

CULTURAL-HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES ON COLLECTIVE INTELLIGENCE

In the era of digital communication, collective problem solving is increasingly important. Large groups can now resolve issues together in completely different ways, which has transformed the arts, sciences, business, education, technology, and medicine. Collective intelligence is something we share with animals and is different from machine learning and artificial intelligence. To design and utilize human collective intelligence, we must understand how its problem-solving mechanisms work. From democracy in ancient Athens, through the invention of the printing press, to COVID-19, this book analyzes how humans developed the ability to find solutions together. This wide-ranging, thought-provoking book is a game-changer for those working strategically with collective problem solving within organizations and using a variety of innovative methods. It sheds light on how humans work effectively alongside machines to confront the most urgent challenges ever faced by humanity. This title is also available as Open Access on Cambridge Core.

ROLF K. BALTZERSEN is Professor in the Faculty of Education at Østfold University College, Norway. His research interests include collective intelligence, communication, metacognition, educational technology, and teaching.

CURRENT PERSPECTIVES IN SOCIAL AND
BEHAVIORAL SCIENCES

Current Perspectives in Social and Behavioral Sciences provides thought-provoking introductions to key topics, invaluable to both the student and scholar. Edited by world leading academics, each volume contains specially-commissioned essays by international contributors, which present cutting-edge research on the subject and suggest new paths of inquiry for the reader. This series is designed not only to offer a comprehensive overview of the chosen topics, but to display and provoke lively and controversial debate.

Published titles:

Culture, Mind, and Brain: Emerging Concepts, Models, and Applications
edited by LAURENCE J. KIRMAYER, SHINOBU KITAYAMA, CAROL M.
WORTHMAN, and CONSTANCE A. CUMMINGS

Genetics, Ethics and Education
edited by SUSAN BOUREGY, ELENA L. GRIGORENKO, STEPHEN R. LATHAM
and MEI TAN

Global Perspectives on Teacher Motivation
edited by HELEN WATT, PAUL RICHARDSON, and KARI SMITH

Nurturing Creativity in the Classroom,
2nd edition edited by RONALD A. BEGHETTO and JAMES C. KAUFMAN

Research and Theory on Workplace Aggression
edited by NATHAN A. BOWLING and M. SANDY HERSHCOVIS

Mindfulness and Performance
edited by AMY L. BALTZELL

Creativity and Reason in Cognitive Development,
2nd edition edited by JAMES KAUFMAN and JOHN BAER

Reflections on the Learning Sciences
edited by MICHAEL A. EVANS, MARTIN J. PACKER and R. KEITH SAWYER

CULTURAL-HISTORICAL
PERSPECTIVES ON
COLLECTIVE INTELLIGENCE

Patterns in Problem Solving and Innovation

ROLF K. BALTZERSEN

Ostfold University College



Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-83374-5 — Cultural-Historical Perspectives on Collective Intelligence
 Rolf K. Baltzersen
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108833745

DOI: 10.1017/9781108981361

© Rolf K. Baltzersen

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781108981361 under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this license, visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0>

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties. Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly. When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781108981361

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Baltzersen, Rolf K., 1974- author.

TITLE: Cultural-historical perspectives on collective intelligence : patterns in problem solving and innovation / Rolf K. Baltzersen, Østfold University College.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2022. | SERIES: Current perspectives in social and behavioral sciences | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2021017609 (print) | LCCN 2021017610 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108833745 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108986755 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108981361 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Swarm intelligence. | Technological innovations—Social aspects. | Human-computer interaction.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC Q337.3 .B35 2022 (print) | LCC Q337.3 (ebook) | DDC 006.3/824-dc23
 LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021017609>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021017610>

