Detailed Table of Contents

List of Figures viii
Acknowledgements xx
Table of Cases xxii
Table of Legislation, Treaties and Conventions liii
List of Abbreviations lxx

Part I

Methods and Introduction 3

1 The Constitutional Boundaries of European Fiscal Federalism 24

1.1 An Introduction to European Constitutionalism 28
1.1.1 European Monist Federalism and the Principle of Supremacy 28
1.1.2 The Federation of Sovereign States 31
1.1.3 Constitutional Pluralism 34

1.2 The Constitutional Boundaries of the EU Legal Order 35
1.2.1 Member State Kompetenz-Kompetenz 35
1.2.1.1 Pure Constitutional Evaluation 37
1.2.1.2 Normative Evaluation 50
1.2.1.3 Positivist Evaluation 54

1.2.2 Member State Constitutional Identity 57
1.2.2.1 Pure Constitutional Evaluation 60
1.2.2.2 Normative Evaluation 73
1.2.2.3 Positivist Evaluation 78

1.3 The Constitutional Boundaries of European Fiscal Federalism 83
# Detailed Table of Contents

1.3.1 Fiscal Sovereignty 84
   1.3.1.1 Three Tests for Fiscal Sovereignty 87
   1.3.1.2 Unlawful Restrictions on Fiscal Sovereignty 94
   1.3.1.3 Unlawful Conferral of Fiscal Sovereignty 94
   1.3.1.4 Unlawful Impairments of Fiscal Sovereignty 96
   1.3.1.5 Permissible Limitations on Fiscal Sovereignty 97

1.3.2 Price Stability and Fiscal Discipline 98
   1.3.2.1 Price Stability 100
   1.3.2.2 Fiscal Discipline: Sound Budgetary Policies and a Sustainable Balance of Payments 102

1.4 Conclusions: Permanent Constraints on European Fiscal Federalism 103

2 The Maastricht Architecture of European Fiscal Federalism 106
   2.1 The Teleology of European Economic and Monetary Union 108
   2.2 The Principles of Economic and Monetary Union 114
      2.2.1 Price Stability 114
      2.2.2 Fiscal Discipline 115
      2.2.3 Fiscal Sovereignty 117
      2.2.4 Market Discipline 119
   2.3 The Legal Architecture of European Fiscal Federalism 122
      2.3.1 Articles 123–125 TFEU: The Prohibition on Financial Assistance 124
      2.3.2 Article 121 TFEU: The Multilateral Surveillance Procedure (MSP) 130
      2.3.3 Article 126 TFEU: The Excessive Deficit Procedure (EDP) 131
   2.4 Conclusions: The Maastricht Architecture 134

3 The Failure and Abrogation of the Maastricht Model 137
   3.1 Sovereign Debt Yields and the Failure of the Prohibition on Financial Assistance 141
      3.1.1 Nominal Interest-Rate Convergence 141
      3.1.2 The Interest Rate Channel and the Bailout Expectation 149
      3.1.3 Low and Negative Real Interest Rates 152
      3.1.4 Private-Sector Credit Expansion 156
# Table of Contents

## Part I

3.1.5 Analysis: The Failure of the Prohibition on Financial Assistance  158
3.2 Macroeconomic Imbalances and the Failure of the MSP  160
3.2.1 Cross-Border Credit Flows  160
3.2.2 Current Account Imbalances and Net External Indebtedness  169
3.2.3 Reallocation to Non-Tradable Consumption and Competitive Divergence  172
3.2.4 Analysis: The Failure of the Multilateral Surveillance Procedure  175
3.3 The Sovereign Debt Crisis and the Failure of the EDP  181
3.3.1 Not a Sovereign Debt Crisis  181
3.3.2 The European Sovereign Debt Crisis  186
3.3.3 The Futility of Centralized Fiscal Governance: A Counterfactual  190
3.3.4 Analysis: The Failure and Abrogation of the Excessive Deficit Procedure  193
3.4 Conclusions: Economic Criteria for EU Federalism  196

## 4 Constitutional Criteria for EU Fiscal Federalism  199

## Part II

5 The Emergent Centralized Architecture of European Fiscal Federalism  203
5.1 Overview of Reforms  204
5.2 Classification of the New Model  210
5.3 Demands on the European Legal Order and Operational Hypotheses  213

