

↻ Introduction: Clara Schumann in the Musicological Imagination

JOE DAVIES

Bicentenary Reflections: Schumann after Reich¹

Though much has been written about Clara Schumann, she is still, more than 165 years after her birth, known to us only through the eyes and minds of her own era. She is viewed even today as her nineteenth-century contemporaries saw her – as a saint or “priestess,” as a dedicated wife, mother, and musician.

Nancy B. Reich, 1985²

In the fifteen years since the first edition of this biography was published, interest in Clara Schumann has exploded. Performances, editions, and recordings of her music, films, dramas, radio and TV programs inspired by her life, piano competitions in her name, dissertations, scholarly papers, articles in the scholarly and popular presses, program notes, publication of letters, biographies in several languages and revisionist biographies, all attest to the significance of and fascination with Clara Wieck Schumann as an artist and as a woman.

Reich, 2001³

These vignettes capture something of the renaissance that occurred in Clara Schumann scholarship towards the end of the twentieth century. Reich’s biography, a model of its kind, played a pivotal role in these developments. Her deep connection with the subject matter, her discerning approach to matters of class and gender, and her willingness to question received ideas about Schumann’s relationship with the men in her circle

¹ My approach to these reflections takes inspiration from Marcia J. Citron: ‘Women and the Western Art Canon: Where Are We Now?’, *Notes* 64/2 (2007), 209–15; Citron, ‘A Bicentennial Reflection: Twenty-Five Years with Fanny Hensel’, in ‘Fanny Hensel (née Mendelssohn Bartholdy) and Her Circle’: Proceedings of the Bicentenary Conference, Oxford, July 2005, ed. Susan Wollenberg, *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 4/2 (2007), 7–20; and Susan Wollenberg, ‘“Master of Her Art”: Fanny Hensel (née Mendelssohn Bartholdy), 1805–1847’, *Ad Parnassum: A Journal of Eighteenth- and Nineteenth-Century Instrumental Music* 3/6 (2005), 33–44.

² Nancy B. Reich, *Clara Schumann: The Artist and the Woman* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1985 (rev. ed. 2001)), preface to the first edition, xii.

³ Reich, *Clara Schumann*, preface to the revised edition, ix.

have not only given much-needed clarity to the details of Schumann's life and art, but have also provided the bedrock for subsequent reappraisals of women in music.⁴

A few decades later, the events of 2019 marking the bicentenary of Clara Schumann's birth gave new impetus to the process of rediscovery that has been underway since the publication of Reich's biography.⁵ Such was the case at the international conference on which this volume is based, 'Clara Schumann (née Wieck) and Her World', held at Lady Margaret Hall, Oxford, 14–16 June 2019. True to its title, the three-day gathering of scholars and performers from Canada, Finland, Germany, Ireland, the UK and the USA afforded an opportunity to re-evaluate Schumann's creative output in relation to the artistic landscape of the world(s) in which she lived and worked.⁶ What arose over the course of the proceedings was a deeper awareness of her music,⁷ her pedagogy and

⁴ These elements are discernible across Reich's published corpus, which includes, inter alia, 'The Diaries of Fanny Hensel and Clara Schumann: A Study in Contrasts', *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 4/2 (2007), 21–36; 'Clara Schumann and America', in *Clara Schumann: Komponistin, Interpretin, Unternehmerin, Ikone*, ed. Peter Ackermann and Herbert Schneider (Hildesheim: Georg Olms Verlag, 1999), 195–203; 'The Correspondence between Clara Wieck Schumann and Felix and Paul Mendelssohn', in *Schumann and His World*, ed. R. Larry Todd (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1994), 205–32; 'Clara Schumann', in *New Grove Dictionary of Women Composers*, ed. Julie Anne Sadie and Rhian Samuel (London: Macmillan, 1994), 411–16; 'Women As Musicians: A Question of Class', in *Musicology and Difference: Gender and Sexuality in Music Scholarship*, ed. Ruth Solie (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993), 125–46; 'Clara Schumann and Johannes Brahms', in *Brahms and His World*, ed. Walter Frisch (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1990), 37–47; and co-authored with Anna Burton, 'Clara Schumann: Old Sources, New Readings', *Musical Quarterly* 70/3 (1984), 332–54.

