

## CHAPTER I

*Introduction*

Today, the word ‘compunction’ conveys a sense of remorse, though usually in a weakened sense. Its significance for Christianity in Late Antiquity and Byzantium was more profound. The feeling of compunction was intertwined with the experience of paradisaical nostalgia and an outpouring of tears. It was portrayed as a feeling that befell the faithful and yet was an emotion that could not be felt unless it was earnestly sought. Responding to a question from an ascetic on why, from time to time, ‘compunction falls upon the soul without much effort’ and, on other occasions, the soul ‘cannot feel any compunction’, Basil the Great (c. 330–379) declared:

Ἡ μὲν τοιαύτη κατάνυξις Θεοῦ ἔστι δῶρον, ἢ εἰς ἐρεθισμὸν τῆς ἐπιθυμίας, ἵνα γευσασμένη ἡ ψυχὴ τῆς γλυκύτητος τοῦ τοιοῦτου πόνου, σπουδᾶσθαι τοῦτον ἐξομαλίσαι· ἢ εἰς ἀπόδειξιν τοῦ δύνασθαι τὴν ψυχὴν διὰ σπουδαιοτέρας ἐπιμελείας ἐν καταλύξει εἶναι πάντοτε.<sup>1</sup>

Such a compunction is a gift from God in order to stir up desire, so that the soul, having tasted the sweetness of such compunction or sorrow might be stirred up to foster it, or as proof that the soul is able through more zealous application to be always in such compunction.<sup>2</sup>

This book explores how this dialectical relationship was embodied in the interpersonal dynamics of Byzantine liturgical hymns, which opened an affective space where compunction could be perceived and felt. It examines the emotion of compunction by reimagining the liturgical performance of the hymns that mobilised and enacted κατάνυξις.<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> *Asketikon: The Shorter Responses*, 16. PG 31, 1092D.

<sup>2</sup> The English translation is from Anna M. Silvas, trans. *The Asketikon of St Basil the Great* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), 282–83.

<sup>3</sup> Κατάνυξις is the Greek word for compunction in Byzantium. See G. W. H. Lampe, *Patristic Greek Lexicon* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1961), 713. Secondary literature has sometimes transliterated it as *katanyxis* or *katanuxis*. The Greek word is not found in any writings from antiquity but makes its

The compunctious hymns of Romanos the Melodist (c. 490–560), Andrew of Crete (c. 660–740) and Kassia (c. 810–865), which were performed during Great Lent and Holy Week, are my focus.<sup>4</sup> The choice of these three hymnographers allows for a diachronic exploration of compunction from the sixth century until the ninth century. Moreover, all three of these hymnographers had a connection to Constantinople, which is the topographical nexus of this study. Finally, the hymns of each hymnographer provide an opportunity to examine three different genres of Byzantine hymnography – *kontakion*, *kanon* and *sticheron idiomelon*.<sup>5</sup>

Experiencing hymns in Byzantium was a liturgical event. Hymns were performed during sacred rituals that were infused with meaning. The Byzantines saw the order of their highly ritualised society as images of the celestial world.<sup>6</sup> Even a simple procession around the church traced the circle of eternity and consecrated time in their eyes. Language, music and ritual were inextricable, and interiority was not merely an allegorical construct; the performance of hymns evoked godly passions and embodied a liturgical world for the faithful. In reimagining the performance of Byzantine hymns that sought to arouse compunction, I explore the relationships between these modalities and the liturgical world they created.

This will be the first diachronic exploration of compunction as an emotion that was liturgically experienced in Eastern Christendom.

