Economics of Visual Art

How can arts managers, artists, and art market observers approach the study of economics? Accompanied by hand-drawn illustrations, wideranging case studies, and expansive discussion resources, this interdisciplinary microeconomics primer engages with complex – and, at turns, political – questions of value and resourcefulness with the artist or manager as the decision-maker and the gallery, museum or studio as "the firm". Whitaker arms the reader with analytic and creative tools that can be used in service to economic sustainability for artists and organizations. By exploring the complexities of economics in application to art, design and creative industries, this book offers ways to approach the larger world as an art project.

AMY WHITAKER is an assistant professor in Visual Arts Administration at New York University and author of award-winning books *Museum Legs* and *Art Thinking*.

Economics of Visual Art

Market Practice and Market Resistance

AMY WHITAKER *New York University*



Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-70497-7 — Economics of Visual Art Amy Whitaker Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108704977 DOI: 10.1017/9781108649919

© Amy Whitaker 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data Names: Whitaker, Amy, author. Title: Economics of visual art : market practice and market resistance / Amy Whitaker. Description: Cambridge ; New York : Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Includes bibliographical references and index. Identifiers: LCCN 2021000987 (print) | LCCN 2021000988 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108483421 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108649919 (ebook) Subjects: LCSH: Art – Economic aspects. Classification: LCC N8600 .W48 2021 (print) | LCC N8600 (ebook) | DDC 338.4/77–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021000987 LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021000988 ISBN 978-1-108-48342-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-70497-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

for Michael J. Lewis and Eva Grudin

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-70497-7 — Economics of Visual Art Amy Whitaker Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

> Human life is messy, never to be grasped in its full complexity or shaped according to plan Thus, the very real success of economists in establishing their professional dominion ... throws them into the rough and tumble of democratic politics and into a hazardous intimacy with economic, political, and administrative power.

> > Marion Fourcade, Étienne Ollion, and Yann Algan¹

Art is the highest form of hope.

Gerhard Richter²

Contents

	List of Figures	<i>page</i> ix
	List of Tables	xiv
	Preface: A Letter to the Reader	XV
	Acknowledgments	xix
	Introduction	1
1	Markets	15
2	Cost	43
3	Price	77
4	Failure	102
5	Structure	129
6	Power	155
7	Labor	177
8	Property	198
9	Investment	222
10	Systems	244

vii

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-70497-7 — Economics of Visual Art Amy Whitaker Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

viii contents

Appendices	255
Notes	274
References	342
Index	379

Figures

А	Eliza Squibb, Supply and Demand Quilt Square,	
	2011. Courtesy of the artist. pag	e xv
В	Alfred Marshall, drawing of supply and demand.	
	Marshall Library, Cambridge University. Reproduced	
	with the kind permission of the Marshall Librarian.	4
С	Alfred Marshall, teaching aids. Marshall Library,	
	Cambridge University. Reproduced with the kind	
	permission of the Marshall Librarian.	5
D	Stanley Jevons, detail of untitled watercolor showing	
	world commodity prices. Marshall Library, Cambridge	
	University. Reproduced with the kind permission of the	
	Marshall Librarian.	6
Е	Bridget Riley, Seated Nude, in two studies and one	
	painting. Left to right: Tonal Study (Painting of a Seated	
	Nude), 1949–52, black and white Conté and oil on paper;	
	Color Study (Painting of a Seated Nude), 1949–52, oil on	
	paper; Painting of Seated Nude, 1952, oil on canvas board	1.
	Courtesy of the artist.	10
F	Kara Walker, A Subtlety. Courtesy of the artist and	
	Sikkema Jenkins & Co. Photograph by Mark	
	Reinhardt.	12
1.1	Nina Katchadourian, <i>Topiary</i> , 2012 ("Seat Assignment"	
	project, 2010 and ongoing). Courtesy of the artist,	
	Catharine Clark Gallery, and Pace Gallery.	16
1.2	Nina Katchadourian, selected images from Lavatory	
	Self-Portraits in the Flemish Style ("Seat Assignment"	
	project, 2010 and ongoing). Courtesy of the artist,	
	Catharine Clark Gallery, and Pace Gallery.	17

