

CONSTITUTIONAL IDENTITY IN A EUROPE OF MULTILEVEL CONSTITUTIONALISM

Constitutional identity is a topic of increasing importance in understanding the interaction between the EU and its Member States. This is because the EU is enjoined, in accordance with Article 4(2) TEU, to respect the constitutional identities of the Member States. There is also a trend among the states to articulate their constitutional identities, in particular in relation to European integration. This volume fills a need in scholarship by presenting critical analyses of the constitutional identities of selected Member States. Leading and well-placed experts contribute country studies on a range of states, which are compared using a framework that can be applied to other Member States as well. The analyses and comparison of their constitutional identities take place in the context of the EU's multilevel architecture.

CHRISTIAN CALLIESS is Professor for Public and European Law at the Free University of Berlin, Germany. From 2015 until 2018, he was on leave in order to work as Legal Adviser to the European Political Strategy Centre (EPSC), the in-house think tank of the President of the European Commission and Head of the Institutional Team. Before 2015, he advised the German Parliament (Bundestag), also representing it before the German Constitutional Court and the European Court of Justice, among others, in the *ESM and OMT* case. He co-edits a legal commentary on European Law and has regularly published on matters of European, constitutional, and environmental law.

GERHARD VAN DER SCHYFF is an Associate Professor in the Department of Public Law and Governance at Tilburg Law School in the Netherlands. His research interests cover European and comparative constitutional law and fundamental rights. Gerhard's research has been referred to in various (minority) opinions, including those by the European Court of Human Rights and the Supreme Court of Appeal of South Africa. In 2015, he held a Humboldt Fellowship for Experienced Researchers at the Chair of Professor Christian Calliess at the Free University of Berlin.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-72739-6 — Constitutional Identity in a Europe of Multilevel Constitutionalism

Edited by Christian Calliess, Gerhard van der Schyff

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

CONSTITUTIONAL
IDENTITY IN A EUROPE
OF MULTILEVEL
CONSTITUTIONALISM

Edited by

CHRISTIAN CALLIESS

Free University of Berlin

GERHARD VAN DER SCHYFF

Tilburg University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-72739-6 — Constitutional Identity in a Europe of Multilevel Constitutionalism
Edited by Christian Calliess, Gerhard van der Schyff
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108727396
DOI: 10.1017/9781108616256

© Cambridge University Press 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020
First paperback edition 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data
Names: Calliess, Christian, 1964- editor. | Van der Schyff, Gerhard,
editor.

Title: Constitutional identity in a Europe of multilevel constitutionalism
/ edited by Christian Calliess, Free University of Berlin [and] Gerhard
van der Schyff, Tilburg University

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY, USA Cambridge
University Press, 2020. |

Identifiers: LCCN 2019025862 | ISBN 9781108480437 (hardback) | ISBN
9781108480437 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Constitutional law--European Union countries.

Classification: LCC KJC4445 .C6657 2020 | DDC 342.4--dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019025862>

ISBN 978-1-108-48043-7 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-72739-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,
or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

<i>List of Contributors</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiii
PART I Constitutional Identity Introduced and Its EU Law Dimension	1
1 Constitutional Identity Introduced	3
CHRISTIAN CALLIESS AND GERHARD VAN DER SCHYFF	
2 Article 4(2) TEU as a Vehicle for National Constitutional Identity in the Shared European Legal System	9
ANITA SCHNETTGER	
PART II Constitutional Identity and Its Member State Law Dimension	39
3 Constitutional Identity in Austria: Basic Principles and Identity beyond the Abolition of the Nobility	41
GEORG LIENBACHER AND MATTHIAS LUKAN	
4 Constitutional Identity in Belgium: A Thing of Mystery	59
ELKE CLOOTS	
5 Constitutional Identity in the Czech Republic: A New Twist on an Old-Fashioned Idea?	85
DAVID KOSAŘ AND LADISLAV VYHNÁNEK	
6 Constitutional Identity in Denmark: Extracting Constitutional Identity in the Context of a Restrained Supreme Court and a Strong Legislature	114
HELLE KRUNKE	

