

Contents

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <b>1 The Basics of the Convention System</b>  | <b>1</b>  |
| 1.1 Introduction  | 1         |
| 1.2 Main Principles Underlying the Convention: Effectiveness and Subsidiarity                         | 3         |
| 1.3 The Double Role of the European Court of Human Rights   | 9         |
| 1.4 The Structure of Convention Rights Review   | 11        |
| 1.5 Typology of Convention Rights from a Perspective of Possibilities for Justification               | 19        |
| <b>2 The Court’s Overall Argumentative Approach – Mediating Between the Abstract and the Concrete</b> | <b>31</b> |
| 2.1 Introduction  | 31        |
| 2.2 Object of Review: Legislation and/or Individual Decisions   | 32        |
| 2.3 Individual Redress or General Convention Interpretation?  | 36        |
| 2.4 The Role of Precedent in the Court’s Case Law   | 37        |
| 2.5 Case-based Review, Incrementalism and the Search for a Reflective Equilibrium                     | 41        |
| 2.6 Legal Effect of the Court’s Interpretations; ‘Res Interpretata’                                   | 44        |
| <b>3 Principles Governing the Interpretation and Application of Convention Rights</b>                 | <b>46</b> |
| 3.1 Introduction  | 46        |
| 3.2 The ECHR and the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties   | 47        |
| 3.3 Evolutive Interpretation and the Convention as a ‘Living Instrument’                              | 51        |
| 3.4 Meta-teleological Interpretation and the Underlying Values of the Convention                      | 59        |
| 3.5 Autonomous Interpretation   | 67        |
| <b>4 Methods of Convention Interpretation</b>   | <b>78</b> |
| 4.1 Introduction  | 78        |
| 4.2 Textual Interpretation  | 79        |
| 4.3 Interpretation in light of the <i>Travaux Préparatoires</i>                                       | 83        |
| 4.4 Internally Harmonising Interpretation   | 87        |
| 4.5 Common Ground or Consensus Interpretation   | 93        |

|    |   |     |
|----|---|-----|
| vi | Contents  |     |
|    | <b>5 Positive and Negative Obligations</b>  | 108 |
|    | 5.1 Introduction  | 108 |
|    | 5.2 Definition of Positive Obligations  | 110 |
|    | 5.3 Types of Positive Obligations   | 121 |
|    | 5.4 The Relation Between Negative and Positive Obligations                          | 132 |
|    | <b>6 Vertical and Horizontal Effect</b>   | 136 |
|    | 6.1 Introduction  | 136 |
|    | 6.2 Direct Responsibility of the State for Interferences with<br>Convention Rights  | 138 |
|    | 6.3 Indirect Horizontal Effect  | 144 |
|    | <b>7 The Margin of Appreciation Doctrine</b>  | 160 |
|    | 7.1 Introduction  | 160 |
|    | 7.2 The Development, Function and Effects of the Margin of<br>Appreciation Doctrine | 163 |
|    | 7.3 Applicability of the Margin of Appreciation Doctrine                            | 168 |
|    | 7.4 Determining the Scope of the Margin of Appreciation                             | 172 |
|    | 7.5 Continued Relevance of the Margin of Appreciation Doctrine?                     | 196 |
|    | <b>8 Justification of Restrictions I – Lawfulness</b>                               | 198 |
|    | 8.1 Introduction  | 198 |
|    | 8.2 Autonomous and Substantive Interpretation                                       | 199 |
|    | 8.3 A Basis in Domestic Law   | 200 |
|    | 8.4 Accessibility   | 203 |
|    | 8.5 Foreseeability  | 205 |
|    | 8.6 Absence of Arbitrariness  | 212 |
|    | 8.7 Procedural Safeguards   | 214 |
|    | <b>9 Justification of Restrictions II – Legitimate Aim</b>                          | 220 |
|    | 9.1 Exhaustive Lists of Legitimate Aims and Their Importance                        | 220 |
|    | 9.2 Application and Interpretation of the Legitimate Aim Requirement                | 221 |
|    | 9.3 Discrepancy Between Stated and Real Aims  | 225 |
|    | 9.4 Plurality of Aims   | 226 |
|    | 9.5 Interconnectedness of Legitimate Aim and Proportionality                        | 227 |

|   | Contents | vii |
|---|----------|-----|
| <b>10 Justification of Restrictions III – Necessity, Proportionality and Fair Balance</b> | 229      |     |
| 10.1 Formulas, Tests and Standards  | 229      |     |
| 10.2 Necessity, a Pressing Social Need and the Least Restrictive Means Test               | 233      |     |
| 10.3 The Relevant and Sufficient Test   | 239      |     |
| 10.4 Fair Balance, Proportionality and Related Tests                                      | 242      |     |
| 10.5 Procedural Review  | 258      |     |
| Index   | 261      |     |