

Communicative Efficiency

All living beings try to save effort, and humans are no exception. This groundbreaking book shows how we save time and energy during communication by unconsciously making efficient choices in grammar, lexicon and phonology. It presents a new theory of ‘communicative efficiency’, the idea that language is designed to be as efficient as possible, as a system of communication. The new framework accounts for the diverse manifestations of communicative efficiency across a typologically broad range of languages, using various corpus-based and statistical approaches to explain speakers’ bias towards efficiency. The author’s unique interdisciplinary expertise allows her to provide rich evidence from a broad range of language sciences. She integrates diverse insights from over a hundred years of research into this comprehensible new theory, which she presents step-by-step in clear and accessible language. It is essential reading for language scientists, cognitive scientists and anyone interested in language use and communication.

NATALIA LEVSHINA is a postdoctoral researcher at the Neurobiology of Language Department, Max Planck Institute for Psycholinguistics. She is the author of the best-selling book *How to Do Linguistics with R* (2015).

Communicative Efficiency

Language Structure and Use

Natalia Levshina

Max Planck Institute for Psycholinguistics, The Netherlands



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-74394-5 — Communicative Efficiency: Language Structure and Use
Natalia Levshina
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108743945
DOI: 10.1017/9781108887809

© Natalia Levshina 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023
First paperback edition 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-108-84079-8 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-108-74394-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-108-74394-5 — Communicative Efficiency: Language Structure and Use

Natalia Levshina

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

To my teachers

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> x
<i>List of Tables</i>	xii
<i>Preface</i>	xv
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xvi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvii

Part I Different Types of Efficiency in Language	1
1 Communicative Efficiency: Main Concepts	3
1.1 What Is Communicative Efficiency?	3
1.2 Benefits and Costs in Communication	8
1.3 How to Be Efficient?	18
1.4 Three Principles of Efficient Communication	23
1.5 ‘Good-Enough’ Efficiency	29
1.6 Conclusions	34
2 Efficiency and Formal Length	36
2.1 Efficient Length Asymmetries	36
2.2 Accessibility of Referents and Length of Referential Expressions and Markers	37
2.3 Grammatical Coding Asymmetries and Splits	46
2.4 The Use and Omission of Clause Connectors	50
2.5 Same-Subject and Different-Subject Constructions	55
2.6 Zipf’s Law of Abbreviation	57
2.7 Phonetic Reduction and Enhancement	61
2.8 Conclusions	65
3 Efficiency and the Order of Meaningful Elements	66
3.1 Efficient Order	66
3.2 Factors Determining Efficiency of Order	66
3.3 Cross-Linguistic Manifestations of Efficient Order	76
3.4 Star Wars and Violations of Conventional Word Order	90
3.5 Conclusions	93

viii Contents

4	Other Ways of Saving Effort	95
4.1	Efficiency Beyond Coding Length and Word Order	95
4.2	Preference for Accessible Units and Interpretations	95
4.3	Analytic Support	97
4.4	<i>Horror Aequi</i> , or Avoidance of Identity	100
4.5	Entry Place for New Referents	102
4.6	Conclusions	103
Part II	Efficiency and Language Evolution	105
5	Emergence of Efficient Language Patterns	107
5.1	Changes Leading to Efficient Patterns	107
5.2	Efficiency-Driven Formal Reduction	109
5.3	Efficiency-Driven Formal Enhancement	111
5.4	Causal Models of Formal Reduction and Enhancement	118
5.5	Suppletion, Compositionality and the Competition of Meanings for Forms	128
5.6	Word Order Optimization	130
5.7	A Note on Teleology	132
5.8	Conclusions	134
6	From Trade-Offs to Causal Networks	136
6.1	Trade-Offs in Linguistics	136
6.2	Problems with Trade-Offs	139
6.3	From the Trade-Off between Case Marking and Word Order to a Multivariate Causal Network	144
6.4	Conclusions	151
Part III	Case Studies	153
7	Efficient Form–Meaning Mapping in Causative Constructions	155
7.1	The Causative Continuum	155
7.2	More Than Just Direct and Indirect Causation	161
7.3	Competition between Formal Parameters	175
7.4	Diachronic Evidence	182
7.5	An Artificial Language Learning Experiment	187
7.6	Conclusions	191
8	Differential Case Marking and Efficiency	193
8.1	Differential Case Marking	193
8.2	Cross-Linguistic Generalizations Related to Differential Case Marking	195
8.3	Explanations of Differential Case Marking	203
8.4	Reverse Engineering: Cross-Linguistic Generalizations and Corpus Data	208
8.5	Development of Differential Case Marking	223
8.6	Experimental Evidence from Artificial Languages	226
8.7	Conclusions	228
9	Efficient Use of Function Words in English Alternations	230
9.1	Construction–Filler Predictability and Efficiency	230
9.2	Stay (at) Home, Save Lives!	232

