1 *Sehet an die Exempel der Alten*

The Presence of the Past in Telemann's Sacred Vocal Music

STEVEN ZOHN

As a composer whose unusually long career traversed multiple historical epochs, from the 1690s to the 1760s, Georg Philipp Telemann maintained a complex relationship with the musical past. On the one hand, he had a healthy respect for much music of the previous generation, such as Arcangelo Corelli's sonatas, Jean-Baptiste Lully's operas, and Agostino Steffani's duets. On the other, he was deeply ambivalent about "ancient" music and musicians, criticizing what he saw as impoverished melodies, contrapuntal excesses, and a rejection of whatever was new. His artistic responses to old music reveal yet a third perspective, that of a composer at pains to bring outmoded musical idioms into a meaningful dialogue with more modern ones. In exploring this last perspective here, I consider a number of Telemann's vocal works in which archaic and modern styles are set beside each other, sometimes in the same movement. Two works in particular, church cantatas composed in Frankfurt during the period 1717–21, demonstrate how such juxtapositions can serve as rhetorically powerful tools for communicating a theological message. At the same time, they allow us an opportunity to pull the curtain back a bit further on the composer's historical consciousness.

Keith Chapin has argued persuasively that Telemann's ideas about old versus new music were shaped early on by the literature he was exposed to as a schoolboy by the learned Caspar Calvör at Zellerfeld, later by the particular form of *galant* behavior promoted by Christian Thomasius at Leipzig University, and ultimately by the French *Querelle* of the Ancients and Moderns. In his own works, the composer followed Thomasius's *galant* middle path by combining a modern compositional idiom that emphasized singing melodies with an ancient habitus that stressed exercising good judgment, by selecting appropriate compositional models, and by

I am grateful to Ellen Exner, Robin A. Leaver, and Bettina Varwig for their helpful comments on drafts of this chapter and to Eric F. Fiedler for furnishing me with electronic copies of his editions.

maintaining autonomy from tradition.[1] Telemann fashioned himself as a Modern in his autobiographical essays and correspondence by dismissing what he saw as the contrapuntal pedantry and melodic emptiness of the Ancients, as represented by his former colleague at the Sorau court, the composer and writer Wolfgang Caspar Printz (1641–1717). He recalled, in 1740, engaging the sixty-something Printz around 1705 in discussions about melody, in which the older musician "wailed bitterly about the melodic excesses of contemporary composers" while the twenty-something Telemann "laughed at the unmelodic artificiality of the old composers."[2]

Perhaps Telemann was again thinking of Printz and those of his ilk when, in a letter to Johann Mattheson of November 18, 1717, he praised his correspondent's championing of modern music as set out in the second part of *Das Beschützte Orchestre* (Hamburg, 1717): "I cannot but approve of both your intentions, the first of which is to make plain the false shine of the ancients and to chastise their capricious idolizing of themselves and condemning of the present age."[3] In *Das Neu-eröffnete Orchestre* (Hamburg, 1713), Mattheson had criticized what he viewed as the music-theoretical pedantry of Athanasius Kircher (1601–80) in the *Musurgia universalis* (Rome, 1650); now, in *Das Beschützte Orchestre*, he was responding to Johann Heinrich Buttstett (1666–1727), an Ancient of more recent vintage who had come to Kircher's defense in

[1] Keith Chapin, "Counterpoint: From the Bees or For the Birds? Telemann and Early Eighteenth-Century Quarrels with Tradition," *Music & Letters* 92/3 (2011): 377–409. For an alternative reading of some of Chapin's musical evidence, see Steven Zohn, "Morality and the 'Fair-Sexing' of Telemann's Faithful Music Master," in *Consuming Music: Individuals, Institutions, Communities, 1730–1830*, ed. Emily Green and Catherine Mayes (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2017), 74–9.