vi	CONTENTS	
7	Constitutional Identity in France: Vices and – Above All – Virtues	134
	FRANÇOIS-XAVIER MILLET	
8	Constitutional Identity in Germany: One for Three or Three in One?	153
	CHRISTIAN CALLIESS	
9	Constitutional Identity in Ireland: National and Popular Sovereignty as Checks on European Integration	182
	EOIN DALY	
10	Constitutional Identity in Italy: Institutional Disagreements at a Time of Political Change	201
	FEDERICO FABBRINI AND ORESTE POLLICINO	
11	Constitutional Identity in the Netherlands: Sailing with Others	222
	ERNST HIRSCH BALLIN	
12	Constitutional Identity in Poland: Is the Emperor Putting On the Old Clothes of Sovereignty?	243
	ANNA ŚLEDZIŃSKA-SIMON AND MICHAŁ ZIÓŁKOWSKI	
13	Constitutional Identity in Spain: Commitment to European Integration without Giving Up the Essence of the Constitution	268
	JOSÉ MARTÍN Y PÉREZ DE NANCLARES	
14	Constitutional Identity in the United Kingdom: An Evolving Concept	284
	PAUL CRAIG	
	PART III Comparative Constitutional Identity and Multilevel Constitutionalism	303
15	Member States of the European Union, Constitutions, and Identity: A Comparative Perspective	305
	GERHARD VAN DER SCHYFF	

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-72739-6 — Constitutional Identity in a Europe of Multilevel Constitutionalism
Edited by Christian Calliess , Gerhard van der Schyff
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

	CONTENTS	vii
16	The Protection of Constitutional Identity in a Europe of Multilevel Constitutionalism	348
	CHRISTIAN CALLIESS AND ANITA SCHNETTGER	
	<i>Index</i>	372

CONTRIBUTORS

CHRISTIAN CALLIESS, LL.M. (Bruges), is Professor for Public and European Law at the Free University of Berlin, Germany, and former (2015–2018) Legal Adviser to the European Political Strategy Centre (EPSC), the in-house think tank of the President of the European Commission.

ELKE CLOOTS is an attorney at the Antwerp bar and Professor of Media Law at the University of Antwerp. She holds a PhD in law from the University of Leuven and an MJur from the University of Oxford and has published widely in the field of Belgian and European constitutional law. She is the author of *National Identity in EU Law* (2015).

PAUL CRAIG is Professor of English Law at St John's College, Oxford. His research interests cover constitutional law, administrative law, and EU law, and he has written extensively in these areas. His latest book is *UK, EU and Global Administrative Law: Foundations and Challenges* (2015). He is the UK alternate member on the Venice Commission.

EÓIN DALY is a lecturer in the School of Law at the National University of Ireland, Galway. He specialises in the political theory of constitutional law, with a focus on republicanism, history of political thought, religious freedom, and church–state relations. He is author of *Rousseau's Constitutionalism: Austerity and Republican Freedom* (2017) and *Religion, Law and the Irish State* (2012) and co-author, with Tom Hickey, of *The Political Theory of the Irish Constitution* (2015).

FEDERICO FABBRINI is Full Professor of EU Law at the School of Law and Government of Dublin City University (DCU) and Director of the DCU Brexit Institute. He holds a PhD from the European University Institute and is the author of *Fundamental Rights in Europe* (2014), *Economic Governance in Europe* (2016), and *Introduzione al diritto dell'Unione europea* (2018).

ERNST HIRSCH BALLIN is Distinguished University Professor (Tilburg University), Professor in Human Rights Law (University of Amsterdam), and President of the Asser Institute for International and European Law. He is also a member of the Scientific Council for Government policy (WRR). Professor Hirsch Ballin was a member (2000–2006) and then the president (2003–2006) of the Administrative Jurisdiction Division of the Council of State until he was reappointed as Minister of Justice of the Netherlands (2006–2010). He has recently published on the future of the European Union, citizens' rights and fundamental rights protection, and trust in the rule of law.

DAVID KOSAŘ is Associate Professor of Constitutional Law and Director of the Judicial Studies Institute (JUSTIN) at Masaryk University in Brno, Czech Republic. He is the author of *Perils of Judicial Self-Government in Transitional Societies* (2016).

HELLE KRUNKE is Professor of Constitutional Law and Head of PhD School, Faculty of Law, University of Copenhagen. Her recent publications include *The Nordic Constitutions: A Comparative and Contextual Study* (2018); 'The Danish Ajos-Case – the Missing Case from Maastricht and Lisbon', *European Papers*, 3 (1), pp. 157–182 (2018); and *Judges as Guardians of Constitutionalism and Human Rights* (2016).

GEORG LIENBACHER is a member of the Austrian Constitutional Court and Professor of Public Law at the Institute for Austrian and European Public Law at the Vienna University of Economics and Business. He was Head of the Constitutional Service of the Federal Chancellery of Austria and Chairman of the Experts Group for State and Administrative Reform and has held, and still holds, various other positions in scientific organisations and authorities. He is the author of a large number of publications and editor of several legal journals and a commentary on the Austrian Federal Constitution.

