Agents of the Hidden Imam

In 874 CE, the eleventh Imam died and the Imami community splintered. The institutions of the Imamate were maintained by the dead Imam’s agents, who asserted they were in contact with a hidden twelfth Imam. This was the beginning of “Twelver” Shiʿism. Edmund Hayes provides an innovative approach to exploring early Shiʿism, moving beyond doctrinal history to provide an analysis of the socio-political processes leading to the canonization of the Occultation of the twelfth Imam. Hayes shows how the agents cemented their authority by reproducing the physical signs of the Imamate, including protocols of succession, letters, and alms taxes. Four of these agents were ultimately canonized as “envoys” but traces of earlier conceptions of authority remain embedded in the earliest reports. Hayes dissects the complex and contradictory Occultation narratives to show how, amid the claims of numerous actors, the institutional positioning of the envoys allowed them to assert a quasi-Imamic authority in the absence of an Imam.

Edmund Hayes is a researcher at Radboud University, Nijmegen. He has authored numerous articles at the intersection between the intellectual, religious, and social history of early Islam, including on the institutions of the Shiʿi Imamate, Islamic revenues, charity and taxation, excommunication, ethnicity, and gender and sexuality.
Cambridge Studies in Islamic Civilization

Editorial Board
Chase F. Robinson, Freer|Sackler, Smithsonian Institution (general editor)
Anne Broadbridge, UMass Amberst
Michael Cook, Princeton University
Maribel Fierro, Spanish National Research Council
Alan Mikhail, Yale University
Intisar Rabb, Harvard University
Muhammad Qasim Zaman, Princeton University

Other titles in the series are listed at the back of the book.
Agents of the Hidden Imam

Forging Twelver Shi‘ism, 850–950 CE

EDMUND HAYES
Radboud University, Nijmegen
For Mum and Dad
Yet som men say in many partys of Inglonde that Kynge Arthure ys nat
dede, but had by the wyll of Oure Lorde Jesu into another place; and men
say that he shall com agayne, and he shall wynne the Holy Crosse. Yet
I woll nate say that hit shall be so; but rather I wolde sey, here in thys
worlde he changed his lyff. And many men say that there ys written upon
the tumbe thys [vers]: HIC IACET ARTHURUS, REX QUONDAM
REXQUE FUTURUS [Here lies Arthur, king once, king to be].

Thomas Malory, *Le Morte Darthur*
Contents

List of Figures                                      page viii
List of Tables                                       ix
Acknowledgments                                      x
List of Abbreviations                                xii

Introduction                                        1
1 The Rise of the Agents in the Late Imamate (830–874 CE) 28
2 The Crisis before the Crisis: The Feud between Imamic Contenders and the Power of the Agents 42
3 Crisis! The Mother, the Brother, the Concubine, and the Politics of Inheritance 52
4 The Agents of the Nāḥiya in the Era of Perplexity 80
5 The Creation of an Envoy: The Rise of Abū Jaʿfar al-ʿAmrī 120
6 Rise and Fall: Ibn Rawh, Shalmaghānī, and the Rise and Fall of the Envoyship 172
Conclusion                                         216

Bibliography                                       222
Index                                               242
Figures

1 Dirham naming of ʿAlī al-Riḍā as heir to ʿAbbasid caliph Maʿmūn  page 34
2 The wise king behind a curtain  44
3 A funeral  54
4 Modern location of house of ʿAskarī Imams in Samarra  66
5 Early claims to represent the Imamate  79
6 Dancing girls from Samarra palace  102
7 Third-/ninth-century Arabic letter with its response written overleaf  128
8 Lamp  134
9 Seal  180
10 The execution of Ḥallāj in Baghdad  192
### Tables

1. The canonical sequence of the twelve Imams of the Twelver Shi’a  
   page 3
2. Tūsī’s taxonomy of praised and censured agents, envoys, and false Gates  
   11
3. Agents who saw the Imam, as reported by Muḥammad al-Kūfī  
   88
4. Reports about Ibn Mahziyar  
   136
5. The incarnation of the divine pentad proposed by Shalmaghānī by 312/924  
   203
Acknowledgments