first appearance in the Septuagint. See, for example, Isaiah 29:10 or Psalm 59:5. See also T. Muraoka, *A Greek-English Lexicon of the Septuagint* (Leuven: Peeters, 2009), xiii, 378. Its verbal form (κατανύσσω) is usually given a metaphorical meaning rather than a literal one – ‘to affect mentally and profoundly’, *ibid.* Likewise, in the New Testament, the noun is imbued with an unfavourable sense and translated as ‘bewilderment’ or ‘stupor’ – Johannes P. Louw and Eugene A. Nida, *Greek-English Lexicon of the New Testament: Based on Semantic Domains* (New York, NY: United Bible Societies, 1988). Yet its verbal form retained the metaphorical sense of being pricked in or cut to the heart. See also the interesting translation of κατανύξις as ‘astonishment’ in Johann Lust, Erik Eynikel and Katrin Hauspie, *A Greek-English Lexicon of the Septuagint* (Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 1992), 240. On the biblical understanding of compunction and its transformation into a Christian concept, see Marguerite Harl, ‘Les origines grecques du mot et de la notion de “componction” dans la Septante et chez ses commentateurs’, *Revue des Études Augustiniennes* 32 (1986): 3–21.

<sup>4</sup> I use ‘compunctious’ (a translation of the Greek adjectival form of ‘compunction’ – κατανυκτικόν) in a broad sense to describe a hymn or event that evokes, arouses or is characterised by compunction. For an exploration of the term κατανυκτικόν and its meanings in Byzantine religious poetry, see Antonia Giannouli, ‘Catanyctic Religious Poetry: A Survey’, in *Theologica Minora: The Minor Genres of Byzantine Theological Literature*, ed. Antonio Rigo, Pavel Ermilov and Michele Trizio (Turnhout: Brepols, 2013), 86–109.

<sup>5</sup> These three genres and other technical terms are defined in the Glossary. More detailed definitions and contexts of each of these three genres (*kontakion*, *kanon* and *sticheron idiomelon*) will be explored in Chapters 3, 4 and 5.

<sup>6</sup> Robert F. Taft, *Through Their Own Eyes: Liturgy as the Byzantines Saw It* (Berkeley, CA: InterOrthodox Press, 2006), 134.

*Introduction*

3

However, this is not a history of crying or a study of spiritual weeping.<sup>7</sup> While hymns often linked compunction with tears, this points to the affective mysticism that shaped its experience in Byzantium. The existing literature on compunction has largely overlooked the hymns that dramatised it. Favouring the patristic writings that defined it as a concept or doctrine, scholarship has either presented compunction as synonymous with πένθος (mourning, *penthos*) or neglected its affective dimension. First published in 1944, Irénée Hausherr's study of compunction remains an invaluable point of departure.<sup>8</sup> However, his methodology is deficient. The reference to compunction as a 'doctrine' in the title of the book betrays the Western scholasticism that defines Hausherr's approach. Moreover, his study of *penthos* in patristic literature does not adequately differentiate it from compunction. Indeed, he devotes only four pages to discussing the latter.<sup>9</sup>

Although Hausherr's investigation of *penthos* drew on an array of patristic texts and evidence, it becomes difficult to discern a coherent argument amidst his disparate sources. This did not prevent Sandra McEntire – who in 1990 responded to Hausherr's seminal work with an exploration of compunction in medieval England – from praising Hausherr's book as 'the best study of its kind, unequaled by a comparable examination of the concept of spiritual mourning in the West'.<sup>10</sup> A notable contrast is Hannah Hunt's thorough criticism of Hausherr's methodology.<sup>11</sup> Hunt's main concerns are 'the cavalier attitude' to scholarly material, the imposition of a scholastic reasoning on patristic literature that belongs to the mystical tradition of Byzantine theology and the insensitive approach to the context of patristic texts.<sup>12</sup>

<sup>7</sup> On this topic, see Piroska Nagy, *Le don des larmes au Moyen Âge. Un instrument en quête d'institution (V<sup>e</sup>–XIII<sup>e</sup> siècle)* (Paris: Albin Michel, 2000), 125–42; Kimberley Christine Patton and John Stratton Hawley, eds., *Holy Tears: Weeping in the Religious Imagination* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2005); Elina Gertsman, ed., *Crying in the Middle Ages: Tears of History* (Abingdon: Routledge, 2011); Tomás Fernández, 'Byzantine Tears: A Pseudo-Chrysostomic Fragment on Weeping in the *Florilegium Coislinianum*', in *Encyclopedic Trends in Byzantium? Proceedings of the International Conference Held in Leuven 6–8 May 2009*, ed. Peter van Deun and Caroline Macé (Leuven: Peeters, 2011), 125–42.

