

THE VEIL OF PARTICIPATION

Public participation is a vital part of constitution-making processes around the world, but we know very little about the extent to which participation affects constitutional texts. In this book, Alexander Hudson offers a systematic measurement of the impact of public participation in three much-cited cases – Brazil, South Africa, and Iceland – and introduces a theory of party-mediated public participation. He argues that public participation has limited potential to affect the constitutional text but that the effectiveness of participation varies with the political context. Party strength is the key factor, as strong political parties are unlikely to incorporate public input, while weaker parties are comparatively more responsive to public input. This party-mediation thesis fundamentally challenges the contemporary consensus on the design of constitution-making processes and places new emphasis on the role of political parties.

Dr. Alexander Hudson is a Research Fellow in the Comparative Constitutionalism Fellow Group at the Max Planck Institute for the Study of Religious and Ethnic Diversity. His research focuses on the role of citizens in processes of constitutional change, including participatory drafting processes, referendums, and crowdsourcing.

COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW AND POLICY

Series Editors

Tom Ginsburg, *University of Chicago*
 Zachary Elkins, *University of Texas at Austin*
 Ran Hirschl, *University of Toronto*

Comparative constitutional law is an intellectually vibrant field that encompasses an increasingly broad array of approaches and methodologies. This series collects analytically innovative and empirically grounded work from scholars of comparative constitutionalism across academic disciplines. Books in the series include theoretically informed studies of single constitutional jurisdictions, comparative studies of constitutional law and institutions, and edited collections of original essays that respond to challenging theoretical and empirical questions in the field.

Books in the Series

Redrafting Constitutions in Democratic Orders: Theoretical and Comparative Perspectives

Edited by Gabriel L. Negretto

From Parchment to Practice: Implementing New Constitutions

Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Z. Huq

The Failure of Popular Constitution Making in Turkey: Regressing Towards Constitutional Autocracy

Edited by Felix Petersen and Zeynep Yanaşmayan

A Qualified Hope: The Indian Supreme Court and Progressive Social Change

Edited by Gerald N. Rosenberg, Sudhir Krishnaswamy and Shishir Bail

Constitutions in Times of Financial Crisis

Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Mark D. Rosen and Georg Vanberg

Reconstructing Rights: Courts, Parties, and Equality Rights in India, South Africa, and the United States

Stephan Stohler

Constitution-Making and Transnational Legal Order

Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Terence C. Halliday and Gregory Shaffer

Hybrid Constitutionalism: The Politics of Constitutional Review in the Chinese Special Administrative Regions

Eric C. Ip

The Politico-Legal Dynamics of Judicial Review: A Comparative Analysis

Theunis Roux

The Invisible Constitution in Comparative Perspective

Edited by Rosalind Dixon and Adrienne Stone

Constitutional Courts in Asia: A Comparative Perspective

Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen and Andrew Harding

Judicial Review in Norway: A Bicentennial Debate

Anine Kierulf

Constituent Assemblies

Edited by Jon Elster, Roberto Gargarella, Vatsal Naresh, and Bjorn Erik Rasch

The DNA of Constitutional Justice in Latin America: Politics, Governance, and Judicial Design
Daniel M. Brinks and Abby Blass

The Adventures of the Constituent Power: Beyond Revolutions?
Andrew Arato

Constitutions, Religion and Politics in Asia: Indonesia, Malaysia and Sri Lanka
Dian A. H. Shah

Canada in the World: Comparative Perspectives on the Canadian Constitution
Edited by Richard Albert and David R. Cameron

Courts and Democracies in Asia
Po Jen Yap

Proportionality: New Frontiers, New Challenges
Edited by Vicki C. Jackson and Mark Tushnet

Constituents before Assembly: Participation, Deliberation, and Representation in the Crafting of New Constitutions
Todd A. Eisenstadt, A. Carl LeVan, and Tofigh Maboudi

Assessing Constitutional Performance
Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Huq

Buddhism, Politics and the Limits of Law: The Pyrrhic Constitutionalism of Sri Lanka
Benjamin Schonthal

Engaging with Social Rights: Procedure, Participation and Democracy in South Africa's Second Wave
Brian Ray

