

The Past Can't Heal Us

In this innovative study, Lea David critically investigates the relationship between human rights and memory, suggesting that, instead of understanding human rights in a normative fashion, human rights should be treated as an ideology. Conceptualising human rights as an ideology gives us useful theoretical and methodological tools to recognise the real impact human rights has on the ground. David traces the rise of the global phenomenon that is the human rights memorialisation agenda, termed 'moral remembrance', and explores what happens once this agenda becomes implemented. Based on evidence from the Western Balkans and Israel/Palestine, she argues that the human rights memorialisation agenda does not lead to a better appreciation of human rights; instead, contrary to what would be expected, it serves to strengthen national sentiments, divisions and animosities along ethnic lines, and leads to the new forms of societal inequalities that are closely connected to different forms of corruptions.

LEA DAVID is Assistant Professor and Ad Astra Fellow at the School of Sociology, University College Dublin. She has held the prestigious Fulbright, Jonathan Shapira and Marie Curie postdoctoral fellowships and established the Critical Thinking on Memory and Human Rights Research Group.

Human Rights in History

Edited by

Stefan-Ludwig Hoffmann, University of California, Berkeley

Samuel Moyn, Yale University, Connecticut

This series showcases new scholarship exploring the backgrounds of human rights today. With an open-ended chronology and international perspective, the series seeks works attentive to the surprises and contingencies in the historical origins and legacies of human rights ideals and interventions. Books in the series will focus not only on the intellectual antecedents and foundations of human rights, but also on the incorporation of the concept by movements, nation-states, international governance, and transnational law.

A full list of titles in the series can be found at:
www.cambridge.org/human-rights-history

The Past Can't Heal Us

*The Dangers of Mandating Memory
in the Name of Human Rights*

Lea David

University College Dublin



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108817103

DOI: 10.1017/9781108861311

© Lea David 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

First paperback edition 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Names: David, Lea, 1976– author.

Title: The past can't heal us : the dangers of mandating memory in the name of human rights / Lea David.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Series: Human rights in history | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2020002613 (print) | LCCN 2020002614 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108495189 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108817103 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108861311 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Human rights–Philosophy. | Memorialization. | Collective memory.

Classification: LCC JC571 .D33274 2020 (print) | LCC JC571 (ebook) | DDC 323.01–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2020002613>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2020002614>

ISBN 978-1-108-49518-9 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-81710-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	page vi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	ix
1 Introduction	1
2 Human Rights As an Ideology? Obstacles and Benefits	21
3 What Is Moral Remembrance?	41
4 The Institutionalisation of Moral Remembrance: Case Study of Palestine and Israel	66
5 The Institutionalisation of Moral Remembrance: Case Study of the Western Balkans	95
6 Human Rights, Memory and Micro-Solidarity	124
7 Mandating Memory, Mandating Conflicts	186
<i>Bibliography</i>	214
<i>Index</i>	240

Acknowledgements

This book is a product of my intellectual growth – from my PhD, when I timidly dared to start developing my own perspective, throughout four postdoctoral fellowships, during which I learned how to dive bravely into the depths of knowledge, without fear and intimidation.

Though I hope this book will contribute to our academic efforts to provoke a meaningful debate on moral remembrance and to disclose the often hidden relationships between ideals and politics and between wishful thinking and real outcomes on the ground, as well as the spectrum of complexities that define those relationships, this book also sheds some light on its author. In a sense, similar to the ways in which anthropology of the body uses scars, bodily deviations or a tooth index to narrate life stories, this book discloses my own, unique path. The imprints I leave here are all a testimony to people who have inspired me, supported me along the way or disputed my approach. My gratitude, my contemplations, my anxieties – all are engraved here in theories and arguments I have used, in particular examples I have showcased and in the voids and silences that appear sporadically in the text.

