

INFIDELS AND EMPIRES IN A NEW WORLD ORDER

Before international relations in the West, there were Christian–infidel relations. *Infidels and Empires in a New World Order* decenters the dominant story of international relations beginning with Westphalia in 1648 by looking a century earlier to the Spanish imperial debate at Valladolid addressing the conversion of native peoples of the Americas. In addition to telling this crucial yet overlooked story from the colonial margins of Western Europe, this book examines the Anglo-Iberian Atlantic to consider how the ambivalent status of the infidel other under natural law and the law of nations culminating at Valladolid shaped subsequent international relations in explicit but mostly obscure ways. From Hernán Cortés to Samuel Purchas, and Bartolomé de las Casas to New England Puritans, a host of unconventional colonial figures enter into conversation with Francisco de Vitoria, Hugo Grotius, and John Locke to reveal astonishing religious continuities and dissonances in early modern international legal thought with important implications for contemporary global society.

David M. Lantigua is Assistant Professor of Moral Theology and Christian Ethics at the University of Notre Dame. He was previously a faculty member at The Catholic University of America and was a former graduate fellow at the Notre Dame Institute for Advanced Study. He co-authored, with Darrell Fasching and Dell deChant, *Comparative Religious Ethics: A Narrative Approach to Global Ethics*, Second Edition (2011). He is also co-editor of *Bartolomé de las Casas and the Defense of Amerindian Rights: A Brief History with Documents* (2020), part of the Atlantic Crossings series.

LAW AND CHRISTIANITY

Series Editor

John Witte, Jr., Emory University

Editorial Board

- Nigel Biggar, University of Oxford
 Marta Cartabia, Italian Constitutional Court/University of Milano-Bicocca
 Sarah Coakley, University of Cambridge
 Norman Doe, Cardiff University
 Rafael Domingo, Emory University/University of Navarra
 Brian Ferme, Marcianum, Venice
 Richard W. Garnett, University of Notre Dame
 Robert P. George, Princeton University
 Mary Ann Glendon, Harvard University
 Kent Greenawalt, Columbia University
 Robin Griffith-Jones, Temple Church, London/King's College London
 Gary S. Hauk, Emory University
 R. H. Helmholz, University of Chicago
 Mark Hill QC, Inner Temple, London/Cardiff University
 Wolfgang Huber, Bishop Emeritus, United Protestant Church of Germany/Universities of
 Heidelberg, Berlin, and Stellenbosch
 Michael W. McConnell, Stanford University
 John McGuckin, Union Theological Seminary
 Mark A. Noll, University of Notre Dame
 Jeremy Waldron, New York University
 Michael Welker, University of Heidelberg

The Law and Christianity series publishes cutting-edge work on Catholic, Protestant, and Orthodox Christian contributions to public, private, penal, and procedural law and legal theory. The series aims to promote deep Christian reflection by leading scholars on the fundamentals of law and politics, to build further ecumenical legal understanding across Christian denominations, and to link and amplify the diverse and sometimes isolated Christian legal voices and visions at work in the academy. Works collected by the series include groundbreaking monographs, historical and thematic anthologies, and translations by leading scholars around the globe.

Books in the series

- The Possibility of Religious Freedom: Early Natural Law and the Abrahamic Faiths*
 Karen Taliaferro
- Catholic Social Teaching: A Volume of Scholarly Essays*
 edited by Gerard Bradley and E. Christian Brugger
- The Immortal Commonwealth: Covenant, Community, and Political Resistance in Early Reformed Thought*
 David P. Henreckson
- Great Christian Jurists in American History*
 edited by Daniel L. Dreisbach and Mark David Hall

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-73557-5 — Infidels and Empires in a New World Order
 David M. Lantigua
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Great Christian Jurists and Legal Collections in the First Millennium
 Philip L. Reynolds

English Ecclesiastical Lawyers: A History of Their Life and Work
 R. H. Helmholz

Law, Love and Freedom: From the Sacred to the Secular
 Joshua Neoh

Great Christian Jurists in French History
 Olivier Descamps and Rafael Domingo

Church Law in Modernity: Toward a Theory of Canon Law Between Nature and Culture
 Judith Hahn

Common Law and Natural Law in America: From the Puritans to the Legal Realists
 Andrew Forsyth

Care for the World: Laudato Si' and Catholic Social Thought in an Era of Climate Crisis
 edited by Frank Pasquale

Church, State, and Family: Reconciling Traditional Teachings and Modern Liberties
 John Witte, Jr.