[2] Johann Mattheson, *Grundlage einer Ehren-Pforte* (Hamburg: Mattheson, 1740), 361: "Denn er beweinte bitterlich die Ausschweiffungen der itzigen melodischen Setzer; wie ich die unmelodischen Künsteleien der Alten belachte." Telemann noted that in these discussions he played the role of Democritus (known as the "laughing philosopher") and Printz that of Heraclitus (the "weeping philosopher"). It is possible that Telemann refrained from mentioning their substance in his 1718 autobiography out of respect for the recently deceased Printz. Instead, he observed that his time at Sorau "was also useful to me in that I was able to savor my conversations with the famous music theorist Mr. Caspar Printz." ("Sorau war mir auch in dem nutzbar/ daß die *Conversation* des berühmten *Musici theoretici*, Herrn Caspar Printzens/ geniessen konnte.") Johann Mattheson, *Grosse General-Baß-Schule. Oder: Der exemplarischen Organisten-Probe* (Hamburg: Kißner, 1731), 175.

[3] Telemann wrote the letter in French, and Mattheson published it alongside his own German translation in the *Critica musica*, 2 vols. (Hamburg: Mattheson 1725), 2:277–79, here at 277: "Je ne puis qu'approver vos deux desseins, dont le premier est, de decouvrir le faux brillant de Anciens, & de chatier le caprice de ceux, qui les idolatrent & meprisent le siecle d'aujourdhui"; "Ich kan nicht umhin ihre beyde Absichten zu billigen, deren erste ist, das übertünchte Wesen der Alten bloß zu stellen, und den Eigensinn derjenigen zu bestraffen, die Abgötter aus denselben machen, und die itzigen Zeiten verachten." Instead of Telemann's "the false shine of the ancients," Mattheson gives "the whitewashed nature of the ancients." Both the French original and German translation have been reprinted in TB, 251–54 (No. 89).

Ut, mi, sol, re, fa, la, tota Musica et Harmonia Aeterna (Erfurt, 1716). Thus Telemann inserted himself, however briefly, into a dispute over a universal, mathematical-speculative conception of music (Kircher/Buttstett) versus one that was more pragmatic, empirical, and sensualist (Mattheson).[4]

Telemann's most extended discussion of ancient versus modern music occurs in his first autobiographical essay, dated September 10, 1718 – that is, less than a year after his letter to Mattheson. Writing about his school years at the Andreanum Gymnasium in Hildesheim (1697–1701), Telemann recalled that

I took the works of newer German and Italian masters as my models, finding the most pleasant taste in their style, which was at once inventive, singing, and well crafted. I am still of the opinion that a young man proceeds better if he examines works of this sort than if he seeks to emulate those by Ancients, who may counterpoint in curls but are naked in invention, or who write fifteen or twenty obbligato voices in which Diogenes himself would find scarcely a tiny drop of melody with his lantern. Despite quoting this,

Qui veteres ita miratur laudatque Poetas	If they so marvel at and praise the old poets that
Ut nihil anteferat, nihil illis comparet [errat]; . .	They give precedence to nothing over them, Compare nothing with them, they are wrong.

with its dignified thoughts, permit me to offer along the same lines what an anonymous Frenchman writes on the subject:

Ne les (die Alten) *eleve pas dans un ouvrage saint*	Do not raise them (the Ancients) in a hallowed work
Au rang où dans ce temps les Auteurs ont atteint.	To the level which authors of this time have attained.
Plus séconde aujourd'hui la Musique divine	More productive today, divine music
D'un art laborieux étale la doctrine,	Spreads the doctrine of an elaborate art,
Dont on voit chaque jour s'accroitre les progrez.	Which we see increase its progress every day.[5]

[4] On Mattheson's criticisms of (and indebtedness to) Kircher, see Wolfgang Hirschmann, "Polemik und Adaption: Zur Kircher-Rezeption in den frühen Schriften Johann Matthesons," *Neues wissenschaftliches Jahrbuch* 5 (1996): 77–91. I am grateful to the author for calling my attention to this article.

