CEL S U S I N H I S W O R L D

Celsus penned the earliest known detailed attack upon Christianity. While his identity is disputed and his anti-Christian treatise, entitled the True Word, has been exclusively transmitted through the hands of the great Christian scholar Origen, he remains an intriguing figure. In this interdisciplinary volume, which brings together ancient philosophers, specialists in Greek literature, and historians of early Christianity and of ancient Judaism, Celsus is situated within the cultural, philosophical, religious and political world from which he emerged. While his work is ostensibly an attack upon Christianity, it is also the defence of a world in which Celsus passionately believed. It is the unique contribution of this volume to give voice to the many dimensions of that world in a way that will engage a variety of scholars interested in late antiquity and the histories of Christianity, Judaism and Greek thought.

James Carleton Paget is Reader in Early Christianity and Ancient Judaism, University of Cambridge. His interests include the Jewish origins of Christianity and the history of biblical interpretation. He has written a number of books and articles on second-century Judaism and Christianity and is co-editor of the Journal of Ecclesiastical History and Fellow and Tutor at Peterhouse.

Celsus in his World

Philosophy, Polemic and Religion
in the Second Century

Edited by

JAMES CARLETON PAGET
University of Cambridge

SIMON GATHERCOLE
University of Cambridge
Contents

List of Contributors  page viii
Preface  xiii

Introduction
James Carleton Paget and Simon Gathercole

1  Of Scholarship, Piety and Community:
Origen’s Purpose(s) in Contra Celsum
Lewis Ayres
Apologetic and Internal Christian Argument
in the Contra Celsum: A Response
Rowan Williams

2  Annotations on the Literary Structure of Celsus’
Alēthēs Logos with special reference to the Second
Speech of the Jew
Johannes Arnold

The Problem of the Structure of Celsus’ Alēthēs Logos:
A Response
Simon Gathercole

3  Celsus As Platonist Philosopher
David Sedley

4  Celsus’ Theology: Ineffable Logos and
Impersonal Providence
George Boys-Stones
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Origen’s Celsus and Imperial Greek Religiosity</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teresa Morgan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Celsus, or Philosophy and the Second Sophistic</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gretchen Reydams-Schils</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Homer in Origen, Against Celsus</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Hunter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>The Gospel according to Celsus: Celsus’ Representation of Christianity</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loveday Alexander</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>The Reception of the Aléthès Logos</td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sébastien Morlet</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Celsus’ Judaism</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philip Alexander</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Shaping the Religious Debate from within Second Sophistic Culture:</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simon Goldhill</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Homer in the Polemics between Celsus and Origen:</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George van Kooten</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Celsus on Christianity – A Detractor with a Constructive Agenda:</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Josef Lössl</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Literary Influence and Polemical Tradition:</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William Horbury</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Celsus’ Jew as Celsus’ Christian Construct?</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Martin Goodman</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONTENTS

11 The Multiple Personalities of Celsus’ Jew
   Judith M. Lieu

The Distinctiveness of Celsus’ Jew: A Response
   James Carleton Paget

12 Afterword
   Mark Edwards

Bibliography
   415

Author Index
   440

Subject Index
   445
Contributors

**Loveday Alexander** is Professor Emerita of Biblical Studies at the University of Sheffield. Her research interests include the formation and reception of early Christianity, with a special focus on Acts and Hebrews.

**Philip Alexander** is Professor Emeritus of Postbiblical Jewish Literature at the University of Manchester and a Fellow of the British Academy. He has written widely on Jewish Bible interpretation, the Dead Sea Scrolls, Jewish messianism and apocalyptic, and Jewish magic and mysticism. He is currently researching the Epistle to the Hebrews in the context of Judaism between 70 and 135.

**Johannes Arnold** is Professor für Patristik und Antikes Christentum in the Hochschule Sankt Georgen in Frankfurt am Main. Among other publications, he is the author of *Der Wahre Logos des Kelsos. Eine Strukturanalyse* (2016).

**Lewis Ayres** is Professor of Catholic and Historical Theology at Durham, and Professorial Fellow at the Australian Catholic University in Melbourne. He works on Patristic and Modern Catholic theology. His books include *Nicaea and Its Legacy* and *Augustine’s Trinitarian Theology*. He is currently finishing a monograph on exegesis at the end of
CONTRIBUTORS

the second century, and editing *The Cambridge History of Early Christian Theology*.

**George Boys-Stones** is Professor of Classics and Philosophy at the University of Toronto. His published work has focused on the schools of the Hellenistic period and subsequent philosophical developments in the Roman Mediterranean.

**James Carleton Paget** (co-editor) is Reader in Early Christianity and Ancient Judaism, University of Cambridge. He is co-editor of the *Journal of Ecclesiastical History* and Fellow and Tutor at Peterhouse.

**Mark Edwards** has been Tutor in Theology at Christ Church, Oxford, and University Lecturer/Associate Professor in the Faculty of Theology and Religion at the University of Oxford since 1993. Since 2014 he has held the title Professor of Early Christian Studies. His books include *Origen against Plato* (2002), *Catholicity and Heresy in the Early Church* (2009) and *Aristotle and Early Christian Thought* (2019).

