

Agents of the Hidden Imam

In 874 CE, the eleventh Imam died and the Imami community splintered. The institutions of the Imamate were maintained by the dead Imam's agents, who asserted they were in contact with a hidden twelfth Imam. This was the beginning of "Twelver" Shi'ism. Edmund Haves provides an innovative approach to exploring early Shi'ism, moving beyond doctrinal history to provide an analysis of the sociopolitical processes leading to the canonization of the Occultation of the twelfth Imam. Hayes shows how the agents cemented their authority by reproducing the physical signs of the Imamate, including protocols of succession, letters, and alms taxes. Four of these agents were ultimately canonized as "envoys" but traces of earlier conceptions of authority remain embedded in the earliest reports. Hayes dissects the complex and contradictory Occultation narratives to show how, amid the claims of numerous actors, the institutional positioning of the envoys allowed them to assert a quasi-Imamic authority in the absence of an Imam.

Edmund Hayes is a researcher at Radboud University, Nijmegen. He has authored numerous articles at the intersection between the intellectual, religious, and social history of early Islam, including on the institutions of the Shiʿi Imamate, Islamic revenues, charity and taxation, excommunication, ethnicity, and gender and sexuality.



Cambridge Studies in Islamic Civilization

Editorial Board
Chase F. Robinson, Freer | Sackler, Smithsonian Institution (general editor)
Anne Broadbridge, UMass Amberst
Michael Cook, Princeton University
Maribel Fierro, Spanish National Research Council
Alan Mikhail, Yale University
Intisar Rabb, Harvard University
Muhammad Qasim Zaman, Princeton University

Other titles in the series are listed at the back of the book.



Agents of the Hidden Imam

Forging Twelver Shi 'ism, 850–950 CE

EDMUND HAYES

Radboud University, Nijmegen





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108834391

DOI: 10.1017/9781108993098

© Edmund Hayes 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-83439-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Mum and Dad



Yet som men say in many partys of Inglonde that Kynge Arthure ys nat dede, but had by the wyll of Oure Lorde Jesu into another place; and men say that he shall com agayne, and he shall wynne the Holy Crosse. Yet I woll nate say that hit shall be so; but rather I wolde sey, here in thys worlde he changed his lyff. And many men say that there ys written upon the tumbe thys [vers]: HIC IACET ARTHURUS, REX QUONDAM REXQUE FUTURUS [Here lies Arthur, king once, king to be].

Thomas Malory, Le Morte Darthur



Contents

List of Figures p	age viii
List of Tables	ix
Acknowledgments	X
List of Abbreviations	xii
Introduction	1
1 The Rise of the Agents in the Late Imamate (830–874 CE	_
2 The Crisis before the Crisis: The Feud between Imamic	,
Contenders and the Power of the Agents	42
3 Crisis! The Mother, the Brother, the Concubine,	
and the Politics of Inheritance	52
4 The Agents of the <i>Nāḥiya</i> in the Era of Perplexity	80
The Creation of an Envoy: The Rise of Abū Jaʿfar	
al-ʿAmrī	120
6 Rise and Fall: Ibn Rawḥ, Shalmaghānī, and the Rise	
and Fall of the Envoyship	172
Conclusion	216
Bibliography	222
Index	242



Figures

1	Dirham naming of 'Alī al-Riḍā as heir to 'Abbasid	
	caliph Ma'mūn	page 34
2	The wise king behind a curtain	44
3	A funeral	54
4	Modern location of house of 'Askarī Imams in Samarra	66
5	Early claims to represent the Imamate	79
6	Dancing girls from Samarra palace	102
7	Third-/ninth-century Arabic letter with its response	
	written overleaf	128
8	Lamp	134
9	Seal	180
10	The execution of Ḥallāj in Baghdad	192



Tables

1	The canonical sequence of the twelve Imams	
	of the Twelver Shiʿa	page 3
2	Ṭūsī's taxonomy of praised and censured agents,	
	envoys, and false Gates	11
3	Agents who saw the Imam, as reported by Muḥammad	l
	al-Kūfī	88
4	Reports about Ibn Mahziyār	136
5	The incarnation of the divine pentad proposed by	
	Shalmaghānī by 312/924	203



