

Trust and the Islamic Advantage

In much of the Muslim world, Islamic political and economic movements appear to have a comparative advantage. Relative to similar secular groups, they are better able to mobilize supporters and sustain their cooperation long term. Nowhere is this more apparent than in Turkey, a historically secular country that has experienced a sharp rise in Islamic-based political and economic activity. Drawing on rich data sources and econometric methods, Avital Livny challenges existing explanations – such as personal faith – for the success of these movements. Instead, Livny shows that the Islamic advantage is rooted in feelings of trust among individuals with a shared, religious group identity. This group-based trust serves as an effective substitute for more generalized feelings of interpersonal trust, which are largely absent in many Muslim-plurality countries. The book presents a new argument for conceptualizing religion as both a personal belief system and a collective identity.

Avital Livny is Assistant Professor in the Department of Political Science, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. She is the recipient of several awards from the National Science Foundation, the US Department of Education, and the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation. Her dissertation research also received the Juan Linz Award from the APSA Comparative Democratization Section.

Trust and the Islamic Advantage

Religious-Based Movements in Turkey and the Muslim World

AVITAL LIVNY

University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-70723-7 — Trust and the Islamic Advantage
Avital Livny
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108707237

DOI: 10.1017/9781108751667

© Avital Livny 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

First paperback edition 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-108-48552-4 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-70723-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-70723-7 — Trust and the Islamic Advantage
Avital Livny
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To my family

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>List of Tables</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xii
I Introduction	I
Lessons from the Turkish Case	4
A Trust-Based Theory of Islamic-Based Movements	5
Existing Theories of Islamic Politics and Economics	11
Preview of Findings	13
Plan of the Book	14
PART I Theoretical Development	
2 Understanding the Rise of Islamic-Based Movements in the Muslim World	21
2.1 Political and Economic Activity in the Muslim World	24
2.2 Existing Theories of Islamic-Based Mobilization	29
2.3 A Theoretical Evaluation of Existing Explanations	35
3 Evaluating Existing Theories of the Islamic Advantage	37
3.1 Empirical Implications of the Grievance Theory	38
3.2 Assessing the Faith-Based Theory of “Transvaluation”	45
3.3 The Role of Information in Islamic Politics	59
3.4 The Puzzle of the Islamic Advantage	64
4 Generalized Distrust and the Participation Gap in the Muslim World	65
4.1 The Value of Interpersonal Trust	67
4.2 Trust and Trustworthiness in the Muslim World	78
4.3 Can Trust Expectations Be Improved?	84
4.4 The Trust Problem in the Muslim World	91

viii	<i>Contents</i>
5	Muslim Identity and Group-Based Trust 94
5.1	Trust within Identity Groups 96
5.2	Islam as a Group Identity 105
5.3	Conclusion 121
PART II Applications and Empirics	
6	Explaining the Islamic Advantage in Political Participation 125
6.1	The Trust Problem in Mass Political Movements 126
6.2	The Trust-Based Islamic Advantage in Mass Politics 132
6.3	State Repression and the Islamic Advantage 140
6.4	Conclusion 145
7	Islam, Trust, and Strategic Voting in Turkey 148
7.1	The Complexities of the Turkish Electoral System 150
7.2	The Trust Problem in Voter Coordination 158
7.3	Trust and the Success of Turkey's Islamic Parties 166
7.4	Conclusion 178
8	The Quasi-Integration of Firms in an Islamic Community: The Case of MÜSIAD 181
8.1	The Trust Problem in Economic Relations 183
8.2	Estimating MÜSIAD's Comparative Advantage 195
8.3	Conclusion 203
PART III Conclusion	
9	Conclusion 209
	<i>Appendix</i> 222
	<i>Bibliography</i> 225
	<i>Index</i> 251

