

## LAW STUDENT PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT AND FORMATION

Law schools currently do an excellent job of helping students to “think like a lawyer,” but empirical data show that clients, legal employers, and the legal system need students to develop a wider range of competencies. This book helps legal educators to understand these competencies and provides practical ways to build them into a law school curriculum. Based on recommendations from the American Bar Association, the American Association of Law Schools, and the Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching, it will equip students with the skills they need not only to think but also to act and feel like a lawyer. With this proposed model, students will internalize the need for professional development toward excellence, their responsibility to others, a client-centered approach to problem solving, and strong well-being practices. These four goals constitute a lawyer’s professional identity, and this book empowers legal educators to foster each student’s development of a professional identity that leads to a gratifying career that serves society well. This title is Open Access.

Neil W. Hamilton has focused on the professional development and formation of law students in his teaching since 1987 and in his scholarship since 2001 with fifty-seven law journal articles and a book, *ROADMAP: The Law Student’s Guide to Meaningful Employment* (2d ed. 2018). He is the Thomas and Patricia Holloran Professor of Law and founding director of the Holloran Center for Ethical Leadership in the Professions at the University of St. Thomas School of Law.

Louis D. Bilonis is Dean Emeritus and Droege Professor of Law at the University of Cincinnati College of Law and a Fellow at the Holloran Center. An experienced administrator, teacher, and scholar, he has focused particularly on strategies for leading change in legal education.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-108-74565-9 — Law Student Professional Development and Formation

Neil W. Hamilton , Louis D. Billionis

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

---

# Law Student Professional Development and Formation

BRIDGING LAW SCHOOL, STUDENT,  
AND EMPLOYER GOALS

**NEIL W. HAMILTON**

University of St. Thomas

**LOUIS D. BILIONIS**

University of Cincinnati



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
 978-1-108-74565-9 — Law Student Professional Development and Formation  
 Neil W. Hamilton, Louis D. Bilonis  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
 New Delhi – 110025, India  
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108745659](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108745659)

DOI: [10.1017/9781108776325](https://doi.org/10.1017/9781108776325)

© Cambridge University Press 2022

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at [doi.org/10.1017/9781108776325](https://doi.org/10.1017/9781108776325) under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this license, visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0>

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties.

Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI [10.1017/9781108776325](https://doi.org/10.1017/9781108776325)

First published 2022

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

### *Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

NAMES: Hamilton, Neil W., author. | Bilonis, Louis D., author.

TITLE: Law student professional development and formation : bridging law school, student, and employer goals / Neil W. Hamilton, University of St. Thomas; Louis D. Bilonis, University of Cincinnati.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2022. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2021062709 (print) | LCCN 2021062710 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108745659 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108776325 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Practice of law – Study and teaching – United States.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KF272 .H36 2022 (print) | LCC KF272 (ebook) | DDC 340.071/173–dc23/eng/20220208

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021062709>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021062710>

ISBN 978-1-108-74565-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-108-74565-9 — Law Student Professional Development and Formation  
Neil W. Hamilton , Louis D. Billionis  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*To my children and their spouses, Shaan and Laura, Maya and Derek, and Kyra and Jon, who inspire me each day through their tireless love and support of the next generations. – NWH*

*To the mentors who have known me better than I know myself – my wife Ann Hubbard, our daughter Graciela, Judith Wegner, Martha Crunkleton, and John Williams. – LDB*

