

Historical Legacies of Communism

Historical Legacies of Communism reveals how legacies of the Communist Party of the Soviet Union (CPSU) have survived in the politics, economic development, culture, and society of post-Communist regions in the twenty-first century. The authors show how this impact is not driven by Communist ideology but by the clientelistic practices, opportunism, and cynicism prevalent in the CPSU. Their study is built on a novel dataset of the CPSU membership rates in Russian regions in the 1950s–1980s, alongside case studies, interviews, and an analysis of mass media previously only available in Russian and discussed here in English for the first time. It will appeal to students and scholars of Russian and Eastern European politics and history, and anyone who wants to better understand countries which live or have lived through Communism, from Eastern Europe to China and East Asian Communist states.

Alexander Libman is Professor of Social Sciences and Eastern European Studies at Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich, and a research affiliate at the International Center for the Study of Institutions and Development of the National Research University Higher School of Economics, Moscow. He is the author, co-author, and co-editor of ten books.

Anastassia V. Obydenkova is a visiting Professor at Barcelona Institute of International Studies, a leading research fellow at the National Research University Higher School of Economics, and a research affiliate at the Institute for Economic Analysis of Spanish Council for Scientific Research. She was a Fox Fellow at Yale University, a Fung Fellow at Princeton University, and a Davis Senior Research Scholar at Harvard University. She is the author of multiple articles and books.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-82998-4 — Historical Legacies of Communism
Alexander Libman , Anastassia V. Obydenkova
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-82998-4 — Historical Legacies of Communism
Alexander Libman , Anastassia V. Obydenkova
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Historical Legacies of Communism

*Modern Politics, Society, and Economic
Development*

Alexander Libman

Free University of Berlin

Anastassia V. Obydenkova

Barcelona Institute of International Studies (IBEI)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-82998-4 — Historical Legacies of Communism
Alexander Libman , Anastassia V. Obydenkova
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108829984

DOI: 10.1017/9781108900133

© Alexander Libman and Anastassia V. Obydenkova 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ Book Ltd. Padstow, Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-82998-4 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-82048-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-82998-4 — Historical Legacies of Communism
Alexander Libman , Anastassia V. Obydenkova
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To our parents and grandparents, who lived
through Socialism.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-82998-4 — Historical Legacies of Communism
Alexander Libman , Anastassia V. Obydenkova
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> x
<i>List of Maps</i>	xii
<i>List of Tables</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xv
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xviii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 The Shadow of the CPSU	4
1.3 Empirical Strategy	10
1.4 Outline of the Book	12
2 The CPSU Legacy: Leninism or Clientelism?	18
2.1 Historical Legacies and the Legacies of Communism	18
2.2 CPSU Members as Agents of Persistence in Russian Regions?	23
2.3 CPSU Members and Communist Socialization	26
2.4 CPSU Legacy as a Legacy of (Neo)Patrimonialism	35
2.5 Pre-Communist Legacies and the Legacies of the CPSU	37
2.6 Mechanisms of Persistence	41
2.7 Limited Access Order and Selection of Dependent Variables	45
2.8 Conclusion: Main Hypotheses of the Study	47
3 Cultural Environment and Soviet Cinematography as a Legacy of the CPSU	52
3.1 The Power of the Movie: If You Conquer the Hearts, You Will Conquer the Minds! Soviet Movies as a Legacy	52
3.2 Soviet Movies: Are They Actually Popular? Happy New Year!	62
3.3 Modern Russian Cinematography, Nostalgia, and the Vertical of Power	71
3.4 Conclusion	76
4 Measuring CPSU Legacies	82
4.1 Capturing Subnational Party Saturation	82
4.2 CPSU Saturation or Other Developmental Legacies?	91
4.3 Empirical Setting: Post-Communist Regions	94
4.4 Validating the CPSU Saturation Data: Evidence from Archives	96
4.5 Conclusion: Soviet Movies, Nostalgia, and the Vertical of Power	99
	vii

viii	Contents	
5	Democracy	100
5.1	Theory and Hypotheses	102
5.2	Data and Model	105
5.3	Results	113
5.4	Causal Mechanisms	121
5.5	CPSU Legacies and Federal Elections	130
5.6	Conclusion	136
6	Corruption	138
6.1	Empirical Setting	140
6.2	Theory and Hypotheses	143
6.3	Data and Model	150
6.4	Results	158
6.5	Causal Mechanisms	163
6.6	Conclusion	166
7	Inequality	168
7.1	Empirical Setting	169
7.2	Theory and Hypotheses	174
7.3	Data and Model	181
7.4	Results	186
7.5	Causal Mechanisms	191
7.6	Conclusion	201
8	Mortality	203
8.1	Empirical Setting	204
8.2	Theory and Hypotheses	207
8.3	Data and Model	210
8.4	Results	214
8.5	Conclusion	222
9	Attitudes Toward Migrants	225
9.1	Empirical Setting	227
9.2	Theory and Hypotheses	231
9.3	Data and Model	240
9.4	Results	244
9.5	Trust: Why Is There No CPSU Effect?	247
9.6	Conclusion	252
10	Economic Development and Innovations	255
10.1	Theory and Hypotheses	255
10.2	Data and Model	262
10.3	Results	267
10.4	Explaining the Results and Nonresults	275
10.5	Conclusion	278