Figures

1.1	Map of the Muslim World	<i>page</i> 12
2.1	Participation in Collective Political Activities in the Muslim World	25
2.2	Saving Activity, In and Outside of the Muslim World	27
3.1	Political and Economic Grievances in the Muslim World	41
3.2	Income and Political Participation in the Muslim World	43
3.3	Income and Bank Savings in the Muslim World	44
3.4	Obstacles to Political and Economic Participation	47
3.5	Political Participation and Religious Faith	50
3.6	Faith and Bank Assets across the Muslim World	53
3.7	Faith and Islamic Party Vote Share in Turkey	55
3.8	Faith and Support for the AKP	56
3.9	Faith and Support for Islamic Parties, Cross-Nationally	58
3.10	Policy Positions of Turkish Political Parties	62
4.1	Determinants of Generalized Trust	84
4.2	The Effect of Islam on Trust across Individuals	86
4.3	Trust among Migrants	90
5.1	Relationships between Markers of Religion in Turkey	114
5.2	Relationships between Markers of Religion, Cross-Nationally	115
5.3	Self-Reported Religiosity and Mosque Attendance	116
5.4	Religious Identity, Efficacy, and Trust	120
6.1	Political Participation and Generalized Distrust	134
6.2	Political Participation and Mosque Attendance	137
6.3	Distrust and Political Participation, across Mosque Attendance	139
6.4	Distrust, Identity, and Participation, across Levels of Repression	143
6.5	The Substitution Effect under Repression	145
7.1	Party-System Fractionalization in Turkey (1961–2018)	151
7.2	Vote Volatility in Turkey (1965–2018)	152
7.3	Turkish Parties' Left–Right Orientation, over Time	154
7.4	Wasted Votes, across Electoral Districts (1961–2002)	156
7.5	Distrust and Wasted Votes, across Turkish Provinces over Time	170

7.6	Islamic Identity and Wasted Votes	173
7.7	Distrust and Wasted Votes, across Levels of Islamic Identity	174
8.1	Changes in MÜSIAD Membership over Time	192
8.2	Marginal Effect of Vertical Integration, across Levels of Volatility	198
8.3	Marginal Effect of MÜSIAD Membership	199
8.4	Effect of MÜSIAD Membership, by Level of Volatility	201
9.1	The Substitution Effect across Religious Denominations	212
9.2	Generalized Distrust and Vote Volatility, across Countries	214
9.3	Generalized Distrust and Islamic Group Identity, across the Muslim World	215
9.4	Trust and Honesty, across Countries	216
9.5	Trust and Honesty, across Levels of Regulation	218
A6.1	Turkish Parties' Left–Right Orientation, over Time	223
A6.2	Bank Savings as Trust Proxy	224

Tables

3.1	Comparing Existing Theories of Islamic-Based Mobilization	<i>page</i> 38
4.1	Heterogeneous Preferences in a Public Goods Game	72
5.1	Personal Religiosity and Islamic Identity Factor Loadings	117

Acknowledgments

This project began as my doctoral dissertation, completed in the Department of Political Science at Stanford University. As such, the work presented here would not have been possible without the mentorship of some remarkable people. David Laitin, Jeremy Weinstein, and Lisa Blaydes helped guide this project along, each offering their own variety of sage advice. At times, they (rightly) pushed me back to the field; at others, they (wisely) reminded me to just get on with it and put pen to paper. Along the way, they advocated for me and this project, even when we disagreed about a given twist and turn. In so doing, they led by the very best example, modeling behavior that I now seek to emulate with my own students.

Beyond the courses and advising, a great many of the lessons learned in graduate school were those taught by friends and colleagues. For the always-thoughtful feedback on various iterations of this project, I thank Jessica Gottlieb, Grant Gordon, Avner Greif, Justin Grimmer, Eric Kramon, Beatriz Magaloni, Aila Matanock, Ramya Parthasarathy, Tomer Perry, Amanda Robinson, Jonathan Rodden, and Mike Tomz. An especially heartfelt thank you goes to the members of my weekly working group – Rachel Gillum, Mackenzie Israel-Trummel, Lauren Prather – whose thoughtful contributions appear throughout this manuscript. I am also grateful to Ayça Alemdaroğlu, Joel Beinin, Burcu Karahan, Burçak Keskin-Kozat, Uğur Peçe, and Ali Yaycıoğlu for their warm embrace of my different methodology and for their friendship. Work aside, I am not sure I would have survived graduate school without Alex Blackman, Jessica Gottlieb, Bob Henig, Sara Mrsny, Ramya Parthasarathy, Tomer Perry, Lauren Prather, Amanda Robinson, Luke Stein, and Eliana Vasquez.

During fieldwork, I was privileged to spend my time with an incredible group of colleagues who became fast friends: Elizabeth Angell, Josh Carney, Sarah El-Kazaz, Gail Godbey, Timur Hammond, Hikmet Kocamaner, Özlem Özgür, Danielle van Dobben Schoon, Brian Silverstein, Vedica Kant, Elizabeth Williams, and Mark Wyers. And to those who always make the field feel like home, welcoming me back upon each return, I thank Alexios Menexiadis,

Acknowledgments

xiii

Seçil Öznur Yakan, and Veysel Öztürk. I am also forever grateful to members of the Peçe family for their endless warmth and hospitality. Finally, special thanks go to my collaborators and interlocutors: Ali Çarkoğlu; Seda Ertaç; Yılmaz Esmer; Eren Pultar and Aydın Erdem at KONDA Research and Consultancy; Eyüp Aydın and Nail Olpak at MÜSIAD; the fine folks at the American Research Institute in Turkey; and all those I encountered around my neighborhood and in my travels who, eager to share in a conversation, opened up their world to me.