⁵ Besides the Oxford conference mentioned above, the spate of bicentenary events included: 'Die Herrlichste von Allen – Clara Schumann zum 200. Geburtstag', 9–12 May, Robert-Schumann-Haus, Zwickau; 'Clara Schumann at 200: Study Days', 4–5 October, University of Ottawa; 'Performing Clara Schumann: Keyboard Legacies and Feminine Identities in the Long Romantic Tradition', 16–17 November, Cornell University; 'Clara Schumann 200th Anniversary Festival', 22–24 February, St John's Smith Square, London; and 'Clara Schumann: Rethinking the Myth', 13 October, under the auspices of the Oxford Lieder Festival.

⁶ Precedents for this emphasis on 'her world' – a trope that has gradually emerged from the shadows of 'his world' – include the bicentenary conference 'Fanny Hensel (née Mendelssohn Bartholdy) and Her Circle', St Catherine's College, Oxford, 22–24 July 2005, whose selected proceedings are published in *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 4/2 (2007), under the same title; and Rebecca Cypess and Nancy Sinkoff (eds.), *Sara Levy's World: Gender, Judaism, and the Bach Tradition in Enlightenment Berlin* (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2018), developed from the conference 'Sara Levy's World', Rutgers University, 29–30 September 2014.

⁷ Alongside the discussions of Schumann's music were several performances, including two lecture-recitals, 'For clever hands – or for more beautiful hands? Clara Schumann as a four-hand partner' by Cecilia Oinas and Anna Kuvaja, and 'Reimagining the romance: contextualising Clara Schumann's Op. 21 and 22' by R. Larry Todd and Katharina Uhde; a recital of her lieder

performance activities, and also her reception, both contemporaneously and posthumously.⁸

During those intervening years between the first edition of Reich's biography and the bicentennial juncture, 1985–2019, scholars made important strides towards expanding the purview of Clara Schumann scholarship.⁹ Notable here are the German-language biographies by Beatrix Borchard,¹⁰ Janina Klassen¹¹ and Irmgard Knechtges-Obrecht¹² that have added fresh perspectives to the evolving portrait of Schumann, while also suggesting new possibilities in the wider sphere of documenting musicians' lives. This is especially true of Borchard's latest book, *Clara Schumann – Musik als Lebensform*, which (branching out from a chronological approach) re-evaluates particular themes in Schumann's life, such as her relationship with her mother and father, through the lens of thoughts and feelings expressed in her personal correspondence.¹³ These biographical developments are complemented on the one hand by the uncovering of a wealth of primary sources (letters, diaries, memorabilia),¹⁴ and on the other by studies that have dealt with Schumann's 'afterlife'. Examples of the latter range from accounts of filmic portrayals, such as those by Borchard,¹⁵

and piano music by Aisling Kenny, Cecily Lock and Cheryl Tan; and Lucy Parham's composer portrait, 'I, Clara,' narrated by Dame Harriet Walter.

⁸ For a fuller account of the conference, see the reports by Louis De Nil, published on the Royal Musical Association website, and Nicole Grimes, in *American Brahms Society Newsletter* 37/2 (2019), 10–11.

⁹ The references woven throughout this chapter are not intended to be comprehensive; a wider listing of publications can be found in the Select Bibliography.

¹⁰ Beatrix Borchard, *Clara Schumann. Ihr Leben* (Frankfurt: Ullstein, 1991); and Borchard, *Clara Schumann. Ihr Leben. Eine biographische Montage* (Hildesheim, Zürich and New York: Georg Olms Verlag, 2015).

¹¹ Janina Klassen, *Clara Schumann. Musik und Öffentlichkeit* (Cologne: Böhlau, 2009).

¹² Irmgard Knechtges-Obrecht, *Clara Schumann. Ein Leben für die Musik* (Darmstadt: wbg THEISS, Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 2019).

¹³ Beatrix Borchard, *Clara Schumann – Musik als Lebensform. Neue Quellen – Andere Schreibweisen* (Hildesheim: George Olms Verlag, 2019).

