

FEDERALISM AND DECENTRALIZATION IN THE CONTEMPORARY MIDDLE EAST AND NORTH AFRICA

This volume, the first of its kind in the English language, examines the law and politics of federalism and decentralization in the Middle East and North Africa. Comprised of eleven case studies examining the experience across the region, together with essays by leading scholars providing comparative and theoretical perspectives and a synthetic conclusion by the co-editors, the volume offers a textured portrait of the dilemmas of decentralization during a period of sweeping transition in the region. The collection addresses an important gap in the comparative decentralization literature, which has largely neglected the MENA region. Both retrospective and forward-looking in orientation, the book is a valuable resource not only for scholars of comparative politics, constitutional design, and Middle East studies, but also for policymakers evaluating the feasibility and efficacy of decentralization as a vehicle for improving governance and responding to identity conflict in any part of the world.

Aslı Ü. Bâli is Professor of Law at Yale Law School. Previously she served as a professor of law and Director of the Center for Near Eastern Studies at UCLA. She is president-elect of the Middle East Studies Association and she also co-chairs the Advisory Council for the Middle East Division of Human Rights Watch. She is co-editor of *Constitution Writing, Religion and Democracy* (Cambridge, 2017).

Omar M. Dajani is Professor of Law at McGeorge School of Law, University of the Pacific where he is co-director of the Global Center for Business and Development. Previously, he served as legal adviser to the Palestinian negotiating team in peace talks with Israel. He contributes to peacebuilding and legal infrastructure development projects for think tanks, governments and international organizations.



ASCL STUDIES IN COMPARATIVE LAW

ASCL Studies in Comparative Law publishes monographs and collections that broaden theoretical and practical knowledge of the world's many legal systems. Published under the direction of the American Society of Comparative Law, the ASCL Studies examines legal problems in a comparative light to advance legal science, develop technical insights, and promote greater cooperation across jurisdictional and cultural boundaries. This book series serves legal practitioners and those seeking to improve law and justice by publishing in-depth comparative studies of specific legal problems in every area of law.

The series has two general editors. David Gerber is Distinguished Professor of Law and Co-Director of the Program in International and Comparative Law at Chicago-Kent College of Law, Illinois Institute of Technology. He is past President of the American Society of Comparative Law. Mortimer Sellers is Regents Professor of the University System of Maryland and Director of the Baltimore Center for International and Comparative Law. He is past President of the Internationale Vereinigung für Rechts-und Sozialphilosophie.

Series Editors

David Gerber Chicago-Kent College of Law Mortimer Sellers University of Baltimore

Editorial Board

Richard Albert University of Texas

David Clark Willamette University

Helge Dedek McGill University

James Feinerman Georgetown University

Richard Kay University of Connecticut

Maximo Langer University of California Los Angeles

Ralf Michaels Duke University

Fernanda Nicola American University

Jacqueline Ross University of Illinois

Kim Lane Scheppele Princeton University

Franz Werro Georgetown University



External Advisory Board

Josef Drexl University of Munich
Diego Fernandez Arroyo Institut d'etudes politiques de Paris
Hongjun Gao Tsinghua University
Michele Graziadei University of Turin
Ko Hasegawa University of Hokkaido
Hisashi Harata University of Tokyo
Andreas Heinemann University of Zurich
Christophe Jamin Institut d'etudes politiques de Paris
Yong-Sun Kang Yonsei University
Claudia Lima Marques Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul
Bertil Emrah Oder Koc University
Amr Shalakany American University of Cairo



Federalism and Decentralization in the Contemporary Middle East and North Africa

Edited by **ASLI Ü. BÂLI**Yale Law School

OMAR M. DAJANI

University of the Pacific, California





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108831239 DOI: 10.1017/9781108923682

© Cambridge University Press 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress ISBN 978-1-108-83123-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

	t of Contributors	page x
Ack	knowledgments	XV
1	Introduction: From Revolution to Devolution? Aslı Ü. Bâli and Omar M. Dajani	1
	PART I THEORETICAL AND COMPARATIVE CONTEXT	
2	Decentralization to Manage Identity Conflicts Philip G. Roeder	17
3	Devolution and the Promotion (or Evasion) of Minority Rights Will Kymlicka	50
4	Constitutional Design Options for Territorial Cleavages in the Middle East Tom Ginsburg	67
5	How Decentralization Efforts Have Recentralized Authority in the Arab Region Mona Harb and Sami Atallah	82
	PART II DECENTRALIZATION AND GOVERNANCE REFORM	
6	Decentralization, Ideology, and Law in the Islamic Republic of Ira Kian Tajbakhsh	in 99
7	Salvaging State Legitimacy in Iraq through Decentralization Ali Al-Mawlawi	120