ISBN 978-1-108-83374-5 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-98675-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For my children, Silvia and Johannes.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> xiii
<i>List of Tables</i>	xviii
I What Is Collective Intelligence?	I
1.1 The Need for New Types of Collective Problem Solving	1
1.2 Theoretical Perspectives on CI	6
1.2.1 A General Group Intelligence Factor	7
1.2.2 Self-Organization	9
1.2.3 The Role of Diversity	10
1.3 Top Solvers in Online Innovation Teams	15
1.4 A Cultural-Historical Perspective on CI	16
1.5 The Methodological Steps	18
1.5.1 Step 1: Review Current CI Practices	18
1.5.2 Step 2: Identifying CI as Three Types of Collective Problem Solving	20
1.5.3 Step 3: A Historical Analysis of the Problem-Solving Types	22
1.5.4 Step 4: Design of CI	23
2 Crowdsourcing	27
2.1 What Is Crowdsourcing?	27
2.2 Online Innovation Contests	28
2.2.1 Background	28
2.2.2 The IdeaRally: Rapid Problem Solving in Large Groups	32
2.2.3 The Climate CoLab: Transparent Innovation Contests	36
2.3 Online Citizen Science	38
2.3.1 Zooniverse: Online Citizen Science Platforms	38
2.3.2 FoldIt: Citizen Science Games	42
2.4 Summary	46
2.4.1 Crowdsourcing Skills	47
2.4.2 Design of Crowdsourcing	48

3	Open Online Knowledge Sharing	50
3.1	Background	50
3.2	Open Sharing of Scientific Knowledge	51
3.2.1	Open Access Publishing	51
3.2.2	Open Database Projects	52
3.2.3	Open Textbooks	54
3.2.4	Wikipedia	56
3.2.5	The Polymath Project	58
3.2.6	Galaxy Zoo Quench	61
3.3	Open Sharing of Practical Knowledge	62
3.3.1	Open Sharing of Videos	62
3.3.2	Open Sharing of Geographical Resources	66
3.3.3	Open Sharing of Corporate Knowledge	67
3.3.4	Open Sharing of Political Arguments	68
3.4	Summary	72
4	Human Swarm Problem Solving	75
4.1	Background	75
4.2	Decision Threshold Methods	77
4.2.1	Quorum Decisions as Swarm Problem Solving among Animals	77
4.2.2	Human Quorum Response as Swarm Problem Solving	82
4.2.3	Majority Decisions	85
4.3	Averaging	88
4.3.1	Averaging as Swarm Problem Solving in Animals	88
4.3.2	Human Averaging as Swarm Problem Solving	90
4.4	Large Gatherings	93
4.4.1	Large Gatherings as Swarm Problem Solving among Animals	93
4.4.2	Large Gatherings as Human Swarm Problem Solving	96
4.5	Heterogeneous Social Interaction	104
4.5.1	Heterogeneous Social Interaction in Animal Swarm Problem Solving	104
4.5.2	Human Heterogeneous Social Interaction as Human Swarm Problem Solving	108
4.6	Environmental Sensing	114
4.6.1	Environmental Sensing in Animal Swarm Problem Solving	114
4.6.2	Human Environmental Sensing	118
4.7	What Is Human Swarm Problem Solving?	124
4.7.1	Predefined Problems	125
4.7.2	Prespecified Problem-Solving Procedures	126
4.7.3	Rapid Time-Limited Problem Solving	129
4.7.4	Individual Learning	131
4.7.5	Summary of the Basic Characteristics in Human Swarm Problem Solving	133

