

## TOWERING JUDGES

In *Towering Judges: A Comparative Study of Constitutional Judges*, Rehan Abeyratne and Iddo Porat lead an exploration of a new topic in comparative constitutional law: towering judges. The volume examines the work of nineteen judges from fourteen jurisdictions, each of whom stood out individually among their fellow judges and had a unique impact on the trajectory of constitutional law. The chapters ask: what makes a towering judge; what are the background conditions that foster or deter the rise of towering judges; are towering judges, on balance, positive or detrimental for constitutional systems; how do towering judges differ from one jurisdiction to another; how do political and historical developments relate to this phenomenon; and how does all of this fit within global constitutionalism? The answers to these questions offer important insight into how these judges were able to shine to an uncommon degree in a profession where individualism is not always looked on favourably.

Rehan Abeyratne is an associate professor of law and the executive director of the Centre for Comparative and Transnational Law at the Chinese University of Hong Kong. His research focuses on comparative constitutional law. His published works have appeared in leading peer-reviewed journals and in edited volumes from Cambridge University Press and other scholarly publishers.

Iddo Porat is an associate professor of law at the College of Law and Business, Israel. He specialises in constitutional law, comparative constitutional law and legal theory. His books include *Proportionality and Constitutional Culture* (with Moshe Cohen-Eliya; Cambridge University Press, 2013).

## COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW AND POLICY

### *Series Editors*

Tom Ginsburg *University of Chicago*  
 Zachary Elkins *University of Texas at Austin*  
 Ran Hirschl *University of Toronto*

Comparative constitutional law is an intellectually vibrant field that encompasses an increasingly broad array of approaches and methodologies. This series collects analytically innovative and empirically grounded work from scholars of comparative constitutionalism across academic disciplines. Books in the series include theoretically informed studies of single constitutional jurisdictions, comparative studies of constitutional law and institutions, and edited collections of original essays that respond to challenging theoretical and empirical questions in the field.

### *Books in the Series*

*Redrafting Constitutions in Democratic Orders: Theoretical and Comparative Perspectives* Edited by Gabriel L. Negretto

*From Parchment to Practice: Implementing New Constitutions* Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Z. Huq

*The Failure of Popular Constitution Making in Turkey: Regressing Towards Constitutional Autocracy* Edited by Felix Petersen and Zeynep Yanaymuyan

*A Qualified Hope: The Indian Supreme Court and Progressive Social Change* Edited by Gerald N. Rosenberg, Sudhir Krishnaswamy and Shishir Bail

*Constitutions in Times of Financial Crisis* Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Mark D. Rosen, Georg Vanberg

*Reconstructing Rights: Courts, Parties, and Equality Rights in India, South Africa, and the United States* Stephan Stohler

*Constitution-Making and Transnational Legal Order* Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Terence C. Halliday and Gregory Shaffer

*Hybrid Constitutionalism: The Politics of Constitutional Review in the Chinese Special Administrative Regions* Eric C. Ip

*The Politico-Legal Dynamics of Judicial Review: A Comparative Analysis* Theunis Roux

*The Invisible Constitution in Comparative Perspective* Edited by Rosalind Dixon and Adrienne Stone

*Constitutional Courts in Asia: A Comparative Perspective* Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen and Andrew Harding

*Judicial Review in Norway: A Bicentennial Debate* Anine Kierulf

*Constituent Assemblies* Edited by Jon Elster, Roberto Gargarella, Vatsal Naresh, and Bjorn Erik Rasch

*The DNA of Constitutional Justice in Latin America: Politics, Governance, and Judicial Design* Daniel M. Brinks and Abby Blass

*The Adventures of the Constituent Power: Beyond Revolutions?* Andrew Arato

*Constitutions, Religion and Politics in Asia: Indonesia, Malaysia and Sri Lanka* Dian A. H. Shah

*Canada in the World: Comparative Perspectives on the Canadian Constitution* Edited by Richard Albert and David R. Cameron

