

THOMAS AQUINAS ON THE METAPHYSICS OF THE HUMAN ACT

This book offers a novel account of Aquinas's theory of the human act. It argues that Aquinas takes a human act to be a composite of two power-exercises, where one relates to the other as form to matter. The formal component is an act of the will, and the material component is a power-exercise caused by the will, which Aquinas refers to as the "commanded act." The book also argues that Aquinas conceptualizes the act of free choice as a hylomorphic composite: it is, materially, an act of the will, but it inherits a form from reason. As the book aims to show, the core idea of Aquinas's hylomorphic action theory is that the exercise of one power can structure the exercise of another power, and this provides a helpful way to think of the presence of cognition in conation and of intention in bodily movement.

CAN LAURENS LÖWE is Postdoctoral Researcher at the Humboldt-Universität, Berlin, and a Member of the Centre for Advanced Studies in the Humanities "Human Abilities." He has published numerous articles on medieval philosophy in journals including the *British Journal for the History of Philosophy* and *Vivarium*.





THOMAS AQUINAS ON THE METAPHYSICS OF THE HUMAN ACT

CAN LAURENS LÖWE

Centre for Advanced Studies in the Humanities "Human Abilities," Humboldt-Universität, Berlin





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108833646 DOI: 10.1017/9781108986120

© Can Laurens Löwe 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data NAMES: Löwe, Can Laurens, author.

TITLE: Thomas Aquinas on the metaphysics of the human act / Can Laurens Löwe.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2021001517 (print) | LCCN 2021001518 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108833646 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108986533 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108986120 (ebook) SUBJECTS: LCSH: Thomas, Aquinas, Saint, 1225?–1274. | Human acts. | Metaphysics. CLASSIFICATION: LCC B765.T54 L69 2021 (print) | LCC B765.T54 (ebook) | DDC 171/.2–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021001517 LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021001518

ISBN 978-I-I08-83364-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Elise





Contents

Lists of Figures and Tables	page x
Acknowledgments	xi
List of Abbreviations	xiii
Introduction	I
PART I: THE GENERAL FRAMEWORK	9
I What Is a Human Act?	II
1.1 Introduction	II
1.2 The General Metaphysics of Powers	II
1.3 Acts, Actions, and Passions	14
1.4 Human Acts: The Choice-Based Account	22
1.5 Aquinas against Aristotle on Choice	28
i.6 Why Choice?	31
1.7 The Task ahead of Us: The Two Composites	33
PART II: CHOICE HYLOMORPHISM	35
2 Practical Judgment	37
2.1 Introduction	37
2.2 Judgments: Attitude and Content	38
2.3 Precepts about Doable and Makeable Things	42
2.4 Precepts, Means, and Ends: The Logical Form of Prece	epts 48
2.5 The Logical Form Fleshed Out: Two Distinctions	50
3 The Judgment of Choice	57
3.1 Introduction	57
3.2 Precepts Not Subject to Free Assent	57
3.3 Precepts Subject to Free Assent	62
3.4 Free Assent and Second-Order Judgment	66
3.5 Conclusion: The Judgment of Choice Explained	72

vii



> viii Contents Volition and Its Dependence on Judgment 74 4.1 Introduction 74 4.2 Volitions and Their Direction of Fit 74 4.3 Volitions and the Good in General 79 4.4 The Dependence of Volition on Judgment: Terminological Preliminaries 8т The Object's Final- and Formal-Causal Influence 86 4.6 Efficient Causation and the Will's Self-motion 89 4.7 Two Arguments for Intellectualism 92 4.8 Choice and Its Dependence on the Judgment of Choice 97 Choice: Its Intrinsic and Its Extrinsic Form TOO 5.1 Introduction TOO 5.2 Extrinsic and Intrinsic Forms: Original and Derivative Intentionality 100 5.3 The Structural Difference between Volition and Judgment 104 5.4 Volitional Form, Part 1: Attitude 105 5.5 Volitional Form, Part 2: Content 107 5.6 Choice Hylomorphism Explained III PART III: ACT HYLOMORPHISM 115 The Hylomorphic Structure of the Human Act 117 6.1 Introduction 117 6.2 The Act of Command, Part 1: The Suárezian Reading 117 6.3 The Act of Command, Part 2: Instrumental Causation 122 6.4 The Act of Use and the Commanded Act 126 6.5 The Case for Act Hylomorphism 129 6.6 Developing Aquinas's Act Hylomorphism: Part 1 133 6.7 Developing Aquinas's Act Hylomorphism: Part 2 135 6.8 How Choice Explains the Human Act 139 6.9 Conclusion 146 The Ontology of Bodily Human Acts 147 7.1 Introduction 147 7.2 The Distinction between Immanent and Transeunt Acts 149 7.3 Immanent and Transeunt Acts as Components of the Human Act 153 7.4 The Distinction between Complete and Incomplete Acts 160 7.5 Incomplete Acts: Power and Mereology 163 7.6 Complete Acts and Their Instantaneous Character 171 7.7 Heterogeneity and Formal Causation 174 The Ontology of Mental Human Acts 178

8.1 Introduction

8.2 The Sensory Power of Memory

8.3 The Commanded Act of Reminiscing

178

179

183



	Contents	ix
	8.4 Use and the Commanded Act of Reminiscing	186
	8.5 Control and Impediments: Starting and Stopping	190
	8.6 Conclusion	192
9	Aquinas's Act Hylomorphism Today	193
Ap_{i}	pendix: Judgment and Composition and Division	203
Bibliography		208
Ind	dex	222



