

**PLATO'S *PHAEDO***

Plato's *Phaedo* is a literary gem that develops many of Plato's most famous ideas. David Ebrey's careful reinterpretation argues that the many debates about the dialogue cannot be resolved so long as we consider its passages in relative isolation from one another, separated from their intellectual background. His book shows how Plato responds to his literary, religious, scientific, and philosophical context, and argues that we can understand the dialogue's central ideas and arguments only in light of its overall structure. This approach yields new interpretations of the dialogue's key ideas, including the nature and existence of "Platonic" forms, the existence of the soul after death, the method of hypothesis, and the contemplative ethical ideal. Moreover, this comprehensive approach shows how the characters play an integral role in the *Phaedo*'s development and how its literary structure complements Socrates' views while making its own distinctive contribution to the dialogue's drama and ideas.

DAVID EBREY is Serra Hünter Fellow at the University of Barcelona. He has co-edited (with Richard Kraut) the *Cambridge Companion to Plato* (2022), edited *Theory and Practice in Aristotle's Natural Science* (2015), and published articles on a variety of topics in Plato and Aristotle.

# Plato's *Phaedo*

FORMS, DEATH, AND THE PHILOSOPHICAL LIFE

**DAVID EBREY**

University of Barcelona



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press &amp; Assessment

978-1-108-79099-4 — Plato's Phaedo

David Ebrey

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,  
a department of the University of Cambridge.We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of  
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108790994](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108790994)

DOI: 10.1017/9781108787475

© Cambridge University Press &amp; Assessment 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions  
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take  
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

First paperback edition 2024

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library**Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data*

NAMES: Ebrey, David, 1978– author.

TITLE: Plato's Phaedo : forms, death, and the philosophical life / David Ebrey,  
Universitat de Barcelona.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2022. |

Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2022025741 (print) | LCCN 2022025742 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108479943 (hardback) |

ISBN 9781108790994 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108787475 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Plato. Phaedo. | BISAC: PHILOSOPHY / History &amp; Surveys / Ancient &amp; Classical

CLASSIFICATION: LCC B379 .E27 2022 (print) | LCC B379 (ebook) | DDC 184–dc23/eng/20220708

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022025741>LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022025742>

ISBN 978-1-108-47994-3 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-79099-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence  
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this  
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will  
remain, accurate or appropriate.

*To my parents*

# Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page xi</i>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
A Brief Overview of the Dialogue	8
<b>1 The Characters</b>	<b>12</b>
1.1 <i>Phaedo</i>	13
1.2 Plato and Other Socratics	15
1.3 Simmias and Cebes, Philolaus and Pythagoreanism	17
1.4 Socrates	22
1.5 Conclusion	27
<b>2 The <i>Phaedo</i> as an Alternative to Tragedy and Socrates as a Poet: 57a–61c</b>	<b>28</b>
2.1 The <i>Phaedo</i> 's Engagement with Tragedy	29
2.2 Socrates as a True Hero	35
2.3 The <i>Phaedo</i> as a Story of Gods, Heroes, and the Underworld	38
2.4 The Action of the Dialogue and Tragic Drama	42
2.5 An Aesop Fable about Pleasure and Pain: 60b–c	47
2.6 Socrates as Interpreter of Dreams: 60c–61b	52
2.7 Conclusion	53
<b>3 Defense of the Desire to Be Dead: 61c–69e</b>	<b>54</b>
3.1 The Argument against Suicide: 61c–63a	55
3.2 The Aims and Structure of the Defense Speech: 63b–69e	57
3.3 The Philosopher's Desire to Be Dead	59
3.4 Itself through Itself ( <i>auto kath' hauto</i> )	63
3.5 Bodily Pleasures, Pains, Desires, and Fears	69