<sup>8</sup> Irénée Hausherr, *Penthos: The Doctrine of Compunction in the Christian East* (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1982).

<sup>9</sup> *Ibid.*, 7–11.

<sup>10</sup> Sandra J. McEntire, *The Doctrine of Compunction in Medieval England: Holy Tears* (Lewiston, NY: The Edwin Mellen Press, 1990), 3. Given McEntire explores compunction and weeping in medieval England, I have not undertaken a critique of her work.

<sup>11</sup> Hannah Hunt, *Joy-Bearing Grief: Tears of Contrition in the Writings of the Early Syrian and Byzantine Fathers* (Leiden: Brill, 2004), 25–32.

<sup>12</sup> *Ibid.*, 28.

While Hausherr asserted that compunction is ‘an emotion which plants deep in the soul a feeling, an attitude, or a resolution’ and ‘denotes a shock which comes from without’ whereas *penthos* is ‘the psychological reaction’, he concluded that compunction and *penthos* are ‘virtual equivalents’.<sup>13</sup> Despite noting their lexicographic differences, Tomáš Špidlík echoed Hausherr’s view of the synonymy of the two terms in his own handbook of Eastern Christian spirituality.<sup>14</sup> It was not until John Chryssavgis’ consideration of compunction within the context of his broader interest in a theology of tears that a subtle but important distinction between *penthos* and compunction was delineated.<sup>15</sup>

Chryssavgis acknowledged the difficulty in categorising *penthos* and compunction as two disparate states, especially when a *prima facie* reading of some patristic texts may suggest they coinhere, but insisted on the need for a distinction without defining rationally what is essentially an existential experience:

Compunction or *katanyxis* is not identical with either *penthos* or tears. *Penthos* is a general term describing the precondition of tears, whether as a gift of God or not . . . Compunction, on the other hand, is a state preceding both *penthos* and tears, and is the cause of joyful sorrow.<sup>16</sup>

Hunt also distinguished *penthos* from compunction, suggesting the latter ‘tends to refer to a particular moment of awakening, the physical sensation of the heart being pricked—whereas mourning is more of a continuous movement’.<sup>17</sup> This study draws on the distinction articulated by Chryssavgis and developed by Hunt, but explores how compunction emerged in the hymnody of Byzantium and as a chapter in the history of emotions.<sup>18</sup> Chryssavgis and Hunt viewed compunction through the lens of patristic texts and did so only fleetingly. Compunction was a minor consideration within broader studies of the theology of tears and *penthos* respectively.

<sup>13</sup> Hausherr, *Penthos*, 8–9.

<sup>14</sup> Tomáš Špidlík, *La spiritualité de l’Orient chrétien* (Roma: Pontificium Institutum Orientalium Studiorum, 1978), 195.

<sup>15</sup> John Chryssavgis, ‘Κατάνυξις: Compunction as the Context for the Theology of Tears in St John Climacus’, *Κληρονομία* 17, no. 2 (1985): 131–36; *Ascent to Heaven: The Theology of the Human Person According to Saint John of the Ladder* (Brookline, MA: Holy Cross Orthodox Press, 1989), 125–61; ‘A Spirituality of Imperfection: The Way of Tears in Saint John Climacus’, *Cistercian Studies Quarterly* 37, no. 4 (2002); *John Climacus: From the Egyptian Desert to the Sinaite Mountain* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004), 131–62.

<sup>16</sup> *Ascent to Heaven*, 127. <sup>17</sup> Hunt, *Joy-Bearing Grief*, 16.

<sup>18</sup> On the history of emotions, see Jan Plamper, *The History of Emotions: An Introduction*, trans. Keith Tribe (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015).

*Introduction*

5

While these themes and the associated patristic literature are vital contexts, neither Hunt nor Chryssavgis considered the liturgical context of compunction and the hymns that embodied this emotion.