¹⁴ See the *Schumann Briefedition*, ed. Robert-Schumann-Haus Zwickau, Institut für Musikwissenschaft der Hochschule für Musik Carl Maria von Weber and the Robert-Schumann-Forschungsstelle Düsseldorf (Cologne, 2008–), www.schumann-briefe.de/editionsplan.html; Gerd Nauhaus (ed.), *The Marriage Diaries of Robert and Clara Schumann: From Their Wedding Day to the Russia Trip*, trans. Peter Ostwald (Chicago: Northeastern University Press, 1993); and Berthold Litzmann, *Clara Schumann: An Artist's Life, Based on Material Found in Diaries and Letters*, trans. Grace E. Hadow (2 vols.; London: Macmillan, 1913 (rev. ed. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013)).

¹⁵ Beatrix Borchard, 'Darf man das? Robert und Clara Schumann als Filmhelden', in *Robert Schumann. Persönlichkeit, Werk und Wirkung: Bericht über die Konferenz, Leipzig 2010*, ed. Helmut Loos (Leipzig: Gudrun Schröder Verlag, 2011), 483–94.

Knechtges-Obrecht¹⁶ and Georg Mass,¹⁷ through discussions of literary depictions, as in David Ferris's comparative study of Janice Galloway's *Clara* and J. D. Landis's *Longing*,¹⁸ to April Prince's recent critique of iconographic representations of Schumann.¹⁹ This growing body of work has brought renewed attention not only to the realities of Schumann's life, but also to the ways in which these have been recontextualized in scholarly biographies and fictionalized in popular culture.

New readings of Schumann have blossomed also in connection with her pianism. To offer a range of examples: Ferris has examined how Schumann navigated the boundaries between public and private performance, with a particular emphasis on her soirées in Berlin, 1839–40;²⁰ Valerie Goertzen has drawn attention to Schumann's improvisatory practices in creating connections among 'mosaics' of short pieces;²¹ Alexander Stefaniak has traced Schumann's engagement with different modes of virtuosity, particularly that which transcended the physical and entered the realm of interiority;²² and, most recently, Natasha Loges has highlighted Schumann's role, together with Julius Stockhausen, in bringing the song cycle into the world of 'serious, instrumental music' through their mixed-genre performances.²³ From these studies, as well as earlier work in this area,²⁴ Schumann

¹⁶ Irmgard Knechtges-Obrecht, "'Das Klavier war der Schlüssel': Ein Bericht über den Film *Geliebte Clara*", in *Correspondenz: Mitteilungen der Robert-Schumann-Gesellschaft e.V. Düsseldorf* 31 (2008), 27–33.

¹⁷ Georg Mass, "'Frühlingsinfonie": Robert und Clara Schumann in Films', in *Robert Schumann für die Jugend: Beiträge zu Theorie und Praxis des musikpädagogischen Komponistenporträts*, ed. Janina Klassen (Mainz: Schott, 2008), 92–111.

¹⁸ David Ferris, 'The Afterlives of the Schumanns', in *Rethinking Schumann*, ed. Roe-Min Kok and Laura Tunbridge (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), 357–94.

¹⁹ April L. Prince, '(Re)Considering the Priestess: Clara Schumann, Historiography, and the Visual', *Women and Music: A Journal of Gender and Culture* 21 (2017), 107–40.

²⁰ David Ferris, 'Public Performance and Private Understanding: Clara Wieck's Concerts in Berlin', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 56/2 (2003), 351–408.

²¹ Valerie Goertzen, 'Clara Wieck Schumann's Improvisations and Her "Mosaics" of Small Forms', in *Beyond Notes: Improvisation in Western Music of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries*, ed. Rudolph Rasch (Lucca: Brepols, 2011), 153–62; and Goertzen, 'Setting the Stage: Clara Schumann's Preludes', in *In the Course of Performance: Studies in the World of Musical Improvisation*, ed. Bruno Nettl and Melinda Russell (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1998), 237–60.

²² Alexander Stefaniak, 'Clara Schumann's Interiorities and the Cutting Edge of Popular Pianism', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 70/3 (2017), 697–765.

²³ Natasha Loges, 'From Miscellanies to Musical Works: Julius Stockhausen, Clara Schumann, and *Dichterliebe*', in *German Song Onstage: Lieder Performance in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries*, ed. Loges and Laura Tunbridge (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2020), 70–86.

