

## INTERNATIONAL STATUS IN THE SHADOW OF EMPIRE

Nauru is often figured as an anomaly in the international order. This book offers a new account of Nauru's imperial history and examines its significance to the histories of international law. Drawing on theories of jurisdiction and bureaucracy, it reconstructs four shifts in Nauru's status – from German protectorate, to League of Nations C Mandate, to UN Trust Territory, to sovereign state – as a means of redescribing the transition from the nineteenth-century imperial order to the twentieth-century state system. The book argues that as international status shifts, imperial form accretes: as Nauru's status shifted, what occurred at the local level was a gradual process of bureaucratisation. Two conclusions emerge from this argument. The first is that imperial administration in Nauru produced the Republic's post-independence 'failures'. The second is that international recognition of sovereign status is best understood as marking a beginning, not an end, of the process of decolonisation.

CAIT STORR is Chancellor's Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the University of Technology Sydney. She is an associate member of the Institute of International Law and the Humanities at Melbourne Law School, and junior faculty with the Institute of Global Law and Policy at Harvard Law School. Her doctoral thesis was awarded the University of Melbourne Chancellor's Prize.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-72410-4 — International Status in the Shadow of Empire  
Cait Storr  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL  
AND COMPARATIVE LAW: 150

Established in 1946, this series produces high quality, reflective and innovative scholarship in the field of public international law. It publishes works on international law that are of a theoretical, historical, cross-disciplinary or doctrinal nature. The series also welcomes books providing insights from private international law, comparative law and transnational studies which inform international legal thought and practice more generally.

The series seeks to publish views from diverse legal traditions and perspectives, and of any geographical origin. In this respect it invites studies offering regional perspectives on core *problématiques* of international law, and in the same vein, it appreciates contrasts and debates between diverging approaches. Accordingly, books offering new or less orthodox perspectives are very much welcome. Works of a generalist character are greatly valued and the series is also open to studies on specific areas, institutions or problems. Translations of the most outstanding works published in other languages are also considered.

After seventy years, Cambridge Studies in International and Comparative Law sets the standard for international legal scholarship and will continue to define the discipline as it evolves in the years to come.

*Series Editors*

Larissa van den Herik

*Professor of Public International Law, Grotius Centre for International Legal Studies, Leiden University*

Jean d'Aspremont

*Professor of International Law, University of Manchester and Sciences Po Law School*

*A list of books in the series can be found at the end of this volume.*

INTERNATIONAL STATUS  
IN THE SHADOW  
OF EMPIRE

Nauru and the Histories of International Law

CAIT STORR  
*University of Technology Sydney*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
 978-1-108-72410-4 — International Status in the Shadow of Empire  
 Cait Storr  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India  
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.  
 It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of  
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
 Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108724104](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108724104)  
 DOI: 10.1017/9781108682602

© Cait Storr 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
 no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
 permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020  
 First paperback edition 2022

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

Names: Storr, Cait, author.

Title: International status in the shadow of empire : Nauru and the histories of international  
 law / Cait Storr, University of Glasgow.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY, USA : Cambridge University  
 Press, 2020. | Series: Cambridge studies in international and comparative law | Based on  
 author's thesis (doctoral – University of Melbourne, 2017) issued under title: Nauru :  
 international status, imperial form and the histories of international law. | Includes  
 bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2020009166 | ISBN 9781108498500 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108682602  
 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Nauru – International status – History. | Nauru – Politics and government.  
 Classification: LCC KZ4796 .S76 2020 | DDC 341.4/2099685–dc23  
 LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2020009166>

ISBN 978-1-108-49850-0 Hardback  
 ISBN 978-1-108-72410-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or  
 accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in  
 this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,  
 or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
Prologue	1
1 International Status, Imperial Form: Nauru and the Histories of International Law	9
1.1 Introduction	9
1.2 Nauru as Symptom versus Nauru as Parable	12
1.3 On Administrative Form: Attending to Practices of Jurisdiction and Bureaucracy	15
1.4 The Argument: Status Shifts, Form Accretes	24
1.5 Situating this Book in the Field	26
1.6 Telling an Administrative Story: Strengths and Limitations	32
1.7 The Structure of the Book	39
2 From Trading Post to Protectorate, 1888	45
2.1 Introduction	45
2.2 1884: the DHPG Pays its First Dividend	46
2.3 The Reluctance of the Bismarckian Reich	48
2.4 Hamburg Trading Firms and the Legacy of the Hansa	50
2.5 Hanseatic Firms in the Pacific	54