This study builds on Derek Krueger's exploration of the liturgical self in Byzantium.<sup>19</sup> Krueger acknowledges that 'access to the interior religious experience of Byzantine Christians proves difficult', but contends that their sacred rituals and liturgical hymns 'produce, articulate, and maintain norms for self-understanding and self-presentation'.<sup>20</sup> Similarly, this book does not go in search of what the Byzantine faithful were feeling; it probes how liturgical hymns embodied, mobilised and enacted the emotion of compunction. After all, emotions in Byzantium were socially situated, historically fashioned and shaped by liturgical ritual. Indeed, the 'mapping of biblical narrative into liturgical time' did not simply define the Christian self but also the 'Christian "we"'.<sup>21</sup> This notion lends itself to the concept of an emotional community where the faithful embraced 'the same norms of emotional expression' and valued particular emotions.<sup>22</sup>

The primary texts framing Krueger's exploration of Christian interiority were principally Byzantine hymns and his study raises important methodological considerations. These considerations marry well with those posited by Sarah McNamer in relation to the history of emotions, which I will discuss later in this introduction.<sup>23</sup> Indeed, Krueger acknowledges that 'the history of emotions in Byzantium deserves further investigation',<sup>24</sup> but this topic was not his ultimate objective. Building on Robert Taft's *Through Their Own Eyes*, which examines how the Byzantines experienced liturgy, Krueger probes 'how Byzantine Christians came to view themselves through the liturgy' and how this ritual shaped selfhood.<sup>25</sup>

<sup>19</sup> Derek Krueger, *Liturgical Subjects: Christian Ritual, Biblical Narrative and the Formation of Self in Byzantium* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2014).

<sup>20</sup> *Ibid.*, 7. <sup>21</sup> *Ibid.*, 72.

<sup>22</sup> Barbara H. Rosenwein, *Emotional Communities in the Early Middle Ages* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2006), 2.

<sup>23</sup> Sarah McNamer, 'Feeling', in *Oxford Twenty-First Century Approaches to Literature: Middle English*, ed. Paul Strohm (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007), 241–57; *Affective Meditation and the Invention of Medieval Compassion* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2010), 1–21; 'The Literariness of Literature and the History of Emotion', *PMLA* 130, no. 5 (2015): 1436.

<sup>24</sup> Krueger, *Liturgical Subjects*, 167. However, see Derek Krueger, 'The Transmission of Liturgical Joy in Byzantine Hymns for Easter', in Brouria Bitton-Ashkelony and Derek Krueger, eds., *Prayer and Worship in Eastern Christianities, 5th to 11th Centuries* (New York, NY: Routledge, 2017), 132–50.

<sup>25</sup> Krueger, *Liturgical Subjects*, 3.

### Compunction in Patristic Literature

While this book is not a systematic exploration of how compunction evolves as a concept in patristic literature, the writings of church fathers and mothers offer an overarching theological and spiritual framework for understanding how this emotion emerged in a liturgical context. Therefore, from time to time, my exploration of hymns evoking compunction will also reflect on excerpts from these writings. This will shed light on the relationship between the more philosophical musings of church fathers and mothers, and the subtle theology of the liturgical hymns the faithful would hear and sing. Although patristic literature often considered compunction as an element that formed part of a complex concept, it also portrayed compunction as being kindled following a divine encounter, a heartbreaking event that engenders tears – and the visitation of Christ who heals the heart – or within the context of spiritual counsel on themes such as the remembrance of death. Tears of compunction may break the heart, but they are also a divine gift that provokes repentance, mercy and consolation.<sup>26</sup>

In response to a question on how compunction can be acquired through prayer and psalmody, the sixth-century Palestinian monks Barsanuphius and John advised that it is through the remembrance of one's sinfulness and the prospect of divine judgment that the feeling of compunction and desire for repentance will come.<sup>27</sup> However, their spiritual counsel is not as dark as it may first seem and its message is filled with hope, not despair. Psalmody that arouses compunction can elicit divine mercy. In singing to God, 'one must keep one's intellect alert to the words of the text and assume within one's soul the meaning concealed in them' so that the good deeds portrayed are cause for emulation.<sup>28</sup> Likewise, the evil actions depicted in sacred song should encourage asceticism and repentance. The monks suggest the sacred drama that unfolds in the performance of psalmody is not a source of amusement, but the personal adventure of human freedom experienced by the singer. When psalmody is performed

<sup>26</sup> See, for example, the patristic references in Chrysavgis, 'Κοιτάσεις', 132–34. On the theme of repentance in patristic literature, see Alexis Torrance, *Repentance in Late Antiquity. Eastern Asceticism and the Framing of the Christian Life* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 88–175.

