

## CONTENTS

*Preface* page xxi

### **1 Overview 1**

§ 1.01	The ITO, the GATT, and the WTO	1
	[1] Bretton Woods and the Havana Charter	1
	[2] The Negotiation of the GATT	3
	[3] The Protocol of Provisional Application (PPA)	4
	[4] GATT's Forty-Seven "Provisional" Years	6
	[5] GATT Dispute Settlement	8
§ 1.02	The Uruguay Round	16
	[1] The Overall Context	16
	[2] The Negotiations on Dispute Settlement	18
§ 1.03	The World Trade Organization	20
§ 1.04	The Dispute Settlement Body	22
§ 1.05	The Dispute Settlement Understanding (DSU)	23
	[1] The Institutional Structure	23
	[2] The System: Civil Law and Common Law	25
§ 1.06	The Doha Round and DSU Reform	26
§ 1.07	Assistance for Developing Countries	30
	[1] The DSU	30
	[2] The Advisory Centre on WTO Law	30
§ 1.08	Other Developments: The Appellate Body Crisis	31
§ 1.09	Researching WTO Law	33
§ 1.10	WTO Dispute Settlement in a Nutshell	34

<b>2</b>	<b>Jurisdiction</b>	<b>40</b>
§ 2.01	Overview	40
§ 2.02	Terms of Reference	42
	[1] Rationale for Terms of Reference	42
	[2] Standard Terms of Reference	43
	[3] Special Terms of Reference	44
	[4] Parallelism Between Consultations and Terms of Reference	44
	[5] From the Terms of Reference to Submissions to a Panel	47
	[6] <i>Non Ultra Petita</i>	49
	[7] The Obligation of Panels to Consider All Issues Referred to in the Terms of Reference	50
§ 2.03	Jurisdiction <i>Ratione Materiae</i>	53
	[1] Covered Agreements	53
	[2] Conflicts Among Special or Additional Rules	54
	[3] Simultaneous Application of Different Agreements	55
	[4] The DSU and the Competence of Other WTO Bodies (Institutional Balance)	56
	[5] The “Matter” Before the Panel	58
	[6] Measures Changed During Proceedings	59
	[7] Change in the Legal Justification for a Measure	60
	[8] Measures No Longer in Effect (Expired Measures)	61
	[9] Review of Measures Taken to Comply with Rulings and Recommendations of the DSB	65
§ 2.04	Jurisdiction <i>Ratione Personae</i>	65
	[1] Non-Members	65
	[2] Non-application Between Particular Members	66
	[3] Regional and Local Government Entities	67
§ 2.05	Standing ( <i>Locus Standi</i> )	69
	[1] Requirement of a Legal Interest	69
	[2] Exhaustion of Local Remedies	71
	[3] Intensity of Participation in Dispute Settlement	72
	[4] Participation of Private Parties ( <i>Amicus Curiae</i> )	73
§ 2.06	Review of Jurisdictional Claims	75
	[1] Challenges to Jurisdiction	75
	[2] <i>Ex Officio</i> Review of Jurisdiction	76
	[3] <i>Res Judicata</i>	77

## CONTENTS

ix

[4] Estoppel	79
[5] Engagement in Procedures in Good Faith	82
[6] Waiver of Right to Pursue Dispute Settlement	83
§ 2.07 Arbitration	84
§ 2.08 Appellate Jurisdiction	84
<b>3 Sources of Law</b>	<b>86</b>
§ 3.01 Overview	86
§ 3.02 The DSU Regime	87
§ 3.03 The Covered Agreements	88
§ 3.04 Public International Law Generally	89
§ 3.05 Implied Powers	91
§ 3.06 Agreements Explicitly Mentioned in the Covered Agreements	92
[1] The Havana Charter	92
[2] Agreements Mentioned in the TRIPS Agreement	93
[3] Agreements Mentioned in the SCM Agreement	94
[4] Agreements Mentioned in the SPS and TBT Agreements	95
[5] Other International Agreements	95
§ 3.07 Agreements Made by the WTO	96
§ 3.08 Actions by WTO Bodies	96
[1] Authoritative Interpretations	96
[2] Amendments	98
[3] Waivers	98
[4] Decisions by Permanent WTO Bodies	99
[5] Decisions by Ad Hoc WTO Bodies	102
§ 3.09 Custom	102
§ 3.10 General Principles of Law	104
[1] Error	105
[2] Non Adimplenti Contractus	105
[3] Good Faith ( <i>Bona Fides</i> )	106
[4] Deference in Case of Doubt ( <i>In Dubio Mitius</i> )	107
[5] Exceptions Must Be Interpreted Narrowly	108
[6] Effective Treaty Interpretation/ <i>Effet Utile</i>	108

