

EMPIRE, KINSHIP AND VIOLENCE

Empire, Kinship and Violence traces the history of three linked imperial families in Britain and across contested colonial borderlands from 1770 to 1842. Elizabeth Elbourne tracks the Haudenosaunee Brants of northeastern North America from the American Revolution to exile in Canada; the Bannisters, a British family of colonial administrators, whistle-blowers and entrepreneurs who operated across Australia, Canada and southern Africa; and the Buxtons, a family of British abolitionists who publicized information about what might now be termed genocide towards Indigenous peoples while also pioneering humanitarian colonialism. By recounting the conflicts that these interlinked families were involved in, she tells a larger story about the development of British and American settler colonialism and the betrayal of Indigenous peoples. Through an analysis of the changing politics of kinship and violence, Elizabeth Elbourne sheds new light on transnational debates about issues such as Indigenous sovereignty claims, British subjecthood, violence, land rights and cultural assimilation.

ELIZABETH ELBOURNE is Associate Professor at McGill University. Her previous publications include *Blood Ground: Colonialism, Missions and the Contest for Christianity in Britain and the Eastern Cape,* 1799–1852 (2003) and *Sex, Power, and Slavery* (2014), co-edited with Gwyn Campbell.



Critical Perspectives on Empire

Editors

Professor Catherine Hall University College London

Professor Mrinalini Sinha University of Michigan

Professor Kathleen Wilson State University of New York, Stony Brook

Critical Perspectives on Empire is a major series of ambitious, cross-disciplinary works in the emerging field of critical imperial studies. Books in the series explore the connections, exchanges and mediations at the heart of national and global histories, the contributions of local as well as metropolitan knowledge, and the flows of people, ideas and identities facilitated by colonial contact. To that end, the series not only offers a space for outstanding scholars working at the intersection of several disciplines to bring to wider attention the impact of their work; it also takes a leading role in reconfiguring contemporary historical and critical knowledge, of the past and of ourselves.

A full list of titles published in the series can be found at: www.cambridge.org/cpempire



EMPIRE, KINSHIP AND VIOLENCE

Family Histories, Indigenous Rights and the Making of Settler Colonialism, 1770–1842

ELIZABETH ELBOURNE

McGill University







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

 $www. cambridge. org \\ Information on this title: www. cambridge. org/9781108749497$

DOI: 10.1017/9781108782791

© Elizabeth Elbourne 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023 First paperback edition 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-108-47922-6 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-74949-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

List of Figures	page	e vii	
List of Maps	viii		
Acknowledgeme	nts	ix	
A Note on Nome	enclatu	re	хi
List of Abbrevia	tions	xiii	

Introduction: Kinship, Violence and the Colonial State

PART I North America 25

- 1 Before the Revolution: Belonging and Un-belonging in British-Haudenosaunee Borderlands 27
- 2 All the King's Men: Kinship and the American Revolution 70
- Land, Identity and Indigenous Sovereignty in British
 North America, 1783–1820 114
 - PART II Upper Canada, New South Wales, Van Diemen's Land, Victoria, Western Australia, the Cape Colony, Sierra Leone 151
- 4 Upper Canada: Haudenosaunee Land Claims and the Politics of Expertise 153
- 5 New South Wales: Frontier Violence and the 'Rule of British Law' 189
- 6 Southern Africa: Protest, Petitions and the Paradoxes of Imperial Liberalism 232
- 7 From Sierra Leone to Swan River: The Bannisters' Imperial World 270
 - PART III Britain, the Cape Colony, West Africa 305
- 8 Colonial Sins and Priscilla Buxton's Quest for Virtue 307



vi CONTENTS

9 Keeping Colonialism in the Family: Kinship, Humanitarianism and the Niger Expedition 348

Conclusions 372

Bibliography 379

Index 412



FIGURES

1.1	Miniature of Sir William Johnson (c. 1760) page 46
2.1	Portrait of Peter Johnson, copy by James George Kingston of
	a lost original (1834) 78
2.2	Benjamin West, 'Colonel Guy Johnson and Karonghyontye
	(Captain David Hill)' (1776) 84
3.1	Miniature of John Norton (1805) 133
3.2	Two young men by the tomb of Joseph Brant (September, 1934) 134
3.3	Miniature of Elizabeth Kerr (née Brant) 144
3.4	Gilbert Stuart, Portrait of Thayendenegea (Joseph Brant) (1786) 148
4.1	Benjamin Robert Haydon, 'The Anti-Slavery Convention, 1840' (1841) 156
5.1	Portrait of Biraban: cropped from frontispiece Lancelot Threlkeld,
	A Key to the Structure of the Aboriginal Language (1850) 209
6.1	Signature page, memorial from inhabitants of Bethelsdorp (1829) 245
6.2	Keith Calder, Statue of David Stuurman, National Heritage Monument,
	Tshwane, South Africa 252
6.3	Signature page, memorial from David, Klaas and Jannetje Stuurman
	(1829) 253
8.1	Portrait of Priscilla Buxton: frontispiece to E. MacInnes,
	Extracts from Priscilla Johnston's Journal and Letters (1862) 308



