

Political Censorship in British Hong Kong

Drawing on archival materials, Michael Ng challenges the widely accepted narrative that freedom of expression in Hong Kong is a legacy of British rule of law. Demonstrating that the media and schools were pervasively censored for much of the colonial period and only liberated at a very late stage of British rule, this book complicates our understanding of how Hong Kong came to be a city that championed free speech by the late 1990s. With extensive use of primary sources, the free press, freedom of speech and judicial independence are all revealed to be products of Britain's China strategy. Ng shows that, from the nineteenth to the twentieth century, Hong Kong's legal history was deeply affected by China's relations with world powers. Demonstrating that Hong Kong's freedoms drifted along waves of change in global politics, this book offers a new perspective on the British legal regime in Hong Kong.

Michael Ng is Associate Professor of the Faculty of Law at the University of Hong Kong and has published widely on the legal history of China and Hong Kong in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. He has been appointed as visiting fellow of the University of Cambridge, visiting scholar of the University of Melbourne and the National University of Singapore, and visiting Associate Professor of National Taiwan University. He was a founding officer and executive committee member of the International Society for Chinese Law and History.



LAW IN CONTEXT

Series editors

Professor Kenneth Armstrong
University of Cambridge
Professor Maksymilian Del Mar
Queen Mary, University of London
Professor Sally Sheldon
University of Kent

Editorial advisory board

Professor Bronwen Morgan University of New South Wales Emeritus Professor William Twining University College London

Since 1970, the Law in Context series has been at the forefront of a movement to broaden the study of law. The series is a vehicle for the publication of innovative monographs and texts that treat law and legal phenomena critically in their cultural, social, political, technological, environmental and economic contexts. A contextual approach involves treating legal subjects broadly, using materials from other humanities and social sciences, and from any other discipline that helps to explain the operation in practice of the particular legal field or legal phenomena under investigation. It is intended that this orientation is at once more stimulating and more revealing than the bare exposition of legal rules. The series includes original research monographs, coursebooks and textbooks that foreground contextual approaches and methods. The series includes and welcomes books on the study of law in all its contexts, including domestic legal systems, European and international law, transnational and global legal processes, and comparative law.

Books in the Series

Acosta: The National versus the Foreigner in South America: 200 Years of Migration and Citizenship Law

Ali: Modern Challenges to Islamic Law

Alyagon Darr: Plausible Crime Stories: The Legal History of Sexual Offences in

Mandate Palestine

Anderson, Schum & Twining: Analysis of Evidence, 2nd Edition

Ashworth: Sentencing and Criminal Justice, 6th Edition

Barton & Douglas: Law and Parenthood



Baxi, McCrudden & Paliwala: Law's Ethical, Global and Theoretical Contexts: Essays in Honour of William Twining

Beecher-Monas: Evaluating Scientific Evidence: An Interdisciplinary Framework for Intellectual Due Process

Bell: French Legal Cultures

Bercusson: European Labour Law, 2nd Edition

Birkinshaw: European Public Law

Birkinshaw: Freedom of Information: The Law, the Practice and the Ideal, 4th Edition Blick: Electrified Democracy: The Internet and the United Kingdom Parliament in History

Broderick & Ferri: International and European Disability Law and Policy: Text, Cases and Materials

Brownsword & Goodwin: Law and the Technologies of the Twenty-First Century: Text and Materials

Cane & Goudkamp: Atiyah's Accidents, Compensation and the Law, 9th Edition

Clarke: Principles of Property Law

Clarke & Kohler: Property Law: Commentary and Materials

Collins: The Law of Contract, 4th Edition

Collins, Ewing & McColgan: Labour Law, 2nd Edition

Cowan: Housing Law and Policy

Cranston: Commercial Law from the Nineteenth Century: Law as Backcloth

Cranston: Legal Foundations of the Welfare State

Darian-Smith: Laws and Societies in Global Contexts: Contemporary Approaches

Dauvergne: Making People Illegal: What Globalisation Means for Immigration
and Law