My biggest and eternal gratitude goes to Siniša Malešević, the world's leading sociologist on nationalism and my Marie Curie Fellowship supervisor (2017–2019) at University College Dublin (UCD), whose intellectual work has had a crucial impact on the ways in which I make sense of the world. I truly doubt that, without his conceptual frameworks and theoretical insights, this book would have had the slightest chance to blossom. His academic impact on my intellectual development, though gargantuan, is nevertheless tiny when compared to the human side of his impact, along with his commitment, evident in his endless support and his willingness to engage in debates, explanations and advice on how to navigate the jungle of knowledge. His kindness, his good intentions and his tenacious encouragement have guided me through the roller coaster of research and writing, and all are imprinted here in this book.

Two other people deserve a special acknowledgement, as my endless conversations with them inspired me, shaped the way I think and left an

anthropological footprint on this book. The first is Robert M. Hayden, from the University of Pittsburgh, who was my mentor during my Fulbright Fellowship and who has continued to actively engage with my work – to comment on it, often to tear it apart, to engage with it, to discuss it, to contest it – always pushing me to be courageous and to go against the stream if necessary, even if it is at the expense of being, in an academic sense, not ‘popular’. Second, I wish to thank Carol Kidron, who was there for me after I obtained my PhD, when my future looked very bleak and uncertain, and who supervised some of my first independent research. Her work inspired me profoundly, and this book, in many ways, emerged through the cracks she opened for me. She encouraged me to explore them further.

It would be an understatement to say that the many other interactions – long and short – I have had with the people who have influenced my work were ‘significant’. Rather, they were decisive, providing me with my intellectual and academic home. My PhD supervisors, Lev Grinberg and Jackie Feldman, gave me both sociological and anthropological foundations in the subjects of memory and nationalism, and the tools to take my first steps independently into research and publishing. In fact, the entire Sociology and Anthropology Department at the Ben Gurion University in the Negev – in particular, Uri Ram, Yulia Lerner, Sara Helman and Nir Avrieli – guided me and supported me in one way or another throughout my PhD and after. At Haifa University, where I held my first postdoctoral fellowship, my research was warmly welcomed and supported by the newly opened and truly inspiring Anthropology Department, in particular by Amalia Saar, and by Arieh Kochavi and Yael Granot-Bein at the Weiss-Livnat International Program in Holocaust Studies. I owe special gratitude to Adriana Kamp from the Sociology and Anthropology Department at Tel Aviv University, who was my adviser but became my friend.

I am endlessly grateful to Malešević for introducing me to the Dubrovnik Divided Societies faculty group, Saša Božić, Niall Ó Dochartaigh, Biljana Kašić, Daphne Winland, Simona Kuti and others. My long conversations with Miguel A. Centeno and Deborah A. Kaple from the Department of Sociology at Princeton University lured me into this endless pit of curiosity that led to a breakthrough in my research. However, my ability to thrive was largely due to my academic home, at UCD’s School of Sociology, where I was based during my Marie Curie Fellowship and where I was fortunate enough to be accepted as a permanent faculty member. Small and big talks in the school hallway, guest lectures and day-to-day activities with the faculty members – Andreas Hess, Alice Friedman, Gerard Boucher, Mathew Creighton, Barbara Gornicka,

viii Acknowledgements

Thomas Grund, Steven Loyal, Aogán Mulcahy, Sara O'Sullivan, Ruben Flores, Veronica Baker, Deirdre Brophy and others – made me feel welcomed and able to ask, enquire, suggest, propose, discuss or contest freely any ideas that I was struggling with at the time. One person, besides Siniša Malešević, especially made me really feel that this is not a stop on the way to another institutional home – that this IS where I want to be. The Head of the School of Sociology, Iarfhlaith Watson, created an atmosphere of support, appreciation and transparency, without animosity and hostility, but just kindness, which proved to be a true remedy for my soul and body. It felt like a home away from home, a place where the journey could stop and I could just become.

Several conversations about the book brought me in touch with some of the greatest scholars of our times, to whom I am extremely grateful. They were kind enough to listen, open to suggesting and keen to help, and they include Bob Clifford, Omer Bartov and Eric Weitz. My huge thanks go to the editors of the Cambridge University Press series 'Human Rights in History', Samuel Moyn and Stefan-Ludwig Hoffmann, as well as to Michael Watson, the senior commissioning editor, and Emily Sharp, the editorial assistant for History and Area Studies, who helped me go through the process of getting the book manuscript ready.

