LEGAL BARBARIANS

In this novel and unorthodox historical analysis of modern comparative law, Daniel Bonilla Maldonado explores the connections between modern comparative law and the identity of the modern legal subject. Narratives created by modern comparative law shed light on the role played by law in the construction of modern individual and collective identities. This study first examines the relationship between identity, law, and narrative. Second, it explores the moments of emergence and transformation of this area of law: instrumental comparative studies, comparative legislative studies, and comparative law as an autonomous discipline. Finally, it analyzes the theoretical perspectives that question the narrative created by modern comparative law: Third World Approaches to International Law, postcolonial studies of law, and critical comparative law. For lawyers and legal scholars, this study brings a nuanced understanding of the connections between the theory of modern comparative law and contemporary practical legal and political issues.

Daniel Bonilla Maldonado is Full Professor of Law at Universidad de los Andes, Bogotá, Colombia. He has held a Fulbright Fellowship and visiting positions at, among others, Yale Law School, Sciences Po-Paris School of Law and Universidad de Buenos Aires. He is the editor of Constitutionalism of the Global South (Cambridge, 2013).
LEGAL BARBARIANS

Identity, Modern Comparative Law and the Global South

DANIEL BONILLA MALDONADO

University of Los Andes
To Natalia and Alicia
CONTENTS

Acknowledgments  page viii

Introduction  1

1 The Legal Identity of the Global South: Narrative and Comparative Law  29

2 Comparative Instrumental Studies: Montesquieu, Geography, and Law  46

3 Comparative Legislative Studies: H.S. Maine, History, Progress, and the Comparative Method  70

4 Comparative Law as an Autonomous Discipline: Legal Taxonomies and Families  100

5 The Critical Academic of Law: Resistance and Emancipation  133

Index  177
Legal Barbarians is the product of a long personal and academic journey. Paul Kahn and James Silk accompanied me in very important parts of this process; their friendship, solidarity, and academic support were central to experiencing it in a rich and fruitful way. Sheila Foster and Colin Crawford also had a central role in this journey; their personal and professional support was essential to successfully undergo it.

Amaya Alvez, Esteban Hoyos, Manuel Iturralde, Carlos Morales de Setién Ravina, Russel Pearce, Silvina Ramírez, Michael Riegner, and Juan Pablo Sarmiento – colleagues and friends – read the manuscript (or parts of it) and offered sharp and provocative comments, which I greatly appreciate.

Edward Suárez, Diego Ramírez, Olga Cabeza, and Julio César Padilla, doctoral students at University of Los Andes, and Louis Imbert at Sciences Po – Paris, participated in a seminar where the entire manuscript was read; their critiques and suggestions helped me correct or refine many of the book’s arguments.

I presented the book at the universities of Buenos Aires, EAFIT, Fordham, Humboldt-Berlin, ICESI, Norte-Barranquilla, Rosario, Sao Paulo, Sciences Po – Paris, and Yale. I am very grateful for the questions and critiques offered by the professors and students who attended these presentations.

Natalia Serrano, Daniela Carvajal, Santiago Vernaza, Gabriela Pedraza, and Julián Diaz were formidable research assistants; without them, this work could not have been completed.

Nicolás, Natalia Maria, and Gloria accompanied me lovingly and generously during all the ups and downs of the writing process.