	[7] Lex Specialis	110
	[8] Contemporaneity	113
§ 3.11	Teachings of the Most Highly Qualified Publicists	114
§ 3.12	Prior Reports by Panels and the Appellate Body	115
	[1] GATT Practice	116
	[2] Adopted GATT Reports in the WTO	117
	[3] Unadopted GATT Reports in the WTO	118
	[4] Appellate Body Reports	119
	[5] The Appellate Body and Consistency in Case Law	125
	[6] WTO Panel Reports	128
§ 3.13	International Agreements Not Incorporated in WTO Agreements	129
	[1] Tokyo Round Agreements	129
	[2] Multilateral Agreements	130
	[3] Acts by International Organizations	134
	[4] Agreements Between the Parties to a Dispute	134
	[5] Circumstances Surrounding the Conclusion of the WTO Agreements	137
§ 3.14	Decisions of Other International Tribunals	137
	[1] Overview	137
	[2] Recourse to Article 32 of the VCLT in Order to Confirm	138
§ 3.15	Domestic Law	140
§ 3.16	Interpretation of WTO Law	141
	[1] The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	141
	[2] Ordinary Meaning: Use of Dictionaries	143
	[3] Context, Object, and Purpose	145
	[4] Subsequent Agreements	146
	[5] Subsequent Practice	147
	[6] Other Relevant Rules of International Law	148
	[7] Special Meaning	148
	[8] Supplementary Means of Interpretation	149
	[9] Preparatory Work: Negotiating History	149
	[10] Authentic Versions in Other Languages	151

<b>4</b>	<b>Consultations and the Panel Process</b>	<b>153</b>
§ 4.01	Overview	153
§ 4.02	Good Offices, Conciliation, and Mediation	154
§ 4.03	Consultations	156
	[1] Overview	156
	[2] Preparation	156
	[3] Purpose of Consultations	158
	[4] Form and Content of the Request	158
	[5] The Response to the Request	160
	[6] The Adequacy of the Request for Consultations	160
	[7] Consultations Meetings	164
	[8] Adequacy of Consultations	166
	[9] Confidentiality	167
	[10] Third Parties	170
	[11] Time Elements	171
§ 4.04	Request for the Establishment of a Panel and Terms of Reference	173
	[1] Overview	173
	[2] Time Elements	174
	[3] Form and Content	175
	[4] The Specific Measure at Issue	177
	[5] Amendment of Measures after the Panel Request	182
	[6] “Unwritten” Measures	183
	[7] Expired Measures	183
	[8] The “Claim” or the Legal Basis of the Complaint	183
	[9] Products Listed in the Panel Request	187
	[10] Standard Terms of Reference	189
	[11] Special Terms of Reference	190
	[12] Reviews and Arbitrations	190
§ 4.05	Establishment and Composition of Panels	191
	[1] Establishment	191
	[2] Composition	193
	[3] Selecting Panelists	193
§ 4.06	Function, Authority, and Responsibility of Panels	197
	[1] Overview	197