David: Kinship, Law and Politics: An Anatomy of Belonging

Davies: Perspectives on Labour Law, 2nd Edition

Dembour: Who Believes in Human Rights?: Reflections on the European Convention de Sousa Santos: Toward a New Legal Common Sense: Law, Globalization, and Emancipation

Diduck: Law's Families

Dupret: Positive Law from the Muslim World

Emon: Jurisdictional Exceptionalisms: Islamic Law, International Law, and Parental

Child Abduction

Estella: Legal Foundations of EU Economic Governance Fortin: Children's Rights and the Developing Law, 3rd Edition

Garnsey: The Justice of Visual Art: Creative State-Building in Times of Political Transition

Garton, Probert & Bean: Moffat's Trusts Law: Text and Materials, 7th Edition

Ghai & Woodman: Practising Self-Government: A Comparative Study of Autonomous Regions

Glover-Thomas: Reconstructing Mental Health Law and Policy



Gobert & Punch: Rethinking Corporate Crime

Goldman: Globalisation and the Western Legal Tradition: Recurring Patterns of Law

and Authority

Haack: Evidence Matters: Science, Proof, and Truth in the Law Harlow & Rawlings: Law and Administration, 4th Edition

Harris: An Introduction to Law, 8th Edition

Harris, Campbell & Halson: Remedies in Contract and Tort, 2nd Edition

Harvey: Seeking Asylum in the UK: Problems and Prospects

Herring: Law and the Relational Self

Hervey & McHale: European Union Health Law: Themes and Implications

Hervey & McHale: Health Law and the European Union

Holder & Lee: Environmental Protection, Law and Policy: Text and Materials, 2nd Edition

Jackson & Summers: The Internationalisation of Criminal Evidence: Beyond the Common Law and Civil Law Traditions

Kostakopoulou: The Future Governance of Citizenship

Kreiczer-Levy: Destabilized Property: Property Law in the Sharing Economy Kubal: Immigration and Refugee Law in Russia: Socio-Legal Perspectives

Lewis: Choice and the Legal Order: Rising above Politics

Likosky: Law, Infrastructure and Human Rights

Likosky: Transnational Legal Processes: Globalisation and Power Disparities

Lixinski: Legalized Identities

Loughnan: Self, Others and the State: Relations of Criminal Responsibility

Lunney: A History of Australian Tort Law 1901–1945: England's Obedient Servant?

Maughan & Webb: Lawyering Skills and the Legal Process, 2nd Edition

McGaughey: Principles of Enterprise Law

McGlynn: Families and the European Union: Law, Politics and Pluralism

Mertens: A Philosophical Introduction to Human Rights

Moffat: Trusts Law: Text and Materials

Monti: EC Competition Law

Morgan: Contract Law Minimalism: A Formalist Restatement of Commercial Contract Law

Morgan & Yeung: An Introduction to Law and Regulation: Text and Materials

Nash: British Islam and English Law: A Classical Pluralist Perspective

Nicola & Davies: EU Law Stories: Contextual and Critical Histories of European Jurisprudence

Norrie: Crime, Reason and History: A Critical Introduction to Criminal Law, 3rd Edition

O'Dair: Legal Ethics: Text and Materials

Oliver: Common Values and the Public-Private Divide

Oliver & Drewry: The Law and Parliament

Palmer & Roberts: Dispute Processes: ADR and the Primary Forms of Decision-Making, 1st Edition



> Palmer & Roberts: Dispute Processes: ADR and the Primary Forms of Decision-Making. 3rd Edition

