

IN THE SHADOW OF LEVIATHAN

Thomas Hobbes and John Locke sit together in the canon of political thought but are rarely treated in common historical accounts. This book narrates their intertwined careers during the Restoration period, when the two men found themselves in close proximity and entangled in many of the same political conflicts. Bringing new source material to bear, *In the Shadow of Leviathan* establishes the influence of Hobbesian thought over Locke, particularly in relation to the pre-eminent question of religious toleration. Excavating Hobbes's now forgotten case for a prudent, *politique* toleration gifted by sovereign power, Jeffrey Collins argues that modern, liberal thinking about toleration was transformed by Locke's gradual emancipation from this Hobbesian mode of thought. This book investigates those landmark events – the civil war, Restoration, the popish plot, the Revolution of 1688 – which eventually forced Locke to confront the limits of *politique* toleration, and to devise an account of religious freedom as an inalienable right.

JEFFREY R. COLLINS is Associate Professor of History at Queen's University, Canada. He is the author of *The Allegiance of Thomas Hobbes* (2005) and numerous articles on early modern religion and political thought in journals such as *Modern Intellectual History* and the *Journal of Modern History*. He is also a regular book reviewer for the *Wall Street Journal* and the *Times Literary Supplement*.

IDEAS IN CONTEXT

Edited by David Armitage, Richard Bourke, Jennifer Pitts and John Robertson

The books in this series will discuss the emergence of intellectual traditions and of related new disciplines. The procedures, aims and vocabularies that were generated will be set in the context of the alternatives available within the contemporary frameworks of ideas and institutions. Through detailed studies of the evolution of such traditions, and their modification by different audiences, it is hoped that a new picture will form of the development of ideas in their concrete contexts. By this means, artificial distinctions between the history of philosophy, of the various sciences, of society and politics, and of literature may be seen to dissolve.

The series is published with the support of the Exxon Foundation.

A list of books in the series can be found at the end of the volume.

IN THE SHADOW
OF LEVIATHAN

John Locke and the Politics of Conscience

JEFFREY R. COLLINS

Queen's University, Ontario



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-74622-9 — In the Shadow of Leviathan
Jeffrey R. Collins
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108746229
DOI: 10.1017/9781108778879

© Jeffrey R. Collins 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020
First paperback edition 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-108-47881-6 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-108-74622-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,
or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-74622-9 — In the Shadow of Leviathan
Jeffrey R. Collins
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For Mark Kishlansky, in memoriam

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>Note on the Text</i>	x
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xi
Introduction	i
1 John Locke and Interregnum Hobbism	15
2 The Restoration Projects of Thomas Hobbes	63
3 Locke and the Restoration <i>Politique</i>	116
4 Non-domination Liberty in Spiritual Context	172
5 Locke, Conscience, and the <i>Libertas Ecclesiae</i>	212
6 Locke and Catholicism: The ‘Roman Leviathan’	271
7 Locke and a ‘More Liberal’ Hobbism	315
Conclusion: Conscience and Liberalism’s Two Paths	360
<i>Bibliography</i>	378
<i>Index</i>	421

Acknowledgements

Any new book on canonical figures such as John Locke or Thomas Hobbes, and still more a book on both, is necessarily a collaborative enterprise. Working on this project over too many years, I have benefited enormously from the published research, correspondence, and personal advice of a large number of colleagues. My sincere thanks are therefore extended to Arash Abizadeh, Donald Akenson, Teresa Bejan, Ronald Beiner, William Bulman, Paul Cheney, Robin Douglass, Paul Halliday, John Harpham, Robert Ingram, Andrew Jainchill, Andrew Lister, John Marshall, John Morrill, Eric Nelson, Jon Parkin, Steve Pincus, Timothy Raylor, Jacqueline Rose, David C. Smith, Timothy Stanton, Richard Tuck, Laurens von Apeldoorn, and Sam Zeitlan. I have presented portions of this book at many seminars and workshops. My thanks go to those who organized or attended presentations at the University of Chicago, McGill University, Concordia University, the University of Toronto, Queen's University, the Huntington Library, the Folger Library, several sessions of the North American Conference of British Studies, the annual conference of the International Society for Intellectual History, the Triangle Intellectual History Seminar at Duke University, Leiden University, the University of Helsinki, the Institute for Historical Study, and (on more than one occasion) Cambridge University.