Constitutional Courts As Mediators: Armed Conflict, Civil-Military Relations, and the Rule of Law in Latin America
Julio Ríos-Figueroa

Perils of Judicial Self-Government in Transitional Societies
David Kosař

Making We the People: Democratic Constitutional Founding in Postwar Japan and South Korea
Chaihark Hahm and Sung Ho Kim

Radical Deprivation on Trial: The Impact of Judicial Activism on Socioeconomic Rights in the Global South
César Rodríguez-Garavito and Diana Rodríguez-Franco

Unstable Constitutionalism: Law and Politics in South Asia
Edited by Mark Tushnet and Madhav Khosla

Magna Carta and Its Modern Legacy
Edited by Robert Hazell and James Melton

Constitutions and Religious Freedom
Frank B. Cross

International Courts and the Performance of International Agreements: A General Theory with Evidence from the European Union
Clifford J. Carrubba and Matthew J. Gabel

Reputation and Judicial Tactics: A Theory of National and International Courts
Shai Dothan

Social Difference and Constitutionalism in Pan-Asia
Edited by Susan H. Williams

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-79351-3 — The Veil of Participation
Alexander Hudson
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Constitutionalism in Asia in the Early Twenty-First Century

Edited by Albert H. Y. Chen

Constitutions in Authoritarian Regimes

Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Alberto Simpser

Presidential Legislation in India: The Law and Practice of Ordinances

Shubhankar Dam

Social and Political Foundations of Constitutions

Edited by Denis J. Galligan and Mila Versteeg

Consequential Courts: Judicial Roles in Global Perspective

Edited by Diana Kapiszewski, Gordon Silverstein, and Robert A. Kagan

Comparative Constitutional Design

Edited by Tom Ginsburg

Towering Judges

Edited by Rehan Abeyratne and Iddo Porat

The Veil of Participation

CITIZENS AND POLITICAL PARTIES IN CONSTITUTION-MAKING PROCESSES

ALEXANDER HUDSON

Max Planck Institute (Göttingen, Germany)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-108-79351-3 — The Veil of Participation
 Alexander Hudson
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108793513

DOI: 10.1017/9781108878685

© Alexander Hudson 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2021

First paperback edition 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

NAMES: Hudson, Alexander, author.

TITLE: The veil of participation : citizens and political parties in constitution-making processes / Alexander Hudson, Comparative Constitutionalism Fellow Group, Max Planck Institute for the Study of Religious and Ethnic Diversity.

DESCRIPTION: [New York] : [Cambridge University Press], 2021. | Series: CCLP comparative constitutional law and policy | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2020047392 (print) | LCCN 2020047393 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108840071 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108793513 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108878685 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Constitutions. | Constitutional law | Political participation. | Political parties – Law and legislation. | Legislation – Citizen participation.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC K3165 .H783 2021 (print) | LCC K3165 (ebook) | DDC 342.02–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2020047392>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2020047393>

ISBN 978-1-108-84007-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-79351-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-79351-3 — The Veil of Participation
Alexander Hudson
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To Isobel

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> xi
<i>List of Tables</i>	xii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 The Public Face of Constitution-Making	1
1.2 Why Is a Study of Participation Important?	3
1.3 What This Book Does	6
1.4 Outline of the Book	8
2 Theoretical Foundations of Participatory Drafting	12
2.1 Introduction	12
2.2 Party-Mediated Political Participation	12
2.3 Constitution-Making and Political Parties	14
2.4 Questions of Legitimacy and Efficacy	27
2.5 The Theory Revisited	36
3 South Africa: Party Domination	39
3.1 Introduction	39
3.2 Historical Background	41
3.3 Drafting the Final Constitution	49
3.4 Analysis of the Drafting Process	59
3.5 In the Words of the Drafters	65
3.6 The Constitutional Principles as a Limiting Factor	75
3.7 Conclusion	77
4 Brazil: Citizen Entrepreneurs	79
4.1 Introduction	79
4.2 Historical Background	81
4.3 The National Constituent Assembly	84