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-82998-4 — Historical Legacies of Communism
Alexander Libman , Anastassia V. Obydenkova
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents	ix
11 The Origin and Persistence of Legacies	280
11.1 Temporal Depth of Legacies	282
11.2 Temporal Persistence of Legacies	288
11.3 Additional Tests	295
11.4 Conclusion	296
12 Conclusion	299
12.1 Main Findings and Contributions	299
12.2 Soviet Cinematography: The Story of <i>Dog's Heart</i> and <i>Garage</i>	302
12.3 Post-Communism in Post-Soviet Eurasia: United by the CPSU Legacy?	308
12.4 Modern Communism: Worldwide Perspective – So Different and Yet So Similar	311
12.5 Legacy of Single-Party Regimes and (Neo)Patrimonialism	315
<i>Bibliography</i>	319
<i>Index</i>	361

Figures

4.1 Development of CPSU membership in the USSR over time (right scale: thousands of people; left scale: percent)	<i>page</i> 85
4.2 Distribution of CPSU saturation in 1976, percent	86
4.3 Correlation of the CPSU membership data in 1976 according to the archival data and the Congress data (thousands of people)	98
4.4 Correlation of the CPSU membership data in 1976 according to the archival data and the Congress data, excluding Moscow City and Moscow Oblast (thousands of people)	98
5.1 CPSU legacy, bureaucracy, and nondemocratic regimes in Russian regions	128
6.1 Distribution of corruption indicators across Russian regions, percent	155
7.1 Corruption and inequality in the Russian regions (corruption indicator computed by FOM varies between 14 and 58, Gini coefficient from the Rosstat data between zero and one)	180
7.2 Gini coefficient for the Russian Federation (the indicator varies between zero and one)	182
7.3 Gini coefficient at the regional level, Rosstat (the indicator varies between zero and one)	183
8.1 Life expectancy in the USSR and in Russia, years	204
8.2 Distribution of mortality rates across regions of Russia, 2012 (death per 100,000 people)	211
8.3 CPSU saturation (percent) and male mortality (death per 100,000 people)	213
8.4 Marginal effects of the CPSU legacy on male mortality, 2012	222
8.5 Marginal effects of the CPSU legacy on female mortality, 2012	223
9.1 Migration to Russia from the CIS: size and economic significance	230
9.2 Distribution of the share of those cautious of labor migrants across the regions of Russia, percent of respondents	241

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-82998-4 — Historical Legacies of Communism
Alexander Libman , Anastassia V. Obydenkova
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

List of Figures	xi
10.1 Distribution of Russian regions according to GDP growth rates, 2008–2012 (percent)	265
10.2 Distribution of foreign trade and patent activity across Russian regions, 2012	266
10.3 Distribution of regions according to the post-Soviet trade share (between zero and one)	267
10.4 Distribution of regions according to the natural logarithm of indicators of innovation activity (log one plus number of patents)	269
12.1 CPSU saturation in the Soviet republics, 1973, percent of the total population	310

Maps

4.1 CPSU saturation in the Russian regions in the 1970s	<i>page 87</i>
5.1 Carnegie Center democracy score in various regions of Russia	107
6.1 Aggregate corruption indicator in various regions of Russia	153
7.1 Variation of the Gini coefficient across the regions of the Russian Federation (coefficient between zero and one)	184
8.1 Male mortality across the regions of the Russian Federation (deaths per 100,000 people)	212
9.1 Attitude toward migrants across the regions of the Russian Federation (percent of respondents with negative attitude toward migrants)	242
10.1 Innovation activity (number of patent applications) in the regions of Russia	270