Great Christian Jurists in Spanish History
 Rafael Domingo and Javier Martínez-Torrón

Under Caesar's Sword: How Christians Respond to Persecution
 edited by Daniel Philpott and Timothy Samuel Shah

God and the Illegal Alien
 Robert W. Heimbürger

Christianity and Family Law
 John Witte, Jr., and Gary S. Hauk

Christianity and Natural Law
 Norman Doe

Great Christian Jurists in English History
 edited by Mark Hill, QC, and R. H. Helmholz

Agape, Justice, and Law
 edited by Robert F. Cochran, Jr, and Zachary R. Calo

Calvin's Political Theology and the Public Engagement of the Church
 Matthew J. Tuininga

God and the Secular Legal System
 Rafael Domingo

How Marriage Became One of the Sacraments
 Philip L. Reynolds

Christianity and Freedom (Volume I: Historical Perspectives, Volume II: Contemporary Perspectives)

edited by Timothy Samuel Shah and Allen D. Hertzke

The Western Case for Monogamy Over Polygamy
 John Witte, Jr.

The Distinctiveness of Religion in American Law
 Kathleen A. Brady

Pope Benedict XVI's Legal Thought
 Marta Cartabia and Andrea Simoncini

Infidels and Empires in a New World Order

EARLY MODERN SPANISH CONTRIBUTIONS
TO INTERNATIONAL LEGAL THOUGHT

DAVID M. LANTIGUA
University of Notre Dame



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-73557-5 — Infidels and Empires in a New World Order
David M. Lantigua
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108735575

DOI: 10.1017/9781108633499

© David Lantigua 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

First paperback edition 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

NAMES: Lantigua, David M., author.

TITLE: Infidels and empires in a new world order : early modern Spanish contributions to international legal thought / David Lantigua, University of Notre Dame, Indiana.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY, USA Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Series: Law and Christianity | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2019049169 (print) | LCCN 2019049170 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781108498265 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108633499 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: International law – Spain – History – 16th century. | Indigenous peoples (International law) – History – 16th century. | Indians – Legal status, laws, etc. – History – 16th century. | Casas, Bartolomé de las, 1484–1566 – Influence.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KZ1242 .L36 2020 (print) | LCC KZ1242 (ebook) |

DDC 341.4/85209031–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019049169>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019049170>

ISBN 978-1-108-49826-5 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-73557-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-73557-5 — Infidels and Empires in a New World Order
David M. Lantigua
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For Marisa Ann

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
1 Introduction: International Relations Beyond Westphalia	1
Theology and the Universal Church	5
International Relations, Westphalia, and Anarchy	10
Valladolid and Infidels in a New World Order	21
PART I THE NEW WORLD CRUCIBLE OF INFIDEL RIGHTS	29
2 Theocratic World Order and Religious Wars	31
Crusades and the Rights of Infidels	33
Papalist World Order Under Iberian Rule	41
Taking Possession of the Indies	51
Religious Wars Against Idolatry	60
3 Spanish Dominicans and the “Affair of the Indies”	74
Initial Theological Debates About Conquest	77
Infidel Rights, Restitution, and World Order	92
Unjust War and the Ethic of Evangelization	115
4 The Politics of Natural Law at Valladolid, 1550–1551	141
Bishop Las Casas and the Valladolid Junta	144
Dispossessing Idolaters	165
The Imperial Politics of Natural Law	175

	PART II GOD, EMPIRES, AND INTERNATIONAL SOCIETY	187
5	From Infidels to Savages: Empires of Commerce and Natural Rights	189
	Christian Commerce by Force of Arms	194
	Individual Punishment in the State of Nature	211
	European Civilization and Land Ownership	226
6	The Scholastic Law of Nations, Native Occupation, and Human Solidarity	251
	The Spanish Scholastic-Juristic Law of Nations	254
	Political Agency and Consent in the Indies	270
	The Native Right of Resistance	289
	Lawful Occupation and the Christian Ethic of Intervention	302
	Conclusion	324
	<i>Bibliography</i>	329
	<i>Index</i>	346