Since graduating, my work has been generously supported by new colleagues, first, at the Carlos III-Juan March Institute of Social Sciences and, now, at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. In Madrid, I was lucky to spend my time learning from and laughing with María José Hierro Hernandez, Luis Fernando Medina, Magdalena Nebreda, Dídac Queralt, Andrew Richards, Pedro Riera, Ignacio Sánchez-Cuenca, Rick Sandell, Sarah Valdez, and Tod Van Gunten. Since arriving in Champaign-Urbana, I have been generously supported by a tremendous group of colleagues, many of whom read parts or all of this manuscript in preparation for my book conference. I thank Scott Althaus, Jake Bowers, Damarys Canache, Stephen Chaudoin, Hadi Esfahani, Brian Gaines, Sarah Hummel, Kostas Kourtikakis, Jim Kukulinski, Carol Leff, Jeff Mondak, Bob Pahre, Tom Rudolph, Gisela Sin, Matt Winters, and Cara Wong for their comments and suggestions. A special thanks to Kelly Senters for her participation in the conference, and to Kristin Bail for her comments on the final manuscript.

Outside my department at the University of Illinois, I have been honored to be so supported by the incredible team at the Cline Center for Advanced Social Research. This project would not have been completed without the physical and intellectual space provided to me by Scott Althaus, Dan Shalmon, and Sheila Roberts. I also appreciate the support from other units at UIUC, from the Center for Advanced Study, the Center for Global Studies, the Center for South Asian and Middle Eastern Studies, the European Union Center, and the Initiative in Holocaust, Genocide, and Memory Studies. I am also privileged to have found a tremendous community of friends in Urbana, whose support is hard-baked into everything I have accomplished while here: Nir Ben-Moshe, Jake Bowers, Eric Calderwood, Jennifer Carr, Alison Carter, Catharine Fairbairn, Nick Grossman, Verena Hoefig, Sarah Hummel, Jamie Jones, Aleks Ksiazkiewicz, Pendar Paul Madavi, John Meyers, Andrea Miller, Alyssa Prorok, Nate Schmitz, Gisela Sin, and Cara Wong. Outside of my Urbana community, I am very lucky to call Artemis Brod, Mark Budolfson, Federica Carugati my friends.

I have also enjoyed considerable support and encouragement from members of the Association for Analytic Learning about Islam and Muslim Societies (AALIMS), the Association for the Study of Religion, Economics, and Culture (ASREC), and from the Institute for the Study of Religion, Economics and Society (IRES). A special thanks to Jean-Paul Carvalho, Larry Iannaccone, Amaney Jamal, Saumitra Jha, Mark Koyama, Timur Kuran, Tarek Masoud, Rich Nielsen, Liz Nugent, Chris Paik, Tom Pepinsky, and Jared

Rubin. Portions of this book were written while I was in-residence at the Institute for Futures Studies (Institutet för Framtidsstudier), supporting meetings with members of the Stockholm University Institute for Turkish Studies. For that special opportunity, I thank Gustaf Arrhenius, Hans Ingvar Roth, and Folke Tersman. In addition, this project has been generously supported by the Stanford University Graduate Fund, the Stanford Institute for Innovation in Developing Economies, the Stanford Humanities Center, the Abbasi Program in Islamic Studies, the Center for Russian, East European and Eurasian Studies at Stanford University, the Stanford University Graduate Research Opportunity Grant, the United States Department of Education, the United States Department of State, and the Andrew W. Mellon Fellowship of Scholars in the Humanities Program. It has also been vastly improved based on comments from two anonymous reviewers and my editor, Sara Dostow.

Last, but by no means least, this book is dedicated to my family. In my application to graduate school, I described what it was like to be raised by my father, Miron, a computer scientist, and my mother, Efrat, an artist and healer. Together, they nurtured a curiosity in me that was at once precise and sensitive. If, at the end of this process, I have managed to produce a book that is both precise and sensitive, it is in no small part because of them and my step-parents, Ken and Marina. My brother, Jon, and his wife, Ayala, have also played an invaluable role in this, as have Talia and Dani, my niece and nephew. Thank you for proving to me that family members can become true friends. My dear extended family in Israel, Massachusetts, Michigan, and California has never wavered in supporting my academic pursuits, and I am grateful for every visit and every conversation. Finally, to Ben, my love and partner in crime: you have jumped into every adventure right alongside me, and each moment has been made infinitely better for your part in it. I cannot imagine what lies ahead for us, and I cannot wait.