Law schools currently do an excellent job of helping students to “think like a lawyer,” but empirical data show that clients, legal employers, and the legal system need students to develop a wider range of competencies. This book helps legal educators to understand these competencies and provides practical ways to build them into a law school curriculum. Based on recommendations from the American Bar Association, the American Association of Law Schools, and the Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching, it will equip students with the skills they need not only to think but also to act and feel like a lawyer. With this proposed model, students will internalize the need for professional development toward excellence, their responsibility to others, a client-centered approach to problem solving, and strong well-being practices. These four goals constitute a lawyer’s professional identity, and this book empowers legal educators to foster each student’s development of a professional identity that leads to a gratifying career that serves society well. This title is Open Access.

Neil W. Hamilton has focused on the professional development and formation of law students in his teaching since 1987 and in his scholarship since 2001 with fifty-seven law journal articles and a book, ROADMAP: The Law Student’s Guide to Meaningful Employment (2d ed. 2018). He is the Thomas and Patricia Holloran Professor of Law and founding director of the Holloran Center for Ethical Leadership in the Professions at the University of St. Thomas School of Law.

Louis D. Bilionis is Dean Emeritus and Droege Professor of Law at the University of Cincinnati College of Law and a Fellow at the Holloran Center. An experienced administrator, teacher, and scholar, he has focused particularly on strategies for leading change in legal education.
Law Student Professional Development and Formation

BRIDGING LAW SCHOOL, STUDENT, AND EMPLOYER GOALS

NEIL W. HAMILTON
University of St. Thomas

LOUIS D. BILIONIS
University of Cincinnati
To my children and their spouses, Shaan and Laura, Maya and Derek, and Kyra and Jon, who inspire me each day through their tireless love and support of the next generations. – NWH

To the mentors who have known me better than I know myself – my wife Ann Hubbard, our daughter Graciela, Judith Wegner, Martha Crunkleton, and John Williams. – LDB
## Contents

### List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of Figures</th>
<th>page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of Figures</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of Tables</th>
<th>xii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### Acknowledgments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgments</th>
<th>xiv</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### 1 Introduction: The Four Foundational Professional Development and Formation (PD&F) Goals and Their Benefits for Students, Faculty, Staff, and Administrators

1.1 The Benefits of a More Effective Curriculum to Foster PD&F Goal 1: Each Student's Ownership of Continuous Professional Development toward Excellence at the Competencies That Clients, Legal Employers, and the Legal System Need

1.2 The Benefits of a More Effective Curriculum to Foster PD&F Goal 2: Each Student's Deep Responsibility and Service Orientation to Others, Especially the Client

1.3 The Benefits of a More Effective Curriculum to Foster PD&F Goal 3: Each Student's Client-Centered Problem-Solving Approach and Good Independent Professional Judgment That Ground Each Student's Responsibility and Service to the Client

1.4 The Benefits of a More Effective Curriculum to Foster PD&F Goal 4: Student Well-Being Practices

1.5 Realizing These Benefits at Your School

### Appendix A A Summary of the Empirical Studies That Define the Foundational Competencies That Clients and Legal Employers Need

17
A Framework for Purposefulness to Realize the Four Professional Development and Formation Goals

2.1 How to Think about Professional Identity Formation
   2.1.1 Choose a Workable Conception of Professional Identity
   2.1.2 See the Formation of Professional Identity as Principally a Process of Socialization
   2.1.3 Recognize the Components of Professional Identity Formation and the Interrelationship between Them – and the Significance of Competencies

2.2 How to Think – and Not Think – About Supporting Professional Identity Formation
   2.2.1 Think First and Foremost of the Student’s Socialization and Formation Experiences: What Law Faculty Do Is Important, but Only One of Many Means to the End
   2.2.2 Think about Taking Responsibility and Asserting Leadership: What Law Schools Can Do Is Not Limited to “Teaching” by the Faculty
   2.2.3 Think about Curating and Coaching: Teaching Is Not Limited to the Transmission of Expert Knowledge
   2.2.4 Think Enterprise Wide: Professional Identity Formation Support Already Occurs throughout the Law School and Can Serve – Rather Than Detract from – Established Goals and Priorities

2.3 How to Advance the Law School’s Own Professional Development
   2.3.1 Support the Law School’s Own Professional Development
   2.3.2 Be Purposeful in Project Management
   2.3.3 Nurture Relationships and Collaborations
   2.3.4 Understand Lessons Learned from Medical Education

3 Competency-Based Education as Another Step in Purposefulness – Lessons Learned from Medical Education’s Fifteen Years of Additional Experience with Professional Development and Formation Goals
   3.1 Medical Education’s Move toward Defining Core Competencies and Stages of Development on Each Competency
Contents