[5] Mattheson, *Grosse General-Baß-Schule*, 171–72: "Ich ließ die Stücke derer neuern Teutschen und Italiänischen Meister mir zur Vorschrifft dienen / und fand an ihrer Erfindgungs-vollen / singenden und zugleich arbeitsamen Arth den angenehmsten Geschmack / bin auch noch jetzt der Meynung / daß ein junger Mensch besser verfahre/ wann er sich mehr in denen Sätzen von

The "newer German and Italian masters" worth emulating are evidently the composers that Telemann mentions in his 1740 autobiographical essay as having provided him with models for church and instrumental music: Corelli, Steffani, Antonio Caldara, and Johann Rosenmüller.[6] Whereas the first three composers were Telemann's older contemporaries (Steffani was just eleven years his senior), Rosenmüller (1619–84) belonged to a different era entirely. And since Rosenmüller was also a full generation older than Printz, it is evident that the latter's "ancient" status was not strictly a function of his age.

Musical Reflections of the Past

Beyond these writings, we must turn to Telemann's music to get a better read on his stance toward the Ancients. It is well established that he treats musical archaism as a topic in some of his instrumental works. Among the sonatas and concertos from the opening years of the eighteenth century, use of this topic takes the form of slow, imitative first movements in the *stile antico*.[7] Such curious transfers to instrumental ensemble of a style

gedachter Sorte umsiehet / als denenjenigen Alten nachzuahmen suchet / die zwar krauß genung *contra-punkti*ren / aber darbey an Erfindung nackend sind / oder 15. biß 20. obligate Stimmen machen / wo aber *Diogenes* selbst mit seiner Laterne kein Tröpfgen Melodie finden würde. Denn / ungeachtet ich diesem / … seine ehrerbietigen Gedancken lassen kann / so wird mir doch erlaubet seyn / denjenigen beyzufallen / was ein ungenannter Frantzose von dieser Materie schreibet: …" My translation of Telemann's German borrows from that in Chapin, "Counterpoint: From the Bees or For the Birds?," 398.

Telemann's first quotation comes from Horace, Epistles 2.1 (The Epistle to Augustus), lines 64–65; translation from Ross Kilpatrick, *Poetry of Criticism: Horace Epistles II and the Ars Poetica* (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 1989), 60. The "anonymous" French poetic lines are in fact drawn from Jean de Serré de Rieux (1668–1747), *La Musique, Poëme … Par Monsieur D******* (Lyons: André Laurens, 1714), 29, where the text reads: "Mais ne l'éleve pas dans un Ouvrage saint/ Au rang où dans ce temps les Auteurs ont atteint. / Plus séconde aujourd'huy la Musique Latine / D'un Art laborieux étale la doctrine, / Dont on voit chaque jour s'accroître les progrez." Note the substitution of "Musique divine" in Telemann's version for the original "Musique Latine." My thanks to Wolfgang Hirschmann for calling my attention to Rieux's poem. I have adapted the translation of Telemann's version in Chapin, "Counterpoint: From the Bees or for the Birds?," 378.

[6] Mattheson, *Grundlage einer Ehren-Pforte*, 357.

[7] See the Sonata in F Minor for two violins, two violas, cello, and continuo, TWV 44:32; the Quartet in G Major for two violins, viola, and continuo, TWV 43:G5; the Concerto in A Minor for two recorders, two oboes, two violins, and continuo, TWV 44:42; the Concerto in G Major for two violins and strings, TWV 52:G2; and the Concerto in C Major for four unaccompanied violins, TWV 40:203. Written at a later date, and perhaps for a church performance, is the Concerto ("Sinfonia") in F Major for recorder, viola da gamba, and strings doubled by cornetto, two oboes, and three trombones, TWV 50:3, the first-movement ritornellos of which are in the *stile antico*. One also encounters fugues with *stile antico* subjects, as in the first movement of the Partita in G Minor for oboe and continuo, TWV 41:g2, and the second movement of the Sonata in E Minor for two oboes, two violins, two violas, and continuo, TWV 50:4. For discussions of all

