CONTENTS

Preface page xxi

1 Overview 1

§ 1.01 The ITO, the GATT, and the WTO 1
[1] Bretton Woods and the Havana Charter 1
[2] The Negotiation of the GATT 3
[3] The Protocol of Provisional Application (PPA) 4
[4] GATT’s Forty-Seven “Provisional” Years 6
[5] GATT Dispute Settlement 8

§ 1.02 The Uruguay Round 16
[1] The Overall Context 16
[2] The Negotiations on Dispute Settlement 18

§ 1.03 The World Trade Organization 20

§ 1.04 The Dispute Settlement Body 22

§ 1.05 The Dispute Settlement Understanding (DSU) 23

§ 1.06 The Doha Round and DSU Reform 26

§ 1.07 Assistance for Developing Countries 30
[1] The DSU 30

§ 1.08 Other Developments: The Appellate Body Crisis 31

§ 1.09 Researching WTO Law 33

§ 1.10 WTO Dispute Settlement in a Nutshell 34
## Contents

### 2 Jurisdiction 40

#### § 2.01 Overview 40

#### § 2.02 Terms of Reference 42

1. Rationale for Terms of Reference 42
2. Standard Terms of Reference 43
3. Special Terms of Reference 44
4. Parallelism Between Consultations and Terms of Reference 44
5. From the Terms of Reference to Submissions to a Panel 47
6. *Non Ultra Petita* 49
7. The Obligation of Panels to Consider All Issues Referred to in the Terms of Reference 50

#### § 2.03 Jurisdiction *Ratione Materiae* 53

1. Covered Agreements 53
2. Conflicts Among Special or Additional Rules 54
3. Simultaneous Application of Different Agreements 55
4. The DSU and the Competence of Other WTO Bodies (Institutional Balance) 56
5. The "Matter" Before the Panel 58
6. Measures Changed During Proceedings 59
7. Change in the Legal Justification for a Measure 60
8. Measures No Longer in Effect (Expired Measures) 61
9. Review of Measures Taken to Comply with Rulings and Recommendations of the DSB 65

#### § 2.04 Jurisdiction *Ratione Personae* 65

1. Non-Members 65
2. Non-application Between Particular Members 66
3. Regional and Local Government Entities 67

#### § 2.05 Standing (*Locus Standi*) 69

1. Requirement of a Legal Interest 69
2. Exhaustion of Local Remedies 71
3. Intensity of Participation in Dispute Settlement 72
4. Participation of Private Parties (*Amicus Curiae*) 73

#### § 2.06 Review of Jurisdictional Claims 75

1. Challenges to Jurisdiction 75
2. *Ex Officio* Review of Jurisdiction 76
3. *Res Judicata* 77
Table of Contents

3 Sources of Law 86

§ 3.01 Overview 86

§ 3.02 The DSU Regime 87

§ 3.03 The Covered Agreements 88

§ 3.04 Public International Law Generally 89

§ 3.05 Implied Powers 91

§ 3.06 Agreements Explicitly Mentioned in the Covered Agreements 92
  [2] Agreements Mentioned in the TRIPS Agreement 93
  [4] Agreements Mentioned in the SPS and TBT Agreements 95
  [5] Other International Agreements 95

§ 3.07 Agreements Made by the WTO 96

§ 3.08 Actions by WTO Bodies 96
  [1] Authoritative Interpretations 96

§ 3.09 Custom 102

§ 3.10 General Principles of Law 104
  [1] Error 105
  [2] Non Adimplenti Contractus 105
  [3] Good Faith (Bona Fides) 106
  [5] Exceptions Must Be Interpreted Narrowly 108
x CONTENTS

[7] Lex Specialis 110
[8] Contemporaneity 113

§ 3.11 Teachings of the Most Highly Qualified Publicists 114

§ 3.12 Prior Reports by Panels and the Appellate Body 115
[1] GATT Practice 116
[3] Unadopted GATT Reports in the WTO 118

§ 3.13 International Agreements Not Incorporated in WTO Agreements 129
[1] Tokyo Round Agreements 129
[2] Multilateral Agreements 130
[4] Agreements Between the Parties to a Dispute 134
[5] Circumstances Surrounding the Conclusion of the WTO Agreements 137

§ 3.14 Decisions of Other International Tribunals 137
[1] Overview 137
[2] Recourse to Article 32 of the VCLT in Order to Confirm 138

§ 3.15 Domestic Law 140

§ 3.16 Interpretation of WTO Law 141
[3] Context, Object, and Purpose 145
[4] Subsequent Agreements 146
[5] Subsequent Practice 147
[7] Special Meaning 148
[8] Supplementary Means of Interpretation 149
[9] Preparatory Work: Negotiating History 149
[10] Authentic Versions in Other Languages 151
4 Consultations and the Panel Process 153