This book has been eight years, innumerable conversations, and four towns in the making. In its infancy, Franklin Lewis, Paul Walker, Tahera Qutbuddin, and Sabine Schmidtke gave me indispensable guidance, feedback, and support. Fellow graduate students at the University of Chicago not only read my work, but provided a stimulating and fertile atmosphere, especially Austin O’Malley, Sabahat Adil, Alidost Numan, Kaveh Hemmat, Jessica Andruess, Shatha Mutawwa, Rodrigo Adem, Cam Cross, Ferenc Csirkés, Maryam Sabbaghi, Chris Markiewicz, Shiraz Hajiani, Derek Davison, James Windsor, Zahit Atcil, Sulyman Hassan, and Nazeer Lotfi-Fard, and my MEHAT peeps Esra Tasdelen and Meggie Shortle. Feedback at different stages from several careful readers helped me think about the major changes needed to transform this research into a book, especially Rob Gleave, Eirik Hovden, Moojan Momen, Alireza Doostdar, Wilferd Madelung, and Mushbehg Asatryan. I had a testing ground for my ideas in the Shi’i Studies Group in Chicago, co-organized with Mohammad Sagha, Alex Muller, Zach Winters, and championed by Paul Walker. Over the years I have benefited greatly from conversations, advice, and feedback on my work from many colleagues, especially Matthew Pierce, George Warner, Omid Ghaemmaghami, Etan Kohlberg, Ahmed El Shamsy, Sean Anthony, Fred Donner, Rula Abisaab, and Sajjad Rizvi. In attempting to make sense of the sometimes elusive context and allusive Arabic of Imami hadith, I have benefited from conversations and email exchanges with Kumail Rajani, Devin Stewart, Hassan Ansari, Geert Jan van Gelder, and Peter Webb. Thanks to Arianna D’Ottone, Matt Saba, Robert Hillenbrand, and Jelle Bruning for invaluable advice in thinking about image and material culture. Special thanks are due to Sabine Schmidtke, who invited
Acknowledgments

me for a short but intensely fruitful fellowship at the Institute of Advanced Studies in Princeton in the context of the Shi'i Studies Research Program funded by the Carnegie Corporation of New York, during which I knocked off the first draft of my final chapter. In the framework of the project “Embedding Conquest: Naturalising Muslim Rule in the Early Islamic Empire (600–1000)” funded by the European Research Council (within the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation program, grant agreement no. 683194), I have had constant support and stimulation. I will be eternally grateful to Petra Sijpesteijn, the leader of this project, not only for the time to finish this book, but because Petra and the wonderful folks in Leiden, Alon Dar, Reza Huseini, Cecilia Palombo, Eline Scheerlinck, Abdullah Alhatlani, Shuqi Jia, and our numerous guests, have greatly enriched my understanding of the broader world in which the events analyzed in this book took place.

Thanks and love to Mum and Dad for instilling in me a curiosity about history and literature, and to Flora, Jacob, Rufus, and Leila for making a home of light, laughter, food, dancing, and games in Chicago, Waterville, Tübingen, Leiden, and counting . . .
Abbreviations

In the notes:

**Elr**  
Encyclopaedia Iranica

**EI2**  
Encyclopaedia of Islam, second edition

**EI3**  
Encyclopaedia of Islam, third edition

**Lane**  
(London: Williams and Norgate, 1863–93)

In translations from the Arabic:

**AJ**  
ʿAzza wa-jalla, “He is glorified and great.” Used of God.

**AS**  
ʿAlayhi al-salām, “upon him be peace.” Used of an Imam, or Imams if in the plural.

**QAR**  
Qaddasa Allāh rūḥahu, “may God sanctify his soul” (or dual or plural forms). Used for the envoys.

**RA**  
Rahimahu Allāh, “may God have mercy upon him” (or dual or plural forms). Used for a venerated figure who has passed away.

**RAA**  
Raḍiya Allāh ʿanhu, “may God be pleased with him” (or dual or plural forms). Used for agents, envoys, scholars, and other pious, venerated followers and companions of the Imams.

**RATAA**  
Raḍiya Allāh taʿālā ʿanhu wa-ardāhu, “may God most high be pleased with him and grant him contentment.” Used for agents, envoys, scholars, and other pious, venerated followers and companions of the Imams.
List of Abbreviations

SAA  Šallā Allāh ‘alayhi or Šalawāt Allāh ‘alayhi, “may God bless him” or “God’s blessings be upon him.” Usually used for a prophet.

SAAA Šallā Allāh ‘alayhi wa-ālibi, “may God pray for him and his family.” Used for the Prophet Muḥammad.

SAAS Šallā Allāh ‘alayhi wa-sallam, “may God pray for him and grant him peace.” Used for the Prophet Muḥammad.

T Taʿālā, “He is most high.” Used for God.