For financial and institutional support during the research and writing of this book I am grateful to Queen's University, the history department of Queen's University, the Huntington Library, Clare Hall of Cambridge University, the Hoover Institute, and the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada.

Paul Monod, my first mentor in the discipline of history, read the entire manuscript of this book, as did my friend and colleague Brent Sirota. Both provided invaluable advice. Felix Waldmann and I have corresponded regularly and productively as we pursued related research projects, and on two occasions (in the latter instance in coordination with his co-author J. C. Walmsley) he very generously shared manuscript discoveries with me

Acknowledgements

ix

before their publication. I must reserve particular expressions of gratitude for two pre-eminent scholars of John Locke. Professors Mark Goldie and John Milton both read this manuscript closely and provided me with very extensive and supportive critiques. Their technical knowledge, interpretive skill, and collegial generosity improved the book immeasurably. Remaining faults are entirely my own. I am also deeply grateful to the librarians and archivists, too numerous to name, who have assisted me with their collections. I warmly thank David Armitage, who encouraged me to submit this manuscript to Cambridge University Press's outstanding Ideas in Context series, and Elizabeth Friend-Smith, under whose exemplary editorship the series happily falls.

My final words of gratitude are of a more personal nature: to my parents, Randall and Patricia Collins, for ongoing support; to my wife and fellow historian, Ana Siljak (whose advice greatly improved this book); and to our three children, Theodore, Natalia, and Alexander (who undoubtedly delayed its appearance but made the years of its composition infinitely more joyous).

Mark Kishlansky, my doctoral supervisor, mentor, and friend, passed away too soon in 2015. We discussed this book on many occasions, and I wish that he had lived to see it between covers. With gratitude and sadness I dedicate it to his memory.

Note on the Text

Citations in this book follow Cambridge's short-title method, or the List of Abbreviations. Fuller publication information is provided in the Bibliography. Quotations follow the spelling and punctuation of the source text, except in rare instances where this might entail serious confusion. Abbreviations have been silently expanded in most instances, as have ampersands (which Locke, in particular, used with some frequency). Where translations are sourced to a modern, critical translation, I have followed that translation. Otherwise translations are my own. In cases where I have consulted original documents but a reliable, modern printed edition is available, I have quoted the former but cited both. All dates in this book presume the year to have begun on 1 January. Where a single date is provided, it follows the Old Style Julian Calendar used in the British Isles until 1752. In cases of documents or correspondence originating on the continent, both Old Style and New Style dates are provided.

Abbreviations

- AB* *Thomas Hobbes, An Answer to a Book Published by Dr. Bramhall, late Bishop of Derry; called the Catching of the Leviathan Together with an Historical Narration concerning Heresie, and the Punishment Thereof* (London, 1682).
- ABL* *Brief Lives: Chieflly of Contemporaries, set down by John Aubrey, between the years 1669 & 1696*, ed. Andrew Clark (2 vols., Oxford, 1898).
- AO* Anthony Wood, *Athenae Oxonienses*, ed. P. Bliss (4 vols., London, 1813–20).
- Beh.* Thomas Hobbes, *Behemoth*, ed. Paul Seaward (Oxford, 2010).
- Beinecke Beinecke Rare Books and Manuscripts Library, Yale University.
- Bodl. Bodleian Library, University of Oxford.
- BL British Library, London.
- CH* *The Correspondence of Thomas Hobbes*, ed. Noel Malcolm (2 vols., Oxford, 1994).
- CJ* *Journals of the House of Commons* (London, 1802), *British History Online*.
- CL* *The Correspondence of John Locke*, ed. E. S. de Beer (9 vols., Oxford, 1976–).
- CSPD* *Calendar of State Papers, Domestic, British History Online*.
- CSPV* *Calendar of State Papers, Venetian, British History Online*.
- DC* Thomas Hobbes, *On the Citizen [De Cive]*, ed. and trans. Richard Tuck and Michael Silverthorne (Cambridge, 1998).
- DCL* Thomas Hobbes, *A Dialogue between a Philosopher and a Student, of the Common Laws of England*, in *Writings on Common Law and Hereditary Right*, eds. Alan Cromartie and Quentin Skinner (Oxford, 2005).