Contents

ix

5	The Origins of Human Swarm Problem Solving	135
5.1	Background	135
5.2	The Emergence of Group Hunting	136
5.3	The Emergence of Premodern Trade	139
5.4	Human Swarm Problem Solving in Ancient Athens	143
5.4.1	Maximizing Information about the Athenian Territory	143
5.4.2	Heterogeneous Social Interaction through Rotation and Randomization	147
5.4.3	Decision Threshold Methods in the Assembly and the People's Court	153
5.4.4	Large Gatherings in Athens	159
5.5	A Summary of Human Swarm Evolution	163
5.5.1	The Evolution of Synchronized Swarm Problem Solving	165
5.5.2	The Evolution of Pinpointed Swarm Problem Solving	167
6	Human Stigmergic Problem Solving	171
6.1	What Is Stigmergic Problem Solving?	171
6.1.1	Background	171
6.1.2	Quantitative Stigmergy	173
6.1.3	Qualitative Stigmergy	175
6.1.4	Sematectonic Stigmergy	177
6.1.5	Marker-Based Stigmergy	178
6.1.6	Human Stigmergic Problem Solving Is Solution-Centered	178
6.2	Rating Complete Solutions	180
6.2.1	Search Engines and Collaborative Filtering	180
6.2.2	Different Rating Methods	184
6.3	Reestimating Solutions	186
6.4	Completing Solutions	192
6.5	Adapting Complete Solutions	195
6.5.1	Background	195
6.5.2	Open Textbooks	195
6.5.3	Internet Memes	197
6.6	What Is Human Stigmergic Problem Solving?	200
6.6.1	Solution-Centered Collective Problem Solving	200
6.6.2	“Rating Complete Solutions” as Marker-Based, Quantitative Stigmergy	203
6.6.3	“Reestimating Solutions” as Quantitative, Sematectonic Stigmergy	204
6.6.4	“Completing Solutions” as Qualitative, Sematectonic Stigmergy	204
6.6.5	“Adapting Complete Solutions” as Sematectonic, Qualitative Stigmergy	206
6.6.6	Improvement of Solutions as the Basis for Human Stigmergic Problem Solving	207

x	<i>Contents</i>	
7	The Origins of Human Stigmergic Problem Solving	208
7.1	Background	208
7.2	The Invention of Writing	209
7.3	The Invention of the Printing Press	214
7.3.1	Mass Copying of Printed Information	215
7.3.2	Flexible Modification of Printed Information	225
7.4	A Summary of Human Stigmergic Evolution	232
7.4.1	The Invention of Writing	232
7.4.2	The Invention of the Printing Press	234
7.4.3	The Invention of the Internet	235
8	Collaborative Problem Solving	238
8.1	Background	238
8.2	Working Well with Others	239
8.2.1	Being in a Symmetrical Group Relationship	240
8.2.2	Interest in Meeting People Who Are Different	241
8.3	Cognitive Diversity	242
8.4	Equal Participation	247
8.5	Joint Coordination	250
8.5.1	Establishing a Shared Understanding of the Problem	251
8.5.2	Planning the Process	251
8.5.3	Staying Focused on Shared Goals	251
8.5.4	Ensuring the Conversational Flow	252
9	The Origins of Collaborative Problem Solving	254
9.1	Background	254
9.2	Antecedents to Mutual Collaboration	254
9.2.1	Mutual Collaboration Originates from Gestural Communication	255
9.2.2	Three Communicative Motives	258
9.2.3	The Joy of Collaboration	260
9.3	Antecedents to Collaborative Culture	262
9.3.1	The Emergence of a Community of Learners	262
9.3.2	Equal Participation	266
9.4	A Summary of the Evolution of Collaborative Problem Solving	271
10	Intelligent Engagement	276
10.1	Background	276
10.2	Mass Deliberation	278
10.2.1	Citizens' Council in Ostbelgien	279
10.2.2	Better Reykjavík	282
10.3	Mass Voting	285
10.4	Transparent Collective Work	290
10.4.1	Crowd Peer Review	292
10.4.2	The Icelandic Experiment	295
10.4.3	Crowdsourcing Bills of Law	296