Many others along the way helped me tie my thoughts together into one solid structure: Gruia Badescu, Taylor MacConnell, Cecile Blaser, Sven Milekić and the entire research network on 'Critical Thinking on Memory and Human Rights' where I discussed my research findings on several occasions. Sporadic conversations with Hannes Baumann, Erika Harris, Orli Fridman, Yossi Harpaz, Filip Ejodus, Jasna Dragović-Soso, Jelena Subotić, Mischa Gabowitsch and many, many others helped me tremendously in shaping my research. I also want to thank Gary Branigan, who has been there closely editing my work since its very inception, and my sister Mia David, who had to suffer my endless talks on my desires, aspirations and disappointments on how the book cover should look.

Finally, it was my family who had the best and the worst of me during this entire process. My husband Nery, my twin daughters Aya and Zoe, our late dog Riva and our new dog Sushi – at the end of the day, they were my anchor, my tribe. Thank you for moving continents, changing culture, weather and landscape for me, and pushing me to dare against all the odds!

This project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under the Marie Skłodowska-Curie grant agreement No 745922.

Abbreviations

AAA	American Anthropological Association
ASA	American Sociological Association
BADIL	Resource Centre for Palestinian Residency and Refugee Rights NGO
BDS	Boycott Divestment and Sanctions movement
BiH	Bosnia and Herzegovina
CFP	Combatants for Peace
CNA	Centre for Nonviolent Action
CSF	Civil Society Facility
EIDHR	European Instrument for Democracy and Human Rights
ENP	European Neighbourhood Policy
EP	European Parliament
EU	European Union
FBiH	Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina
FGD	focus group discussion
FGYO	Southeast Europe Initiative of the French–German Youth Office
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for Yugoslavia
IDF	Israeli Defense Forces
IDP	internally displaced persons
IFI	international financial institution
IHRA	International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance
IMTFE	International Military Tribunal for the Far East
INGO	international non-governmental organisation
IPA	Instrument for Pre-accession Assistance
IPCRI	Israel–Palestine Center for Research and Information

x List of Abbreviations

IPSOS	Ipsos Group S.A., a global market research and consulting firm
IPTF	International Police Task Force
ISA	International Sociological Association
IW	Impunity Watch
JAT	Yugoslav Airlines Transportation
JNA	Yugoslav People's Army
LGBTI	lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex community
MECA	Middle East Children's Alliance
NANSEN	NANSEN Dialogue Centre
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NGO	non-governmental organisation
NORAD	Norwegian Directorate for Development Cooperation
NSSP	Neveh Shalom/Wahat el Salam School for Peace
ODIHR	Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights
OHCHR	United Nations Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
OHR	Office of the High Representative
OPT	occupied Palestinian territory
OSCE	Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
P2P	People 2 People Programme
PA	Palestinian Authority
PCFF	Parents Circle–Families Forum
PLO	Palestinian Liberation Organization
PLU	person like us
PNA	Palestinian National Authority
PRIME	Peace Research Institute in the Middle East
R2P	Responsibility to Protect
RECOM	Regional Commission Tasked with Establishing the Facts about All Victims of War Crimes and Other Serious Human Rights Violations Committed on the Territory of the Former Yugoslavia from 1 January 1991 to 31 December 2001
RS	Republika Srpska
RYCO	Regional Youth Cooperation Office
SFRJ	Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia
SIDA	Swedish International Development Agency
SUBNOR	Association of Fighters of the National Liberation War
TRC	Truth and Reconciliation Commissions
UDHT	Universal Declaration of Human Rights

List of Abbreviations

xi

UN	United Nations
UNRWA	United Nations Relief and Works Agency
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USHMM	United States Holocaust Memorial Museum
VLJI	Van Leer Jerusalem Institute
YIHR	Youth Initiative for Human Rights