- 2.6 The Reich, Imperial Expansion and the Berlin Conference of 1884 59
- 2.7 The Concept of the Protectorate 62
- 2.8 The ‘Colonial Protectorate’ 65
- 2.9 The Establishment of German Protectorates 66
- 2.10 Concern in the Australasian Colonies over German Imperial Expansion 72
- 2.11 German and British Consular Jurisdiction in the Western Pacific 76
- 2.12 The Establishment of the German Protectorate of the Marshall Islands 80
- 2.13 The Legal Structure of the German Protectorate Regime 82
- 2.14 The Agreement between the Jaluit Gesellschaft and the Reich 84
- 2.15 The Incorporation of Nauru into the Marshall Islands Protectorate 89
- 2.16 Nauru’s Incorporation into the Marshall Islands Protectorate as a Matter of Law 93
- 2.17 International Status and Imperial Form: Administration in Nauru 97
- 2.18 Conclusion 98
- 3 From Protectorate to Colony to Mandate, 1920 100
  - 3.1 Introduction 100
  - 3.2 Administration of Nauru as Part of the Marshall Islands Protectorate 102
  - 3.3 The Collapse of the German Protectorates and the Assertion of Direct Rule 107
  - 3.4 The Federation of Australia and Taxonomies of British Imperial Form 114

## CONTENTS

vii

3.5	Agriculture, Phosphate, Labour and Race in the Pacific	119
3.6	The Pacific Islands Company and its Agreement with the Jaluit Gesellschaft	125
3.7	The Right Passed from the Gesellschaft to the Pacific Phosphate Company	129
3.8	The Commencement of Phosphate Operations on Nauru	131
3.9	Nauru, War and Australian 'Sub-Empire' in the Pacific	134
3.10	Internationalisation, the Mandatory Principle and the Peace Treaty	140
3.11	The Nauru Island Agreement of 1919	148
3.12	Incorporation of the Nauru Island Agreement and its Relationship to Article 22	151
3.13	The Transfer Agreement with the Pacific Phosphate Company	154
3.14	The Mandate for Nauru and the Tension between International and Sub-Imperial Status	154
3.15	Conclusion	158
4	From Mandate to Trust Territory, 1947	161
4.1	Introduction	161
4.2	Administration of Nauru as a C Mandate of the League of Nations	163
4.3	Phosphate, Agriculture, Population and Race in the Australian Interwar Period	175
4.4	The Co-Existence of Mandates and Protectorates: the Interwar International	179
4.5	The 'Colonial Question' and the Failing Legitimacy of the League of Nations	182
4.6	The Return to War and the Japanese Occupation of Nauru	187

viii	CONTENTS
	4.7 The Formation of the United Nations and the Trusteeship Council 191
	4.8 Nauru becomes a Trust Territory 197
	4.9 Conclusion 201
5	From Trust Territory to Sovereign State, 1968 204
	5.1 Introduction 204
	5.2 Administration of Nauru as a Trust Territory 210
	5.3 Trusteeship, Decolonisation and the South West Africa Cases 217
	5.4 The Nauru Talks: Resettlement, Political Independence and Phosphate 225
	5.5 Independence Day: Nauru becomes a Republic 234
	5.6 The Constitution of the Republic of Nauru 239
	5.7 Conclusion: The Ironies of Nauruan Independence 241
6	After Independence: Sovereign Status and the Republic of Nauru 244
	6.1 Introduction 244
	6.2 <i>Nauru v. Australia</i> and the Unresolved Question of Rehabilitation 248
	6.3 After Independence: Deployments of Sovereign Status and the Future of Nauru 252
	6.4 Conclusion 259
	<i>Bibliography</i> 262
	<i>Index</i> 290

## ILLUSTRATIONS

- 1 Map of Nauru from Paul Hambruch, *Nauru: Ergebnisse der Südsee-Expedition, 1908–1910* (Hamburg: L. Friederichsen & Co, 1914). Credit: Alamy Stock Images. page 7
- 1.1 Head Chief Hammer DeRoburt and Minister for Territories Charles Barnes sign the Nauru Independence Agreement, 1967. Parliament House, Canberra. Credit: National Archives of Australia. NAA: A1200, L67643. 15
- 1.2 Abandoned phosphate cantilever, Aiwo, Nauru, August 2018. Credit: Mike Leyral/AFP/Getty Images. 37
- 2.1 ‘Die Südsee ist das Mittelmeer der Zukunft’ [The South Sea is the Mediterranean of the Future], from *Kladderadatsch*, 13 July 1884. Credit: Bildarchiv Preußischer Kulturbesitz, Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin. 61
- 2.2 German map of the Marshall Islands, est. 1884. Credit: Universitätsbibliothek Johann Christian Senckenberg Frankfurt am Main. 74
- 3.1 Nauruan community with German naval officers, 1896. Credit: ullstein bild/ullstein bild via Getty Images. 107
- 3.2 Pacific Phosphate Company officers with Chinese labourers, est. 1906–1908. Credit: Image courtesy of the National Archives of Australia. NAA: R32, VOLUME 118/41. 133
- 3.3 ‘Pacific Mandates’, map published in George Blakeslee, ‘Mandates of the Pacific’ (1922) *Foreign Affairs* 1, 102. Republished with permission of *Foreign Affairs*, conveyed through Copyright Clearance Center Inc. 156
- 4.1 Phosphate workings near Number 2 Unit, British Phosphate Commission, April 1923. Image courtesy of the National Archives of Australia. NAA: R32, NAURU 5/502. 169
- 4.2 North American B-25 Mitchell bomber above Nauru during Japanese occupation. Credit: Seventh Air Force Photo/The LIFE Picture Collection via Getty Images. 190
- 5.1 Nauru Legislative Council on a visit to Australia during the Nauru Talks. J. A. Bop (chairman), Agoko Doguape, Edwin Tsitsi and Roy Degoreore. Credit: John Patrick O’Gready/Fairfax Media via Getty Images. 229
- 5.2 The British Phosphate Commissioners (D. J. Carter (NZ) C. E. Barnes (Aus) and Sir Charles Johnston (UK)) with President Hammer De Roburt and the flag of the Republic of Nauru, Independence Day, 31 January 1968. Credit:

X	LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS
	Image courtesy of the National Archives of Australia. NAA: A1200, L69077. 239
6.1	His Excellency Hammer DeRoburt, President of Nauru (right) and Queen Elizabeth II. Credit: John Shelley Collection/Avalon/Getty Images. 247
6.2	Satellite image of Australia’s Regional Processing Centre, topside, Nauru. Credit: DigitalGlobe via Getty Images. 253
6.3	DeepGreen CEO Gerard Barron and Kenyan delegate Pauline Mcharo, International Seabed Authority, February 2019. Credit: IISD/Diego Noguera (enb.iisd.org/oceans/isa/2019-1/26feb.html). 258

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This project has generated its own global community, real and imagined. It is beyond me to list all those who have contributed to its realisation, and the list that follows will inevitably omit others equally deserving of acknowledgement. To that end I begin by acknowledging that very little is achieved alone. We simply do not always, or in good time, recognise the ways we are supported by others.

This project originated in a brief consultancy I held with the Parliament of Nauru in 2009. Thanks to Cheryl Saunders and Katy Le Roy for suggesting me as a candidate for the role; and thanks to Stella Duburiya, Fimosa Temaki, Tini Duburiya, Barina Waqa, Kristie Dunne and Catriona Steele.

The doctoral research on which this book is based was completed at the University of Melbourne, with the support of an Australian Postgraduate Award from the Australian Department of Education and Training, and a Melbourne Abroad Travelling Scholarship. The conversion from doctoral thesis to monograph was completed at the University of Glasgow, with publication support from the University of Glasgow's Research Excellence Framework Fund. Postgraduate research remains out of reach for many, particularly in the global South, and access to funding support for doctoral research and publication is a privilege I do not wear lightly.

I have been beyond fortunate to receive outstanding scholarly advice throughout the course of this project. My principal doctoral supervisor Sundhya Pahuja walked this path with me from beginning to end, and her acumen and grace have been guiding lights along the way. Co-supervisor Shaun McVeigh has been a steadfast source of intellectual integrity and care. Gerry Simpson and Matthew Craven have both provided wise counsel at pivotal moments in this project's development. Doctoral examiners Antony Anghie and Peter Fitzpatrick provided incisive feedback and advice on converting the thesis into a monograph, as did two anonymous peer reviewers for Cambridge University Press – my sincere

thanks to all. Comments on work in progress have contributed enormously to the refinement of this work along the way. Thanks in particular to Anne Orford, Tim Lindsey, Hani Sayed, Martti Koskenniemi, Miranda Johnson, Tim Rowse, Nehal Bhuta and Mai Taha for their time, diligence, and custodianship of the craft. Any errors and shortcomings in the text remain my own.

The Institute of International Law and the Humanities at Melbourne Law School and the Institute of Global Law and Policy at Harvard Law School have been the unofficial homes of this project. The Melbourne and Glasgow communities were fabulous intellectual environments in which to complete this work. Each of these communities has been a source of solidarity and good humour, and I thank my academic and professional colleagues across these institutions for their contributions to keeping these communities alive. In particular, I thank the following for their friendship: James Parker, Jake Goldenfein, Tom Andrews, Sara Dehm, Maria Elander, Anna Hood, Maddy Chiam, Kirsty Gover, Rose Parfitt, Julia Dehm, Adil Hasan Khan, Christopher Gevers, Monique Cormier, Ntina Tzouvala and Olivia Barr; Henry Jones; and at Glasgow, Charlie Peevers, Christian Tams, Anna Chadwick, Akbar Rasulov, Alan Brown, Toni Marzal and Jane Mair.

It is the nature of scholarly work that this book leans heavily on the earlier work of others. I want to acknowledge certain scholars here, if only to illustrate that the real impact of good scholarship escapes contemporary metrics: thanks to Wilhelm Fabricius, Stewart Firth, Peter Sack, Dymphna Clark, Dirk Spennemann, Maslyn Williams, Barrie Macdonald, Nancy Viviani, Christopher Weeramantry, Antony Anghie and Deborah Cass. I would also like to thank Tom Randall and Gemma Smith at Cambridge University Press for editorial assistance and patience along the way; and Kate McIntosh, for expert indexing assistance.

Lastly, my deepest gratitude and love to Tess, Rob, Mick and Pete; to Tom, Alice and Tadeo; to Andrea, Nigel, Monica, Zoë, James and Zoë; and to Miles.