	[2] Working Procedures	198
	[3] Special Working Procedures	199
	[4] Confidentiality of the Panel Process	200
	[5] Organizational Meeting	201
	[6] Preliminary Rulings	202
§ 4.07	Third Parties, Multiple Complainants, and Counter-Complaints	203
	[1] Overview	203
	[2] Third-Party Notification	203
	[3] Third-Party Rights	205
	[4] Third-Party Rights in Reviews and Arbitrations	208
	[5] Multiple Complainants	208
	[6] Counter-Complaints	210
	[7] <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Briefs	211
§ 4.08	Role of the Secretariat	212
§ 4.09	Written Submissions to Panels	215
	[1] Overview	215
	[2] First Written Submission	216
	[3] Second Written Submission	219
	[4] Written Answers to Questions	219
	[5] Executive Summaries of Submissions	220
§ 4.10	Meetings of Panels with the Parties	220
	[1] Overview	220
	[2] First Meeting of the Panel with the Parties	222
	[3] Third-Party Session	223
	[4] Second Meeting of the Panel with the Parties	224
	[5] Open Meetings of Panels	225
	[6] “Virtual” Meetings of Panels	226
§ 4.11	Computation of Time	227
§ 4.12	Suspension of Panel Proceedings	228
§ 4.13	“Violation,” “Non-violation,” and “Other Situation” Complaints	229
	[1] Overview	229
	[2] Violation Complaints	230
	[3] Non-violation Complaints	230
	[4] “Other Situation” Complaints	232

## CONTENTS

xiii

§ 4.14	Composition of Delegations	233
	[1] Representation by Private Lawyers	233
	[2] Representatives of Industry	234
§ 4.15	Interim Review	234
	[1] Overview	234
	[2] Descriptive Portions of the Report	234
	[3] Interim Reports	235
	[4] Arguments and Evidence	236
	[5] Meetings	238
§ 4.16	Final Reports	239
	[1] Format	239
	[2] Content	239
	[3] Separate Opinions	241
	[4] Adoption of Reports	242
<b>5</b>	<b>Special Rules and Procedures</b>	<b>243</b>
§ 5.01	Overview	243
§ 5.02	GATT and WTO Rules for Developing Countries	244
§ 5.03	The 1966 Understanding and Developing Countries	244
	[1] Consultations	244
	[2] Good Offices, Conciliation, or Mediation	245
	[3] Establishment of Panels	246
	[4] Panel Procedures	246
§ 5.04	Developing Country-Related Provisions of the DSU	247
	[1] Consultations	247
	[2] Panel Process	247
	[3] Least-Developed Countries	249
	[4] Other Provisions	249
§ 5.05	The SPS Agreement	250
	[1] Overview	250
	[2] Experts	250
	[3] Ad Hoc Consultations on Specific SPS Issues	251
	[4] Developing Countries	251

§ 5.06	Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade	252
	[1] Overview	252
	[2] Measures Covered by the TBT Agreement	252
	[3] Experts	253
	[4] Developing Countries	254
§ 5.07	Anti-dumping Agreement	255
	[1] Overview	255
	[2] Establishment of a Panel	255
	[3] The “Matter” before an Anti-dumping Panel	256
	[4] Article 17.5: Factual Basis for Review	257
	[5] Article 17.6: Standard of Review	258
	[6] Article 17.6(i): Review of Factual Determinations	260
	[7] Article 17.6(ii): Review of Legal Determinations	262
	[8] Confidential Information	265
	[9] Developing Countries	266
	[10] Overlap with Countervailing Duties	267
§ 5.08	Agreement on Implementation of Article VII of GATT 1994 (Customs Valuation Agreement)	267
§ 5.09	Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures	268
	[1] Overview	268
	[2] Prohibited Subsidy Procedures	268
	[3] Requests for Consultations: SCM Article 4.2	269
	[4] Procedures before the Permanent Group of Experts	271
	[5] Actionable Subsidy Procedures	272
	[6] Annex V Procedures for Developing Information Concerning Serious Prejudice	273
	[7] Proceedings Involving Both Prohibited and Actionable Subsidies	279
	[8] Non-actionable Subsidies	280
	[9] Countervailing Measures	280
	[10] Developing Countries	281
	[11] Remedies	281
§ 5.10	Agreement on Textiles and Clothing (ATC)	282
§ 5.11	General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS)	283
	[1] Overview	283