<sup>27</sup> Letter 428 in *Barsanuphius and John: Letters*, trans. John Chrysavgis, vol. 2 (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2007), 54. For the Greek text, see *Barsanuphe et Jean de Gaza: Correspondance*, ed. François Neyt and Paula de Angelis-Noah. SC 450 (Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 2002).

<sup>28</sup> *Barsanuphius and John*, vol. 2, 55.

*The Psalms and Compunction*

7

in this way, the gift of compunction and ascetic struggle is the benevolence of God.

Another gift of compunction is described in Athanasius of Alexandria's (c. 298–373 AD) exploration of how dreaming could be a vehicle for divine revelation. In his letter *On Sickness and Health*, after citing the visions that Elisha and Daniel experienced whilst asleep and briefly alluding to the five senses of the body and soul, Athanasius describes a divine sense that is awakened by compunction:

There is, after these, also another sixth sense, with which we who are able to touch partake of the untouchable, about which Solomon said, 'you will discover a divine sense perception' and which often comes to pass in compunction of heart.<sup>29</sup>

Athanasius suggests a threefold framework for these kinds of dreams to occur: a vigilant mind, a spiritual sensorium and the emotion of compunction. While the experiences of dreaming and liturgical worship are not entirely analogous, the potential of the former to participate in the divine illuminates the mystical significance of the latter. As we will see, the singing of hymns activated liturgical memory, which did not interpret the biblical events of salvation and its protagonists through the prism of history, but as realities that become present as part of the mystery of worship, as images resembling what they signified.

### The Psalms and Compunction

Throughout this book, I consider the performance of the Psalms in Byzantine worship and how this would have created an atmosphere of compunction in the liturgical cycle. The Psalms of David formed part of the worship of the earliest Christian communities and evolved in elaborate ways over the centuries as a cornerstone of prayer and liturgical song.<sup>30</sup> As early as the fourth century, Psalm 50 was a recurring song of repentance that the faithful would hear, recite or sing during the prayers of the daybreak office and, over time, other parts of the Byzantine divine office.<sup>31</sup> In voicing the words of Psalm 50, the faithful prayed daily for divine mercy

<sup>29</sup> Chapter 8. F. Diekamp, *Analecta Patristica*, OCA 117 (Rome: Pontificium Institutum Orientalium Studiorum, 1938), 7. The English translation is my own.

<sup>30</sup> For an overview, see Robert F. Taft, 'Christian Liturgical Psalmody: Origins, Development, Decomposition, Collapse', in *Psalms in Community: Jewish and Christian Textual, Liturgical, and Artistic Traditions*, ed. Harold W. Attridge and Margot Elsbeth Fassler (Leiden: Brill, 2004), 7–32.

<sup>31</sup> Krueger, *Liturgical Subjects*, 19; Kallistos Ware, "Forgive Us . . . As We Forgive": Forgiveness in the Psalms and the Lord's Prayer', in *Meditations of the Heart: The Psalms in Early Christian Thought*

and asked for the grace of forgiveness, comforted by the promise that their entreaty would not remain unheard: ‘a broken and humbled heart God will not despise’.<sup>32</sup> However, this penitential plea for forgiveness was by no means the only song of the Psalter they would have experienced. All 150 Psalms of the Septuagint were interspersed in various arrangements throughout the weekly cycle of worship, and the set of six Psalms known as the *Hexapsalmos* was chanted at the beginning of matins.<sup>33</sup> Moreover, beyond the use of the Psalms in communal worship, the vast majority of extant Byzantine Psalters appear to have been intended for personal devotion, which suggests the Psalms were also read outside of the divine office as a form of prayer by those who were literate.<sup>34</sup>

