

## A Tale of Two Narratives

The Holocaust and the Nakba are foundational traumas in Israeli–Jewish and Palestinian societies and form key parts of each respective collective identity. This book offers a parallel analysis of the transmission of these foundational pasts in Israeli–Jewish and Palestinian societies by exploring how the Holocaust and the Nakba have been narrated since the signing of the 1993 Oslo Accords. The work exposes the existence and perpetuation of ethnocentric victimhood narratives that serve as the theoretical foundations for an ensuing minimization – or even denial – of the other’s past. Three established realms of societal memory transmission provide the analytical framework for this study: official state education, commemorative acts, and mass mediation. Through this analysis, the work demonstrates the interrelated nature of the Israeli–Palestinian conflict and the contextualization of the primary historical events, while also highlighting the universal malleability of mnemonic practices.

GRACE WERMENBOL is a Middle East-focused analyst for the U.S. government and a non-resident scholar at the Washington-based Middle East Institute. She holds a Ph.D. from St Antony’s College, University of Oxford, where her research focused on the Israeli–Palestinian conflict. She is the recipient of numerous academic grants and awards, including from the University of Oxford, the Council of British Research in the Levant, the University of Cambridge’s Woolf Institute, and the Dutch Prins Bernhard Foundation.

*Cambridge Middle East Studies*

Editorial Board

Charles Tripp (general editor)  
Julia Clancy-Smith  
F. Gregory Gause  
Yezid Sayigh  
Avi Shlaim  
Judith E. Tucker

**Cambridge Middle East Studies** has been established to publish books on the nineteenth- to twenty-first-century Middle East and North Africa. The series offers new and original interpretations of aspects of Middle Eastern societies and their histories. To achieve disciplinary diversity, books are solicited from authors writing in a wide range of fields including history, sociology, anthropology, political science, and political economy. The emphasis is on producing books affording an original approach along theoretical and empirical lines. The series is intended for students and academics, but the more accessible and wide-ranging studies will also appeal to the interested general reader.

*A list of books in the series can be found after the index.*

# A Tale of Two Narratives

*The Holocaust, the Nakba, and the  
Israeli–Palestinian Battle of Memories*

---

Grace Wermenbol



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-108-79440-4 — A Tale of Two Narratives  
Grace Wermenbol  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108794404](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108794404)

DOI: 10.1017/9781108885430

© Grace Wermenbol 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2021

First paperback edition 2022

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data*

Names: Wermenbol, Grace, 1990- author.

Title: A tale of two narratives : the Holocaust, the Nakba, and the Israeli-Palestinian battle of memories / Grace Wermenbol.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Series: Cambridge Middle East studies | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2020037768 (print) | LCCN 2020037769 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108840286 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108794404 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108885430 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Jewish-Arab relations. | Arab-Israeli conflict—Historiography. | Holocaust, Jewish (1939-1945)—Historiography. | Israel-Arab War, 1948-1949—Historiography. | Collective memory—Israel. | Group identity—Israel. | Israel—Ethnic relations.

Classification: LCC DS119.7 .W45735 2020 (print) | LCC DS119.7 (ebook) | DDC 956.9405—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020037768>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020037769s>

ISBN 978-1-108-84028-6 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-79440-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

In loving memory of my father.

A world that can be explained even with bad reason is a familiar world. But, on the other hand, in a universe suddenly divested of illusions and lights, man feels an alien, a stranger. His exile is without remedy since he is deprived of the memory of a lost home or the hope of a promised land.

—Albert Camus, *The Myth of Sisyphus*

And, of course, people are interested only in themselves. If a story is not about the hearer he will not listen. And I here make a rule – a great and lasting story is about everyone or it will not last. The strange and the foreign is not interesting – only the deeply personal and familiar.

—John Steinbeck, *East of Eden*

## Contents

---

<i>List of Figures</i>	page x
<i>List of Tables</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xii
<i>A Note on Transliteration</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvi
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
The Holocaust and the Nakba as Foundational Pasts	3
Theorizing Collective Memory	5
Silencing the Other's Past	7
Victimhood Narratives and Their Exclusionary Manifestations	12
Structural Make-Up and Methodology	17
<b>1 The Post-Oslo Period: A Historical Overview</b>	<b>22</b>
The Declaration of Principles	22
Implementing the Oslo Accords	31
Palestinian Politics in the Wake of Oslo	39
Israeli Politics in the Post-Oslo Era	43
Doves and Hawks: Confronting the Peace Process	46
The Second Intifadah	51
Withdrawing from Gaza: Ending the "War of the Settlers"	57
Post-Oslo Negotiations: The Ongoing Multilateral Approach	59
The Second Lebanon War	60
The Gaza Wars	61
<b>Part I The Textbook of Memory</b>	<b>69</b>
The Post-Oslo Palestinian and Israeli Educational Systems	70
The History Curriculum: An Approved Version of History	72
The Creation of a Useable Past: Delegitimizing the Other's Narrative	74
<b>2 The Holocaust in Israeli Textbooks: Death and Deliverance</b>	<b>77</b>
The Holocaust in Israeli Education: A Historical Overview	79
The Holocaust in Contemporary Israeli Textbooks	85
The Holocaust and Israel	100
The 1948 War in Israeli Textbooks	102
Concluding Remarks	116
	vii