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-108-74565-9 — Law Student Professional Development and Formation  
Neil W. Hamilton , Louis D. Billionis  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> xi
<i>List of Tables</i>	xii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiv
<b>1 Introduction: The Four Foundational Professional Development and Formation (PD&amp;F) Goals and Their Benefits for Students, Faculty, Staff, and Administrators</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 The Benefits of a More Effective Curriculum to Foster PD&F Goal 1: Each Student’s Ownership of Continuous Professional Development toward Excellence at the Competencies That Clients, Legal Employers, and the Legal System Need	3
1.2 The Benefits of a More Effective Curriculum to Foster PD&F Goal 2: Each Student’s Deep Responsibility and Service Orientation to Others, Especially the Client	4
1.3 The Benefits of a More Effective Curriculum to Foster PD&F Goal 3: Each Student’s Client-Centered Problem-Solving Approach and Good Independent Professional Judgment That Ground Each Student’s Responsibility and Service to the Client	7
1.4 The Benefits of a More Effective Curriculum to Foster PD&F Goal 4: Student Well-Being Practices	13
1.5 Realizing These Benefits at Your School	15
Appendix A A Summary of the Empirical Studies That Define the Foundational Competencies That Clients and Legal Employers Need	17

<b>2</b>	<b>A Framework for Purposefulness to Realize the Four Professional Development and Formation Goals</b>	<b>28</b>
2.1	How to Think about Professional Identity Formation	30
2.1.1	Choose a Workable Conception of Professional Identity	30
2.1.2	See the Formation of Professional Identity as Principally a Process of Socialization	31
2.1.3	Recognize the Components of Professional Identity Formation and the Interrelationship between Them – and the Significance of Competencies	32
2.2	How to Think – and Not Think – About Supporting Professional Identity Formation	37
2.2.1	Think First and Foremost of the Student’s Socialization and Formation Experiences: What Law Faculty Do Is Important, but Only One of Many Means to the End	37
2.2.2	Think about Taking Responsibility and Asserting Leadership: What Law Schools Can Do Is Not Limited to “Teaching” by the Faculty	38
2.2.3	Think about Curating and Coaching: Teaching Is Not Limited to the Transmission of Expert Knowledge	40
2.2.4	Think Enterprise Wide: Professional Identity Formation Support Already Occurs throughout the Law School and Can Serve – Rather Than Detract from – Established Goals and Priorities	43
2.3	How to Advance the Law School’s Own Professional Development	49
2.3.1	Support the Law School’s Own Professional Development	49
2.3.2	Be Purposeful in Project Management	50
2.3.3	Nurture Relationships and Collaborations	51
2.3.4	Understand Lessons Learned from Medical Education	52
<b>3</b>	<b>Competency-Based Education as Another Step in Purposefulness – Lessons Learned from Medical Education’s Fifteen Years of Additional Experience with Professional Development and Formation Goals</b>	<b>53</b>
3.1	Medical Education’s Move toward Defining Core Competencies and Stages of Development on Each Competency	53



<i>Contents</i>	<i>ix</i>
3.2 Lessons Learned in Moving toward Competency-Based Medical Education (CBME)	55
3.3 Applying Lessons Learned from CBME to Legal Education	60
<b>4 Ten Principles to Inform Curriculum Development</b>	<b>64</b>
4.1 Principle 1 Milestone Models Are Powerful Tools	67
4.2 Principle 2 Sequenced Progressions of Curriculum and Assessment Modules Are Powerful Tools	69
4.3 Principle 3 Go Where They Are	70
4.4 Principle 4 Reflection and Self-Assessment Are Powerful Tools	72
4.5 Principle 5 Mentoring and Coaching Are Powerful Tools to Be Combined	75
4.6 Principle 6 Major Transitions Are Pivotal to Development – and Major Opportunities for Support	82
4.7 Principle 7 Connect Professional Development and Formation to the Student Personally	87
4.8 Principle 8 Think Very Differently about Assessment on PD&F Goals	89
4.9 Principle 9 Student Portfolios Can Help Students Progress	94
4.10 Principle 10 Program Assessment on PD&F Goals Becomes Clear and Manageable if Principles 1 through 9 Are Heeded and Implemented	96
Appendix B Milestone Models for All Four PD&F Goals	99
Appendix C Further Research Needed on the Major Transitions for Law Students	111
Appendix D Milestone Model on Reflection and Reflection Writing Assignment Grading Template	112
<b>5 Going Where Each Major Stakeholder Is and Building Bridges among Them in Order to Realize the Four Professional Development and Formation Goals</b>	<b>118</b>
5.1 Assess Local Conditions with Respect to the Faculty, Staff, and Administrators	119
5.2 Build a “Coalition of the Willing”	121
5.3 Build a Learning Community of Faculty and Staff Interested in Any of the Four PD&F Goals	122
5.4 Always “Go Where They Are” with Respect to Faculty, Staff, and Administrators	123
5.5 Repeatedly Emphasize the Value and Importance of “Curating”	124