The *Hexapsalmos*, which consisted of Psalms 3, 37, 62, 87, 102 and 142, narrated a poignant tale of despair coloured with the hope of salvation. The pain of persecution and the sense of fallenness one feels in the descent to the darkest places of the underworld eventually give way to glimmers of hope, mercy and compassion. At the nadir of despair appears the Lord:

who is very merciful toward all your acts of lawlessness,  
 who heals all your diseases,  
 who redeems your life from corruption,  
 who crowns you with mercy and compassion,  
 who satisfies your desire with good,  
 your youth will be renewed like an eagle’s.<sup>35</sup>

What hitherto was a melancholy voyage where the congregation was invited to identify with the afflicted voice of the Psalmist – ‘my life drew near to Hades, I was counted among those who go down into a pit’<sup>36</sup> – suddenly becomes a journey of restoration. Although the rubrics are not always consistent on the question of whether the *Hexapsalmos* was sung by the entire congregation or recited by one person, there was certainly a desire for the words of these psalms to be heard by the faithful.<sup>37</sup> As an integral part of sacred ritual, they became a familiar story that guided listeners and singers alike, teaching them how to feel and how to pray.

*and Practice. Essays in Honour of Andrew Louth*, ed. Andreas Andreopoulos, Augustine Casiday and Carol Harrison (Turnhout: Brepols, 2011), 58.

<sup>32</sup> Psalm 50:19.

<sup>33</sup> Archimandrite Job Getcha, *The Typikon Decoded: An Explanation of Byzantine Liturgical Practice* (Yonkers, NY: St Vladimir’s Seminary Press, 2012), 15–23; Eugen J. Pentiu, *The Old Testament in Eastern Orthodox Tradition* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014), 216–21.

<sup>34</sup> Georgi R. Parpulov, ‘Psalms and Personal Piety in Byzantium’, in *The Old Testament in Byzantium*, ed. Paul Magdalino and Robert Nelson (Washington, DC: Dumbarton Oaks, 2010), 82.

<sup>35</sup> Psalm 102:3–5. <sup>36</sup> Psalm 87:4–5. <sup>37</sup> Krueger, *Liturgical Subjects*, 20–21.



Amidst an array of blessed emotions and depraved feelings, the faithful could yearn for the former while learning to despise the latter. The chapters that follow will show how the Psalms, together with the broader corpus of liturgical hymns, became affective scripts that cultivated holy emotions such as compunction.

### Compunction as an Emotion in Byzantium

Looking closely at the history of emotions, it is not a case of false friends to loosely equate the modern word ‘emotion’ with the Greek word *πάθος*. Caution is warranted given that scholars have been anxious to employ precise emotion terminology and carefully trace semantic change in concepts of emotion.<sup>38</sup> Contemporary scholars often use ‘passion’ and ‘emotion’ interchangeably when discussing antiquity and late antiquity.<sup>39</sup> Although I follow these scholars in translating the Greek word *πάθος* as ‘emotion’, I acknowledge that the shift from passions to emotions in the early modern period psychologised and secularised the philosophical and theological dimensions of the former.<sup>40</sup> Thomas Dixon has argued that it was only in the nineteenth century that the passions of the soul gave way to a secular psychological category – emotions.<sup>41</sup> However, this shift in emotional vocabulary occurred centuries earlier.<sup>42</sup> While calling compunction an emotion may be somewhat anachronistic inasmuch as emotions in Byzantium were often called passions, this is not a lexical barrier provided we begin with an understanding of the significance of emotions for Byzantine Christianity and the classical philosophy it inherited.

*Πάθος* is often translated as ‘passion’ but it does not suggest extreme emotions in the modern sense of the word. It literally means something that befalls someone or the soul – an event or calamity – and is linked to

<sup>38</sup> Ute Frevert, ‘Defining Emotions: Concepts and Debates over Three Centuries’, in *Emotional Lexicons: Continuity and Change in the Vocabulary of Feeling 1700–2000*, ed. Ute Frevert et al. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014), 1–31.