*Courts and Democracies in Asia* Po Jen Yap

- Proportionality: New Frontiers, New Challenges* Edited by Vicki C. Jackson and Mark Tushnet
- Constituents before Assembly: Participation, Deliberation, and Representation in the Crafting of New Constitutions* Todd A. Eisenstadt, A. Carl LeVan, and Tofiq Maboudi
- Assessing Constitutional Performance* Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Huq
- Buddhism, Politics and the Limits of Law: The Pyrrhic Constitutionalism of Sri Lanka*  
Benjamin Schonthal
- Engaging with Social Rights: Procedure, Participation and Democracy in South Africa's Second Wave* Brian Ray
- Constitutional Courts As Mediators: Armed Conflict, Civil-Military Relations, and the Rule of Law in Latin America* Julio Ríos-Figueroa
- Perils of Judicial Self-Government in Transitional Societies* David Kosař
- Making We the People: Democratic Constitutional Founding in Postwar Japan and South Korea*  
Chaihark Hahm and Sung Ho Kim
- Radical Deprivation on Trial: The Impact of Judicial Activism on Socioeconomic Rights in the Global South* César Rodríguez-Garavito and Diana Rodríguez-Franco
- Unstable Constitutionalism: Law and Politics in South Asia* Edited by Mark Tushnet and Madhav Khosla
- Magna Carta and Its Modern Legacy* Edited by Robert Hazell and James Melton
- Constitutions and Religious Freedom* Frank B. Cross
- International Courts and the Performance of International Agreements: A General Theory with Evidence from the European Union* Clifford J. Carrubba and Matthew J. Gabel
- Reputation and Judicial Tactics: A Theory of National and International Courts* Shai Dothan
- Social Difference and Constitutionalism in Pan-Asia* Edited by Susan H. Williams
- Constitutionalism in Asia in the Early Twenty-First Century* Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen
- Constitutions in Authoritarian Regimes* Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Alberto Simpser
- Presidential Legislation in India: The Law and Practice of Ordinances* Shubhankar Dam
- Social and Political Foundations of Constitutions* Edited by Denis J. Galligan and Mila Versteeg
- Consequential Courts: Judicial Roles in Global Perspective* Edited by Diana Kapiszewski, Gordon Silverstein, and Robert A. Kagan
- Comparative Constitutional Design* Edited by Tom Ginsburg

# Towering Judges

A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF CONSTITUTIONAL  
JUDGES

Edited by

**REHAN ABEYRATNE**

The Chinese University of Hong Kong

**IDDO PORAT**

College of Law and Business, Israel



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-108-79414-5 — Towering Judges  
Edited by Rehan Abeyratne, Iddo Porat  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108794145](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108794145)

DOI: 10.1017/9781108879194

© Cambridge University Press 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

First paperback edition 2022

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

NAMES: Abeyratne, Rehan, author. | Porat, Iddo, author.

TITLE: Towering judges : a comparative study of constitutional judges / edited by Rehan Abeyratne, The Chinese University of Hong Kong; Iddo Porat, College of Law and Business (Israel).

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Series: Comparative constitutional law and policy | Includes index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2020028702 (print) | LCCN 2020028703 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108840217 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108879194 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Judges. | Constitutional courts. | Constitutional law.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC K3367 .A24 2021 (print) | LCC K3367 (ebook) | DDC 347/.03534-dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020028702>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020028703>

ISBN 978-1-108-84021-7 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-79414-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-108-79414-5 — Towering Judges  
Edited by Rehan Abeyratne , Iddo Porat  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

For Anna and Eila – Rehan Abeyratne  
For my Natalie – Iddo Porat

## Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page xi</i>
<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>xii</i>
<b>Introduction: Towering Judges – A Conceptual and Comparative Analysis</b>	<b>1</b>
Rehan Abeyratne and Iddo Porat	
<b>1 Towering Judges and Global Constitutionalism</b>	<b>21</b>
Iddo Porat	
<b>2 The Landscapes that Towering Judges Tower Over</b>	<b>40</b>
Mark Tushnet	
<b>3 Sir Anthony Mason: Towering Over the High Court of Australia</b>	<b>56</b>
Gabrielle Appleby and Andrew Lynch	
<b>4 Lady Hale: A Feminist Towering Judge</b>	<b>78</b>
Rosemary Hunter and Erika Rackley	
<b>5 Hugh Kennedy: Ireland’s (Quietly) Towering Nation-Maker</b>	<b>96</b>
Tom Gerald Daly	
<b>6 Judicial Rhetoric of a Liberal Polity: Hong Kong, 1997–2012</b>	<b>117</b>
CL Lim	
<b>7 Judicial Minimalism as Towering: Singapore’s Chief Justice Chan Sek Keong</b>	<b>134</b>
Jaclyn L Neo and Kevin YL Tan	