viii	Contents	
3	Teaching the Nakba: Old Wounds, New Textbooks	118
	A Brief History of the Palestinian Educational System	119
	The Stirrings of a New Educational System	123
	The Jordanian Curriculum and the 1948 War	129
	The New Palestinian Textbooks: The 1948 War in National Education	
	Textbooks between 1995 and 2000	133
	An Exclusive Victimhood Narrative: The Holocaust and the	
	Palestinian Curriculum	143
	Concluding Remarks	149
	<b>Part II The Landscape of Memory</b>	151
	The Commemoration of Watersheds	153
	The Nakba and the Holocaust as Watersheds	154
	Commemorating the Past in Physical and Non-physical Mnemonic Acts	156
4	Recreating and Reclaiming the Lost Homeland	159
	The Capitulation of Oslo	161
	The Return Visit: A Negation of the Nakba	163
	Implementing a Temporary Return	165
	The March of Return	174
	Nakba Commemoration in the West Bank	179
	Concluding Remarks	189
5	A Past That Does Not Pass	191
	Incorporating the Holocaust in Israel's Physical and	
	Mental Consciousness	193
	The IDF and Holocaust Commemoration	198
	The Holocaust as a National Death	202
	Holocaust Memory Sites: Invoking the Holocaust, Living the Holocaust	204
	The New Yad Vashem and the Zionist Rebirth	211
	The Holocaust as a Pedagogical Tool	215
	Keeping the Holocaust in a Narrow Jewish Ghetto	218
	Concluding Remarks	223
	<b>Part III Scoop on the Past</b>	225
	The Mediation of a National Identity	227
	The Media as an Interpretative Memory Community	228
6	Never Forget and Never Again	235
	The Israeli Media Landscape and the Holocaust: A Brief Overview	237
	Holocaust Memorial Day: A Ritualized Media Event	242
	“ <i>Our Holocaust</i> ”: The Holocaust as a Common Destiny	243
	Addressing the Holocaust at Every Chance: Daily Holocaust Mediation	258
	The Holocaust as a National Trauma: Evoking the Ongoing Threat	261
	Concluding Remarks	267
7	Preserving the Past, Mobilizing the Past	269
	The Historic Palestinian Media Landscape	274
	The Emergence of a Mobilized Palestinian Press	277



Contents	ix
Exposing the Nakba as a Historical Event: A Land with a People	280
Preserving the Past for Future Generations: The Media as a Prospective Memory Realm	285
The Nakba as a Present Continuous: Nakba Mediation Inside the 1948 Borders	288
Mobilizing the Past: Nakba Mediation in East Jerusalem and the West Bank	291
Concluding Remarks	302
Conclusion	304
The Ongoing Nakba	304
The “Never Again” State of Israel	306
The Victims of the Victims	307
A Hidden Memory	308
The Research Findings and Their Application	310
<i>Bibliography</i>	315
<i>Index</i>	371

## Figures

---

4.1 Zochrot's return to al-Ruways	<i>page</i> 170
4.2 Lifta – the “long-abandoned village”	175
4.3 The March of Return to Safuriye	178
4.4 Nakba commemoration at ‘Aida refugee camp’s “Return Gate”	183
4.5 Israeli soldiers stand guard during Hebron’s 2010 Nakba Day Rally	185
5.1 Guarding the ghetto fighters’ legacy	201
5.2 The entrance to Yad Mordechai	206
5.3 The architecture of redemption	214
6.1 Prospective mediation	244
6.2 Holocaust media symbolism	245
6.3 “Our Holocaust”	248
6.4 Israel as the redemptive answer to the Holocaust	254
6.5 Pain which has no end	257
7.1 The Nakba as a mediated commemoration	282
7.2 Preserving the Nakba for future generations	287
7.3 The key and the dream of a return	295
7.4 Holding on to the national goals	300

## Tables

---

2.1 Non-Jewish victims of Nazi persecution	<i>page</i> 86
2.2 Analyzed textbooks in the Israeli school system	87
3.1 The Palestinian textbook production plan	127
3.2 Examined Palestinian textbooks in the Palestinian school system	130