Acknowledgments

This book has been eight years, innumerable conversations, and four towns in the making. In its infancy, Franklin Lewis, Paul Walker, Tahera Qutbuddin, and Sabine Schmidtke gave me indispensable guidance, feedback, and support. Fellow graduate students at the University of Chicago not only read my work, but provided a stimulating and fertile atmosphere, especially Austin O'Malley, Sabahat Adil, Alidost Numan, Kaveh Hemmat, Jessica Andruss, Shatha Mutawwa, Rodrigo Adem, Cam Cross, Ferenc Csirkés, Maryam Sabbaghi, Chris Markiewicz, Shiraz Hajiani, Derek Davison, James Windsor, Zahit Atcil, Sulayman Hassan, and Nazeer Lotfi-Fard, and my MEHAT peeps Esra Tasdelen and Meggie Shortle. Feedback at different stages from several careful readers helped me think about the major changes needed to transform this research into a book, especially Rob Gleave, Eirik Hovden, Moojan Momen, Alireza Doostdar, Wilferd Madelung, and Mushegh Asatryan. I had a testing ground for my ideas in the Shi'i Studies Group in Chicago, co-organized with Mohammad Sagha, Alex Muller, Zach Winters, and championed by Paul Walker. Over the years I have benefited greatly from conversations, advice, and feedback on my work from many colleagues, especially Matthew Pierce, George Warner, Omid Ghaemmaghami, Etan Kohlberg, Ahmed El Shamsy, Sean Anthony, Fred Donner, Rula Abisaab, and Sajjad Rizvi. In attempting to make sense of the sometimes elusive context and allusive Arabic of Imami hadith, I have benefited from conversations and email exchanges with Kumail Rajani, Devin Stewart, Hassan Ansari, Geert Jan van Gelder, and Peter Webb. Thanks to Arianna D'Ottone, Matt Saba, Robert Hillenbrand, and Jelle Bruning for invaluable advice in thinking about image and material culture. Special thanks are due to Sabine Schmidtke, who invited



Acknowledgments

ΧI

me for a short but intensely fruitful fellowship at the Institute of Advanced Studies in Princeton in the context of the Shii Studies Research Program funded by the Carnegie Corporation of New York, during which I knocked off the first draft of my final chapter. In the framework of the project "Embedding Conquest: Naturalising Muslim Rule in the Early Islamic Empire (600–1000)" funded by the European Research Council (within the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation program, grant agreement no. 683194), I have had constant support and stimulation. I will be eternally grateful to Petra Sijpesteijn, the leader of this project, not only for the time to finish this book, but because Petra and the wonderful folks in Leiden, Alon Dar, Reza Huseini, Cecilia Palombo, Eline Scheerlinck, Abdullah Alhatlani, Shuqi Jia, and our numerous guests, have greatly enriched my understanding of the broader world in which the events analyzed in this book took place.

Thanks and love to Mum and Dad for instilling in me a curiosity about history and literature, and to Flora, Jacob, Rufus, and Leila for making a home of light, laughter, food, dancing, and games in Chicago, Waterville, Tübingen, Leiden, and counting . . .



Abbreviations

In the notes:

 E12 Encyclopaedia of Islam, second edition E13 Encyclopaedia of Islam, third edition Lane Edward William Lane, An Arabic-English Lexicon, 		
Lane Edward William Lane, An Arabic-English Lexicon,		
(London: Williams and Norgate, 1863–93)	8 v	ols.

In translations from the Arabic:

AJ	'Azza wa-jalla, "He is glorified and great." Used of God.
AS	'Alayhi al-salām, "upon him be peace." Used of an Imam, or Imams if in the plural.
QAR	Qaddasa Allāh rūḥahu, "may God sanctify his soul" (or dual or plural forms). Used for the envoys.
RA	Raḥimahu Allāh, "may God have mercy upon him" (or dual or plural forms). Used for a venerated figure who has passed
	away.
RAA	Raḍiya Allāh 'anhu, "may God be pleased with him" (or dual or plural forms). Used for agents, envoys, scholars, and other pious, venerated followers and companions of the Imams.
RATAA	Radiya Allāh ta ʿālā ʿanhu wa-arḍāhu, "may God most high be pleased with him and grant him contentment." Used for agents, envoys, scholars, and other pious, venerated followers and companions of the Imams.



List of Abbreviations

XIII

SAA	Ṣallā Allāh 'alayhi or Ṣalawāt Allāh 'alayhi, "may God bless
	him" or "God's blessings be upon him." Usually used for
	a prophet.
SAAA	Ṣallā Allāh 'alayhi wa-ālihi, "may God pray for him and his
	family." Used for the Prophet Muḥammad.
SAAS	Ṣallā Allāh 'alayhi wa-sallam, "may God pray for him and
	grant him peace." Used for the Prophet Muḥammad.
T	Ta ʿālā, "He is most high." Used for God.