associated primarily with vocal music, and secondarily with keyboard music, raise a number of questions. Was the aim to encourage a sense of seriousness, tradition, or timelessness, as was a common motivation behind deploying the *stile antico* in vocal works? Should we understand this archaic topic as related to what musicians of the time called the "strict," "bound," "fugal," or "elaborate" style, and which today is often referred to as the "learned" style in the context of late eighteenth-century studies?[8] Or was it intended mainly to amplify the eclecticism of Telemann's own "mixed taste," which also encompassed the current national idioms of France, Italy, and Poland? The possibility of incorporating the *stile antico* into sonatas and concertos may have occurred to Telemann already during his university years in Leipzig, where tower music (*Turmmusik*) played by the *Stadtpfeifer* included fugues in this antique idiom.[9]

Telemann's more mature instrumental works set old and new musical styles beside each other in ways that can seem almost postmodern in their self-consciousness. Thus the *Ouverture des nations anciennes et modernes*, TWV 55:G4, represents the historical and present-day peoples of Germany, Sweden, and Denmark by pairing "ancient" and "modern" dances; the *Sonates corellisantes* (Hamburg, 1735) effect an almost neoclassic stylistic rapprochement between the venerable Corellian style and a more *au courant galant* language; the *VI Ouvertures à 4 ou 6* (Hamburg, 1736) juxtapose *Lulliste* and *galant* conceptions of the overture-suite, as if to sum up the history of the genre; *Telemanns Canones à 2, 3, 4* (Hamburg, 1735) and *XIIX Canons mélodieux* (Paris, 1738) superimpose the *galant* style on canons, the strictest form of imitative counterpoint; and the three-movement sinfonia, TWV Anh. 50:1, written to introduce an otherwise lost serenata for the 1765 centennial celebration of Hamburg's Commerce Deputation (TVWV 24:4),

these movements, see Steven Zohn, *Music for a Mixed Taste: Style, Genre, and Meaning in Telemann's Instrumental Works* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008; revised paperback edition, 2015), 126, 163–64, 182, 259, 261–63, 269, and 274.

[8] A good survey of late eighteenth-century definitions and applications of the "learned" style is Keith Chapin, "Learned Style and Learned Styles," in *The Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory*, ed. Danuta Mirka (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014), 301–29.

[9] For example, Gottfried Reiche's *Vier und zwanzig Neue Quatricinia, Mit Einem Cornett und drey Trombonen/Vornehmlich Auff das sogenannte Abblasen auff den Rathhäusern oder Thürmen mit Fleiß gestellet* (Leipzig: Köler, 1696). Particularly antique in style are some of the self-standing fugues (called "Fuga"; Nos. 2, 5, 13, 17, 19, and 21–22 in the collection) and those within multisectional works (called "Sonatina"; Nos. 3, 7–9, and 15). Wolfgang Hirschmann, "Telemann und das konzertierende Prinzip," in *Concertare – Concerto – Concert: Das Konzert bei Telemann und seinen Zeitgenossen*, ed. Ralph-Jürgen Reipsch, Carsten Lange, and Brit Reipsch (Hildesheim: Olms, 2020), 15, suggests that *Stadtpfeifer* fugues such as those by Reiche provided a model for the opening movement of the Concerto in F Major, TWV 50:3.

represents "Die alte Welt" (the old world), the "mittlere Welt" (the middle world), and the "jüngere Welt" (the young world) through contrasting styles.[10] All of these works invite us to contemplate differences, similarities, and compatibilities between ancient and modern styles.