Tables

2.1	LAO framework and dependent variables of this study	48
2.2	CPSU legacy: ideology or opportunism?	51
3.1	The most popular movies in Russia in 2016 (including all foreign movies and modern Russian movies)	60
3.2	Movies transmitted on January 1, 2019, on four main TV channels	70
4.1	CPSU membership in border regions of the RSFSR	88
5.1	Impact of CPSU membership in 1976 on subnational democracy in 2000–2004, dep.var.: Carnegie index of democracy, OLS	114
5.2	Robustness checks	116
5.3	Mechanisms of impact of CPSU legacies, 2000–2004, bureaucracy	124
5.4	Direct and indirect effect of CPSU legacy, 2012	125
5.5	CPSU legacies and composition of regional political elites, OLS	126
5.6	Correlation between CPSU saturation in 1976 and Duma election outcomes in 2007–2016	131
5.7	Correlation between CPSU saturation in 1976 and presidential election outcomes in 2008–2018	131
6.1	Correlation matrix for various indicators of corruption	154
6.2	Determinants of aspects of corruption in Russian regions, 2010–2011, OLS	159
6.3	Robustness checks	160
6.4	Mechanisms of impact of CPSU legacies, 2009, bureaucracy	164
6.5	Direct and indirect effect of CPSU legacy on the overall corruption score	165
7.1	CPSU legacy and inequality, dep. var.: regional Gini index, 2012, OLS	187
7.2	Robustness checks	190
7.3	CPSU legacy and shares of income quintiles in the total income, 2012, OLS	191
		xiii

xiv List of Tables

7.4	CPSU legacy and regional social policy, 2012, OLS	193
7.5	Mechanisms of impact of CPSU legacies, 2011, bureaucracy	195
7.6	Direct and indirect effect of CPSU legacy on inequality, 2012	196
7.7	CPSU legacy and labor market outcomes, 2012, OLS	197
7.8	CPSU legacy and charitable activity, 2007 and 2012, OLS	200
8.1	CPSU legacy and standardized male mortality, 2012, OLS	215
8.2	CPSU legacy and standardized female mortality, 2012, OLS	216
8.3	Robustness checks	217
8.4	CPSU legacy and deaths from alcoholism, murders, and suicides, 2012, OLS	219
8.5	CPSU legacy and main causes of male mortality, 2012, OLS	220
8.6	Direct and indirect effect of CPSU legacy on the male mortality, 2012	220
9.1	CPSU legacy and attitude toward migrants, 2012, OLS	245
9.2	Robustness checks	246
9.3	Direct and indirect effect of CPSU legacy on attitude toward migrants, 2012	247
9.4	CPSU legacy, patriotism, and trust, 2007 and 2012, OLS	251
10.1	CPSU legacy and economic performance, 2012, OLS	268
10.2	Robustness checks	272
10.3	Direct and indirect effect of CPSU legacy on the number of patent applications, 2012	277
11.1	Effect of CPSU saturation at various points of time	285
11.2	Cumulative effect of CPSU legacies	290
11.3	Persistence of the CPSU legacy effect on inequality over time	291
11.4	Persistence of CPSU legacy effect on democracy over time	292
11.5	Persistence of CPSU legacy effect on male mortality over time	293
11.6	Persistence of CPSU legacy effect on innovation activity over time	294
11.7	Uniform set of control variables	296
11.8	Legacy of the CPSU and Russian regions in the 1990s	297
11.9	Main results of the book	298

Acknowledgments

Having worked on this book for more than seven years, we have accumulated a number of intellectual debts. We are very grateful to a number of scholars for their constant support, inspiration, and feedback on our research. Specifically, we would like to thank Philippe Schmitter, Mark Beissinger, Grigore Pop-Eleches, Henry Hale, Rawi Abdelal, Larry Diamond, Alexandra Vacroux, Robert Orttung, Vladimir Gel'man, Timothy Colton, Tomila Lankina, Margarita M. Balmaceda, Randall Stone, Petra Stykow, Noah Buckley, Michael Rochlitz, and Andrew Konitzer. Various chapters of the book were presented at the conferences of the American Political Science Association; the European Consortium of Political Research; the International Political Science Association; the European Political Science Association; the International Studies Association; the German Association for Political Science; the Association for Slavic, East European, and Eurasian Studies; the German Association for East European Studies (DGO); and the Post-Communist Working Group at Faculty of Arts and Science of Harvard University, as well as at Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich and the National Research University Higher School of Economics in Moscow.

We also benefitted from opportunities to share our research at a number of guest-speaker events organized in the USA and in Europe over these years, which allowed us to enrich our study through the excellent feedback of participants of these events: Anastassia is grateful to Rawi Abdelal and Alexandra Vacroux from the Davis Center for Russian and Eurasian Studies at Harvard University for their invitation to present on the role of the CPSU legacy in modern corruption at the Comparative Politics Seminar of the Faculty of Arts and Science of Harvard University; to Alina Mungiu-Pippidi for her invitation to present this project at the Hertie School of Governance; to Joshua Tucker for inviting her to present at New York University and for his valuable comments; to Larry Diamond for his support and an invitation to present a draft of the chapter on historical legacies and their consequences for democracy in Russia at the Center on Democracy, Development, and the Rule of Law of

xvi Acknowledgments

Freeman Institute of Stanford University; to Carlos Closa for inviting her to present at the Institute of Public Goods and Policies (IPP) of the Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas (CSIC, Madrid); and to Alexander Cooley and Elise Giuliano for hosting her presentation at Columbia New York University and to Elise for being an excellent discussant of this project. Last but not least, Anastassia thanks Central European University for their invitation to present the entire book at the seminar of the Political Economy Research Group in Budapest and to the organizers of this event, specifically to Ekaterina Paustyan, Martino Comelli, and Pedro Perfeito Da Silva. We are grateful to all participants at these guest-speaker events for their excellent comments and inspiration.