<i>Contents</i>		xi
10.5	Social Media Activism	298
10.6	Dysfunctional Engagement	303
10.7	Summary	309
11	Intelligent Contributions	313
11.1	Background	313
11.2	Many Different Perspectives on the Same Work	314
11.3	The Golden Middle Way Is the Best Solution	317
11.3.1	Meeting at the Quantitative Middle Point	318
11.3.2	Finding a Balanced Representation of All Sides	319
11.3.3	Identifying Commonalities	320
11.4	Searching for the Unexpected Solution	325
11.5	Modularizing the Tasks	329
11.5.1	A Modularization Strategy	329
11.5.2	Modularization in Strongly Interconnected Content Structures	332
11.5.3	Modularization in Loosely Connected Content Structures	333
11.6	Summary	335
12	Intelligent Evaluations	340
12.1	Background	340
12.2	The Reputation Society	341
12.2.1	The Emergence of the Reputation Society	341
12.2.2	Online Reputations Moving into New Domains	344
12.2.3	Reputation Score Systems in Social Media	346
12.3	Evaluating the Collective Work	349
12.3.1	Shared Coordination	349
12.3.2	The Need for Coordinators	353
12.4	Institutionalizing Critical Discourse	355
12.4.1	The Nomothetai	355
12.4.2	The Citizen's Assembly in Ireland	356
12.4.3	Knowledge Commons	361
12.5	Summary	363
13	COVID-19 as a Wicked Problem	366
13.1	Background	366
13.2	The Test and Trace Strategy	368
13.3	Effective Communication about the Pandemic	370
13.4	Rule Compliance	373
13.5	COVID-19 in a CI Perspective	375
13.5.1	Transparent Information	376
13.5.2	Citizen Responsibility	377
13.5.3	Collective Learning	378

xii	<i>Contents</i>	
14	Motivation to Contribute	381
14.1	Background	381
14.2	Being Immersed	382
14.2.1	Being Immersed in Simple Tasks	382
14.2.2	Being Immersed in Complex Tasks	383
14.3	Being Recognized	384
14.4	Being Part of a Community	386
14.5	Learning as Motivation	389
14.5.1	Individual Learning as Motivation	389
14.5.2	Collective Learning as Motivation	390
14.5.3	Transformative Learning as Motivation	391
14.6	Economic Motivation	392
14.7	Making Societal Contributions	393
14.8	Summary	396
15	The Intelligent Society	399
15.1	Background	399
15.2	Instrumentarian Intelligence	401
15.3	Civic Intelligence	408
	<i>References</i>	419
	<i>Index</i>	442

Figures

- | | |
|--|---------|
| 4.1 Two worker ants of the species <i>Temnothorax albipennis</i> performing a tandem run, image courtesy of Thomas O’Shea-Wheller, 2016 | page 80 |
| 4.2 Meerkat (<i>suricata suricatta</i>) digging in the Kalahari Desert, photo © Tim Jackson/Getty Images | 81 |
| 4.3 People raise their hands to vote during the annual Landsgemeinde meeting at a square in the town of Appenzell, April 29, 2012. Appenzell is one of Switzerland’s two remaining Landsgemeinden, a 700-year tradition of an open-air assembly in which citizens can take key political decisions directly by raising their hands, photo Christian Hartmann/Reuters/NTB © | 84 |
| 4.4 Olive Baboons crossing Uaso Nyiro River in Kenya, photo Don Farrall/Getty Images © | 89 |
| 4.5 The honeybee waggle dance. The direction the bee moves informs others about where the site is. The duration of each dance informs about the distance to the site, photo Paul Starosta/Getty Images © | 95 |
| 4.6 Hackathon in Berkeley, California in 2018. Students work at Cal Hacks 5.0, the largest collegiate hackathon, in Berkeley, CA, November 3, 2018, photo Max Whittaker/The New York Times/NTB | 100 |
| 4.7 Cow moose defends her newly born calf from the Grant Creek wolf pack while surrounded in a tundra pond in Denali National Park, Alaska, photo Patrick J. Endres/Getty Images © | 105 |
| 4.8 African Elephant herd walking on marshy area of Amboseli National park, Kenya. The oldest female is the leader of the herd, photo Manoj Shah/Getty Images © | 106 |