5.6	Recognize the Scope of the Challenge in Fostering a Shared Understanding among Faculty, Staff, and Administrators about the Stages of Student Development on Competencies beyond Those Most Familiar to Law Schools. Focus on Gradual Small Steps Tailored to Local Conditions	125
5.7	Emphasize That There Are Many Successful Examples That Can Be Followed or Adapted to Foster Student Growth toward Later Stages of the Four PD&F Goals – and Draw from Them	126
5.7.1	A Milestone Model on the Goal/Learning Outcome That Is of Most Interest Given Local Conditions	127
5.7.2	A Required PD&F Curriculum in the 1L Year	127
5.7.3	A Requirement That Each Student Create and Implement a Written Professional Development Plan with Coaching Feedback (the ROADMAP Curriculum)	129
5.7.4	A 1L Constitutional Law Curriculum That Also Fosters Student Professional Development and Formation	131
5.7.5	A 1L Required Course on the Legal Profession	132
5.7.6	A PD&F Curriculum Development Resource to Be Published in 2022	134
5.8	Go Where the Students Are to Build a Bridge from Their Personal Goals to the Competencies That Clients, Legal Employers, and the Profession Need	134
5.8.1	What Are the Students’ Goals?	135
5.8.2	What Are the Competencies That Clients, Legal Employers, and the Profession Need?	136
5.8.3	Building a Bridge of Coordinated Curricular Modules to Connect the Students’ Goals to Client, Legal Employer, and the Profession’s Needs	138
5.9	Go Where the Legal Employers, Clients, and Profession Are and Build a Bridge Demonstrating That the Law School’s Graduates Are at a Later Stage of Development on the Competencies Employers, Clients, and the Profession Need	141
Appendix E	Coaching Guide for a Meeting on Each 1L Student’s ROADMAP	146
6	The Opportunity to Lead	157
	Index	161

Figures

1	Foundational Competencies Model based on empirical studies of the competencies clients and legal employers need	<i>page 12</i>
2	How the competencies that legal employers and client want build on each other	34
3	Dreyfus and Dreyfus Development Model	57
4	Competency-based legal education’s two central core components informing the three other components in local CBLE programs	62
5	Holloran competency alignment model showing the stages of development of learning outcome competencies: A continuum from entry into law school throughout a career	69
6	Foundational Competencies Model based on empirical studies of the competencies clients and legal employers need	137
7	The ROADMAP FOR EMPLOYMENT template framework	149

Tables

1	Convergence of the empirical studies on the nontechnical competencies that lawyers and legal employers identify as important for the practice of law	<i>page</i> 18
2	Thomson Reuters interviews: What are the top ten competencies that are needed for a successful twenty-first century lawyer?	19
3	Thomson Reuters surveys: What are the top ten competencies that are needed for a successful twenty-first century lawyer?	19
4	Synthesis of the Thomson Reuters interview and survey data: Top competencies needed for a successful twenty-first century lawyer	20
5	IAALS's analysis to identify the lawyer competencies that appeared in 5 percent or more of the AVVO reviews of lawyers in the period 2007–2017	21
6	2019 BTI Consulting Group survey of law firm client service performance (350 interviews with senior in-house counsel)	22
7	2020 NCBE Survey Ranking of the Most Critical Skills and Abilities for Newly Licensed Lawyers	23
8	IAALS 2020 Twelve Building Blocks of Minimum Competence for a New Lawyer	24
9	Competencies Highlighted in Regan and Rohrer's Interviews with 278 Law Firm Partners	25
10	The five core components of competency-based medical education	56
11	ACGME harmonized milestone on evidence-based and informed practice	58
12	A comparison of traditional versus competency-based medical education	59
13	The five core components of competency-based legal education	61
14	The purpose and function of Milestones for the four PD&F goals	63
15	Comparison of mentors and coaches	77