Picciotto: International Business Taxation

Probert: The Changing Legal Regulation of Cohabitation, 1600–2010: From

Fornicators to Family, 1600–2010

Radi: Rules and Practices of International Investment Law and Arbitration

Reed: Internet Law: Text and Materials Richardson: Law, Process and Custody

Roberts & Palmer: Dispute Processes: ADR and the Primary Forms of Decision-

Making, 2nd Edition

Rowbottom: Democracy Distorted: Wealth, Influence and Democratic Politics

Sauter: Public Services in EU Law

Scott & Black: Cranston's Consumers and the Law

Seneviratne: Ombudsmen: Public Services and Administrative Justice

Seppänen: Ideological Conflict and the Rule of Law in Contemporary China: Useful

Paradoxes

Siems: Comparative Law, 3rd Edition

Stapleton: Product Liability

Stewart: Gender, Law and Justice in a Global Market

Tamanaha: Law as a Means to an End: Threat to the Rule of Law

Tuori: Properties of Law: Modern Law and After

Turpin & Tomkins: British Government and the Constitution: Text and Materials, 7th Edition

Twining: General Jurisprudence: Understanding Law from a Global Perspective

Twining: Globalisation and Legal Theory

Twining: Human Rights, Southern Voices: Francis Deng, Abdullahi An-Na'im, Yash Ghai and Upendra Baxi

Twining: Jurist in Context: A Memoir

Twining: Karl Llewellyn and the Realist Movement, 2nd Edition Twining: Rethinking Evidence: Exploratory Essays, 2nd Edition Twining & Miers: How to Do Things with Rules, 5th Edition

Wan: Film and Constitutional Controversy

Ward: A Critical Introduction to European Law, 3rd Edition

Ward: Law, Text, Terror

Ward: Shakespeare and Legal Imagination

Wells & Quick: Lacey, Wells and Quick: Reconstructing Criminal Law: Text and Materials, 4th Edition

Zander: Cases and Materials on the English Legal System, 10th Edition

Zander: The Law-Making Process, 6th Edition



International Journal of Law in Context: A Global Forum for Interdisciplinary Legal Studies

The *International Journal of Law in Context* is the companion journal to the Law in Context book series and provides a forum for interdisciplinary legal studies and offers intellectual space for ground-breaking critical research. It publishes contextual work about law and its relationship with other disciplines including but not limited to science, literature, humanities, philosophy, sociology, psychology, ethics, history and geography. More information about the journal and how to submit an article can be found at http://journals.cambridge.org/ijc



Political Censorship in British Hong Kong

Freedom of Expression and the Law (1842–1997)

Michael Ng

University of Hong Kong





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108830027

DOI: 10.1017/9781108908580

© Michael Ng 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-83002-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

| List of Figures List of Tables Acknowledgements List of Abbreviations | | page x xii xiii xv |
|--|--|-----------------------------|
| | Introduction | 1 |
| 1 | Punitive Censorship and Libel Lawsuits against the Press | 13 |
| 2 | 'Reading Every Line': Era of the Daily Vetting of Newspaper Proofs | 27 |
| 3 | 'Communist China Now Contiguous to Hong Kong': Censorship Imposed by the 'Free World' | 55 |
| 4 | $\hbox{`Patriotism to You Can Be Revolutionary Heresy to Us': Hardened Control of Media, Schools and Entertainment}$ | 87 |
| 5 | Preparing to Negotiate with China: Overt Loosening and Covert Control | 127 |
| 6 | Liberating Hong Kong for China: De-silencing the City | 164 |
| | Conclusion and Epilogue | 190 |
| Glossary of Chinese Newspapers Bibliography Index | | 197 199 208 |