- 4.9 Starlings move as one giant organism to synchronize their defence against predators, Kent, United Kingdom, photo Sandra Standbridge/Getty Images © 115
- 4.10 Bronze whaler shark swimming through a giant ball of sardines, waiting to feed on them. Off the East coast of South Africa, photo wildestanimal/Getty Images © 117
- 5.1 *The Venus of Willendorf*. This is an 11-centimetre Venus figurine estimated to have been made around 25,000 years ago. It was found in Austria and is carved from a limestone that is not local to the area, photo Dorling Kindersley/Getty Images © 141
- 5.2 The kleroterion, the Greek lottery machine. These machines were primarily used to select jurors in Athens. Each court had machines placed in front of the entrance. The model of this kleroterion has 11 columns and was probably not used in the courts, but in the Council. There were 12 tribes in the third century BC and the kleroterion could then be used to select committee members representing all tribes except the one holding the presidency, photo Gianni Dagli Orti/REX/Shutterstock editorial/NTB © 150
- 5.3 The Chigi vase from seventh century BC showing hoplites going to battle, photo Francesco Bino, image courtesy of The National Etruscan Museum © 155
- 5.4 Ostraka, shards of pottery used as a voting ballot. The name of Themistocles, son of Neocles, are written on the shards of pottery. He was banned from Athens through ostracism in 470 BC, Agora Museum, Athens, Greece, photo Akg-images/NTB © 156
- 5.5 The Pnyx hill in Athens where the Assembly had its meetings, photo Miguel Sotomayor/Getty Images © 160
- 6.1 Leafcutter ants following the same trail when carrying leaves back to the nest, photo Ricardo Riechelmann/EyeEm/Getty Images © 174
- 6.2 Cathedral termite mounds near Adelaide River, Northern Territory, Australia. The termite mound structures are approximately 100 years old and can stand up to seven meters in height. The mounds are made with a combination of soil, mud, chewed wood, and saliva. The life of the termite is a constant race against rain because a heavy downpour can ruin part of the mounds. Therefore, the termites will always be

List of Figures

xv

- rebuilding their mounds, photo Yvonne van der Horst/Getty Images © 174
- 6.3 Potter wasp building mud nest, São Paulo, Brazil, photo Kassá/Getty Images © 176
- 6.4 Two hornets building a nest together by making hexagonal cells, Mana, HI, United States, photo Craig Damlo/Getty images © 177
- 6.5 Cheetahs scent marking their territory together, Masai Mara in Kenya, photo Mike Powles/Getty images © 179
- 7.1 Inscribed clay tablet from third millennium BC. Proto-Cuneiform clay tablet with seal impressions: administrative account of barley distribution with cylinder seal impression of a male figure, hunting dogs, and boars ca. 3100–2900 BC. Sumerian, Mesopotamia, probably from Uruk (modern Warka), photo Raymond and Beverly Sackler Gift, 1988/The Metropolitan Museum of Art 210
- 7.2 Egyptian scribes managing granaries when reaping the corn. The scribes record quantities of harvest wheat, probably for tax purposes. Tomb of Menna. Detail from the frescoes in the vestibule, XVIII dynasty of Amenhotep III in Luxor. Original ca. 1400–1352 BC, photo Z. Radovan/Bible Land Pictures/AKG/NTB 213
- 7.3 *The Printer's Workshop*, 1568. One of 133 woodcut book illustrations, showing the interior of a printing press. In the foreground, two men working at the press, the right man applying ink onto the letterpress matrix, the left man taking off a freshly printed sheet. In the background, two men seated in front of type drawers, holding a composition stick. In the foreground, two piles of printed and blank sheets of paper. Credit: From *Panoplia* by Hartmann Schopper. (Frankfurt-am-Main, 1568), Photo © The Trustees of the British Museum 216
- 7.4 Martin Luther's translation of the New Testament, 1524. Luther's first translation of the New Testament arrived in September 1522. This 1524 edition was printed by Melchior Lotter in Wittenberg, Germany. Its most stunning distinction is the 44 woodcuts made by Georg Lemberger in what is known as *Fürstenkolorit*. In this type of illumination, the woodcuts are colored and heightened with gold, suggesting this Bible was created for an aristocrat.