²⁴ See, for example, Claudia de Vries, *Die Pianistin Clara Wieck-Schumann. Interpretation im Spannungsfeld von Tradition und Individualität* (Mainz: Schott, 1996); and Reinhard Kopiez, Andreas C. Lehmann and Janina Klassen, 'Clara Schumann's Collection of Playbills:

emerges, to borrow Stefaniak's characterization, as a 'protean pianist' whose contribution to nineteenth-century performance culture is apt for further investigation.²⁵

Another aspect of Schumann's creative profile that is coming into sharper focus is her work as a composer.²⁶ Though her self-deprecatory views of her compositional endeavours have been well rehearsed in the literature,²⁷ it is only in recent years that scholars have started to problematize them via critical engagement with her music, particularly her lieder.²⁸ Studies that have contributed new insights into Schumann's songs range from those by Michael Baker,²⁹ Rufus Hallmark³⁰ and Susan Wollenberg,³¹ all focusing on her settings of Friedrich Rückert's *Liebesfrühling*, Op. 12, through Susan Youens's exploration of Schumann's Heine settings,³² to Caitlin Miller's investigation of her setting of the 'Loreley' in terms of female power and the male gaze.³³ Their findings are supplemented by the gradual flowering of analytical engagement with Schumann's

A Historiometric Analysis of Life-span Development, Mobility, and Repertoire Canonization', *Poetics* 37 (2009), 50–73.

²⁵ Alexander Stefaniak, 'Clara Schumann and the Imagined Revelation of Musical Works', *Music & Letters* 99/2 (2018), 194–223, at 222.

²⁶ In the wider context of music studies, a watershed moment occurred in 2016 when Clara Schumann's Piano Trio in G minor, Op. 17, was one of five set works by women to be added to the Edexcel A-level music syllabus in the United Kingdom. This was the result of an online campaign launched by Oxford alumna Jessy McCabe, after her initial query to the exam board regarding the lack of women composers on their course specification was met with the following (unsatisfactory) response: 'Given that female composers were not prominent in the western classical tradition (or others for that matter), there would be very few female composers that could be included.' For further details, see www.theguardian.com/education/2015/dec/16/a-level-music-female-composers-students-campaign-jessy-mccabe-edexcel.

²⁷ One such example is her oft-quoted diary entry of 25 November 1839: 'I once believed that I possessed creative talent, but I have given up this idea; a woman must not desire to compose – there has never yet been one able to do it. Should I expect to be the one?' Quoted in Reich, *Clara Schumann*, 216.

²⁸ Important foundations were established in Janina Klassen, *Clara Wieck-Schumann. Die Virtuosin als Komponistin. Studien zu ihrem Werk* (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1990).

²⁹ Michael Baker, 'Multiply Interrupted Structure in Clara Schumann's "Liebst du um Schönheit"', in *Analytical Essays on Music by Women Composers: Secular & Sacred Music to 1900*, ed. Laurel Parsons and Brenda Ravenscroft (New York: Oxford University Press, 2018), 210–27.

³⁰ Rufus Hallmark, 'The Rückert Lieder of Robert and Clara Schumann', *19th-Century Music* 14 (1990), 3–30.

³¹ Susan Wollenberg, 'Clara Schumann's "Liebst du um Schönheit" and the Integrity of a Composer's Vision', in *Women and the Nineteenth-Century Lied*, ed. Aisling Kenny and Wollenberg (New York and London: Routledge, 2015), 123–39.

³² Susan Youens, *Heinrich Heine and the Lied* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), ch. 3, 'A Tale of Three Ballads: Heine and the Schumanns', 174–265.

³³ Caitlin Miller, "'Und das hat mit ihrem Singen, Die Lore-Ley gethan": Subjectivity and Objectification in Two Heine Settings', in *Women and the Nineteenth-Century Lied*, 233–50.

instrumental music, as represented by Marian Wilson Kimber's survey of her piano music and Julie Pednault-Deslauriers's examination of form and bass-lines in her chamber and solo piano pieces.³⁴ These publications offer an invitation to probe deeper into the expressive worlds of Schumann's music, whether in terms of song or instrumental genres, and to find new meanings in the intricacies of her compositional style.