## Acknowledgments

---

The realization of this work would not have been possible without the support of several individuals and organizations; they are, therefore, directly responsible for any merits this book might be deemed to possess. I would like to thank *Het Prins Bernhard Cultuurfonds*, *The Anglo-Israeli Foundation*, *The Sir Richard Stapley Educational Trust*, *The Council for British Research in the Levant*, and *The University of Oxford* for their generous financial assistance in the execution of my research. I am also grateful to my editors at Cambridge University Press: Daniel Brown, Atifa Jiwa, and, at the preliminary and final stages, Maria Marsh for overseeing the transformation of this work from doctoral thesis to academic manuscript. As the culmination of a six-year project, this work benefited from the input and counsel of many individuals. In Jerusalem, Dalia Kerstein assisted me in scouring Israeli and Palestinian phone books and, perhaps more importantly, provided me with steadfast company during my explorations of the city's culinary scene. From Oxford and, subsequently, Oklahoma, Andrew Porwancher offered continual encouragement as I completed my doctoral work and embarked on this book project. My sincere gratitude also goes out to my colleagues and academic mentors who helped me during various stages of the project and whose names – and influence – are interspersed throughout this work. In particular, I would like to convey my utmost appreciation to my doctoral supervisors: Professor Eugene Rogan and Dr. Zoe Waxman. Their intellectual guidance during my time in Oxford, in addition to their consistent positive reinforcement during our many meetings, allowed me to bring this project to successful fruition. This work equally benefited from the input of several academics who provided critical insight during the research and writing process; I would like to thank Professor Avi Shlaim, Professor Nicholas Stargardt, Professor Walter Armbrust, Professor Gilbert Achcar, and Professor Yaacov Yadgar for offering their time and feedback. Finally, I would like to thank my family and my partner for their unwavering support – both in person and from afar.

## A Note on Transliteration

---

For transliteration of Modern Standard Arabic and Hebrew, this work follows the American Library Association-Library of Congress System<sup>1</sup> with two exceptions: First, where established English names of people, places, and institutions exist, English-language spelling is applied and, second, this work uses “tz” rather than “ts” for the Hebrew letter tzadi. For the list of characters of Modern Standard Arabic and Hebrew, see below.

### Arabic

<i>Consonants</i>	<i>Romanization</i>	<i>Consonants</i>	<i>Romanization</i>
ا	omit	ض	ḍ
ب	b	ط	ṭ
ت	t	ظ	ẓ
ث	th	ع	‘ (ayn)
ج	j	غ	gh
ح	ḥ	ف	f
خ	kh	ق	q
د	d	ك	k
ذ	dh	ل	l
ر	r	م	m
ز	z	ن	n
س	s	ه، هـ	h
ش	sh	و	w
ص	ṣ	ي	y

<sup>1</sup> Randall K. Barry, *ALA-LX Romanization Tables: Transliteration Schemes for Non-Roman Scripts* (Washington, DC: U.S. Library of Congress, 1991), 4, 52.

xiv A Note on Transliteration

Vowels	Diphthongs
ﺍ	a
ﻭ	u
ﻯ	i
ﺍَ	ā
ﺍِ	á
ﻭُ	ū
ﻭِ	ī
ﺍﻭ	aw
ﺍﻯ	ay

### Hebrew

Consonants	Romanization	Consonants	Romanization
א	' (alif) or disregarded	ל	l
ב	b	מ (final ם)	m
בּ	v	נ (final ן)	n
ג	g	ס	s
ד	d	ע	' (ayn)
ה	h	פ (final ף)	p
ו	v̄ (only if a consonant)	פ (final ף)	f
וו	v̄ (only if a consonant)	צ (final ץ)	tz
ז	z	ק	k
ח	ḥ	ך	
ט	ṭ		sh
י		שׁ	ś
כ (final ך)	k	ת	t
כּ (final ך)		ת	t

## A Note on Transliteration

xv

Vowels	Romanization
·	a
·	a or o
·	e
·	e
·	i
·	o
·	u
·	e
·	ai
·	e
·	i
·	o
·	u
·	e or disregarded
·	a
·	e
·	o

## Abbreviations

---

ADRID	Association for the Defense of the Rights of the Internally Displaced
AMAN	Coalition for Accountability and Integrity
CMIP	Center for Monitoring the Impact of Peace
CPJ	Committee to Protect Journalists
DFLP	Democratic Front for the Liberation of Palestine
DOP	Declaration of Principles on Interim Self-Government Arrangements
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
ICC	International Criminal Court
IDF	Israeli Defense Forces
IDP	internally displaced Palestinian
JNF	Jewish National Fund
MDHH	Memorial Day to the Holocaust and Heroism
MEMRI	Middle East Media Research Institute
MK	Member of Knesset
MOE	Ministry of Education
NGO	nongovernmental organization
NSC	Nakba and Steadfastness Committee
OT	occupied territories
PA	Palestinian Authority
PCBS	Palestinian Central Bureau for Statics
PCDC	Palestinian Curriculum Development Center
PDFLP	Popular Democratic Front for the Liberation of Palestine
PFLP	Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine
PLC	Palestinian Legislative Council
PLO	Palestinian Liberation Organization
PMW	Palestinian Media Watch
PNA	Palestinian National Authority
PNC	Palestinian National Council



## List of Abbreviations

xvii

POW	prisoner of war
PPP	Palestinian People's Party
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNRWA	United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East
USHMM	United States Holocaust Memorial Museum