MATTHIAS LUKAN is Assistant Professor at the Institute for Austrian and European Public Law at the Vienna University of Economics and Business. He is the author of several publications in the fields of state organisation law, human rights protection, and constitutional law.

JOSÉ MARTÍN Y PÉREZ DE NANCLARES is Professor for International Public Law and European Law at the University of Salamanca, Spain. He has been the Legal Adviser of the Spanish Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Cooperation (2012–2018). He is the author or editor of several books and over 100 scientific

CONTRIBUTORS

xi

articles, papers, and contributions to collective works on European and international matters, published in English, Spanish, French, and German. He is also a member of the Academic Board of the Max Planck Institute for International and Comparative Public Law of Heidelberg, Germany.

FRANÇOIS-XAVIER MILLET is Professor of Public Law at the University of the French West Indies and Research Associate at Toulouse-Capitole University, France. He is currently working as a legal clerk within the chambers of Advocate-General Bobek at the Court of Justice of the European Union. His main research interests lie in European and comparative constitutional law. He notably published *L'Union européenne et l'identité constitutionnelle des États membres* in 2013.

ORESTE POLLICINO is Full Professor of Constitutional Law at Bocconi University, Milan. He is author of more than 150 articles and 15 books (monographs and edited volumes) related to European constitutional law, judicial dialogue, and protection of fundamental rights in the digital age.

ANITA SCHNETTGER is a trainee lawyer at the Higher Regional Court Berlin (Kammergericht). From 2013 to 2017, she was a lecturer at the Free University of Berlin as well as a research assistant to the Chair for Public and European Law of Professor Christian Calliess.

ANNA ŚLEDZIŃSKA-SIMON is Assistant Professor of Constitutional Law at the University of Wrocław (Poland), Department of Law, Administration, and Economy. She is the author of several book chapters and articles on the principle of non-discrimination, gender equality, constitutional review, and human rights. She has recently co-edited with Andreas Wiesand and Kalliopi Chainoglou and in cooperation with Yvonne Donders the book *Culture and Human Rights: The Wrocław Commentaries* (2016); she has published on gender issues in Poland in Eleonore Lepinard and Ruth Rubio Marin (eds.), *Transforming Gender Citizenship: The Irresistible Rise of Gender Quotas in Europe* (2018); and she has written on Polish constitutional identity in *ICON* 13 (2015).

GERHARD VAN DER SCHYFF is an Associate Professor in the Department of Public Law and Governance at Tilburg Law School in the Netherlands. His lecturing and research interests cover European and comparative constitutional law and fundamental rights. This edited volume sprouts from the Humboldt Research Fellowship for Experienced Researchers, which he held

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-72739-6 — Constitutional Identity in a Europe of Multilevel Constitutionalism
Edited by Christian Calliess, Gerhard van der Schyff
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

xii

CONTRIBUTORS

in 2015 at the Chair for Public and European Law of Professor Christian Calliess at the Free University of Berlin.

LADISLAV VYHNÁNEK is Assistant Professor of Constitutional Law at the Faculty of Law, Masaryk University, in Brno and Legal Assistant at the Constitutional Court of the Czech Republic. His research interests include constitutional courts and judicial decision making.

MICHAŁ ZIÓŁKOWSKI is Assistant Professor at the Kozminski University of Warsaw, Poland, and has been Judicial Clerk at the Constitutional Tribunal (2008–2017). He is author of several articles on the principle of equality, constitutional review, state liability, and human rights and has recently published in the *European Constitutional Law Review* on Protocol No. 16 ECHR (in collaboration with Ada Paprocka), in *Constitutional Review* on constitutional moments and crises, and in *Państwo i Prawo* on equality law in Poland.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This edited volume is the product of a collaboration between Christian Calliess of the Free University of Berlin and Gerhard van der Schyff of Tilburg University in the Netherlands. The collaboration was made possible by the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation. The Foundation awarded Dr. van der Schyff a fellowship for experienced researchers, which he held at the Chair for European and Public Law of Professor Calliess, Free University of Berlin in 2015. It was during this fellowship that the idea for the volume germinated. The editors express their sincere gratitude to the Humboldt Foundation for making this collaboration possible.

The editors also thank the contributing authors for their cooperation in making this an EU-wide project on constitutional identity. A special word of gratitude is reserved for Anita Schnettger, whose competent and diligent assistance proved invaluable to the project. In realising this volume, it has been a pleasure to work with Finola O'Sullivan at Cambridge University Press and her colleagues.