viii	Contents	
8	Decentralization Reforms in Post-Revolution Tunisia: The Struggle between Political and Bureaucratic Elites Intissar Kherigi	140
	PART III DECENTRALIZATION AND SELF-DETERMINATION	
9	Autonomy beyond the State Joost Jongerden	169
10	The Devil Is in the Details: Iraqi Kurdistan's Evolving Autonomy Peter Bartu and Aidan MacEachern	183
11	Turkish Kurdistan: Decentralization Reimagined Aslı Ü. Bâli	203
12	Control, Responsibility, and the Israeli-Palestinian Decentralization Debacle Sari Bashi	225
13	"Stuck Together": Can a Two-State Confederation End the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict? Omar M. Dajani and Dahlia Scheindlin	² 45
14	"Dans ses Frontières Authentiques"? Morocco's Advanced Regionalization and the Question of Western Sahara Omar Yousef Shehabi	268
	PART IV DECENTRALIZATION, CONFLICT, AND STATE FRAGMENTATION	
15	Devolution and Federalism in Collapsed States: Constitutional Process and Design George R. M. Anderson and Sujit Choudhry	295
16	The Promise – and Limits – of Stabilization through Local Governance in Libya Karim Mezran and Elissa Miller	318
17	Decentralization in State Disintegration: An Examination of Governance Experiments in Syria Samer Araabi and Leila Hilal	34 ²
18	Decentralization in Yemen: The Case of the Federalist Draft Constitution of 2015 Benoît Challand	365



	Contents	ix
	PART V CONCLUSIONS	
19	Federalism and Decentralization in the MENA Region: Types and Trajectories Aslı Ü. Bâli and Omar M. Dajani	387
Ind	ex	417



Contributors

- George R. M. Anderson currently advises the United Nations, the World Bank, International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance, Humanitarian Dialogue and nongovernmental organizations on constitutional transitions, notably relating to political devolution and to natural resources.
- Samer Araabi currently works as the research director at Accountability Counsel. Previously he worked as a government relations manager for the Arab American Institute in Washington, DC, a project manager for the Syrian Assistance Coordination Unit, and a Syria specialist at the Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs.
- Sami Atallah is an economist and political scientist who is the founding director of the Policy Initiative, a Beirut based think-tank. He was previously the director of the Lebanese Center for Policy Studies for ten years, where he led research on decentralization, local governance, and municipal finance, among others. He co-drafted the decentralization law for Lebanon and served on the related parliamentary committee.
- Aslı Ü. Bâli is Professor of Law at the Yale Law School. Previously, she was Professor of Law at the University of California, Los Angeles (UCLA) School of Law, where she was also the founding faculty director of the Promise Institute for Human Rights and the director of the UCLA Center for Near Eastern Studies.
- **Peter Bartu** teaches at the University of California, Berkeley, on political transitions in the Middle East, the Gulf States, and international organizations and global governance. In fall 2016 he spent three months conducting ethnographic research in Iraqi Kurdistan during the battle of Mosul.
- Sari Bashi is a human rights lawyer, writer, analyst, and lecturer in law. Ms. Bashi co-founded the Israeli human rights group Gisha and served as its executive director of Gisha from its foundation in 2005 until 2014. She also served as the Israel–Palestine Advocacy Director at Human Rights Watch.



xii

List of Contributors

- **Benoît Challand** is Associate Professor of Sociology at the New School for Social Research, New York. His research focuses on civil society and foreign assistance in the Middle East and he has conducted extensive fieldwork on the Yemeni constitution drafting process.
- Sujit Choudhry is an internationally recognized authority on comparative constitutional law and has been an advisor to governance, constitution building, rule of law, and peacebuilding processes for over twenty years, including in Egypt, Jordan, Libya, Nepal, South Africa, Sri Lanka, Tunisia, Ukraine, and Yemen.
- Omar M. Dajani is Professor of Law at the University of the Pacific, McGeorge School of Law, where he also serves as co-director of the Global Center for Business and Development. He previously served as legal adviser to the Palestinian negotiating team in peace talks with Israel.
- **Tom Ginsburg** is the Leo Spitz Professor of International Law at the University of Chicago School of Law; he also holds an appointment in the Political Science Department at the University of Chicago.
- Mona Harb is Professor of Urban Studies and Politics and co-founder of the Beirut Urban Lab at the American University of Beirut. She is working on governance and configurations of activism, collective life, and solidarities in contexts of limited statehood, crises, and disasters.
- Leila Hilal is a senior fellow for the International Security Program and the former director of the Middle East Task Force at the New America Foundation, Washington, DC. She focuses on Syria, the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and issues related to US foreign policy, constitution-making, and transitional justice in the broader Middle East and North Africa.
- **Joost Jongerden** is an associate professor of rural sociology at Wageningen University in the Netherlands and project professor at the Asian Platform for Global Sustainability and Transcultural Studies at Kyoto University, Japan.
- **Intissar Kherigi** is Programme Director of the Jasmine Foundation (Tunisia), a qualified solicitor in the UK, where she worked in the House of Lords, and is completing her doctoral dissertation at the Institut d'etudes politiques (Sciences Po) Paris in comparative political sociology.
- Will Kymlicka is the Canada Research Chair in Political Philosophy at Queen's University in Kingston, Canada.
- **Aidan MacEachern** completed her master's in global studies with an area concentration on the Middle East at the University of California, Berkeley, and focuses her research on Kurdish political movements.