## CONTENTS

xv

[2] Double Taxation Treaties	283
[3] Non-violation Nullification and Impairment	283
[4] Modification of Schedules	284
[5] Air Transport Services	287
[6] Panelists	287
§ 5.12 Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS)	287
§ 5.13 Agreement on Government Procurement	288
[1] Overview	288
[2] Proposals and DSU Notification	289
[3] DSB Authority	289
[4] Terms of Reference	290
[5] Time Limits	290
[6] No Cross-Retaliation	291
§ 5.14 Agreement on Trade in Civil Aircraft	291
§ 5.15 Agreement on Preshipment Inspection	291
§ 5.16 Arbitration	292
[1] Overview	292
[2] Non-actionable Subsidies	294
[3] Trade in Services	295
[4] <i>Sui Generis Bananas</i> Arbitrations	295
<b>6 Evidence and Proof</b>	<b>298</b>
§ 6.01 Evidence and Information	298
[1] Overview	298
[2] Types of Evidence	299
[3] Formal Requirements and Deadlines for Submission of Evidence	300
[4] Panel's Right to Seek Evidence and Information	303
[5] Duty to Provide Evidence and Information	306
[6] Adverse Inferences	308
[7] Admissions and Statements	310
[8] Notifications to the WTO	312
[9] Evidence Not Used in Reaching National Decisions	312
[10] Evidence of Municipal Law	314
[11] Experts	318

[12] Procedures for Consulting with Experts: SPS Experience	322
<b>§ 6.02 Burden of Proof</b>	<b>323</b>
[1] Overview	323
[2] Burden of Proving a Prima Facie Case	325
[3] Exceptions and Excluding Provisions	329
[4] “General Rule-Exception” Analysis	330
[5] Burden of Proof under Specific Agreements and GATT Articles	331
[6] Article 22.6 Arbitrations	334
<b>§ 6.03 Standard of Review</b>	<b>334</b>
<b>§ 6.04 Confidential Information</b>	<b>339</b>
[1] Overview	339
[2] Private Advisors and Other Parties	340
[3] Special Procedures to Protect Confidentiality	343
[4] Government Information	346
<b>7 The Appellate Process</b>	<b>348</b>
<b>§ 7.01 Overview</b>	<b>348</b>
<b>§ 7.02 The Task of the Appellate Body</b>	<b>350</b>
<b>§ 7.03 The Right of Appeal</b>	<b>350</b>
<b>§ 7.04 Time Elements</b>	<b>351</b>
[1] Limits Imposed by the DSU	352
[2] Limits Imposed by the Appellate Body	355
<b>§ 7.05 Appellate Body Rules</b>	<b>357</b>
[1] Overview	357
[2] Duties of Appellate Body Members	358
[3] Chair of the Appellate Body	358
[4] Divisions of the Appellate Body	359
[5] Decision-Making and Collegiality	359
[6] Separate Opinions	360
[7] Filing of Documents	362
[8] Notice of Appeal	364
[9] Working Schedule	367
[10] Appellant’s Submission	367
[11] Appellee’s Submission	368

## CONTENTS

xvii

[12] Multiple or “Other” Appeals	369
[13] Consolidation of Appeals	370
[14] Third Participants	371
[15] Record on Appeal	371
[16] Oral Hearing	372
[17] Written Responses to Questions	375
[18] Failure to Appear and Withdrawal of Appeal	375
[19] Representation by Outside Legal Advisors	377
[20] <i>Amicus Curiae</i> Briefs	377
[21] Business Confidential Information	378
§ 7.06 Issues Relating to the Scope of Appellate Review	380
[1] Questions of Law and Questions of Fact	380
[2] Treatment of Municipal Law	382
[3] Claims Relating to Specific Provisions and Article 11 of the DSU	384
[4] The Lack of Remand Authority and Judicial Economy	386
[5] The Appellate Body’s Rulings	396
§ 7.07 The Current Impasse Regarding the Replacement of Retiring Appellate Body Members	398
§ 7.08 Efforts to Resolve the Impasse	401
[1] The Walker Process	401
[2] The MPIA	402
<b>8 Adoption and Implementation of Reports</b>	<b>406</b>
§ 8.01 Overview	406
§ 8.02 Consideration and Adoption of Reports	406
§ 8.03 Notification of Implementation Intentions	409
§ 8.04 Legal Framework for the “Reasonable Period of Time”	410
§ 8.05 Agreements Establishing the “Reasonable Period of Time”	411
§ 8.06 Arbitrations Establishing the “Reasonable Period of Time”	412
[1] Overview	412
[2] Time within Which to Request Arbitration	413