MAPS

I.1	Guy Johnson, 'Map of the Country of the VI Nations' (1771) page 2
1.1	Six Nations territory and colonial New York, on the verge
	of the Revolution 32
2.1	The war in the Mohawk Valley and its aftermath: North-eastern
	borderlands 71
3.1	North-eastern borderlands after the Revolution 115
3.2	Indigenous lands and treaties, Upper Canada 123
5.1	The Bannister family's Australia 190
6.1	Early nineteenth-century southern Africa 233
9.1	West Africa and the Niger River in the 1840s 351



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Writing and researching this book has stretched out over many years and many places. I could not have written it without the support, inspiration and advice of many people. I am very grateful to all those who have discussed ideas, hosted me at conferences, helped with research and logistics or even just been willing to listen to complaints over a beer. It is a bit of a cliché to say that I am afraid to attempt a list for fear of leaving out too many but this is true. I am deeply privileged to work in rich communities of scholars. Please know that I am very grateful.

For invaluable research assistance, I would like to thank Ian Beattie, Priya Grant, Matthew Migely, Raminder Saini and Matthew Wyman-McCarthy. My thanks also to Matthew Wyman-McCarthy, editor extraordinaire, for his insightful editing of the entire text at a crucial period and to Ian Beattie for a terrific job with the index and final edits. I am very grateful to Geoff Wallace for the beautiful maps. For reading some or all of the current text I greatly appreciate the generosity and insight of Joanna Cruikshank, Allan Greer, Elsbeth Heaman, Nathan Ince, Laura Madokoro, Robert Ross, Lyndall Ryan and Michael Wasser, as well as the anonymous referees of Cambridge University Press. Catherine Desbarats, Marie-Luise Ermisch, Lynn Kozak, Jason Opal, Laila Parsons, Rachel Sandwell and Daviken Studnicki-Gizbert helped shape earlier versions in manuscript workshops and reading groups: thank you. Veena Dwivedi helped me get across the finish line. Max Hamon, Rishma Johal, Angela Tozer and Kevin Vogel deepened my understanding of settler colonialism and Indigenous history in North America. Suzanne Morton helped me think about the big picture. Nigel Penn and Jenny Sorrel were generously hospitable in Cape Town, both intellectually and materially. So too in London were Georgia Kaufmann and Richard Wolfe in London, to whom I am grateful for friendship and shelter over many years. I am also very thankful to Rachel Berger, Ann Curthoys, the late Brian Deer, Allan Downey, Felicia Gabriele, Catherine Hall, Karl Hele, Rick Hill, Zoë Laidlaw, Sandra-Lynn Leclaire, Kirsten McKenzie Stephan Pigeon, Richard Price and Mark Thompson for assistance and generous advice at crucial moments.

To carry out this type of transnational project would be almost impossible without funding and institutional support. I warmly thank the Social Sciences



x

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-108-74949-7 — Empire, Kinship and Violence Elizabeth Elbourne Frontmatter More Information

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

and Humanities Research Council of Canada for financial support, as well the internal grants programme of McGill University. I am grateful to the members of my 'home base' of the Montreal British History Seminar, including my cochair Brian Lewis, for much discussion in the halls of Thompson House over the years. I would also like to thank the many archives and libraries that supported this research, with gratitude to their dedicated staff. I would particularly like to thank archivists at the Western Cape Archives and Records Service for going above and beyond in making material available, and at the Clements Library in Ann Arbor, Michigan, for the chance to participate in afternoon tea. Virve Wiland of the Woodland Cultural Centre was tremendously generous with her time. Joanne Ichimura of the archives of the School of African and Oriental Studies helped me at a key point during the pandemic. Peter Bridge and Celena Bridge sent documents from Perth for a stranger. At McGill, librarian Eamon Duffy has helped me as well as countless other historians. I am grateful to work in a welcoming department, where I have been fortunate to work with wonderful colleagues and superb students.

I reserve my deepest gratitude for my family, including my mother Ann Elbourne for her constant engagement in learning and the other members of my extended family, including the late Judith Elbourne, Rebecca Elbourne and Jeremy Elbourne. Emma, Benjamin and Leah Elbourne-Weinstock were quite a bit younger when I began this project than they now are; they remind me that if we start by teaching our children, they end by teaching us. Thank you above all to Daniel Weinstock for a lifetime of partnership and support.