6 The Constitutional Boundaries of Economic and Monetary Union under EU Law  216
6.1 The Legal Architecture of Conditional Financial Assistance  220
6.1.1 The Bilateral Greek Loan Facility  220
6.1.2 The European Financial Stabilisation Mechanism 220
6.1.3 The European Financial Stability Facility 221
6.1.4 Article 136(3) TFEU 222
6.1.5 The European Stability Mechanism 224
6.1.6 Unconventional Monetary Policy Instruments 227
6.1.7 The Interpretations of the ECJ under Title VIII of Part III TFEU 229
6.2 Conformity with the Allocation of Competences 230
   6.2.1 Incompatibility with the Boundaries of Economic and Monetary Policy 232
   6.2.2 Incompatibility with the Boundaries of Union Financial Assistance 237
   6.2.3 Incompatibility with the Boundaries of Competence for Economic Coordination 239
   6.2.4 Incompatibility with the Boundaries of Competence for Economic Policy 241
6.3 Conformity with the Substantive Law of the Treaty 244
   6.3.1 Conditional Financial Assistance Is Incompatible with the Treaties 247
   6.3.2 The ESM Does Not Meet the First Condition Set Down by the ECJ 251
   6.3.3 The ESM Does Not Meet the Second Condition Set Down by the ECJ 255
   6.3.4 The ESM Does Not Meet the Third Condition Set Down by the ECJ 256
6.4 Conclusion: Conditional Financial Assistance Is Not Compatible with the Treaties 257

7 The Constitutional Boundaries of Member State Fiscal Sovereignty 261
   7.1 Overview of Economic and Fiscal Governance Procedures at EU Level 265
   7.2 Binding Vertical Interlinkages with the European Semester 269
      7.2.1 EU Legislation Binds Budgetary Frameworks to EU Macrofiscal Assessments 270
## Table of Contents

7.2.2 EU Legislation Binds Budgetary Policy: The Budgetary Veto 279
7.2.3 Conclusion: Two Infringements of Member State Fiscal Sovereignty 285

7.3 Binding Vertical Interlinkages with EU Fiscal Governance 287
7.3.1 Significant Observed Deviation from the MTO as Trigger for Enforcement 289
7.3.2 EU Legislation Vertically Integrates the Commission Warning into the TSG 291
7.3.3 Directive 2011/85/EU Binds Member States to EU-Legislated Fiscal Rules 299
7.3.4 The Effect of New Sanctions and Reverse-Burden Voting Rules 303
7.3.5 Conclusion: Three Infringements of Member State Fiscal Sovereignty 307

7.4 Binding Vertical Interlinkages with EU Macroeconomic Governance 308
7.4.1 The Scope of the Macroeconomic Scoreboard 309
7.4.2 ‘Imbalances’ and ‘Excessive Imbalances’ 311
7.4.3 Economic Recommendations Are Incorporated into Binding EU Law 313
7.4.4 Conclusion: An \textit{Ultra Vires} Intrusion on Fiscal Sovereignty 315

7.5 Binding Interlinkages with EFSM, EFSF and ESM Financial Conditionality 317
7.5.1 Denial of Actions against Financial Conditionality Instruments 321
7.5.2 Denial of Direct Actions against EU Macroeconomic Adjustment Programmes 326
7.5.3 Denial of Preliminary References against EU Macroeconomic Adjustment Programmes 327
7.5.4 An Unsustainable Choice between the \textit{Ultra Vires} and the Unenforceable 331

7.6 Conclusion: A Model of Legal Governance the EU Legal Order Cannot Support 333
8 Principles of Fiscal Federalism for the European Union

8.1 Principles of Fiscal Federalism for the European Union

8.1.1 Market Discipline

8.1.2 Hard Budget Constraints

8.1.3 Vertical Fiscal Symmetry

8.1.4 Revenue and Expenditure Autonomy

8.1.5 The Design of Effective Fiscal Rules

8.1.6 Determinants of Fiscal Discipline

8.2 Comparative Systems of Fiscal Federalism for the European Union

8.2.1 The Federal Republic of Germany

8.2.2 The Swiss Confederation

8.2.3 The United States of America

8.2.4 Canada

8.2.5 The European Economic and Monetary Union
8.3 Conclusion: Principles of Fiscal Federalism for the EU 408

Proposed Directions for Future Research and Reform 418

Bibliography 426

Index 478