List of Contributors

xiii

- **Ali Al-Mawlawi** is head of research at the Al-Bayan Center, an independent Iraqi think-tank based in Baghdad, where he specializes in foreign affairs and institutional reform.
- Karim Mezran is a senior fellow at the Atlantic Council's Rafik Hariri Center for the Middle East, Washington, DC, whose research focuses on processes of political change in North Africa, with a concentration on Libya.
- Elissa Miller is completing a policy degree at the Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy at Tufts University. Previously, she served as a nonresident fellow with the Atlantic Council's Rafik Hariri Center for the Middle East, where she focused on political and security developments in Libya, Tunisia, and Egypt.
- **Philip G. Roeder** is a professor in the Department of Political Science at the University of California, San Diego.
- **Dahlia Scheindlin** is a political scientist, public opinion expert, and political strategist. She has advised on eight national campaigns in Israel and in fifteen other countries. She conducts extensive public opinion and policy research on the Israeli-Palestinian conflict for local and international NGOs and she is a policy fellow at the Century Foundation.
- Omar Yousef Shehabi is a legal officer with the United Nations Office of Administration of Justice and a JSD candidate at Yale Law School where he also received his LLM degree. His research focuses on international dispute settlement, the law of international state responsibility, international labor law, and the law of international organizations.
- **Kian Tajbakhsh** is Visiting Professor of Urban Planning at the Graduate School of Architecture, Planning and Preservation at Columbia University. He is an international expert in the areas of local government reform and civil society capacity building whose research focuses on the Middle East with a concentration on Iran.



Acknowledgments

This book grew out of a series of conversations during the 2016 convening of the Yale Law School's Middle East Legal Studies Seminar, which has long provided a wonderful forum for us to come together annually to join discussions with leading experts from the Middle East and North Africa. We are grateful to the McGeorge School of Law, University of the Pacific, for hosting the workshop that formally initiated this project in May 2017. That workshop brought together a group of scholars and interlocutors, some of whom are authors of chapters in this volume, to debate the degree to which decentralization might serve as a framework for addressing the challenges faced in the region in the aftermath of the Arab uprisings. In June 2018, we convened a second workshop where early drafts of most of the chapters included in this volume were first presented at the University of California, Los Angeles (UCLA) School of Law, with generous support from the UCLA Center for Near Eastern Studies and the Promise Institute of Human Rights at UCLA Law. The participants in both workshops provided constructive suggestions for particular papers and invaluable feedback for the conceptual organization of this volume. We would particularly like to thank Zaid al-Ali, Stephanie Koury, Andrew March, John McGarry, Haila al-Mekaimi, and Balakrishnan Menon for their input at an early point in this project. In addition, we would like to thank the participants of the UCLA Law School Faculty Workshop for constructive comments on an early draft of the theoretical framework for the volume, and audience members at several panels where we presented draft chapters at the Middle East Studies Association annual conferences of 2018 and 2019, for their helpful questions; and the participants of the Northern California International Law Scholars workshop in 2020 for their generous feedback on our concluding chapter. We are grateful to Abdallah Ali, Ahmed Ali, Jordan Hutchings, Melis Kilic, Matthew McDonald, Daniel Michaelsen, and Brittany Newell for their excellent research assistance; to Sherry Yuan at UCLA and Stevey Clement and Casandra Fernandez at McGeorge for administrative assistance with the workshops; and especially to Tom Randall at Cambridge University Press, with whom it has been a pleasure to work on this volume. Finally, we thank Jean Marie, Tal, and Ayla for their patience, encouragement, and love, without which we could not have completed this project.