3.6	Forms, Inquiry, and the Soul Itself through Itself	70
3.7	Acquiring Wisdom while Embodied	75
3.8	Courage, Temperance, and the Correct Exchange: 68b–69e	77
3.9	Conclusion	86
<b>4</b>	<b>Cebes' Challenge and the Cyclical Argument: 69e–72d</b>	<b>88</b>
4.1	Cebes' Challenge: 69e–70b	89
4.2	The Structure of the Cyclical Argument	92
4.3	Opposites Coming to Be from Opposites	95
4.4	The Supplemental Argument: 72a–d	98
4.5	Conclusion	99
<b>5</b>	<b>The Recollecting Argument: 72e–77d</b>	<b>100</b>
5.1	The Place of the Argument in the Dialogue	101
5.2	Overview of the Argument	103
5.3	The First Stage – Different Types of Recollecting: 73c–74a	104
5.4	The Second Stage – Equality, Equal Sticks, and the Source of Our Knowledge: 74a–d	108
5.5	The Third Stage – Knowing before Sensing, and so before Birth: 74d–75c	118
5.6	The Fourth Stage – Forgetting the Knowledge We Once Had: 75d–76d	125
5.7	Coda – The Importance of Forms and the Scope of the Argument: 76d–77d	128
5.8	Conclusion	128
<b>6</b>	<b>The Kinship Argument: 77d–80d</b>	<b>131</b>
6.1	The Introduction and Conclusion of the Argument: 77d–78a, 80b	132
6.2	The Structure of the Argument	135
6.3	The First Half of the Argument – Forms and the Many Things: 78b–79a	136
6.4	The Second Half of the Argument – The Soul's Kinship with the Unseen: 79a–80b	152
6.5	The Nature of the Body	157
6.6	Conclusion	159
<b>7</b>	<b>The Return to the Defense: 80d–84b</b>	<b>162</b>
7.1	Incorporating the Kinship Argument into the Defense: 80d–81a	163
7.2	The Body's Effects on Impure Souls: 81b–82b	165
7.3	How the Philosopher's Soul Reasons: 82b–84b	170

## Contents

ix

7.4	Is the Body the Subject of Mental States?	180
7.5	Conclusion	182
8	<b>Misology and the Soul as a <i>harmonia</i>: 84c–86e, 88c–95a</b>	184
8.1	Socrates as a Prophet: 84c–85b	186
8.2	Misology and Motivated Reasoning: 88c–91c	187
8.3	Simmias' Objection – The Soul as (like) a <i>harmonia</i> : 85b–86d	193
8.4	Socrates' Reply: 91c–95a	199
8.5	Conclusion	206
9	<b>Socrates' Autobiography: 95e–102a</b>	207
9.1	<i>Aitia</i> , <i>aition</i> , and the Aims of Natural Science	208
9.2	The Background: Ancient Greek Medicine	214
9.3	Socrates' Initial Inquiry: 96b–97b	216
9.4	What Socrates Thought Anaxagoras Would Do: 97b–98b	220
9.5	What Socrates Sees Anaxagoras as Actually Doing: 98b–99c	224
9.6	Introducing Socrates' Second Sailing: 99c–d	227
9.7	Forms and <i>aitiai</i>	229
9.8	Socrates' Method of Hypothesis	232
9.9	Conclusion	246
10	<b>Cebes' Objection and the Final Argument: 86e–88b, 102a–107b</b>	248
10.1	Closely Engaging with Cebes' Objection: 95b–96a	250
10.2	Cebes' Objection: 86e–88b	251
10.3	The Final Argument's Response to Cebes' Objection	254
10.4	The Forms in Us: 102a–103c	255
10.5	The Bringers: 103c–105c	260
10.6	The Final Argument Proper: 105c–107a	266
10.7	The Soul and the Divine as Immortal	271
10.8	Conclusion	273
11	<b>The Cosmos and the Afterlife: 107c–115a</b>	275
11.1	The First Stage – Socrates' Basic Commitment: 107c–d	276
11.2	The Second Stage – The Bare Outline of the Journey: 107d–108a	277
11.3	The Third Stage – The Journey in Light of Earlier Commitments: 108a–c	279
11.4	The Fourth Stage – Convictions about Cosmology: 108d–110a	280
11.5	The Fifth Stage – The <i>muthos</i> of the Overworld and the Underworld: 110a–114d	285
11.6	Coda – After the <i>muthos</i> : 114d–115a	297
11.7	Conclusion	297