Contents	ix
9.3 Efficient Use of <i>Help (to)</i> Infinitive	234
9.4 Alternation <i>Go (and)</i> Verb	240
9.5 Conclusions	244
10 Conclusions and Perspectives	245
<i>Appendices</i>	250
Appendix 1 List of Languages in the Typological Sample Used in Chapter 7	251
Appendix 2 Corpus Frequencies of Different A and P from Previous Studies Used in Chapter 8	253
<i>References</i>	256
<i>Index</i>	288

Figures

1.1 A hierarchy of benefits in linguistic communication	<i>page</i> 10
1.2 Different types of costs in linguistic communication	10
2.1 Spearman’s rank correlation coefficients between word length and self-information, and between word length and contextual informativity	59
3.1 A sentence with crossing dependencies, according to the Universal Dependencies style	86
3.2 Proportions of nominal objects (horizontal axis) and pronominal objects (vertical axis) after verbs in the Universal Dependencies corpora	90
5.1 A pragmatic causal model of language change	119
5.2 A causal model of language change based on Zipf’s Rational Artisan	123
5.3 A causal model of language change based on Bybee’s usage-based approach	127
6.1 A Pareto frontier based on imaginary data with two different costs	137
6.2 A causal graph showing relationships between clarity, ease and context in communication	140
6.3 A graph displaying causal relationships between four types of cues	149
7.1 Percentage of the total number of causative situations in corpora of three languages	170
7.2 A conditional inference tree for French	172
7.3 Fragments of a video clip used in the experiment	189
7.4 Counts of short and long causative forms in the responses	190
8.1 Probabilities of different features of A based on corpora of spontaneous conversations in five languages	219
8.2 Probabilities of different features of P based on corpora of spontaneous conversations in five languages	220

List of Figures	xi
8.3 Probabilities of the role A given different features based on corpora of spontaneous conversations in five languages	221
8.4 Proportions of marked object forms produced by different pairs of participants in the online communication game	228
9.1 Effect of informativity on the chances of <i>go and</i> Verb vs. <i>go</i> Verb, based on a Generalized Additive Model	243

Tables

5.1 Different properties of language use and change	<i>page</i> 133
7.1 Correlation between formal compactness and semantic and syntactic parameters according to Dixon (2000)	161
7.2 Different types of causation in the typological sample, the meaning of the less compact form	164
7.3 Semantic variables used in the study based on the parallel corpus	171
7.4 Variables participating in splits that separate analytic from lexical causatives	173
7.5 Variables participating in splits that separate morphological from lexical causatives	173
7.6 Variables participating in splits that separate analytic from morphological causatives	174
7.7 Formal parameters associated with (in)directness of causation: number of contrasting pairs	180
8.1 Cross-linguistic distribution of differential transitive subject marking in AUTOTYP 0.1	199
8.2 Cross-linguistic distribution of differential object marking in AUTOTYP 0.1	200
8.3 Number of languages that fit (violate) the scales in the cross-linguistic differential and optional marking database	202
8.4 Reverse-engineered predictions for the distribution of features of A and P in discourse	211
8.5 Distribution of features of A (transitive subjects) within the role	214
8.6 Distribution of features of P within the role	216
8.7 Distribution of the roles within the features (only A shown)	217
8.8 Reverse-engineered predictions and the data	222
9.1 Frequency and informativity of the top twelve verbs most frequently used with locative (<i>at home</i>)	234

List of Tables	xiii
9.2 Frequencies of different subschemata of the construction with <i>help</i>	239
9.3 Spearman’s coefficients representing partial correlations between the proportions of <i>to</i> -infinitives and the informativity measures	240