[3] The Arbitrator	414	
[4] The Mandate of the Arbitrator	415	
[5] Time Allowed for Implementation	417	
§ 8.07 Factors Affecting Time Allowed for Implementation	420	
[1] Overview	420	
[2] Complexity	421	
[3] Need for Legislative Action	423	
[4] Contentiousness of the Issues	425	
[5] Economic Harm	426	
[6] Developing Countries	427	
[7] Other Emergencies	429	
§ 8.08 Surveillance by the DSB	429	
§ 8.09 Disputes Regarding Implementation	430	
[1] Overview	430	
[2] Procedures	432	
[3] Standing to Initiate Article 21.5 Reviews	434	
[4] Requirement of Consultations	436	
[5] Third-Party Rights	437	
[6] “Existence” of an Implementing Measure	438	
[7] Scope of Article 21.5 Reviews	439	
[8] Burden of Proof	448	
[9] Suggestions to Implement	449	
§ 8.10 Prohibited and Actionable Subsidies	450	
[1] Overview	450	
[2] Period to Withdraw a Prohibited Subsidy	451	
[3] “Withdrawal” of a Prohibited or Actionable Subsidy	452	
[4] To “Remove the Adverse Effects” of an Actionable Subsidy	455	
§ 8.11 “Other Situation” Complaints	456	
<b>9 Remedies</b>	<b>457</b>	
§ 9.01 Overview	457	
§ 9.02 GATT Practice	458	
§ 9.03 Overview of the WTO Remedy Regime	461	
§ 9.04 Mutually Agreed Solutions	462	

## CONTENTS

xix

§ 9.05	Purpose of Compensation and Suspension of Concessions	465
§ 9.06	Compensation	467
§ 9.07	Suspension of Concessions or Other Obligations	468
	[1] Request for Authorization to Suspend Concessions	468
	[2] “Carousel” Suspension	471
	[3] Approval of Request/Referral to Arbitration	471
	[4] Arbitration Procedures	473
	[5] Jurisdiction of the Arbitrator	474
	[6] Time Limits for Arbitration	476
	[7] Consequences of Arbitration	477
	[8] Burden of Proof	478
	[9] Information from Other Sources	480
	[10] Determination of the Level of Nullification or Impairment	481
	[11] “Cross-Retaliation”	484
	[12] Temporary Nature of Suspension of Concessions	489
	[13] Third-Party Rights	491
§ 9.08	The “Sequencing” Problem	492
	[1] Overview	492
	[2] The <i>Bananas III</i> Dispute	494
	[3] Ad Hoc Sequencing Agreements	497
	[4] Proposals for Change	501
	[5] The Safeguards “Sequencing” Problem	502
§ 9.09	Prohibited and Actionable Subsidies	504
	[1] Overview	504
	[2] “Appropriate Countermeasures” under Article 4	505
	[3] “Commensurate with the Degree and Nature of the Adverse Effects” under Article 7	509
	[4] Multiple Complainants	510
§ 9.10	Panel and Appellate Body Implementation Suggestions	512
	[1] Overview	512
	[2] Trade Remedy Cases	513
	[3] Cases under Other Agreements	516
	[4] Legal Effect of Implementation Suggestions	517

**10 Conclusion 518**

*Appendix 1 – Sample Working Procedures* 521

*Appendix 2 – Sample BCI Procedures* 531

*Bibliography* 534

*Index* 547