- EcHU* John Locke, *An Essay concerning Human Understanding*, ed. Peter H. Nidditch (Oxford, 1975).
- EcT* John Locke, *An Essay concerning Toleration, and Other Writings on Law and Politics, 1667–1683*, ed. J. R. Milton and Philip Milton (Oxford, 2006).
- ELN* John Locke, *Essays on the Law of Nature and Associated Writings*, ed. W. von Leyden (Oxford, 1954).
- Epistola* John Locke, *Epistola de Tolerantia*, ed. Raymond Klibansky, trans. J. W. Gough (Oxford, 1968).
- HE* Thomas Hobbes, *Historia Ecclesiastica Carmine Elegiaco Concinnata*, trans. and ed. by Patricia Springborg, Patricia Stablein and Paul Wilson (Paris, 2008).
- HMC Historical Manuscripts Commission.
- HN* Thomas Hobbes, *Historical Narration concerning Heresie and the Punishment thereof* [Printed in, and continuously paginated with, *An Answer to a Book published by Dr. Bramall . . .* (London, 1682)].
- Huntington Huntington Library, San Marino, California.
- Lev.* Thomas Hobbes, *Leviathan*, ed. Noel Malcolm (3 vols., Oxford, 2012).
- LHW* John Locke, *Literary and Historical Writings*, ed. J. R. Milton (Oxford, 2019).
- LJ *Journals of the House of Lords* (London, 1767–1830), *British History Online*.
- LL *The Library of John Locke*, ed. John Harrison and Peter Laslett, 2nd. ed. (Oxford, 1971).
- LPQ *Letter from a Person of Quality to his Friend in the Country* (London, 1675).
- MHC Thomas Hobbes, *Mr Hobbes Considered in His Loyalty, Religion, Reputation, and Manners. By Way of a Letter to Dr. Wallis* (London, 1662).
- MS Locke Bodleian Library, MS Locke.
- ODNB *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* [online].
- PNP John Locke, *A Paraphrase and Notes on the Epistles of St Paul to the Galatians, 1 and 2 Corinthians, Romans, and Ephesians* (2 vols., Oxford, 1987).
- PE John Locke, *Political Essays*, ed. Mark Goldie (Cambridge, 1997).

List of Abbreviations

xiii

- PV* Prose Vita of Hobbes. Translated in *The Elements of Law, Human Nature, and De Corpore Politico*, ed. J. C. A. Gaskin (Oxford, 1994), 245–53.
- RLP* *The Reception of Locke's Politics*, ed. Mark Goldie (6 vols., London, 1999).
- SLT* John Locke, *A Second Letter concerning Toleration* (London, 1690).
- TLT* John Locke, *A Third Letter for Toleration, to the author of the Third Letter concerning Toleration* (London, 1692).
- TNA* National Archives, Kew.
- TTG* *Two Treatises of Government: A Critical Edition*, ed. Peter Laslett (2nd edition, Cambridge, 1967).
- TT* John Locke, *Two Tracts on Government*, ed. Philip Abrams (Cambridge, 1967).
- VRC* *Vindications of the Reasonableness of Christianity*, ed. Victor Nuovo (Oxford, 2012).
- VV* Verse Vita of Hobbes. *The Life of Mr Thomas Hobbes of Malmesbury. Written by himself in a Latin poem and now translated into English* (London, 1680).