Preface

This book is a result of two anachronisms. The first one is the old German tradition of writing a postdoctoral thesis. It is part of the habilitation process, which enables a researcher to become a professor. This intention has not materialized yet, but I really enjoyed the process itself when I was writing my habilitation thesis back in 2018. I found that the large format allowed me to put together many different things that I have been thinking about, so I decided to develop the thesis into something better and more comprehensive. And then suddenly came the second anachronism, the pandemic of the dangerous virus, which has been plaguing us since 2020. Never had I thought that such a thing would be possible in the twenty-first century. The shutdown, however, did have the proverbial silver lining, giving me the time and mental space necessary for thinking about the big picture.

Of course, a book may also be an anachronism these days, when important debates happen on Twitter or Facebook. I really hope we are not there yet, but for those who do not have time to read the whole text, the individual chapters should be sufficiently accessible. Some of them provide overviews of specific types of efficiency, while others are centred around a well-known linguistic phenomenon, such as causative constructions or differential case marking.

Thanks to my unconventional career path, or rather, stochastic Markov chain, I have had an opportunity to pursue different research directions and learn about different theories and methods from typology, functional and cognitive linguistics, psycholinguistics, neuroscience and corpus linguistics. I hope that this collection of findings from diverse disciplines will be useful to researchers from different frameworks and backgrounds, and will inspire more (and better) interdisciplinary research in language sciences.

Acknowledgements

An African proverb says, ‘It takes a village to raise a child.’ To paraphrase, it takes a research community to do science. This book is inspired by encounters with many brilliant people, face-to-face and more recently on Zoom. I could not possibly do justice to all of them here, to my colleagues and ex-colleagues in Leipzig, Nijmegen and around the world. Still, I must mention Martin Haspelmath, whose generous intellectual and practical support enabled me to start with this project when I was working in his Leipzig lab in 2016–2019. My work on this book has continued at the Max Planck Institute for Psycholinguistics in Nijmegen, where I have been working since 2019. I am particularly grateful to Peter Hagoort, the head of the Neurobiology of Language Department, who has given me a chance to learn about psycholinguistics and neuroscience, which are indispensable for efficiency research, in a very friendly and intellectually stimulating environment.

I have also learned a lot from my interactions with such experts on efficiency and closely related topics as Mira Ariel, Gertraud Fenk-Oczlon, Martin Haspelmath, John Hawkins, members and ex-members of Ted Gibson’s lab at the MIT, and many, many others. My special thanks go to all colleagues in the Language in Interaction Consortium, who have helped me to understand better the cognitive processes involved in human communication. Of course, all mistakes in this book are solely mine.

Financially, this research was possible thanks to the European Research Council (ERC) under the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme (grant agreement No. 670985) and later thanks to the Dutch Research Foundation NWO (Gravitation grant Language in Interaction, grant number 024.001.006).

I also want to thank my husband Björn for his unfailing faith in me and also for supporting me in my attempts to keep *mens sana in corpore sano*, which has been especially important and challenging in these strange times.

Abbreviations

1	1st person
2	2nd person
3	3rd person
1+2	1st person plural inclusive
A	grammatical role corresponding to the Agent
ABS	absolute
ACC	accusative
AGT	agentive
ART	article
ASP	aspect
CAUS	causative
CONV	converb
DAT	dative
DEC/INF	declarative informal
DEF	definite
DIM	diminutive
DIR	directional
ERG	ergative
EXP	experiential aspectual particle
F	feminine
FOC	focus
FUT	future
GEN	genitive
IM.P	immediate past
IND	indicative
INF	infinitive
INTR	intransitive
LOC	locative
M	masculine
NAR	narrative
NOM	nominative
NPST	non-past

xviii	List of Abbreviations
OBJ	object
Q	question particle
P	grammatical role corresponding to the Patient
IP	probability
PART	particle
PERF	perfect
PFV	perfective
PL	plural
POSS	possessive
PRES	present
PRO	pronoun
PST	past
REC.P	recent past
S	grammatical role corresponding to the intransitive Subject (in ergative languages)
SBJ	subject
SBJV	subjunctive
SFP	sentence-final particle
SG	singular
SUP	supine
TNS	tense
TR	transitive