§ 4.01 Overview 153

§ 4.02 Good Offices, Conciliation, and Mediation 154

§ 4.03 Consultations 156
  [1] Overview 156
  [2] Preparation 156
  [3] Purpose of Consultations 158
  [4] Form and Content of the Request 158
  [7] Consultations Meetings 164
  [8] Adequacy of Consultations 166
  [9] Confidentiality 167
  [10] Third Parties 170

§ 4.04 Request for the Establishment of a Panel and Terms of Reference 173
  [1] Overview 173
  [3] Form and Content 175
  [4] The Specific Measure at Issue 177
  [5] Amendment of Measures after the Panel Request 182
  [7] Expired Measures 183
  [8] The “Claim” or the Legal Basis of the Complaint 183
  [9] Products Listed in the Panel Request 187
  [10] Standard Terms of Reference 189
  [11] Special Terms of Reference 190
  [12] Reviews and Arbitrations 190

§ 4.05 Establishment and Composition of Panels 191
  [1] Establishment 191
  [2] Composition 193
  [3] Selecting Panelists 193

§ 4.06 Function, Authority, and Responsibility of Panels 197
  [1] Overview 197
## Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Working Procedures</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special Working Procedures</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidentiality of the Panel Process</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizational Meeting</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preliminary Rulings</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 4.07 Third Parties, Multiple Complainants, and Counter-Complaints</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Overview</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Third-Party Notification</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Third-Party Rights</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Third-Party Rights in Reviews and Arbitrations</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Multiple Complainants</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Counter-Complaints</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. <em>Amicus Curiae</em> Briefs</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 4.08 Role of the Secretariat</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 4.09 Written Submissions to Panels</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Overview</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. First Written Submission</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Second Written Submission</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Written Answers to Questions</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Executive Summaries of Submissions</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 4.10 Meetings of Panels with the Parties</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Overview</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. First Meeting of the Panel with the Parties</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Third-Party Session</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Second Meeting of the Panel with the Parties</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Open Meetings of Panels</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. “Virtual” Meetings of Panels</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 4.11 Computation of Time</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 4.12 Suspension of Panel Proceedings</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 4.13 “Violation,” “Non-violation,” and “Other Situation” Complaints</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Overview</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Violation Complaints</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Non-violation Complaints</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. “Other Situation” Complaints</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 4.14 Composition of Delegations</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1] Representation by Private Lawyers</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2] Representatives of Industry</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 4.15 Interim Review</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1] Overview</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3] Interim Reports</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[4] Arguments and Evidence</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 4.16 Final Reports</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1] Format</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2] Content</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3] Separate Opinions</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[4] Adoption of Reports</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5 Special Rules and Procedures 243

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>§ 5.01 Overview</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 5.02 GATT and WTO Rules for Developing Countries</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 5.03 The 1966 Understanding and Developing Countries</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1] Consultations</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2] Good Offices, Conciliation, or Mediation</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3] Establishment of Panels</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[4] Panel Procedures</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 5.04 Developing Country-Related Provisions of the DSU</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1] Consultations</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3] Least-Developed Countries</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>§ 5.05 The SPS Agreement</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[1] Overview</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[2] Experts</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[3] Ad Hoc Consultations on Specific SPS Issues</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[4] Developing Countries</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
$ 5.06 Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade 252
[1] Overview 252
[2] Measures Covered by the TBT Agreement 252
[3] Experts 253
[4] Developing Countries 254

$ 5.07 Anti-dumping Agreement 255
[1] Overview 255
[7] Article 17.6(ii): Review of Legal Determinations 262
[8] Confidential Information 265
[9] Developing Countries 266
[10] Overlap with Countervailing Duties 267

$ 5.08 Agreement on Implementation of Article VII of GATT 1994 (Customs Valuation Agreement) 267

$ 5.09 Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures 268
[1] Overview 268
[2] Prohibited Subsidy Procedures 268
[3] Requests for Consultations: SCM Article 4.2 269
[4] Procedures before the Permanent Group of Experts 271
[7] Proceedings Involving Both Prohibited and Actionable Subsidies 279
[8] Non-actionable Subsidies 280
[9] Countervailing Measures 280
[10] Developing Countries 281

$ 5.10 Agreement on Textiles and Clothing (ATC) 282

$ 5.11 General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) 283
[1] Overview 283
Contents

[2] Double Taxation Treaties 283
[3] Non-violation Nullification and Impairment 283
[6] Panelists 287

§ 5.12 Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS) 287

§ 5.13 Agreement on Government Procurement 288
[1] Overview 288
[2] Proposals and DSU Notification 289
[3] DSB Authority 289
[4] Terms of Reference 290
[5] Time Limits 290