3.2 Lessons Learned in Moving toward Competency-Based Medical Education (CBME) 55
3.3 Applying Lessons Learned from CBME to Legal Education 60
4 Ten Principles to Inform Curriculum Development 64
4.1 Principle 1 Milestone Models Are Powerful Tools 67
4.2 Principle 2 Sequenced Progressions of Curriculum and Assessment Modules Are Powerful Tools 69
4.3 Principle 3 Go Where They Are 70
4.4 Principle 4 Reflection and Self-Assessment Are Powerful Tools to Be Combined 72
4.5 Principle 5 Mentoring and Coaching Are Powerful Tools 75
4.6 Principle 6 Major Transitions Are Pivotal to Development – and Major Opportunities for Support 82
4.7 Principle 7 Connect Professional Development and Formation to the Student Personally 87
4.8 Principle 8 Think Very Differently about Assessment on PD&F Goals 89
4.9 Principle 9 Student Portfolios Can Help Students Progress 94
4.10 Principle 10 Program Assessment on PD&F Goals Becomes Clear and Manageable if Principles 1 through 9 Are Heeded and Implemented 96
Appendix B Milestone Models for All Four PD&F Goals 99
Appendix C Further Research Needed on the Major Transitions for Law Students 111
Appendix D Milestone Model on Reflection and Reflection Writing Assignment Grading Template 112

5 Going Where Each Major Stakeholder Is and Building Bridges among Them in Order to Realize the Four Professional Development and Formation Goals 118
5.1 Assess Local Conditions with Respect to the Faculty, Staff, and Administrators 119
5.2 Build a “Coalition of the Willing” 121
5.3 Build a Learning Community of Faculty and Staff Interested in Any of the Four PD&F Goals 122
5.4 Always “Go Where They Are” with Respect to Faculty, Staff, and Administrators 123
5.5 Repeatedly Emphasize the Value and Importance of “Curating” 124
Recognize the Scope of the Challenge in Fostering a Shared Understanding among Faculty, Staff, and Administrators about the Stages of Student Development on Competencies beyond Those Most Familiar to Law Schools. Focus on Gradual Small Steps Tailored to Local Conditions

5.7 Emphasize That There Are Many Successful Examples That Can Be Followed or Adapted to Foster Student Growth toward Later Stages of the Four PD&F Goals – and Draw from Them

5.7.1 A Milestone Model on the Goal/Learning Outcome That Is of Most Interest Given Local Conditions

5.7.2 A Required PD&F Curriculum in the 1L Year

5.7.3 A Requirement That Each Student Create and Implement a Written Professional Development Plan with Coaching Feedback (the ROADMAP Curriculum)

5.7.4 A 1L Constitutional Law Curriculum That Also Fosters Student Professional Development and Formation

5.7.5 A 1L Required Course on the Legal Profession

5.7.6 A PD&F Curriculum Development Resource to Be Published in 2022

5.8 Go Where the Students Are to Build a Bridge from Their Personal Goals to the Competencies That Clients, Legal Employers, and the Profession Need

5.8.1 What Are the Students’ Goals?

5.8.2 What Are the Competencies That Clients, Legal Employers, and the Profession Need?

5.8.3 Building a Bridge of Coordinated Curricular Modules to Connect the Students’ Goals to Client, Legal Employer, and the Profession’s Needs

5.9 Go Where the Legal Employers, Clients, and Profession Are and Build a Bridge Demonstrating That the Law School’s Graduates Are at a Later Stage of Development on the Competencies Employers, Clients, and the Profession Need