Less familiar are instances in which Telemann references archaic musical styles in vocal works, where the text may or may not be a motivating factor. Unsurprisingly, the *stile antico* also makes appearances here, as in the eleven *missae breves* based on chorale melodies (TVWV 9:1–11) and in various church cantatas. But the idiom also turns up in more unexpected contexts, for example in the chorus "Unsere Seele ist gebeugt zur Erden" (Our soul is bowed down to the dust; Psalm 44.25–26) from the late Passion oratorio *Der Tod Jesu*, TVWV 5:6. Here, the Renaissance-style polyphony makes for a stark contrast with the surrounding *galant* movements. One can imagine that younger listeners at the oratorio's first performances, in Hamburg and Berlin during 1755–1756, might have regarded the *stile antico* as a historically - based style whose history had all but run its course. If, as seems likely, Telemann turned to it in "Unsere Seele ist gebeugt zur Erden" as a means of suggesting timelessness and tradition (a particularly ancient text set in a particularly ancient style), he nevertheless effects a striking transformation of the idiom by introducing forward-looking, dissonant harmonies that are utterly foreign to it. This occurs during the course of a point of imitation that dominates the chorus and sets the second line: "O wehe, daß wir so gesündig[e]t haben!" (O woe, that we have sinned so!). That the admission of sin should be highlighted by dissonance and emphasized through textual and musical repetition is not in itself remarkable. But the transformation of a "classic," emotionally restrained mode of musical expression into one that is disquietingly modern in its *Empfindsamkeit* is striking. Thus Telemann has it both ways, as it were, managing to appear simultaneously as an Ancient and a Modern by extending the expressive boundaries of a time-honored style.

Especially interesting for our purposes are Telemann's references elsewhere to a slightly more modern vocal idiom: a *stilo ecclesiastico* harkening back to the mid-seventeenth century and that, paradoxically, may have seemed more obsolete to listeners in the early eighteenth century than the Palestrina-based *stile antico*. This is the church style associated with Heinrich Schütz and his younger contemporaries, strong echoes of which

[10] These works are discussed in Zohn, *Music for a Mixed Taste*, 75–80, 449–52, 458, and 465–67; and in Steven Zohn, "Aesthetic Mediation and Tertiary Rhetoric in Telemann's *VI Ouvertures à 4 ou 6*," in *Bach Perspectives*, vol. 9: *Bach and His German Contemporaries*, ed. Andrew Talle (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2013), 24–49, especially 36–37.

may be heard in the sacred concertos Telemann composed in Hildesheim and Leipzig at the turn of the eighteenth century.[11] Later, in works written for Eisenach, Frankfurt, and Hamburg, he invoked seventeenth-century style and scoring to reinforce the text's dramatic or theological message.

In two vocal works of the 1720s, these invocations take the form of musical winks at the listener. The earlier of these is the cantata *Ich halte aber dafür*, TVWV 1:840, first performed in Frankfurt on the sixth Sunday after Easter (Exaudi Sunday) in 1721 as part of the second *Concerten-Jahrgang* (also known as the *Neues Lied*) to librettos by Gottfried Simonis.[12] The cantata's text contrasts evil present time with God's eternal time, and Telemann responds to the only reference to past time, an observation in the first aria that "the old God still lives" ("Der alte Gott ist noch am Leben"), by including an obbligato cornetto – an "old" instrument belonging more to the past than the present, and which he rarely featured in this way.[13] In fact, this "trumpet aria" is the only movement in the cantata to feature an obbligato instrument, which further highlights the outmoded scoring. A similar effect occurs in Telemann's serenata for the centennial celebration of the Hamburg Admiralty, *Unschätzbarer Vorwurf erkenntlicher Sinnen*, TVWV 24:1 (1723). Here the allegorical character Mercurius sings an aria that begins with the text "When heaven and earth grow old, when the flaming stars finally turn cold, may your peace grow old" ("Wann Himmel und Erde veralten, wann endlich die Flammen der Sterne erkalten, veralte deine Ruh"). In a fleetingly humorous gesture, Telemann highlights the concluding phrase "veralte deine Ruh" by way of a mid-baroque cadential formula ending with a Picardy third.