That Schumann is now viewed from a range of critical perspectives, rather than 'only through the eyes and minds of her own era',³⁵ pays testament to the developments in scholarship on women in music.³⁶ In this regard, we are indebted to the first generation of scholars – among them Jane Bowers, Marcia Citron, Judith Tick and Ruth Solie³⁷ – whose pioneering work did much to destabilize the all-male framing of music history, questioning the processes of inclusion and exclusion that underpin canon formation, and opening up critical space for discussing the contributions women musicians have made throughout the ages. Their approach has inspired research across all avenues of musicological enquiry: alongside contributions in the fields of biography and reception studies,³⁸ there have been increasing waves of analytical engagement with music by women,³⁹ together with contextual studies of their creative work across a range of

³⁴ Marian Wilson Kimber, 'From the Concert Hall to the Salon: The Piano Music of Clara Wieck Schumann and Fanny Mendelssohn Hensel', in *Nineteenth-Century Piano Music*, ed. R. Larry Todd (2nd ed.; New York: Routledge, 2003), 316–55; and Julie Pednault-Deslauriers, 'Bass-Line Melodies and Form in Four Piano and Chamber Works by Clara Wieck-Schumann', *Music Theory Spectrum* 38/2 (2016), 133–54.

³⁵ Reich, *Clara Schumann*, xii.

³⁶ For a thought-provoking dissection of earlier developments in this area, see Paula Higgins, 'Women in Music, Feminist Criticism, and Guerrilla Musicology: Reflections on Recent Polemics', *19th-Century Music* 17/2 (1993), 174–92.

³⁷ Classic studies include Jane Bowers and Judith Tick (eds.), *Women Making Music: The Western Art Tradition, 1150–1950* (Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1986); Marcia J. Citron, *Gender and the Musical Canon* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993); Citron, 'Gender, Professionalism and the Musical Canon', *Journal of Musicology* 8/1 (1990), 102–17; and Solie (ed.), *Musicology and Difference*.

³⁸ Two notable examples are R. Larry Todd, *Fanny Hensel: The Other Mendelssohn* (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010); and Harald Krebs and Sharon Krebs, *Josephine Lang: Her Life and Songs* (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007). For a probing assessment of the wider issues at stake in the documenting of women's lives, see Marian Wilson Kimber, 'The "Suppression" of Fanny Mendelssohn: Rethinking Feminist Biography', *19th-Century Music* 26/2 (2002), 113–29.

³⁹ Recent examples include Parsons and Ravenscroft (eds.), *Analytical Essays on Music by Women Composers: Secular and Sacred Music to 1900*; Laurel Parsons and Brenda Ravenscroft (eds.), *Analytical Essays on Music by Women Composers: Concert Music, 1960–2000* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2017); and Susan Wollenberg, 'New Paths to Analysis': The Case of Women Composers', in *L'analyse musicale aujourd'hui – Music Analysis Today*, ed. Xavier Hascher, Mondher Ayari and Jean-Michel Bardez (Le Vallier: Delatour France, 2015), 291–312.

chronological and geographical reimits.⁴⁰ This body of scholarship, which shows no signs of abating,⁴¹ has brought the study of women in music from the peripheries (where it began life) into a more central position in contemporary musicology.

Thinking about Schumann in relation to her artistic world offers an opportunity to reflect on the changing attitudes towards the paradigms that have featured in the discourse on women in music. Among these is the much-debated issue of separateness versus integration.⁴² Perhaps the most obvious advantage of the former approach, particularly in the earlier phases of scholarship, is that it provided a direct and immediate way of restoring women's voices – which had long been hidden – to the music-historical record. To quote Aisling Kenny and Susan Wollenberg from their Introduction to *Women and the Nineteenth-Century Lied*:

Freeing the women from the dominance of their male counterparts seemed then to be utterly desirable in the face of the prevailing ignorance and prejudice that coloured their reception and conditioned the inadequate attention to their work.⁴³

In the current climate, with its unprecedented level of exposure to women in music, the time would seem ripe for continuing to move in the direction of an integrated approach, whereby the lives and musical activities of women are studied as part of a larger dialogue with those of their contemporaries.

⁴⁰ See, inter alia, Samantha Ege, 'Composing a Symphonist: Florence Price and the Hand of Black Women's Fellowship', *Women and Music: A Journal of Gender and Culture* 24 (2020), 7–27; David Yearsley, *Sex, Death, and Minuets: Anna Magdalena Bach and Her Musical Notebooks* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2019); Laurie Stras, *Women and Music in Sixteenth-Century Ferrara* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2018); Laura Hamer, *Female Composers, Conductors, Performers: Musiciennes of Interwar France, 1919–1939* (Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge, 2018); Francesca Vella, 'Jenny Lind, Voice, Celebrity', *Music & Letters* 98/2 (2017), 232–54; Kenny and Wollenberg (eds.), *Women and the Nineteenth-Century Lied*; Jeanice Brooks, *Nadia Boulanger: Performing Past and Future between the Wars* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013); Matthew Head, *Sovereign Feminine: Music and Gender in Eighteenth-Century Germany* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2013); Head, 'Cultural Meaning for Women Composers: Charlotte ("Minna") Brandes and the Beautiful Dead in the German Enlightenment', *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, 57/2 (2004), 231–84; and Rachel Cowgill and Hilary Poriss (eds.), *The Arts of the Prima Donna in the Long Nineteenth Century* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011).