ix



Figures

| 0.1 | the 2019 Anti-Extradition Law Amendment Bill Movement | page 3 |
|------|--|--------|
| 1.1 | China's leading statesman losing his head, as depicted in Min | 1 0 |
| | Bao (1907) | 18 |
| 1.2 | English translation of the song 'Curry Rice' prepared by the | |
| | Hong Kong government for Executive Council discussion | 22 |
| 1.3 | Letter asking the press to submit all reports for pre-censorship | 23 |
| 1.4 | Letter requesting that the press submit specific reports for | |
| | pre-censorship | 24 |
| 1.5 | Letter asking the SCMP for an explanation of a newspaper | |
| | report | 24 |
| 2.1 | Notice kept by the Chinese press about the opening hours of the | |
| | Press Censorship Office in 1931 | 30 |
| 2.2 | Censored newspaper report | 31 |
| 2.3 | Newspaper report with dots replacing the censored sentences | 32 |
| 2.4 | Newspaper report with dots replacing the censored sentences | 33 |
| 2.5 | Newspaper report with crosses and squares replacing the | |
| | censored sentences | 34 |
| 2.6 | Newspaper report with crosses replacing the censored | |
| | sentences | 35 |
| 2.7 | Newspaper report with squares and crosses replacing the | |
| | censored sentences | 36 |
| 2.8 | Newspaper report with squares and crosses replacing the | |
| | censored sentences | 37 |
| 2.9 | Original manuscript of a news story written in 1931 that was | |
| | banned by the Press Censorship Office | 38 |
| 2.10 | Original manuscript of a news story that was banned by the | |
| | Press Censorship Office | 39 |
| 2.11 | Censored Chinese newspaper reporting legislative councillor | |
| | Lo Man Kam's motion for the abolition of the press censorship | |
| | system | 46 |

X



| | List of Figures | Xi |
|------|---|-----|
| 2.12 | Censored news report appearing in the SCMP on | |
| | 19 March 1938 | 49 |
| 2.13 | Censored Chinese newspaper Wa Tsz Yat Po, dated | |
| | 12 June 1939, reporting the military attack on various cities in | |
| | mainland China by the Japanese air force | 50 |
| 2.14 | Censored Chinese newspaper WKYP, dated 4 May 1939, | |
| | reporting the military attack on Chongqing city in mainland | - 1 |
| 2.1 | China by the Japanese air force | 51 |
| 3.1 | Notice of suppression of Kwok Man Yat Po reported in Kung | |
| 4.1 | Sheung Daily News, 9 June 1946 | 56 |
| 4.1 | Confrontation between policemen and journalists during the | 0.2 |
| 4.2 | eviction process | 93 |
| 4.2 | Letter from the director of information services to CR on | |
| | 22 June 1967 agreeing to provide extra news headlines for | 102 |
| 4.2 | CR's broadcasting | 103 |
| 4.3 | Notes of correspondence between the senior programme | |
| | assistant at RHK, the controller of broadcasting and the | |
| | secretary for Chinese affairs on political censorship of Chinese | 108 |
| 1 1 | songs played by RHK | 108 |
| 4.4 | Note submitted by a Chinese censor to the secretary for | |
| | Chinese affairs (and subsequently forwarded to the controller of broadcasting) reporting the result of political censorship of | |
| | Chinese songs and gramophone records played by RHK | 109 |
| 4.5 | Raid of the three newspapers' offices by a police team armed | 109 |
| 4.3 | with shotguns | 120 |
| 4.6 | Cartons of 'inflammatory posters' removed by plain-clothes | 120 |
| 4.0 | policemen during the raid of Heung to Middle School, a well- | |
| | known leftist school in Hong Kong | 124 |
| | KIIOWII ICILISI SCHOOL III LIOHE IXOHE | 144 |



Tables

| 1.1 | Hong Kong government's actions against the press, 1915–18 | page 25 |
|-----|---|---------|
| 4.1 | Films banned for political reasons from the 1970s to the late | |
| | 1980s and the reasons cited for the ban | 114 |
| 6.1 | Comparison of the number of appearances of news reports on | |
| | human rights and freedoms in SCMP, a major English-language | |
| | newspaper, in the 1970s and 1980s | 166 |
| 6.2 | Comparison of the number of appearances of news reports on | |
| | human rights and freedoms in WKYP, a major | |
| | Chinese-language newspaper, in the 1970s and 1980s | 167 |

xii



Acknowledgements

This book was written during challenging times in Hong Kong. It would not have been possible without advice and assistance from many of my friends and colleagues.