How might listeners of the time have reacted to these modest mixtures of ancient and modern styles? In 1721 Gottfried Ephraim Scheibel, a twenty-five-year-old former theology student who had studied at Leipzig University, published a little book about the church music of his day. Among his concerns was the musical taste of the average congregant, whom he found to be either surprised or scandalized by anything more newfangled than a motet pounded out by that prolific seventeenth-century tunesmith Andreas Hammerschmidt (1611/1612–75):

[11] A selection of these works has been published as Georg Philipp Telemann, *Frühe Kirchenmusiken*, Georg Philipp Telemann: Musikalische Werke, vol. 36, ed. Wolfram Steude (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2003).

[12] For an edition, see Georg Philipp Telemann, *Ich halte aber dafür*, Frankfurter Telemann-Ausgabe, vol. 7, ed. Arno Paduch (Frankfurt: Habsburger Verlag, 1998).

[13] On Telemann's use of the cornetto in his Frankfurt church cantatas, see Christiane Jungius, *Telemanns Frankfurter Kantatenzyklen* (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2008), 238–42.

People are accustomed to the old humdrum and hammersmith [*Hammer-Schmiedischen*] compositions that contain neither grace nor delicacy, and most think that whatever sounds nicely old-fashioned and simple fits best in church. Should then a cantata cross their ears, one composed according to the new, unconstrained manner, some are astonished by it; but others, having heard the same thing in secular music, think instantly that it is a sin, and that such free compositions are not fitting in church, as if the affections may not be moved as well in church as they are on the outside, in an opera or a Collegium musicum.[14]

Scheibel strongly advocated the newer, theatrical type of church cantata then being composed in the more cosmopolitan German cities and courts, and he pointed to Telemann as one of its leading exponents. Four years later, in a lengthy preface to his first annual cycle of church cantata librettos (dedicated to Mattheson and Telemann), Scheibel condemned old-fashioned church music in terms that echo those in Telemann's 1718 autobiography:

But generally those people who are overfond afficionados of antiquity disdain and decry as sinful whatever was not customary before and during their fathers' time. When one asks them what pleased them in the old church music, they answer: It sounded right devout. I would have instead said: It sounded right silly. At the same time, the musical arsenal was full of ponderous canons, the Utremifasolitten (barbarous name! barbarous music!) continuing to carry out their tyranny from a Pharisaic sanctity, just as they would still do now if they could, with some putting up powerful resistance.[15]

[14] Gottfried Ephraim Scheibel, *Zufällige Gedanken von der Kirchen-Music, Wie Sie heutiges Tages beschaffen ist* (Frankfurt and Leipzig: Scheibel, 1721), 40: "Die Leute sind des Alten Schlendrians und der Hammer-Schmiedischen *Composition* gewohnt / da weder Anmuth noch Zierligkeit drinnen stecket / und die meisten dencken / alles was fein altväterisch und einfältig klinget / schicke sich am besten in die Kirche. Kommet nun vor ihr Gehöre eine *Cantate*, die nach der neuen ungezwungenen Art gesetzet / so verwundern sich etliche drüber / andere aber weil sie dergleichen bey weltlichen Musicken gehöret / dencken flugs es sey eine Sünde / solche freye *Composition* schicke sich nicht in die Kirche / *quasi vero*, als wenn die *Affecten* nicht so gutt dörfften in der Kirche *movirt* werden / als ausser derselben in einer *Opera* oder in einem *Collegio Musico*." Translation adapted from Joyce Irwin, "Random Thoughts about Church Music in Our Day," in *Bach's Changing World: Voices in the Community*, ed. Carol K. Baron (Rochester: University of Rochester Press, 2006), 240–41.