Figures

1.1	“Frontispiece of Hobbes’s <i>De Cive</i> .” (Source: Wikimedia Commons, Frontispiece: Elementorum philosophiae sectio tertia de cive, Paris: 1642, by Thomas Hobbes. *EC65 H6525 642e, Houghton Library, Harvard University)	page 18
2.1	“Christopher Columbus Landing by Luigi Gregori.” (Source: photograph of Columbus Murals, University of Notre Dame by David Lantigua)	54
2.2	“Spanish attack on Aztec Temple with Tlaxcalan Allies.” (Source: Getty Images/UniversalImagesGroup/Contributor)	72
3.1	“Statue of Antonio de Montesino in Dominican Republic.” (Source: Getty Images/Christian Ender/Contributor)	94
3.2	“Statue of Francisco de Vitoria in front of Convento de San Esteban, Salamanca, Spain.” (Source: photograph by David Lantigua)	108
3.3	“South American Indians Panning and Working Gold.” (Source: Getty Images/Bettmann/Contributor)	117
3.4	“Domingo de Soto’s <i>In quartum Sententiarum</i> , dist. 5, q. unica, a. 10.” (Source: photograph of University of Salamanca manuscript by David Lantigua)	135
4.1	“Portrait of Bartolomé de las Casas.” (Source: Getty Images/DEA PICTURE LIBRARY/Contributor)	154
4.2	“Juan Ginés de Sepúlveda, 1490–1573.” (Source: Getty Images/Universal History Archive/Contributor)	178
5.1	“Native inhabitants of Virginia.” (Source: Getty Images/Leemage/Contributor)	224
5.2	“Roger Williams Lands in the New World.” (Source: Getty Images Stock Montage/Contributor)	232

5.3	“American Progress by John Gast.” (Source: Getty Images/ Fotosearch/Stringer)	245
6.1	“Sixteenth-Century Spanish drawing of Michoacan natives broken up according to distinct social functions.” (Source: Getty Images/Historical/Contributor)	279
6.2	“Emperors of Peru.” (Source: Getty Images/Hulton Archive/Stringer)	300

Acknowledgments

The ancient world acknowledged dependence on parents, the *patria*, and God. My parents, immigrants to a new world, have been an unfailing source of inspiration, teaching me the rewards of sacrifice and discipline. I am most grateful for their gifts of love and encouragement in my vocation as scholar and teacher. I also thank my amazingly talented sister Jacqueline and my dear brothers Carlos and Mitch for their love over the years. Without my parents, I would not have the level of gratitude for my *patria* and, especially, my Lord and my God. I would like to acknowledge another source of dependence to express my sincere gratitude – the academy. The professional colleagues and friends who have taken the time to converse, inquire, challenge, and, above all, share with me their brilliance and talents humbles and inspires me. There are too many to do justice to, but I shall try to thank a few.

First, my mentor and now colleague and neighbor, Jean Porter. Her careful guidance, judiciousness, and loyalty, combined with profound kindness, have exemplified the true way of being an academic scholar. Without her brilliant wisdom of Aquinas and ethics, I would never have entered the fascinating world of Spanish scholasticism. Her continual support and encouragement have given me confidence and trust to follow through this project. Other mentors and colleagues include Jerry McKenny and David Clairmont, both of whom have not only been sagacious guides professionally, but have also always shown me the dignity of being appreciated and welcomed. I look forward to many more cigars (or pipes) and glasses of rum with them over the years. I also wish to especially thank Tim Matovina and Matt Ashley for their support as chairs of the Department of Theology at Notre Dame, facilitating my time for researching and writing this book. Other colleagues I thank for various

reasons include Peter Casarella, William Mattison, Mary Keys, Neil Arner, Steven Battin, Fr. Kevin Grove, Todd Whitmore, Cyril O'Regan, Joseph Wawrykow, Fr. Paul Kollman, Ken Oakes, and John Cavadini.