⁴¹ Recent publications include Stephen Rodgers (ed.), *The Songs of Fanny Hensel* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2021); and Laura Hamer (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Women in Music since 1900* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2021).

⁴² For an assessment of this issue, see Wollenberg, "Master of Her Art", 35–6.

⁴³ Kenny and Wollenberg, *Women and the Nineteenth-Century Lied*, 6.

It is this kind of thinking that underpins *Clara Schumann Studies*, the first in the series to address a female musician. Inspired by the scholarly currents outlined above, and capturing the spirit of her world, the volume explores Schumann both on her own terms and in relation to the nexus of people, places, events and ideas that shaped her outlook.⁴⁴ The thirteen chapters reflect this approach in three particular respects: first, by delving deeper into the artistic and social landscape of her milieu; secondly, by offering new analytical and critical perspectives on her songs and instrumental music; and thirdly, by reappraising her reception and legacy. Importantly, in its coverage of these areas, the book seeks not to measure Schumann against the model of the ‘great male composer’, a model that is gradually being replaced by a more diverse understanding of musical creativity.⁴⁵ Nor does it champion her uncritically as a ‘woman composer’,⁴⁶ an approach that, to borrow Natasha Loges’s words, ‘suggests that her status is too fragile to tolerate critical scrutiny’.⁴⁷ Instead, it develops a holistic and gender-aware understanding of her work as a composer, performer and teacher vis-à-vis the cultural climate of her time. In other words, the volume is motivated by a desire to humanize (rather than apotheosize) Schumann’s contribution to nineteenth-century life and culture.

⁴⁴ A comparable approach, whereby Clara and Robert Schumann are explored not only as individual artists, but also as a couple who charted their personal and professional trajectories with the other in mind, underpins *Clara and Robert Schumann in Context*, ed. Joe Davies and Roe-Min Kok (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, forthcoming). For formative reappraisals of the artistic relationships between Clara Schumann and members of her circle, see Anna Burton, ‘Robert Schumann and Clara Wieck: A Creative Partnership’, *Music & Letters* 69/2 (1988), 211–28; and John Daverio, *Crossing Paths: Schubert, Schumann, and Brahms* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002). For wider application of this approach, albeit with a different familial slant, see Susan Wollenberg ‘Fanny Hensel’s Op. 8, no. 1: A Special Case of “multum in parvo”’, *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 4/2 (2007), 101–17; R. Larry Todd, ‘On Stylistic Affinities in the Works of Fanny Hensel and Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy’, in *The Mendelssohns: Their Music in History*, ed. John Michael Cooper and Julie D. Prandi (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002), 245–61; and Marcia J. Citron, ‘Felix Mendelssohn’s Influence on Fanny Mendelssohn As a Professional Composer’, *Current Musicology* 37–38 (1984), 9–17.

⁴⁵ This approach is in keeping with the notion of the ‘decentred author’, which removes the author (in this case, the composer) from the centre of a field of study. For more on this concept, see Citron, ‘Women and the Western Art Canon’, 212. ‘Not only has it been salutary for women,’ Citron writes, ‘it has contributed to musicology’s general expansion in topics and methods. Diversity of approach rules, and through the decentering of the composer, the richness of women’s musical contributions have been illuminated.’

⁴⁶ For context regarding the appellation ‘woman composer’, see Head, *Music and Gender in Eighteenth-Century Germany*, ch. 5: ‘Sophie Westenholz and the Eclipse of the Female Sign’, 215–53.

⁴⁷ See p. 274 in this volume.