Figures and Tables

Figures

4.I	Aquinas's taxonomy of strivings	page 76
4.2	The causal roles of reason and will in choice	98
5.I	Aquinas's Choice Hylomorphism	II2
6.I	Aquinas's Act Hylomorphism: extrinsic and intrinsic	138
	forms	
7 . I	The bodily human act and its two bearers	160
9.1	Aquinas and contemporary action theories	197
А.1	Propositional versus judicative composition	207
	Tables	
2.I	Precept types	55
7.I	Immanent/transeunt acts and incomplete/complete acts	163



Acknowledgments

This monograph is based on my PhD dissertation, which I wrote at the University of Leuven under the supervision of Russell Friedman and defended in 2016. I owe a great debt of gratitude to Russ, who encouraged me to work on this topic and from whose helpful comments this book benefited immensely. I also want to thank Martin Pickavé, Carlos Steel, and Andrea Robiglio, who served as examiners of my dissertation. I am particularly grateful to Martin, who provided incredibly detailed and incisive comments on the dissertation. I am also very grateful to Jeffrey Brower, who was my academic mentor during a postdoctoral fellowship at Purdue University from 2018 to 2020. Jeff's work inspired the book's distinctively hylomorphic theme, and he organized a workshop in Park City, Utah, in August 2019, which allowed me to discuss an earlier version of the book manuscript with him as well as with Gloria Frost, Scott MacDonald, and Robert Pasnau. The book benefited significantly from the insightful comments of the participants of this workshop. Finally, I want to thank two anonymous referees at Cambridge University Press, whose extensive and helpful comments led to important revisions of several key chapters and thereby greatly improved the book.

I also owe a debt of gratitude to several institutions. First, I am grateful to the University of Leuven for providing optimal work conditions for writing my dissertation. Second, I want to thank the Flemish Research Council for funding my graduate research as well as a subsequent postdoctoral fellowship at Leuven. Third, I want to thank Purdue University for the above-mentioned postdoctoral fellowship, which allowed me to turn my dissertation into a book. Finally, I want to thank the Centre for Advanced Studies in the Humanities "Human Abilities" in Berlin, under the direction of Dominik Perler and Barbara Vetter, for a postdoctoral fellowship that allowed me to add the finishing touches to the book in spring 2020.



xii

Acknowledgments

I am thankful to the following people for discussion and comments on parts of the book. First, I want to thank my colleagues while a graduate student at Leuven, notably Jenny Pelletier, Luca Gili, and Michael Jaworzyn. Second, I benefited a great deal from discussions with colleagues at Purdue, notably, Michael Augustin, Samuel Bennett, Morganna Lambeth, James Mollison, and Matthew Kroll. I also want to express my gratitude to the participants of the 2018 Cornell Summer Colloquium in Medieval Philosophy as well as the participants of the Midwestern Medieval Philosophy Colloquium at the University of Notre Dame in 2019. Their comments led to considerable revisions of Chapters 2 and 5.

Hilary Gaskin and Hal Churchman deserve great thanks for their editorial work, and I also want to thank Vivian Knopf at Humboldt-Universität, Berlin as well as Imran Bake at Integra Software Services for proof-reading the manuscript. I am also grateful to Lisa Carter for being a great production manager and to Aloysias Saint Thomas for being a thorough and patient typesetter.

Finally, I am deeply grateful to Elise Frketich, my wife, whose love, patience, and philosophical acumen have aided me immeasurably in writing this book. I am likewise very grateful to my parents, Angelica Löwe and Erdem Ergun, as well as my grandmother, Ülkü Ergun, for their continued support and encouragement.



Abbreviations

Aquinas

Comp. Theol. Compendium theologiae (Leon. 42)
De 36 art. Responsio de 36 articulis (Leon. 42)

De Ver. Quaestiones disputatae de veritate (Leon. 22)

De Virt. Quaestiones disputatae de virtutibus
DEE De ente et essentia (Leon. 43)

DM Quaestiones disputatae de malo (Leon. 23)

DPN De principiis naturae (Leon. 43)
DSC De spiritualibus creaturis (Leon. 24, 2)
In DA Sententia libri De anima (Leon. 45, 1)

In DC Sententia super librum De caelo et mundo (Leon. 3)

In De Caus. Super Librum de causis

In De Trin.

Super Boetium De trinitate (Leon. 50)

In Div. Nom.

Super librum Dionysii De divinis nominibus

Sententia libri De sensu et sensato (Leon. 45, 2)

Sententia libri Ethicorum (Leon. 47, 1–2)

In Met. Sententia super Metaphysicam

In Periherm. Expositio libri Peryermeneias. Editio altera retractata

(Leon. 1*1)

In Phys. Sententia super Physicam (Leon. 2)
In Pol. Sententia libri Politicorum (Leon. 48)
In Sent. Scriptum super libros Sententiarum

Leon. Sancti Thomae Aquinatis opera omnia iussu impensaque

Leonis XIII P.M., cura et studio fratrum praedicatorum (Rome: Ex Typographia Polyglotta S. C. de

Propaganda Fide, 1882–)

QDA Quaestiones disputatae de anima (Leon. 24, 1)

QDP Quaestiones disputatae de potentia Dei

Quodl. IX Quodlibet 9 (Leon. 25, 1)

xiii



xiv List of Abbreviations

SCG Summa contra gentiles (Leon. 13–15)

ST Summa theologiae (Leon. 4–12) (I, first part of ST; I-II,

first part of the second part; II-II, second part of

the second part; III, third part)

Aristotle

DA On the Soul

EN Nicomachean Ethics

Met. *Metaphysics* Phys. *Physics*