[15] Gottfried Ephraim Scheibel, *Poetische Andachten Uber alle gewöhnliche Sonn- und Fest-Tage, durch das gantze Jahr, allen Herren Componisten und Liebhabern der Kirchen-Music zum Ergötzen* (Leipzig and Breslau: Rorlach, 1725), sig. b2^{r}: "Allein so urtheilen gemeiniglich diejenigen Leute, die allzugrosse Liebhaber des Alterthums seyn, alles verachten und vor sündlich ausschreyen, was nicht vor dem und zu ihrer Väter Zeiten üblich gewesen. Wenn man sie fragt, was gefiel denn an der alten Kirchen *Music*? So erfolgt die Antwort: Es klang fein andächtig. Ich hätte lieber setzen wollen: Es klung fein einfältig. Zur selbigen Zeit war das Rüsthaus der *Music* noch voller schweren *Canonen*, die *Utremifasolitten* (*barbara Nomina*! *Barbara Musica*!) übten noch ihre Tyranney unter einer Pharisäischen Heiligkeit aus, gleichwie

The tyrannical "Utremifasolitten" are no doubt ancients such as Buttstett (author of *Ut, mi, sol, re, fa, la, tota Musica et Harmonia Aeterna*), whom Mattheson had vanquished some years earlier.

Scheibel's claim that many people preferred "old-fashioned and simple" church music holds some water, for both Friderich Erhardt Niedt (writing ca. 1706–8) and Johann Mattheson (writing in 1739) noted with disapproval that Hammerschmidt's motets were still heard in village churches well into the eighteenth century.[16] Nor was such ancient music confined to the hinterlands: For much of the eighteenth century, the Leipzig Thomasschule's first, second, and third choirs regularly sang late sixteenth-century motets by German and Italian composers, as published in Erdhard Bodenschatz's two-volume anthology *Florilegium Portense* (1603 and 1621).[17] Moreover, Johann Sebastian Bach occasionally performed sacred vocal works by Sebastian Knüpfer and other seventeenth-century composers.[18] Whether Telemann also performed the church music of preceding generations in Eisenach, Frankfurt, and Hamburg is presently unknown, but it seems clear that products of the musical past were very much present in the experiences of many eighteenth-century churchgoers in Protestant Germany.

At the same time, we may presume that the steady diet of modern church music consumed by Telemann's and Bach's audiences from about 1710 onward acclimated many ears to its operatic qualities, the protestations of some writers notwithstanding.[19] In 1725, Scheibel doubted that people in Lower Saxony and Hamburg would agree with the "entirely ludicrous" and "plainly silly" proposition that "the old, poor manner of making music in church is better than the new, artful one."[20] As Bach famously remarked in

sie noch jetzund thun würden, wenn sie nur könnten, und nicht zu ohnmächtig wären einigen Wiederstand zu zeigen."

16 Friedrich Erhardt Niedt, *Musicalischer Handleitung Dritter und letzter Theil*, ed. Johann Mattheson (Hamburg: Benjamin Schillers Erben, 1717), 34; Johann Mattheson, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister* (Hamburg: Christian Herold, 1739), 75, §40.

17 Andrew Parrott, *The Essential Bach Choir* (Woodbridge: Boydell, 2000), 20–27. As Parrott notes, in 1729 Johann Sebastian Bach purchased copies of the *Florilegium Portense* for the Thomasschule that were still being used in 1770.

18 Daniel R. Melamed, *J. S. Bach and the German Motet* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), chapters 12–13.

19 For a survey of reactions, pro and con, to modern figural church music, see Robin A. Leaver, "Oper in der Kirche: Bach und der Kantatenstreit im frühen 18. Jahrhundert," *Bach-Jahrbuch* 99 (2013): 177–86, revised and translated as "Bach and the Cantata Controversy of the Early Eighteenth Century," chapter 5 in Robin A. Leaver, *Bach Studies: Liturgy, Hymnology, and Theology* (Abingdon: Routledge, 2021); and Tanya Kevorkian, *Baroque Piety: Religion, Society, and Music in Leipzig, 1650–1750* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2007), 38–43 and 209–16.