<sup>39</sup> See, for example, Richard Sorabji, *Emotion and Peace of Mind: From Stoic Agitation to Christian Temptation* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2002); David Konstan, *The Emotions of the Ancient Greeks: Studies in Aristotle and Classical Literature* (London: University of Toronto Press, 2006).

<sup>40</sup> Thomas Dixon, ‘Revolt of Passions’, *Modern Theology* 27, no. 2 (2011): 298–312.

<sup>41</sup> Dixon, *From Passions to Emotions: The Creation of a Secular Psychological Category* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), *passim*.

<sup>42</sup> Kirk Essary, ‘Passions, Affections, or Emotions? On the Ambiguity of 16th-Century Terminology’, *Emotion Review* 9, no. 4 (2017): 367–74.

the verb πάσχω ('I suffer' or 'I experience').<sup>43</sup> Diachronically, the word πάθος displays a semantic continuity in denoting what modern scholarship understands as emotion. In the New Testament, the Greek noun πάθος, which appears only on three occasions, bespeaks 'lustful passion'.<sup>44</sup> While Liddell and Scott's primary definition of the ancient Greek word πάθος is 'anything that befalls one', 'a passion, emotion' comes in as a close second.<sup>45</sup> In modern Greek, πάθος is 'the intensity of emotions' or a 'fiery desire'.<sup>46</sup>

Of course, theories of emotion go as far back as Plato, Aristotle and the Stoics. Their ideas influenced Byzantium's culture and theology. Plato thought that emotions, seated as they were in the spirited part of the soul, have a cognitive element, and Aristotle held they are connected with action, belief and judgment. Even Epicurus agreed with Plato and Aristotle on their rational dimension, portraying emotions as 'not simply blind surges of affect, stirrings or sensations' but as 'ways of interpreting the world'.<sup>47</sup> The Stoics, on the other hand, generally argued that emotions were unnatural and therefore should be eliminated.<sup>48</sup> Modern investigations into emotion by philosophers, historians and psychologists have leaned considerably on the ancients in an effort to rehabilitate its intellectual dimension and liberate it from the tyranny of moralism.<sup>49</sup>

The theology of the Alexandrian and Cappadocian Fathers was pivotal in shaping the Byzantine understanding of passions against the backdrop of Hellenism and classical philosophy.<sup>50</sup> Likewise, the Eastern monastic

<sup>43</sup> Lampe, *Patristic Greek Lexicon*, 992, 1049–50. See also Alexander P. Kazhdan and Anthony Cutler, 'Emotions', in *ODB*, 691–92.

<sup>44</sup> The three occasions are: Romans 1:26, Colossians 3:5 and 1 Thessalonians 4:5. See Kallistos Ware, 'The Meaning of "Pathos" in Abba Isaias and Theodoret of Cyrus', *Studia Patristica* 20 (1989): 316–17.

<sup>45</sup> H. G. Liddell and R. Scott, *An Intermediate Greek–English Lexicon* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2002), 584.

<sup>46</sup> George D. Babinotis, *Λεξικό της Νέας Ελληνικής Γλώσσας [Dictionary of the Modern Greek Language]* (Athens: Centre of Lexicology, 1998), 1311.

<sup>47</sup> Martha C. Nussbaum, *The Therapy of Desire: Theory and Practice in Hellenistic Ethics* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2009), 369.

<sup>48</sup> See Sorabji, *Emotion and Peace of Mind*, 1–13.

<sup>49</sup> See Martha C. Nussbaum, *Upheavals of Thought: The Intelligence of Emotions* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001); William M. Reddy, *The Navigation of Feeling: A Framework for the History of Emotions* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001); Daniel M. Gross, *The Secret History of Emotion: From Aristotle's Rhetoric to Modern Brain Science* (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 2006).

<sup>50</sup> Simo Knuuttila, *Emotions in Ancient and Medieval Philosophy* (Oxford: Clarendon, 2004), 111–76.