

The Quest for Security

The British Empire entered the twentieth century in a state of crisis, with many in the legal establishment fearing that the British constitution could no longer cope with the complexity of imperial institutions. At the same time, the military establishment feared the Empire was becoming impossible to defend from multiplying threats. In this innovative study, Jesse Tumblin shows how Britain and its largest colonies, Canada, Australia, New Zealand, India, and South Africa, were swept up in a collective effort to secure the Empire in the early twentieth century. The hierarchy of colonial politics created powerful incentives for colonies to militarize before World War I, reshaping their constitutional and racial relationships toward a dream beyond colonial status. The colonial backstory of a century of war and violence shows how these dreams made "security" the dominating feature of contemporary politics.

Jesse Tumblin is Visiting Assistant Professor and Core Renewal Fellow at Boston College, Massachusetts. He is a past winner of the Saki Ruth Dockrill Prize for International History from the Institute of Historical Research, London.



The Quest for Security

Sovereignty, Race, and the Defense of the British Empire, 1898–1931

Jesse Tumblin

Boston College, Massachusetts





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108712545

DOI: 10.1017/9781108595742

© Jesse Tumblin 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

First paperback edition 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Names: Tumblin, Jesse (Jesse Cole), 1987- author.

Title: The quest for security: sovereignty, race, and the defense of the British

Empire, 1898-1931 / Jesse Tumblin.

Other titles: Widening gyre

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Revision of author's thesis (doctoral) – Boston College, 2016, titled The widening gyre: security, sovereignty, and the naking of modern statehood in the British Empire, 1898–1931. | Includes bibliographical references and index. Identifiers: LCCN 2019031645 (print) | LCCN 2019031646 (ebook) | ISBN

9781108498746 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108595742 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Decolonization – Colonies – Great Britain – History – 20th century. | Imperialism – Government policy – Great Britain – History – 20th century. | Great Britain – Colonies – History – 20th century. | Commonwealth

countries – History – 20th century.

Classification: LCC DA16 .T86 2020 (print) | LCC DA16 (ebook) | DDC 909/.09712410821-dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2019031645

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2019031646

ISBN 978-1-108-49874-6 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-71254-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

	List of Tables and Figures Acknowledgments	page vi vii
	Introduction	1
1	Colonial Federationism, Security, and the South African War	20
2	Lessons of South Africa: Security and Political Culture in the British World, 1902–1906	66
3	Security, Race, and Dominion Status, 1907-1909	111
4	The Collapse of Consensus and Control, 1910–1914	150
5	Race, Conscription, and the Meaning of Sovereignty in War	191
6	The Sharp Sickle: New Realities of Sovereignty in the British Empire, 1918–1926	231
	Epilogue: The Statute of Westminster – A Once and Future Sovereignty	271
	Select Bibliography Index	282 300

V



Tables and Figures

•				
н1	σ	ш	9	c

1.1	"Australia's Glorious Fourth," <i>The Bulletin</i> (Sydney), May 7, 1898. Image: National Library of Australia	21
3.1	Asquith's table on defense spending in the British	
	Empire, 1907–1908	132
7.1	George V and Dominion Heads of Government, 1926 Imperial Conference. Image: Photographs and Illustrations R10383-1-8-E, C-000964, Box 05351, no. 3362798, Library and Archives of Canada	280
7	Γables	
5.1	Imperial deployment and mortality rates, British Empire, World War I	199

vi



Acknowledgments

This book accrued many intellectual debts in the making. The first is to my family, who instilled scholarly habits in me from a young age and gave me the great blessing of not containing any known academic scholars. My mother never failed to answer an open-ended question; my father read me dense histories of grisly maritime disasters like that of the SS *Sultana*, which an ancestor of ours survived by unknown means. My grandfather, John, and my great-uncles, Jimmy and Richie, exposed me to archival research habits from an early age, unearthing finds that proved the same ancestor had a certifiably "fair" moral character in the eyes of the US Government.

A sequence of teachers and professors, each of them an outstanding and tireless servant of the American public education system, gave me a sense of intellectual self-worth and trained me to think seriously. Evelyn Hickerson, Cheryl Warden, Mike Ragland, Mitzi Terry, and John Bohstedt each guided me along this path. John, most of all, shaped me intellectually and made me capable of real academic work at the University of Tennessee. Because of him I will always be, first and foremost, a Riot Specialist. This book would not exist without him. The other History faculty at the University of Tennessee, especially Tom Burman, Ernie Freeberg, and Lorri Glover, gave me the tools to tackle graduate school. The Centre for Contemporary Irish History at Trinity College Dublin, especially Daithí Ó Corráin, baptized me in the fire of archival research methods, and introduced me to sources that have carried through into this book.