*List of Tables* xiii

16	Foundational competencies for a law student mentor/coach	80
17	Experiences in the 1L year and the following summer that 50 percent or more of the students thought had a great, substantial, or moderate impact on their transition from thinking and acting like a student to thinking and acting like a junior lawyer with respect to ownership over continuous professional development	86
18	Law school faculty and staff observing students on any of the four PD&F goals (especially in authentic professional experiences)	93
19	Holloran Center Milestone Model on assessment of student's ownership of continuous professional development (self-directedness)	100
20	Milestone Model on assessment of student's stage of development on a deep responsibility and service orientation to others, especially the client	104
21	Milestone Model on client-centered problem solving and good judgment	107
22	Milestone Model on well-being practices	110
23	Transitions on ownership over a student's continuous professional development that should be included in a survey after the summer between the 2L and 3L years, and a survey at the end of the 3L year	111
24	Percentage of law schools adopting a learning outcome building on a student's internalized responsibility and service to others	120
25	The thirteen most helpful hiring criteria for employers hiring students for postgraduation employment	144

## Acknowledgments

Our students for the seventy-seven years that we jointly have been teaching law have inspired us and helped us to grow each year. We are deeply grateful. We write this book in the hope that we can pay forward to future generations of law students all that we have been given by our students and by those who mentored and coached us over the years. Our hope is that law schools will help all law students to visualize and achieve their goals while living toward widening circles of care and service to others and the values of our profession.

We deeply appreciate all the support we have received over many years from both of our law schools, the University of St. Thomas School of Law and the University of Cincinnati College of Law, and our colleagues at both schools. Lest there be any doubt, we are not speaking for our schools in this book.

We stand on the shoulders of many people in writing this book and to them we are also deeply grateful. Tom Holloran played an enormous role in shaping this book. Tom is the model of the lawyer we hope our students become, our mentor and friend, and the visionary and benefactor who in 2006 created the Thomas Holloran Center for Ethical Leadership in the Professions, which has supported our work leading to this book. Jerry Organ, a founding faculty member at St. Thomas with Professor Hamilton in 2001 who joined the Holloran Center in 2009 and became its codirector in 2016, has shaped our ideas, encouraged us, and partnered in growing the center. Center Fellows Barbara Glesner-Fines, Dean at UMKC School of Law, and Professor Kendall Kerew at Georgia State have also provided important creative support and encouragement.

There are so many wonderful colleagues nationally, sailing under different flags, with whom we have communed and shared ideas and support and who have inspired us. There are too many to list individually here, but they include more than 250 faculty and staff from more than 40 law schools who have been

*Acknowledgments*

xv

participants in the Holloran Center summer workshops on law student professional formation. We are also very grateful to all the scholars whose work we cite in this book.

Earlier work by leaders in the field whose work has been particularly influential for us include Bill Sullivan, Ann Colby, Judith Wegner, Lloyd Bond, and Lee Shulman, the authors of *Educating Lawyers* in 2007. Drs. Eric Holmboe and Robert Englander have generously shared the experience of medical schools with competency-based education.

The Holloran Center coordinator, Brady King, provided key support on all of the tables and figures. Annie Boeckers, a rising third-year student at the University of St. Thomas, gave us valuable support on the footnotes.

Writing a book is like running a marathon but stretched out over several years. We are grateful most of all for our spouses, Uve Hamilton and Ann Hubbard, for getting us through all the challenges with ideas, support, editing help, and love throughout. They are the wing-people who are always alongside us in life.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-108-74565-9 — Law Student Professional Development and Formation  
Neil W. Hamilton , Louis D. Billionis  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---