We would like also to take the opportunity to acknowledge the institutional support of our host universities and the support of our colleagues who work with us on a daily basis and influence the way we think and feel about our research. Anastassia is grateful to the Institut Barcelona d'Estudis Internacionals (IBEI, Barcelona) and her colleagues there for their collaboration and support: Jacint Jordana, Fulya Apaydin, Matthias vom Hau, Andrea C. Bianculli, Laura Chaqués Bonafont, Robert Kissack, and Charles Roger. Anastassia would like to acknowledge the enormous help and support she has received from the Institute for Economic Analysis of the Spanish Council for Scientific Research (IAE-CSIC, Barcelona) and her colleagues from IAE-CSIC for creating a warm and welcoming work environment: Enriqueta Aragonès, Esther Hauk, Albert Marcet, Jordi Brandts, Ana Rute Cardoso, Matthew Ellman, Ada Ferrer-i-Carbonell, and Hannes Mueller; additionally, she is grateful for the support received from the Center for Institutional Studies of National Research University Higher School of Economics and from Leonid Polishchuk. Anastassia also thanks the Davis Center for Russian and Eurasian Studies at Harvard University for granting her the position of Kathryn W. and Shelby Cullom Davis Senior Research Scholar, and the research fellows and visitors of the Davis Center in 2015–2016 for the creative, enthusiastic environment and excellent comments on this book: specifically, Jaclyn A. Kerr, Lyudmila Petrova, Nadia Boyadjieva, Jillian Porter, Inna Melnykovska, Halit Dundar Akarca, Alexander Diener, Zulfiyya Abdurahimova, and Brandon Schechter, and professors Alexandra Vacroux, Timothy Colton, Loren Graham, Terry Martin, Serhii Plokhii, and Rawi Abdelal. Anastassia is also grateful to Fung Global Program at the Princeton Institute for International and Regional Studies (PIIRS) at Princeton University for granting her an opportunity to be a Fung Fellow at PIIRS and to complete her project as well as for the generous support and inspiration of the Department of

Politics of Princeton University, especially of Mark R. Beissinger and Grigore Pop-Eleches. Anastassia thanks them for their support and valuable comments on the multiple drafts of this book. She would also like to thank Mr. William Fung Kwok Lun for launching Fung Global Scholarship program at Princeton University, which connects scholars from around the world and allows them to perfection their research both at Princeton and at a truly global level.

Alexander appreciates the very useful comments of Vladimir Kozlov, who helped a lot in understanding some of the mechanisms underlying the findings of the book and assisted us in integrating insights from demographic and sociological research. He is also grateful to Oxana Shevel for her insightful comments on how the CPSU legacy may affect contemporary attitudes. We are also indebted to Julia Blaut, who has offered excellent research assistance in collecting data for our analysis. Last but not least, we thank two reviewers from Cambridge University Press for their insightful and supportive comments and their help to significantly improve our book.

The authors thank James Disley and Oxford Academic Editing and American Journal Experts for their excellent assistance in terms of proof-reading and language editing of the manuscript. Alexander Libman appreciates the financial support of the Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich. Anastassia V. Obydenkova is grateful for support for this project from the Davis Center for Russian and Eurasian Studies of Harvard University.

The authors of this book are listed alphabetically and they contributed equally to this book.

Abbreviations

CCP	Chinese Communist Party
CHA	comparative historical analysis
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
CMA	causal mediation analysis
CPRF	Communist Party of the Russian Federation
CPSU	Communist Party of the Soviet Union
FOM	Fond Obshchestvennoe Mnenie (Public Opinion Foundation)
GDP	gross domestic product
LAO	limited access order
LDPR	Liberal-Democratic Party of Russia
MPA	modern political economy
NACP	National Anti-Corruption Plan
NGO	nongovernmental organization
NII	Nauchno-issledovatel'skiy institut (research institute)
OLS	ordinary least squares
R&D	research and development
RSFSR	Russian Soviet Federative Socialist Republic
RUR	Russian ruble
SME	small and medium-sized enterprises
US\$	United States dollar
USSR	Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
VTsIOM	Vserossiyskiy Tsentr Izucheniya Obshchestvennogo Mneniya (Russian Public Opinion Research Center)