, to whom I am particularly grateful. Mattias Kumm provided precious guidance during the early stages of this project. I thank Rían Derrig, Conor Gearty, Claire Kilpatrick, Toni Marzal, Kai Möller, Giorgio Monti, Thomas Poole, Vincent Réveillère, Giovanni Sartor, Antonin Sopena, Mathieu Touzel-Divina, Stavros Tsakyrakis, Sebastiaan Van Ouwerkerk and Constantinos Yannakopoulos for valuable discussions and critical readings of parts of this work. I am particularly grateful to Loïc Azoulai, Jacco Bomhoff and Guillaume Tusseau for commenting on the doctoral manuscript on which this book is based. My family and friends have influenced this work much more than they know. Special thanks to Agni, Maria and Kostakis for making life in London so merry. Loutraki and its sporadic inhabitants also merit my sincerest gratitude. The colleagues and friends who contributed to this work bear no responsibility for errors and omissions in the pages that follow. This book would have not even been imagined without the support and comments of Vincent. He merits my deepest appreciation for being a source of inspiration and thought over all these years. This book is dedicated to him.