The History Department at Boston College has given me a fantastic intellectual community to call home from my PhD to the completion of this book. Jim Cronin, my PhD advisor, encouraged me from the beginning to ask big and important questions, and gave me the confidence to build a project that was faithful to that sense of scale. Prasannan Parthasarathi provided untold critical feedback that sharpened my analysis and made me a better writer and thinker. Devin Pendas helped me manage the numerous interventions I was making with this book,

vii



viii Acknowledgments

especially difficult theoretical ones. I could not have asked for better dissertation readers.

Numerous other Boston College faculty helped make this book a success, especially Ginny Reinburg, who shepherded it out of proposal stage and forced me to reckon with some of my own methodological problems. Penny Ismay, Kevin Kenny, Seth Jacobs, and Sarah Ross also provided critical feedback and advice that helped me clarify an inchoate and convoluted idea into something resembling a book argument.

Gráinne McEvoy and Jon Kuiken were outstanding professional mentors to me in graduate school and modeled what it takes to build an intellectual community. Jill Bender also blazed a trail of research across the globe that I learned much from in crafting a project of this scale. The members of my PhD cohort, James Clifton, Erica Foss, Jessica Butler, and Adam Rathge, all read, commented upon, and improved several fairly terrible drafts of this book at the dissertation and book stages. Pete Cajka, Craig Gallagher, and Amy Limoncelli each read most of the chapters, often multiple times and at short notice, and improved them greatly with their critiques. Elise Franklin, Andrea Wenz, Carolyn Twomey, and Tom Fraatz each provided helpful feedback and perspective on various parts of the project. Amanda Demmer read almost the entire manuscript shortly before I submitted it for review, and was a very gracious editorial and revision accountability partner at that stage of the process. My friends at Boston College know, more than I can express here, how much they have meant to me.

This book received support and funding from a number of incredibly generous research organizations, including the Tobin Project for Sustainable National Security Strategy, the Smith-Richardson World Politics and Statecraft Fellowship, the CONNECT Forum for Research in Canada, the British Scholar Society, and the Clough Center for Constitutional Democracy. This book's global research footprint would not have been possible without their generosity.

International Security Studies at Yale University was a home away from home at a critical stage of completing this manuscript, and provided both funding and critical feedback that vastly improved the project. Amanda Behm saw potential in it, for which I am deeply grateful. Adam Tooze and Aimee Genell provided extensive comments and feedback on early stages of the project, as did the other Smith-Richardson Fellows, Julia Famularo and Helen Pho. Max Scholz read much of the manuscript and was an excellent writing partner. Paul Kennedy provided sage counsel and hosted many pizza-fueled scholarly conversations that shaped this book.



Acknowledgments

ix

I am grateful to Michael Watson at Cambridge University Press for taking an interest in the project and for his support and guidance through the process of getting the book from proposal to press. I am also indebted to two anonymous readers who provided important critiques and shared their expertise on sources and literature. A project of this scope depends greatly on the generosity of those more expert in the several fields and histories it implicates.

Several people associated with the International History Seminar at the Institute of Historical Research (IHR) in London played critical roles in making this project possible. Michael Kandiah of King's College was incredibly generous about inviting me to present twice at the IHR, and for providing helpful insights on publication and research avenues to pursue in Britain. I am greatly in his debt. Matthew Glencross also provided numerous suggestions on the royal dimensions of the story I was telling, and a reassuring welcome to an imposing scholarly community. Antony Best at the London School of Economics (LSE) provided helpful feedback on diplomatic and especially Pacific dimensions of the book. Cees Heere offered many indispensable thoughts on trying to drink the ocean of archival sources we have both chased across the former British Empire, and also provided essential feedback on drafts of this book. Graeme Thompson and Dawn Berry helped give me a Canadian welcome to Oxford, and advice and support about doing vital research there. I am fortunate to have this group of colleagues, who have shared their knowledge and expertise with me and made me feel at home in the UK and Ireland.

Daniel McCormack has been one of my best friends for decades and, by virtue of our parallel academic training, is now also a colleague. This book's claims to interdisciplinarity and use of political science and international relations theory owe much to his patient guidance. He also read and critiqued most of this book, did much to improve it, and shares in none of its faults. I hope we continue to collaborate. John Mitcham has been a stalwart friend and professional mentor to me in nearly every aspect of my career for the last five years. His advice, critical feedback, and companionship in distant lands have been essential to this book's completion and success. I am eternally grateful to him, except on the third Saturday of each October.

Finally and most importantly, I would not have completed this book without the indulgence, generosity, and professional example of my wife Nicole. She has been an inspiration and a role model, and has been unflinchingly supportive of me through the uncertainties and absurdities of academic life. As I embarked on this journey she has gone with me, in person and in spirit, to the ends of the earth where the stars are strange. It is to her and to our daughter that I dedicate this book.