4.4	Popular Participation – Individuals	87
4.5	Popular Participation – Groups	97
4.6	Polling Data	103
4.7	In the Words of the Drafters	105
4.8	A Natural Experiment in Brazil: The Afonso Arinos Draft	108
4.9	Conclusion	111
5	Iceland: Citizen Drafters	113
5.1	Introduction	113
5.2	Impetus for Reform: Economic Crisis	114
5.3	The Drafting Process in Iceland	115
5.4	Measuring Participation	120
5.5	Data and Methods	120
5.6	Assessing the Impact of Participation	122
5.7	Statistical Analysis	127
5.8	Why Did the Drafters Give Effect to Proposals from the Public?	132
5.9	A Failed Constitutional Revolution?	134
5.10	Conclusion	136
6	Cross-National Analysis	138
6.1	Introduction	138
6.2	Comprehensive Cross-National Analysis	139
6.3	Qualitative Assessment of Selected Cases	145
6.4	Conclusion	174
7	Public Participation in Constitution-Making Reconsidered	175
7.1	Introduction	175
7.2	Reviewing the Evidence	176
7.3	Broader Implications	178
7.4	Guidance for Constitution Makers	186
	<i>Appendices</i>	189
	<i>Bibliography</i>	198
	<i>Index</i>	219

Figures

3.1	South Africa timeline	<i>page</i> 50
4.1	Brazil timeline	82
5.1	Iceland timeline	116
5.2	Public participation over time	118
5.3	Marginal effects, Model 1	132
6.1	Point estimates (Models 1–4)	144
6.2	Interaction between participation and party strength (Model 4)	145

Tables

2.1	Institutional arrangements, 1974–2014 ($N=254$)	<i>page</i> 17
2.2	Institutional arrangements and participation, 1974–2014 ($N=146$)	21
3.1	Partisan composition of the Constitutional Assembly	50
3.2	Shared text with the 1996 constitution	60
4.1	The constitutional drafts	84
4.2	Parties in the Brazilian Constituent Assembly (Feb 1987)	85
4.3	Degrees of pattern matching	91
4.4	Degree of shared text	91
4.5	Profiles of SAIC follow-up respondents	94
5.1	Distribution of topics in substantive comments	123
5.2	Simplified topics in substantive proposals	127
5.3	Probit estimates	130
5.4	Marginal effects for Model 1 and Model 4	131
5.5	Election results	135
6.1	Distribution of novel rights in national constitutions	141
6.2	Regression models: Inclusion of novel rights	143
6.3	Case selection and party strength	146
A1	Gender of SAIC participants	189
A2	Ages of SAIC participants	189
A3	Occupations of SAIC participants	190
A4	Education level of SAIC participants	190
A5	Income level of SAIC participants	190
A6	Residences of SAIC participants	191
A7	Geographical distribution of SAIC submissions	191
A8	Changes in drafts in response to submissions from the public	192
A9	Distribution of topics in public comments	194
A10	Distribution of topics in Facebook comment threads	195
A11	Statistical models with expanded topics	196
A12	Summary statistics, Models 1–4	197

Acknowledgments

In conducting this research across a number of years and four continents, I have relied on the help of a great many people. In some cases I sought them out, in others, they gave me help I did not even realize I needed. Without a doubt, this book would not have been started or finished without the investments that a host of people have made in my life and work.

I must first thank Zachary Elkins, who encouraged me to pursue this field of research during my graduate work at the University of Texas at Austin. I am incredibly grateful to him for giving me opportunities and guidance, and for his encouragement and generosity throughout my years in Austin. I am also deeply grateful to a number of other members of the Department of Government at the University of Texas at Austin who supported the research behind much of this book, most notably Daniel Brinks, Gary Jacobsohn, Sanford Levinson, and Christopher Wlezien. Many of my classmates in Texas were important to the early stages of this work, and I especially thank Robert Shaffer, Joseph Amick, Christina Bambrick, Thomas Bell, Joseph Cozza, Jacob Dizard, Connor Ewing, and Kyle Shen for their contributions to my research.