New Directions

Our exploration begins with Anja Bunzel's chapter on Clara and Robert Schumann's circles in Dresden during their residency from 1844 to 1850. Capturing Bunzel's interest are the myriad ways in which the Schumanns interacted with their contemporaries through letters, albums, social gatherings and musical soirées, all of which enabled them to become immersed in a vibrant social network that influenced their artistic outlook. Her account highlights the breadth of their influence in Dresden, both socially and musically, and encourages us to reassess the significance of their personal relationships more generally.

Susan Youens takes us on a further excursion to Dresden in her rumination on the Schumanns' response to the revolutions of 1848–49. Weaving together cultural history, biography and musical analysis, Youens sets the scene with a discussion of their personal reactions to the Dresden Uprising, before turning her attention to the 'hints and whispers' of political sentiments in their lieder. Particularly evocative is the way that she interprets local-level tonal events, those seemingly innocuous moments such as the shift from D \flat to F major in 'Geheimes Flüstern hier und dort', Op. 23 No. 3, as signalling deeper, quasi-coded reflections on the revolutionary climate of the time. In locating these hidden meanings, Youens invites us to hear the songs under consideration in dialogue with one another, as interrelated parts of a shared tapestry of musical and political thought.

The chapters by Stephen Rodgers and Harald Krebs continue the conversation about Clara Schumann's songs, linking them with developments in music theory. Rodgers reflects on Schumann's engagement with ideas of musical and poetic closure in a close analysis of two songs: 'Warum willst du and're fragen', Op. 12 No. 11, and 'Ich hab' in deinem Auge', Op. 13 No. 5. Among his focal points is the way in which she subverts cadential closure, as in the final bars of the former song, where the tonic chord is imbued with an aura of equivocation, sounding at once resolved and unresolved. Complementing Rodgers's chapter, Krebs considers Schumann's approach to text setting in a cross section of songs, with a focus on cases where she adapts (for expressive purpose) the declamation suggested by the rhythm of the poetry. These range from momentary deviations, as in 'Am Strande', to instances where irregular patterns of declamation are deployed across an entire song, as in 'Liebst du um Schönheit', Op. 12 No. 4. Krebs, like Rodgers and Youens, probes the interrelationship between technical details and expressive content, in

order to elucidate the ways in which Schumann's songs respond to the emotional and semantic subtleties of the poetic texts on which they are based.

My own chapter, the first in a cluster of studies devoted to Schumann's instrumental music, examines her Piano Concerto in A minor, Op. 7, with a focus on its juxtaposition of the public and the private, the physical and the intimate. Central to this is her handling of the relationship between the soloist and the orchestra, especially in the second movement, where the latter remains silent throughout. These features form a starting point for thinking about the ways in which Schumann's Concerto engages with wider aesthetic discourses, such as the sublime and dream imagery, and for highlighting the new pathways she pursued at a pivotal point in the genre's development.

Notions of intertextuality are foregrounded further in Susan Wollenberg's reappraisal of the influence of J. S. Bach on Schumann's compositional style. Taking her cue from the documentary evidence of Schumann's study of Bach's music with Robert during the early years of their marriage, Wollenberg offers a multilayered analysis of the aspects of his 'Forty-Eight' Preludes and Fugues that she absorbed into her Three Preludes and Fugues, Op. 16, particularly the first of the set. The intertextual resonances – ranging from cases of direct borrowing, to broader stylistic and textural affinities – extend outwards to the fugal writing of the Finale of Schumann's Piano Trio in G minor, Op. 17, an example that Wollenberg considers in the closing pages of her study. Nicole Grimes picks up on these Bachian influences in her chapter on formal innovation and virtuosity in Schumann's Trio. For Grimes, the virtuosic nature of the piece is conveyed through Schumann's manipulation of sonata form, which she examines in relation to the New *Formenlehre*, and through the juxtaposition of pianistic brilliance and self-conscious historicism. Threaded throughout Grimes's analysis is a consideration of the piece's relationship to the development of the genre, not only in terms of compositional style but also in regard to contemporaneous debates about virtuosity. This approach leads to a balanced view of Schumann's engagement with earlier piano trios, both as a performer and a composer, and of the influence of her own Trio on subsequent essays in this genre, notably those by Robert Schumann (Op. 63), Johannes Brahms (Op. 8) and Bedřich Smetana (Op. 15).

Musical dialogues and intertextual exchanges assume a range of guises in the Schumanns' circle, as Katharina Uhde and R. Larry Todd demonstrate