20 Scheibel, *Poetische Andachten*, sig b^{v}: "Die alte schlechte Art in der Kirchen zu *musici*ren gefällt mir besser als die neugekünstelte. Ich glaube nicht, daß in Nieder-Sachsen und in des

his "Short But Most Necessary Draft for a Well-Appointed Church Music" of 1730, "the state of music is quite different from what it was, since our artistry has increased very much, and the taste has changed astonishingly, and accordingly the former style of music no longer seems to please our ears."[21] Now, Bach was angling for more and better musicians for his Leipzig performances of motets and cantatas, so he had good reason to play up the new style's increased demands on performing ensembles. But it is telling that he expressed no interest in performing the works of his predecessor as Thomaskantor, Johann Kuhnau; at least, the town council made no offer to purchase music from Kuhnau's widow.[22]

Although we cannot know how readily Telemann's Frankfurt and Hamburg audiences were able to distinguish between old and new styles, it is not difficult to imagine more alert listeners sensing the alterity of a cornetto used in place of a trumpet or the incongruity of a "hammersmith"-like cadence, especially when aligned with a text referring explicitly to something old. Many in Eisenach and Frankfurt would surely have noticed how the cantatas for the first Sunday in Advent in both of Telemann's *Geistliches Singen und Spielen* cycles, *Nun komm der Heiden Heiland* (TVWV 1:1177, 1710; 1:1174, 1717), open with an abrupt stylistic shift from old (a motet movement in the *stile antico*) to new (an up-to-date da capo aria).[23] They may also have recognized the way in which many cantatas of the second *Concerten-Jahrgang* invoke the sacred concerto by commencing with a sectional dictum (marked "Allabreve") that concludes

Hamburgischen *Pindus* Gräntzen die Leute auf solche gantz aberwitzige und recht einfältige Gedancken von der *Music* gerathen können … ."

[21] BDok I, 63 (No. 22): "Da nun aber der itzige *status musices* gantz anders weder ehedem beschaffen, die Kunst üm so sehr viel gestiegen, der *gusto* sich verwunderens-würdig geändert, dahero auch die ehemalige Arth von *Music* unseren Ohren nicht mehr klingen will … ." Translation from *NBR*, 149 (No. 151).

[22] Michael Maul, *Bach's Famous Choir: The Saint Thomas School in Leipzig, 1212–1804*, trans. Richard Howe (Woodbridge: Boydell, 2018), 138. Telemann, on the other hand, expressed admiration for Kuhnau's church music in the wake of turning down the Leipzig Thomaskantor position in 1722. His poem in praise of German music, "Ueber etliche Teutsche Componisten" (On several German composers), begins with the line "If Kuhnau shows his splendor in pure church pieces" ("Zeigt Kuhnau seine Pracht in reinen Kirchen-Stücken"). The poem appeared in *C. F. Weichmanns Poesie der Nieder-Sachsen*, vol. 2 (Hamburg: Kißner, 1723), 254.

[23] For a discussion of these cantatas, see Ute Poetzsch-Seban, *Die Kirchenmusik von Georg Philipp Telemann und Erdmann Neumeister: Zur Geschichte der protestantischen Kirchenkantate in der ersten Hälfte des 18. Jahrhunderts* (Beeskow: Ortus, 2006), 105–106. Editions of both works are available in Georg Philipp Telemann, *Geistliches Singen und Spielen: Kantaten vom 1. Advent bis zum Sonntag nach Weihnachten*, Georg Philipp Telemann: Musikalische Werke, vol. 39, ed. Ute Poetzsch-Seban (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2004), 3–17 and 173–200.