Appendix E Coaching Guide for a Meeting on Each 1L Student’s ROADMAP

6 The Opportunity to Lead

Index
Figures

1 Foundational Competencies Model based on empirical studies of the competencies clients and legal employers need page 12
2 How the competencies that legal employers and client want build on each other 34
3 Dreyfus and Dreyfus Development Model 57
4 Competency-based legal education’s two central core components informing the three other components in local CBLE programs 62
5 Holloran competency alignment model showing the stages of development of learning outcome competencies: A continuum from entry into law school throughout a career 69
6 Foundational Competencies Model based on empirical studies of the competencies clients and legal employers need 137
7 The ROADMAP FOR EMPLOYMENT template framework 149
## Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Convergence of the empirical studies on the nontechnical competencies that lawyers and legal employers identify as important for the practice of law</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Thomson Reuters interviews: What are the top ten competencies that are needed for a successful twenty-first century lawyer?</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Thomson Reuters surveys: What are the top ten competencies that are needed for a successful twenty-first century lawyer?</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Synthesis of the Thomson Reuters interview and survey data: Top competencies needed for a successful twenty-first century lawyer</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>IAALS’s analysis to identify the lawyer competencies that appeared in 5 percent or more of the AVVO reviews of lawyers in the period 2007–2017</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>2019 BTI Consulting Group survey of law firm client service performance (350 interviews with senior in-house counsel)</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>2020 NCBE Survey Ranking of the Most Critical Skills and Abilities for Newly Licensed Lawyers</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>IAALS 2020 Twelve Building Blocks of Minimum Competence for a New Lawyer</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Competencies Highlighted in Regan and Rohrer’s Interviews with 278 Law Firm Partners</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>The five core components of competency-based medical education</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>ACGME harmonized milestone on evidence-based and informed practice</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>A comparison of traditional versus competency-based medical education</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>The five core components of competency-based legal education</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>The purpose and function of Milestones for the four PD&amp;F goals</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Comparison of mentors and coaches</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

16  Foundational competencies for a law student mentor/coach .................................................. 80
17  Experiences in the 1L year and the following summer that 50 percent or more of the students thought had a great, substantial, or moderate impact on their transition from thinking and acting like a student to thinking and acting like a junior lawyer with respect to ownership over continuous professional development ........................................... 86
18  Law school faculty and staff observing students on any of the four PD&F goals (especially in authentic professional experiences) ......................................................................................... 93
19  Holloran Center Milestone Model on assessment of student’s ownership of continuous professional development (self-directedness) ............................................................................. 100
20  Milestone Model on assessment of student’s stage of development on a deep responsibility and service orientation to others, especially the client .............................................................................. 104
21  Milestone Model on client-centered problem solving and good judgment ................................... 107
22  Milestone Model on well-being practices .................................................................................... 110
23  Transitions on ownership over a student’s continuous professional development that should be included in a survey after the summer between the 2L and 3L years, and a survey at the end of the 3L year ........................................................................................................... 111
24  Percentage of law schools adopting a learning outcome building on a student’s internalized responsibility and service to others .............................................................................................................. 120
25  The thirteen most helpful hiring criteria for employers hiring students for postgraduation employment ........................................................................................................................................... 144
Acknowledgments

Our students for the seventy-seven years that we jointly have been teaching law have inspired us and helped us to grow each year. We are deeply grateful. We write this book in the hope that we can pay forward to future generations of law students all that we have been given by our students and by those who mentored and coached us over the years. Our hope is that law schools will help all law students to visualize and achieve their goals while living toward widening circles of care and service to others and the values of our profession.

We deeply appreciate all the support we have received over many years from both of our law schools, the University of St. Thomas School of Law and the University of Cincinnati College of Law, and our colleagues at both schools. Lest there be any doubt, we are not speaking for our schools in this book. We stand on the shoulders of many people in writing this book and to them we are also deeply grateful. Tom Holloran played an enormous role in shaping this book. Tom is the model of the lawyer we hope our students become, our mentor and friend, and the visionary and benefactor who in 2006 created the Thomas Holloran Center for Ethical Leadership in the Professions, which has supported our work leading to this book. Jerry Organ, a founding faculty member at St. Thomas with Professor Hamilton in 2001 who joined the Holloran Center in 2009 and became its codirector in 2016, has shaped our ideas, encouraged us, and partnered in growing the center. Center Fellows Barbara Glesner-Fines, Dean at UMKC School of Law, and Professor Kendall Kerew at Georgia State have also provided important creative support and encouragement.

There are so many wonderful colleagues nationally, sailing under different flags, with whom we have communed and shared ideas and support and who have inspired us. There are too many to list individually here, but they include more than 250 faculty and staff from more than 40 law schools who have been
Participants in the Holloran Center summer workshops on law student professional formation. We are also very grateful to all the scholars whose work we cite in this book.

Earlier work by leaders in the field whose work has been particularly influential for us include Bill Sullivan, Ann Colby, Judith Wegner, Lloyd Bond, and Lee Shulman, the authors of *Educating Lawyers* in 2007. Drs. Eric Holmboe and Robert Englander have generously shared the experience of medical schools with competency-based education.

The Holloran Center coordinator, Brady King, provided key support on all of the tables and figures. Annie Boeckers, a rising third-year student at the University of St. Thomas, gave us valuable support on the footnotes.

Writing a book is like running a marathon but stretched out over several years. We are grateful most of all for our spouses, Uve Hamilton and Ann Hubbard, for getting us through all the challenges with ideas, support, editing help, and love throughout. They are the wing-people who are always alongside us in life.