x	<i>Contents</i>	
8	<b>Nepal’s Most Towering Judge: The Honourable Kalyan Shrestha</b> Mara Malagodi	155
9	<b>Barak’s Legal Revolutions and What Remains of Them: Authoritarian Abuse of the Judiciary-Empowerment Revolution in Israel</b> Alon Harel	174
10	<b>PN Bhagwati and the Transformation of India’s Judiciary</b> Rehan Abeyratne	195
11	<b>Justice Cepeda’s Institution-Building on the Colombian Constitutional Court: A Fusion of the Political and the Legal</b> David Landau	215
12	<b>A Towering but Modest Judicial Figure: The Case of Arthur Chaskalson</b> Dennis M Davis	236
13	<b>Chief Justice Sólyom and the Paradox of “Revolution under the Rule of Law”</b> Gábor Attila Tóth	255
14	<b>The Socialist Model of Individual Judicial Powers</b> Bui Ngoc Son	275
15	<b>The Civil Law Tradition, the Pinochet Constitution, and Judge Eugenio Valenzuela</b> Sergio Verdugo	290
16	<b>Towering versus Collegial Judges: A Comparative Reflection</b> Rosalind Dixon	308
	<i>Appendix</i>	330
	<i>Index</i>	331



## Acknowledgements

We first developed the idea for this book over a coffee at Melbourne Law School in 2017, when we were both visiting scholars. We are grateful to Melbourne Law School for hosting us and providing us with the opportunity to meet. The Chinese University of Hong Kong Faculty of Law organised a conference on Towering Judges in early 2019 from which this book emerged. We thank CUHK LAW for funding the travel and accommodation of all our contributors and for hosting the conference in its Graduate Law Centre. We are grateful to our contributors for their patience, creativity and willingness to fit their research into our framework. We feel very fortunate to have worked with such a strong group of comparative constitutional law scholars. Ran Hirschl expressed initial enthusiasm for this project and worked with us on the book proposal, which he generously considered for his co-edited series on Comparative Constitutional Law and Policy. We thank him, Tom Ginsburg and Zachary Elkins for including this book in that series. Finally, we thank the editors at Cambridge University Press for their hard work in getting this volume into publishable shape.

## Contributors

**Rehan ABEYRATNE** is an associate professor of law and the executive director of the Centre for Comparative and Transnational Law at the Chinese University of Hong Kong.

**Gabrielle APPLEBY** is a professor and director of the Judiciary Project, Gilbert + Tobin Centre of Public Law, University of New South Wales Faculty of Law.

**BUI Ngoc Son** is an assistant professor of law at the Chinese University of Hong Kong.

**Tom Gerald DALY** is an associate professor and deputy director of the Melbourne School of Government and an associate director of the Edinburgh Centre for Constitutional Law.

**Dennis M DAVIS** is Judge President of the Competition Appeal Court of South Africa.

**Rosalind DIXON** is a professor of law and director of the Gilbert + Tobin Centre of Public Law, University of New South Wales Faculty of Law.

**Alon HAREL** is the Phillip and Estelle Mizock Chair in Administrative and Criminal Law at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem Faculty of Law.

**Rosemary HUNTER** is Professor of Law and Socio-Legal Studies at Kent Law School, University of Kent.

**David LANDAU** is the Mason Ladd Professor and Associate Dean for International Programs at Florida State University College of Law.

**CL LIM** is the Choh-Ming Li Professor of Law at the Chinese University of Hong Kong; Hon. Senior Fellow, BIICL, and Visiting Professor, King's College, London.

**Andrew LYNCH** is a professor at the Gilbert + Tobin Centre of Public Law, University of New South Wales Faculty of Law.

*List of Contributors*

xiii

**Mara MALAGODI** is an assistant professor of law at the Chinese University of Hong Kong.

**Jaelyn L NEO** is an associate professor at the National University of Singapore Faculty of Law.

**Iddo PORAT** is an associate professor at the College of Law and Business, Israel.

**Erika RACKLEY** is a professor of law at Kent Law School, University of Kent.

**Kevin YL TAN** is an adjunct professor at the Faculty of Law, National University of Singapore and a professor at the S Rajaratnam School of International Studies, Nanyang Technological University.

**Gábor Attila TÓTH** is the Alexander von Humboldt Senior Fellow at Humboldt University, Berlin.

**Mark TUSHNET** is the William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law Emeritus at Harvard Law School.

**Sergio VERDUGO** is an associate professor of law at Universidad del Desarrollo, Chile.