A NOTE ON NOMENCLATURE

In part because struggle over Indigenous languages is an important part of the history of settler colonialism, there is considerable variation in current usage concerning the names of Indigenous individuals and groups. I have attempted to balance in the book between using names that are familiar in English and names that reflect what people called themselves in their own languages at the time.

In several cases I use both English and Indigenous versions of names (such as Molly Brant/Konwatsi'tsiaiénni). This is influenced by my experience of living in a multilingual city and noting the extent of code shifting, as well as by recognition that people often in fact had more than one name and changed names at different life stages. I use the anglicized version of the names of Europeans working in English to reflect the documentary record (Frederick Haldimand, rather than Frédéric Haldimand). I also use European surnames to establish family links through time, notably with the Hill and Brant families.

A further, and related, issue is that there are some variant versions of the spelling of names, reflecting evolution in the written versions of originally oral languages. I have generally chosen the simpler version to facilitate ease of reading unless a version is particularly well established. Names were often written down by Europeans and may not completely capture original pronunciation.

I want to acknowledge that there are different approaches to these difficult issues and that I may not always have struck the right balance. I welcome feedback.

Six Nations

I use Haudenosaunee ('people of the longhouse') rather than the older Iroquois (although I retain Iroquois in certain citations, including using historical texts). The name Mohawk is widely used. It was, however, originally an outsider's term. In Kanyen'kéha, the Mohawk language, people call themselves Kanyen'kehà:ka (Kanyenkehaka, Kanienkehaka or Kanien'kehá:ka), people of the flint. I use both Mohawk and Kanyen'kehà:ka but primarily Kanyenkehà:ka. I use Kanyen'kehà:ka rather than Kanien'kehá:ka when referring to the Six Nations to reflect regional variations in dialect, following dominant usage



xii

A NOTE ON NOMENCLATURE

among Haudenosaunee in New York and Ontario, even though Kanien'kehá:ka would be used by people in my own settler territory of Québec. I have otherwise generally used the terms Cayuga, Tuscarora, Oneida, Seneca and Onondaga, since these are in wide usage, but I give alternatives on Map 1.1 (following Susan Hill). The Kanyen'kéha term Onkwehon:we is used by many Haudenosaunee people to describe Indigenous people in general.

South Africa

I use San as a collective term for communities sometimes known collectively as 'Bushmen' where I don't know the names of individual communities. It is nonetheless important to note that 'San' was also originally an outsider's term, given by Khoekhoe herders to describe nomadic hunters. Khoekhoe generally replaces the colonial term 'Hottentot'. The colonial term Caffre was used in shifting ways through time. I cite people who used it in the 1820s and 30s largely as a synonym for 'Xhosa'. The term would, however, mutate by mid-century to influence a highly offensive term beginning with k. I have substituted [Xhosa] when the meaning is clear. I have, however, retained original language in some quotations in which there is possible ambiguity about which groups were being referred to, in order not to distort the historical record. I do not mean to endorse the use of the term. Some place names have been changed in the aftermath of the end of apartheid. For example, the colonial town of Grahamstown is now Makhanda, and the Gariep River replaces the older Orange River. I use new names but indicate older terms on first mention. I use the names of language groups without prefixes for the sake of simplicity, given widespread usage in English (so Xhosa rather isiXhosa and Tswana rather than seTswana).



ABBREVIATIONS

AONSW Archives Office of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia

BL British Library, London

CA Western Cape Archives and Record Services, Cape Town

DCRO Derbyshire County Record Office, UK

DRCHSNY Documents Relative to the Colonial History of the State of New York.

15 vols. Albany, NY: Weed, Parsons and Company, 1853-87

HRA Historical Records of Australia. Series I and Series IV. Sydney: Library

Committee of the Commonwealth Parliament, 1914 and 1922

LMS London Missionary Society papers, Council for World Mission

archives, School of Oriental and African Studies, London

ML Mitchell Library, Sydney, Australia

LAC Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa, Ontario

NCRO Norfolk County Record Office, UK

NYHS New York Historical Society, New York, NY

SCA British Parliamentary Papers. Report of the Select Committee on

Aborigines (British Settlements), 2 vols. London House of Commons,

1836 and 1837

SPG Society for the Propagation of the Gospel. See also USPG

SWP Milton W. Hamilton and Albert B. Corey (eds), The Papers of Sir

William Johnson. 14 vols. Albany, NY: The University of the State of

New York, 1921-1965

TFB Thomas Fowell Buxton Papers, Bodleian Libraries of Commonwealth

and African Studies at Rhodes House, University of Oxford, MSS Brit

Emp. s.444

TNA The National Archives, UK

USPG Archives of the United Society for the Propagation of the Gospel,

Bodleian Libraries of Commonwealth and African Studies at Rhodes House, University of Oxford. Note the SPG became the USPG in 1965

WCL William Clements Library, Ann Arbor, MI WSCRO West Sussex County Record Office, UK

xiii