- Luther downplayed the importance of priests, arguing that the divine text was straightforward enough for everyone to read and understand, Image Courtesy Museum of the Bible Collection. All rights reserved. © Museum of the Bible, 2021 220
- 7.5 Book frontispiece from 1679. Portrait of Jean-Baptiste Tavernier (1605–1689). Tavernier was a seventeenth-century French gem merchant and traveler. In 1675, he published *Les Six Voyages de Jean-Baptiste Tavernier* from his six voyages to Persia and India between the years 1630 and 1668. Credit: State Library Victoria, Australia 222
- 7.6 Printed illustrations in John Gerard's *Herbal History of Plants* from 1633. This is the most famous English herbal, first published in 1597. Credit: Gerard, J., Davyes, R., Johnson, T., Priest, R., Dodoens, R. & Katherine Golden Biting *Collection on Gastronomy* (1633). *The herball: or, Generall historie of plantes*. London, Printed by Adam Islip, Joice Norton and Richard Whitakers. Retrieved from the Library of Congress, Washington, DC, United States. www.loc.gov/item/44028884/ 226
- 7.7 *Theatre of the World, 1570*. *Theatrum Orbis Terrarum* (*Theatre of the World*), is considered to be the first true modern atlas, written by Abraham Ortelius and originally printed on May 20, 1570, in Antwerp, World Map. Credit: Ortelius, A., Diesth, A. C. & Llwyd, H. (1570) *Theatrum Orbis Terrarum*. Antverpiae: Apud Aegid. Copenium Diesth. [Map] Retrieved from the Library of Congress, Washington, DC, United States, www.loc.gov/item/98687183/ 227
- 7.8 An overview of human stigmergic evolution through three different phases, author: own work 233
- 9.1 Smiling baby girl pointing at a unicorn figure, photo Westend61/Getty Images © 258
- 9.2 Regular flint handaxe from Boxgrove, West Sussex, England. From the Acheulian period. The typical tool is a general-purpose handaxe. Credit: © The Trustees of the British Museum 263
- 14.1 A juror identity card or pinakia identifying citizen by names. Clay fragment with Greek inscription, fourth century BC. The identity cards list the name of the juror, his father, and that of his area (demos). When selecting jurors by lot, these plates or “identity tokens” were inserted into the kleroterion,

List of Figures

xvii

- the randomization machine. This fragment is located in the museum of the Ancient Agora, Athens. Photo John Hios/Akg-images/NTB 394
- 15.1 Printer's workshop in Antwerp, sixteenth century. Fourth plate from a print series entitled *Nova Reperta* (New Inventions of Modern Times) consisting of a title page and 19 plates, engraved by Jan Collaert I (ca. 1530–1581), after Jan van der Straet, called Stradanus, and published by Philips Galle around 1600. Illustration of men working at the book mill in Antwerp, Belgium. In the background, a man prepares paper for printing in the press depicted on the right. In a screw press such as that shown, each sheet had to be laid on the type, moved into the press, and pressure applied using the screw. In the center of the foreground, a young boy lays out the newly printed paper for proofreading. On the left, workers set type to be printed. Credit Harris Brisbane Dick Fund, 1934. The Metropolitan Museum of Art, CCo 1.0 Universal Public Domain Dedication 409

Tables

6.1	A comparison between the election results in the swing states in the US 2020 presidential election and the results from a prediction market	<i>page</i> 187
6.2	An overview of the four different types of stigmergic problem solving	202
9.1	A comparison of elaborative collaborative problem solving and rule-governed collaborative problem solving	274
14.1	An overview of different motivational factors relevant to CI	397
15.1	A comparison of civic intelligence and instrumentarian intelligence. Two competing models for an intelligent society	412