My deepest thanks go to the scholars who provided me with comments and suggestions at different stages of the project: Christopher Munn, John Wong, Jed Kroncke, Scott Veitch, Marco Wan, Matthew Erie, Elizabeth Sinn, Fu Hualing, Teemu Ruskola, Carol Tan, Billy So, Ghassan Moazzin, Simon Potter, David Clayton, Fu Po-shek, Michael Palmer, Max Wong, Simon Young, Joshua Getzler, Kevin Tan, Humphrey Ko, Mark Chi-kwan, Chu Wai-li and Andrew Harding. I am also very grateful to Florence Mok, Katrina Lam, Leo Shum, Calvin Cheung and Simone Lee for their dedicated research assistance. My gratitude also goes to the staff members of the Hong Kong Public Records Office, the Law Library and the Special Collections of the University of Hong Kong Libraries and the National Archives at Kew, London, for their helpful support, advice and assistance in accessing historical materials. I also thank Joe Ng and Finola O'Sullivan of Cambridge University Press for their continuous support of my work. I am grateful to the anonymous reviewers for their critical comments and encouragement. The book manuscript benefits hugely from the meticulous editing of Erika Hebblethwaite. I am also thankful to the Hong Kong Government's Research Grants Council and the Faculty of Law of the University of Hong Kong for funding this legal history project.¹ I would like to thank Taylor and Francis for consenting to the reproduction of my published article in this book.²

I want to express my heartfelt gratitude and respect to Ng Bar-ling, the late senior editor of what was once a major Chinese-language newspaper, *Wah Kiu Yat Po*, whom I never had the honour to meet. His careful preservation of

xiii

¹ The work described in this book was substantially supported by grants from the Research Grants Council of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, China (Project Nos. HKU 17605917 and HKU 17616920).

² Chapters 1 and 2 contain materials previously published in 'When Silence Speaks: Press Censorship and Rule of Law in British Hong Kong (1850s–1940s)', *Law and Literature* 29.3 (2017): 425–56.



xiv Acknowledgements

original documents during his time as a journalist and editor from the 1920s to the 1970s provides valuable evidence to attest to the operation of the little-known political censorship regime in colonial Hong Kong.

Last but not the least, I am deeply indebted to my family for the unconditional love, patience and indulgence they have given me during every adventure I have undertaken.



Abbreviations

BBC British Broadcasting Corporation CCP Chinese Communist Party

CPCO Control of Publications Consolidation Ordinance

CPG Chinese Central People's Government

CR Commercial Radio

CUHK Chinese University of Hong Kong
ERO Emergency Regulations Ordinance
FCO Foreign and Commonwealth Office (UK)

FEER Far Eastern Economic Review
GIS Government Information Services

HK Hong Kong

HKFS Hong Kong Federation of Students HKFTU Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions

HKU University of Hong Kong HRC UN Human Rights Committee

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

ISD Information Services Department

JUSTICE International Commission of Jurists

KMT Kuomintang (Chinese Nationalist Party)

LIC Local Intelligence Committee
MFA Ministry of Foreign Affairs (China)

NCNA New China News Agency

OPO Objectionable Publications Ordinance

PLA People's Liberation Army PRC People's Republic of China

RDF Rediffusion
RHK Radio Hong Kong

ROC Republic of China (Taiwan)
RTHK Radio Television Hong Kong
SAR Special Administrative Region

SASI Secretary for Administrative Services and Information

SCMP South China Morning Post

ΧV



xvi List of Abbreviations

SCOPG Standing Committee on Pressure Groups

TVB Television Broadcasts Limited

UK United Kingdom UN United Nations

UPGC University and Polytechnic Grants Committee

US United States of America

WKYP Wah Kiu Yat Po