There are others on my journey to whom I owe gratitude who have now passed into eternity. Darrell Fasching (2017), my mentor at the University of South Florida, taught me to think of Christianity always in terms of its other. And Sabine MacCormack (2012), a dear conversation partner who bridged for me the classical and early modern worlds thereby expanding my imagination about colonial Latin America. Another person who still graces us on earth is Gustavo Gutiérrez, OP. Padre Gustavo has taught me precious truths about the Christian faith. He is my teacher of Bartolomé de las Casas and I cherish the personal conversations with him about all things theological. There is also Ramón Hernández Martín, OP, whom I had the great pleasure of meeting and conversing with at San Esteban in Salamanca during my research. He pointed me to "*las fuentes*" that united the sixteenth-century Spanish Dominicans.

Indeed, there are so many others who have given me inspiration in various ways over the years. I am grateful to my friend Victor Carmona during my time as a graduate student, who helped inspire my interest in the topic, and also to Jennifer Herdt for her ecumenical wisdom of the Christian moral tradition. To Luis Vera, Deonna Neal, Andrew Prevot, Mike Griffin, and Jordan Wales, thank you all for your friendships and conversations. To my friend David Elliot, whose fearless theological inquiry I wish only to emulate. Others from whom I have benefitted with conversations and exchanges include Tim Shah, Paolo Carozza, Russell Hittinger, Matt Tapie, José Cárdenas, David Decosimo, Scott Davis, Ileana Porras, Daniel Brunstetter, Ángel Gallardo, and Garry Sparks. Fellow travelers to the Spanish scholastic world with whom I have greatly enjoyed talking include Elisabeth Kincaid, Catherine Kuiper, and Barrett Turner, who provided helpful feedback on a portion of the manuscript. I would also like to thank the assistance of Nick Ogle and the enriching conversations with Liam de los Reyes and Fr. Dominic Verner. I am especially grateful for the undeserving support and encouragement from a scholar's scholar, Robert Wilken.

Two fellow followers of Las Casas to whom I owe a great deal of gratitude are David Orique, OP, and Larry Clayton. They have inspired me through their work on Latin American colonial history. Fr. David is the embodiment of the Dominican spirit and he has become more than just a scholarly companion, but an incredibly thoughtful friend. Similarly, Larry has become a guide and friend over the last near decade. Gratitude belongs to other scholars who have provided me invaluable feedback on portions of the manuscript and the research: James Muldoon, Daniel Philpott, Luke Glanville, Luis Valenzuela-Vermehren, and

Acknowledgments

xv

Brian Tierney. I am especially grateful to conversation partner William Bain for his incisive and helpful comments on part of the manuscript. Others who have supported this project from The Catholic University of America include Fr. Mark Morozowich, Joe Capizzi, Josh Benson, Chad Pecknold, Bill Barbieri, Tom Cohen, Julia Young, and John Grabowski. The Strake Fund provided generous support in acquiring research materials.

I am incredibly grateful for Luis Fraga and the Institute for Latino Studies at Notre Dame, without which I would not have completed this manuscript. Tremendous thanks also go to Denise Wright and the Kellogg Institute for International Studies for providing me with resources to conduct research in Spain as a graduate student. And to the librarians at the priory of San Esteban in Salamanca, Miguel and Lita, for their patient assistance. For the Notre Dame Institute for Advanced Study, my academic home for a year, and its fantastic leadership and guidance then under Donald Stelluto, Vittorio Hösle, and Carolyn Sherman, I am so grateful. Thanks also to Julie Tanaka at the University of Notre Dame's Hesburgh Library.

Finally, I give my utmost thanks to John Witte as Series Editor for Law and Christianity at Cambridge University Press. Witte is a consummate scholar, teacher, administrator, and mentor. His immensely patient support and guidance has taken this project from its beginning stages and seeing it through to the end. It is my privilege and honor to share it with his series at Cambridge University Press. The editors at Cambridge have also been tremendously patient and helpful as the baton has passed from John Berger to Jackie Grant. I also wish to thank Sunantha Ramamoorthy, Helen Baxter, and the anonymous reviewer whose comments were instrumental to reconceiving this manuscript at an early stage.

Beyond the academy, there is gratitude for dependence on one's home and family. My dearest wife and best friend, Marisa, to you I dedicate this book. I am grateful to your parents, Jack and Maria, for their continual support and encouragement. You are my compass and guide for navigating an uncharted future together with our children. Your love, perseverance, and faith have simply made possible what was impossible. Through you, and through our children – Sofia, Natalia, Elena, and Lilia – I realize every day that the Kingdom of Heaven is near. We did it, as a team.