**Simon Gathercole** (co-editor) is Professor of New Testament and Early Christianity at the University of Cambridge. He is the editor of the journal *New Testament Studies*.

**Simon Goldhill** is Professor of Greek at the University of Cambridge, and Foreign Secretary of the British Academy. He has published widely on Greek literature. His most recent book is *Preposterous Poetics: The Politics and Aesthetics of Form in Late Antiquity* (2020), and his new book, *The Christian Invention of Time: Temporality and the Literature of Late Antiquity*, will be published by Cambridge University Press in 2021.
Martin Goodman is Professor Emeritus of Jewish Studies in the University of Oxford, where he taught from 1986 to 2021 and served as President of the Oxford Centre for Hebrew and Jewish Studies from 2014 to 2018. He has written extensively on both Jewish and Roman history. His books include *Rome and Jerusalem* (2007) and *A History of Judaism* (2017).

William Horbury is Professor Emeritus of Jewish & Early Christian Studies in the University of Cambridge. He is working at present on *Toledoth Jeshu* and Jewish traditions of Jesus in antiquity.

Judith Lieu is Lady Margaret’s Professor of Divinity Emerita at the University of Cambridge and Fellow of Robinson College Cambridge. Her research and writing encompass the New Testament, especially the Johannine literature, and early Christianity with a particular focus on the shaping of Christian identities within the broader religious, social and literary contexts. Building on her work on the discourses of heresy and of Jewishness, she is currently exploring the variety of textual strategies of differentiation and cohesion in Christian writing of the period.

Josef Lössl is Professor of Religion and Theology at Cardiff University, specializing in the study of early Christianity, patristics and late antiquity. He is co-editor of *A Companion to Religion in Late Antiquity* (2018) and executive editor of *Vigiliae Christianae: A Review of Early Christian Life and Language*.

Sophie Lunn-Rockliffe is a Lecturer in Patristics in the Faculty of Divinity, University of Cambridge, and a Fellow of Peterhouse, Cambridge. Her research interests revolve around the religious, intellectual, cultural and social life of the late Roman Empire and its hinterlands.
CONTRIBUTORS

**Teresa Morgan** is Professor of Graeco-Roman History at Oxford University, Nancy Bissell Turpin Fellow and Tutor in ancient history at Oriel College, and McDonald-Agape Professor-elect of New Testament and Early Christianity at Yale Divinity School. She has written on many aspects of Greek and Roman culture and ethics, the New Testament and early churches.

**Sébastien Morlet** is Professor of Classics at Sorbonne University. He is a specialist in ancient Christianity and late antiquity. He has published several studies on Christianity and philosophy, Christianity and Greek culture, ancient religious polemics and the history of doctrine.

**Gretchen Reydams-Schils** is Professor in the Program of Liberal Studies at the University of Notre Dame (USA), and also holds concurrent appointments in classics, philosophy and theology. She specializes in the traditions of Stoicism and Platonism. Her most recent book is *Calcidius on Plato’s Timaeus: Greek Philosophy, Latin Reception, and Christian Contexts* (2020).


**George van Kooten** is Lady Margaret’s Professor of Divinity at the University of Cambridge and Fellow of Clare Hall. His research interest is in a Greco-Roman contextualization of the New Testament writings, and ranges from Paul’s cosmology, anthropology and political philosophy to...
Matthew’s Magi and John’s engagement with Greek mythology, philosophy and the Roman Empire.

Rowan Williams retired as Master of Magdalene College, Cambridge, in 2020, having previously been Archbishop of Canterbury. He has published widely in patristics and systematic theology, and is currently continuing research on Eastern Christian theology and also on issues around theology and human rights.
Preface

Most of the material in this book dates back to a conference, ‘Celsus and his World’, held in Cambridge under the auspices of the Centre for Research in the Arts, Social Sciences and Humanities (CRASSH) in the University of Cambridge. Oliver Wright in particular was an invaluable help to us both in preparing for the conference and during the event itself. We are extremely grateful for financial contributions to the costs of the conference from CRASSH, the Cambridge Interfaith Project, the Spalding Trust, and the Faculty of Divinity in Cambridge. In addition to the authors of the present volume, we very much appreciated the contributions of Prof. Tim Whitmarsh and Dr Rebecca Flemming, both from the Faculty of Classics in Cambridge, as well as those of Prof. Nicholas de Lange, Dr Thomas Graumann and Dr Mark Smith of the Faculty of Divinity. We would like in particular to thank Profs. Simon Goldhill, Richard Hunter, Gretchen Reydams-Schils and George van Kooten for joining the project after the conference to fill in lacunae which had become evident in our discussions. The present volume retains the structure of the conference, perhaps unusually including responses; we believe, however, that these constitute valuable contributions in their own right. David Sedley and George Boys-Stones were initially envisaged as presenter and respondent respectively, but we are delighted that they instead decided to divide up the material and to offer separate, substantial chapters.
In his contention with Celsus over the resurrection, Origen said that this doctrine is ‘deep and difficult to understand, in need of a wise interpreter’ (Cels. 7.32). The same could be said of Celsus, and we are extremely grateful to such an international cast of wise scholarly interpreters for taking part in this volume.