§ 5.14 Agreement on Trade in Civil Aircraft 291

§ 5.15 Agreement on Preshipment Inspection 291

§ 5.16 Arbitration 292
[1] Overview 292
[2] Non-actionable Subsidies 294

6 Evidence and Proof 298

§ 6.01 Evidence and Information 298
[1] Overview 298
[2] Types of Evidence 299
[3] Formal Requirements and Deadlines for Submission of Evidence 300
[4] Panel’s Right to Seek Evidence and Information 303
[5] Duty to Provide Evidence and Information 306
[6] Adverse Inferences 308
[7] Admissions and Statements 310
[8] Notifications to the WTO 312
[10] Evidence of Municipal Law 314
CONTENTS

$ 6.02 Burden of Proof 323
[1] Overview 323
[2] Burden of Proving a Prima Facie Case 325
[5] Burden of Proof under Specific Agreements and GATT Articles 331
[6] Article 22.6 Arbitrations 334

$ 6.03 Standard of Review 334

$ 6.04 Confidential Information 339
[1] Overview 339
[3] Special Procedures to Protect Confidentiality 343

7 The Appellate Process 348

$ 7.01 Overview 348

$ 7.02 The Task of the Appellate Body 350

$ 7.03 The Right of Appeal 350

$ 7.04 Time Elements 351
[1] Limits Imposed by the DSU 352
[2] Limits Imposed by the Appellate Body 355

$ 7.05 Appellate Body Rules 357
[1] Overview 357
[2] Duties of Appellate Body Members 358
[3] Chair of the Appellate Body 358
[6] Separate Opinions 360
[8] Notice of Appeal 364
[10] Appellant’s Submission 367
Table of Contents

§ 7.06 Issues Relating to the Scope of Appellate Review 380
[1] Questions of Law and Questions of Fact 380
[4] The Lack of Remand Authority and Judicial Economy 386

§ 7.07 The Current Impasse Regarding the Replacement of Retiring Appellate Body Members 398

§ 7.08 Efforts to Resolve the Impasse 401
[2] The MPIA 402

8 Adoption and Implementation of Reports 406

§ 8.01 Overview 406

§ 8.02 Consideration and Adoption of Reports 406

§ 8.03 Notification of Implementation Intentions 409

§ 8.04 Legal Framework for the “Reasonable Period of Time” 410

§ 8.05 Agreements Establishing the “Reasonable Period of Time” 411

§ 8.06 Arbitrations Establishing the “Reasonable Period of Time” 412
[1] Overview 412
[2] Time within Which to Request Arbitration 413
# Table of Contents


§ 8.07 Factors Affecting Time Allowed for Implementation 420  
[1] Overview 420  
[2] Complexity 421  
[3] Need for Legislative Action 423  
[5] Economic Harm 426  
[6] Developing Countries 427  
[7] Other Emergencies 429  

§ 8.08 Surveillance by the DSB 429  

§ 8.09 Disputes Regarding Implementation 430  
[1] Overview 430  
[2] Procedures 432  
[3] Standing to Initiate Article 21.5 Reviews 434  
[7] Scope of Article 21.5 Reviews 439  
[8] Burden of Proof 448  
[9] Suggestions to Implement 449  

§ 8.10 Prohibited and Actionable Subsidies 450  
[1] Overview 450  
[2] Period to Withdraw a Prohibited Subsidy 451  
[3] “Withdrawal” of a Prohibited or Actionable Subsidy 452  
[4] To “Remove the Adverse Effects” of an Actionable Subsidy 455  

§ 8.11 “Other Situation” Complaints 456  

9 Remedies 457  

§ 9.01 Overview 457  

§ 9.02 GATT Practice 458  

§ 9.03 Overview of the WTO Remedy Regime 461  

§ 9.04 Mutually Agreed Solutions 462
CONTENTS

§ 9.05 Purpose of Compensation and Suspension of Concessions 465
§ 9.06 Compensation 467
§ 9.07 Suspension of Concessions or Other Obligations 468
  [1] Request for Authorization to Suspend Concessions 468
  [2] “Carousel” Suspension 471
  [3] Approval of Request/Referral to Arbitration 471
  [7] Consequences of Arbitration 477
  [8] Burden of Proof 478
  [9] Information from Other Sources 480
  [10] Determination of the Level of Nullification or Impairment 481
  [12] Temporary Nature of Suspension of Concessions 489
§ 9.08 The “Sequencing” Problem 492
  [1] Overview 492
  [2] The Bananas III Dispute 494
  [3] Ad Hoc Sequencing Agreements 497
§ 9.09 Prohibited and Actionable Subsidies 504
  [1] Overview 504
  [2] “Appropriate Countermeasures” under Article 4 505
  [3] “Commensurate with the Degree and Nature of the Adverse Effects” under Article 7 509
  [4] Multiple Complainants 510
§ 9.10 Panel and Appellate Body Implementation Suggestions 512
  [1] Overview 512
  [2] Trade Remedy Cases 513
  [3] Cases under Other Agreements 516
  [4] Legal Effect of Implementation Suggestions 517
10 Conclusion 518

Appendix 1 – Sample Working Procedures 521
Appendix 2 – Sample BCI Procedures 531
Bibliography 534
Index 547