12	The Death Scene: 115a–118a	299
12.1	Care for the Soul	300
12.2	Socrates' Temperance, Courage, and Piety	301
12.3	Socrates' Last Words	303
12.4	Conclusion	311
	<i>Bibliography</i>	313
	<i>Index Locorum</i>	325
	<i>Index</i>	341



## Acknowledgments

This book would not exist without generous institutional support. I was very fortunate to have a one-year Solmsen Fellowship at the Institute for Research in the Humanities at the University of Wisconsin–Madison, and then a three-year research fellowship from the DFG–funded Research Training Group “Philosophy, Science and the Sciences” at the Humboldt University of Berlin. The community of scholars at Humboldt working on ancient philosophy, science, and medicine provided the perfect environment for writing this book. I received valuable feedback on several chapters at Humboldt’s weekly ancient philosophy colloquium, led in various semesters by Jonathan Beere, Stephen Menn, and James Wilberding.

I owe a special debt of gratitude to Emily Fletcher and David Sedley, who each read through the entire manuscript, providing detailed comments on each chapter. I am also very grateful to Gábor Betegh, Joseph Bjelde, Sean Coughlin, Sylvain Delcomminette, Matt Duncombe, Tushar Irani, Sean Kelsey, and Franco Trivigno for reading several of the chapters and discussing them with me at length, as well as to Cambridge University Press’ readers for their reports. I would also like to thank Rachel Barney, Agnes Callard, Ian Campbell, Willie Costello, Philip van der Eijk, Dhananjay Jagannathan, Gale Justin, Patricia Marechal, Tamer Newar, Suzanne Obdrzalek, Jorge Torres, and John Wynne for comments on individual chapters. In 2018 I organized a week-long reading group on *Phaedo* 88b–103b at Humboldt. I would like to thank the participants; those not already mentioned include Sarah Broadie, Marion Dumont, Nora Kreft, and David Merry. I taught a graduate seminar on the *Phaedo* at Northwestern and two such seminars at Humboldt; in the 2020 seminar at Humboldt the students read through a full draft of the book. I would like to thank the participants in these seminars, including Lukas Apsel, Robert Mordarski, Maribel Ramírez, and Brett Thompson, for their thoughts and suggestions on the chapter drafts. I would also like to thank Kathleen Heil and Manuela Tecusan for their editorial work on the manuscript, Lex Academic for producing the index, and Rosa Matera for reviewing my discussions of the Greek and producing the index locorum.

This book works through the *Phaedo* in order. Most of my essays on the *Phaedo*, by contrast, take up a specific topic and follow it through the dialogue. Hence the content of a single essay typically cuts across several chapters of this book. This is true for “The Asceticism of the *Phaedo*: Pleasure, Purification, and the Soul’s Proper Activity,” *Archiv für Geschichte der Philosophie* 99 (2017), 1–30, “The *Phaedo*’s Final Argument and the Soul’s Kinship with the Divine,” *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy* 60 (2021), 25–62, and “The Unfolding Account of Forms in the *Phaedo*,” in D. Ebrey and R. Kraut (eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Plato*, 2nd ed. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press) (2022), 268–97. “The *Phaedo* as an Alternative to Tragedy,” in *Classical Philology* 118 (2023), is the only essay that overlaps with just a single chapter: Chapter 2. I thank the journals for allowing me to use the material from these articles in this book.

In addition to the talks given in support of the published essays (acknowledged in each), I presented parts of this book to audiences at the University of Crete (Rethymno), the University of Tübingen, the University of Oslo, the National Autonomous University of Mexico, the Ancient Medicine Colloquium at Humboldt, and the following conferences: Philosophy in Assos (2019), a keynote address at the 6th Annual Berlin–Munich graduate conference, the 2020 Eastern APA Symposium, the “Plato and Platonism” conference at the University of Oslo, and “Plato’s Pleasures: New Perspectives” at King’s College London. I would like to thank the organizers and audiences at each of these presentations.

My friends and family have helped me in countless ways through this process. Above all, I thank my parents and my wife, Conni Pätz, for their love and unflagging support.