After leaving Texas, I was incredibly lucky to find a new home at the Max Planck Institute for the Study of Religious and Ethnic Diversity in Göttingen, Germany. This wonderful community of scholars has supported my research and challenged me in many ways. In particular I would like to thank Ayelet Shachar and the Department of Ethics, Law, and Politics for their support in ways large and small. Thanks to Elisabeth Badenhop, Ali Emre Benli, Benjamin Boudou, Derek Denman, Marie-Eve Loiselle, Marieke Riedel, Samuel David Schmid, Martijn van den Brink, and Barbara von Rütte for their comradeship and encouragement.

I am profoundly grateful to Ran Hirschl for all he has done for scholarship in comparative constitutionalism and for me personally. His books were an inspiration to me when I first began to study comparative public law, and it has been my great good fortune to be able to work with him these past two years. He has been an

exceptional mentor and a generous friend. Moreover, the scholarly community he created in Göttingen (and now beyond) has been a wonderful resource. Thanks to Anna Fruhstorfer, Berihun Adugna Gebeye, Lisa Harms, Michael Hein, Eugénie Mérieau, and Mariana Velasco Rivera for their many contributions to this book.

The research reported here has also benefited from comments and questions raised during presentations at a number of conferences. Of particular note are panels at “Democracy Beyond Elections,” University of Bristol Law School, 2017; Melbourne Institute of Comparative Constitutional Law, University of Melbourne, 2018; “Political Parties, Partisanship, and the Constitution,” University of Oxford, 2019; “Political Parties and Deliberative Practices,” ECPR Joint Sessions of Workshops, 2019; Political Studies Association Annual Meeting, 2019; Canadian Political Science Association Annual Conference, 2019; and the American Political Science Association Annual Meeting, 2019.

I am grateful to the following journals for permission to reprint material previously published in the following articles: “When Does Public Participation Make a Difference? Evidence From Iceland’s Crowdsourced Constitution,” *Policy & Internet* 10(2) (2018), 185–217; and “Political Parties and Public Participation in Constitution Making: Legitimation, Distraction, or Real Impact?,” *Comparative Politics* 53(3) (2021).

My research in Brazil was supported both morally and financially by my association with the Fundação Getúlio Vargas. Thanks especially to Pedro Cantisano, Daniel Chada, Ivar Hartmann, Eduardo Magrani, Greg Michener, Michael Mohallem, Thomaz Perreira, and Diego Werneck for being kind and helpful colleagues, and to Joaquim Falcão and Eduardo Jordão for the opportunity to visit FGV. Relatedly, I thank my research assistants at FGV, Pedro Amaro, João Vítor, and Gabriel Mesquita for making a large dataset useful. Thanks also to Elizete Ignácio dos Santos and Thamires de Lima Silva at Clave de Fá Pesquisa e Projetos for working hard to locate and interview contributors to the SAIC database. In Brasília, I also thank Carlos Oliveira, who was vital to the collection of data for this project.

My research in South Africa was made possible by institutional support from the University of Cape Town. I am grateful to the Department of Public Law at the University of Cape Town for officially hosting me. I especially wish to thank Elrena van der Spuy, Pierre de Vos, Robert Mattes, and Hugh Corder for their assistance in various ways. I also thank the many kind people at the National Archives of South Africa and Parliament of South Africa for making me feel welcome in their wonderful country, and assisting me with this research.

The field research behind this book was financed by fellowships from the University of Texas at Austin, and the Fundação Getúlio Vargas, Escola de Direito do Rio de Janeiro, and also by National Science Foundation through Grant No. SES-1535665. I am grateful to these institutions for their investment in my work.

Acknowledgments

xv

At Cambridge University Press, I thank editor Matt Gallaway and editorial assistant Cameron Daddis. I am also grateful to the anonymous reviewers for their insights and suggestions.

My family has also supported the writing of this book in their own ways. My children, Isobel, John, and Richard, have had an unconventional and challenging first few years of life with a father who was researching, writing, and toting them around half the world. I thank them for their patience and love and for giving me a reason to keep smiling even on the days when the writing was hard and the data were inscrutable. My wife, Marianna, has put up with a lot and sacrificed a great deal for me to complete this book. Moreover, I am grateful to her for reading and commenting on the manuscript. I could never repay her for all she has done.