ix

X LIST OF FIGURES

1.3	Caroline Woolard, Work Dress, 2007–13. Courtesy of the	
	artist.	19
1.4	Supply and demand.	21
1.5	Maslow's hierarchy of need.	25
1.6	Constructing a demand curve.	31
1.7	Consumer surplus.	33
1.8	Leonardo da Vinci, Salvator Mundi auction.	35
1.9	Winner's curse.	36
1.10	Summary of supply and demand.	38
1.11	Shifts in supply and demand.	39
1.12	Shift in demand for editioned prints.	40
2.1	Massoud Hassani with Mine Kafon, 2011. Installation	
	photo, Museum of Modern Art, New York, 2013.	
	Photograph by Mahmud Hassani. Courtesy of the	
	artist.	44
2.2	Wedgwood teacup and saucer. Courtesy of	
	Wedgwood.	46
2.3	Charlotte Posenenske, Square Tube Series. Courtesy	
	of Peter Freeman, Inc., New York, and the Estate of	
	Charlotte Posenenske, Frankfurt am Main,	
	Germany.	51
2.4	Lenka Clayton, Three Hundred Year Old Pot 06/02/2020,	
	from "Typewriter Drawings." Courtesy of the artist and	
	Catharine Clark Gallery.	53
2.5	Lenka Clayton, Traditional Welsh Blanket 05/03/17,	
	from "Typewriter Drawings." Courtesy of the artist and	
	Catharine Clark Gallery.	54
2.6	Lenka Clayton, Letter from a Sculptor (Ernst) 01/24/2020,	
	from "Typewriter Drawings." Courtesy of the artist and	
	Catharine Clark Gallery.	55
2.7	William Morris, Tulip and Willow Printed Fabric Design,	
	1873–5 (detail). Photograph by Birmingham Museums	
	Trust, licensed under Creative Commons (CC0).	56

list of figures xi

2.8	2.8 John Goffe Rand, drawing accompanying patent applicat	
	for paint in tubes.	57
2.9	Seeing business models in the shape of income	
	statements.	63
2.10	Breakeven calculation as "bricks" of unit	
	contribution.	64
2.11	Depth and breadth in economies of scale and scope.	68
3.1	Elastic, inelastic, and unit elastic.	81
3.2	Elastic and inelastic slope in demand.	82
3.3	Perfectly elastic and perfectly inelastic demand.	83
3.4	Sol LeWitt, The Autobiography of Sol LeWitt, 1980.	
	Courtesy of the estate of the artist and Pace Gallery. Im	age
	from the Metropolitan Museum of Art and Art	
	Resource.	88
3.5	Pricing for income and inclusion.	91
3.6	Robert Rauschenberg letter to Leo Castelli. Courtesy	
	of the Archives of American Art, Washington, DC.	95
4.1	Poster for Kettle's Yard, University of Cambridge.	
	Courtesy of Kettle's Yard.	105
4.2	Nicholas Serota, concept sketch, ink on copy of the Tat	e
	Masterplan June Report, June 1991, from Tate Modern	
	Project: Early Concepts, Jan 1991–June 1992. Courtesy	
	of Tate Archives.	109
5.1	Demand from the point of view of a perfectly	
	competitive firm.	141
5.2	Demand curve and marginal revenue curve for the	
	monopolistic firm.	142
5.3	Kinked demand for the oligopolistic group of	
	firms.	147
5.4	Prisoner's Dilemma game.	150
6.1	Anastasia Loginova, Supply Chain of the Art World.	
	Courtesy of the artist.	158
6.2	Peter Bahr, Supply Chain of the Art World. Courtesy	
	of the artist.	159

XII LIST OF FIGURES

6.3	A working supply chain of the art world.	160
6.4	Art + Practice exhibition space exterior, Los Angeles,	
	CA. May 6, 2019. Photograph by Natalie Hon. Courtesy	
	of Art + Practice.	170
6.5	Michael Porter, Porter's Five Forces.	172
6.6	Sharon Oster, Six Forces framework.	173
6.7	Adam Brandenburger and Barry Nalebuff, Value	
	Net.	174
7.1	William Powhida, Why Are (Most) Artists (So Fucking)	
	Poor? Courtesy of the artist and Postmasters	
	Gallery.	178
7.2	Artist Jan Müller standing in front of his painting	
	Faust, II, at the opening of his solo exhibition at the	
	Hansa Gallery, 1957. Photograph by Robert Frank.	
	Courtesy of the Museum of Modern Art Archives.	182
7.3	The backward-bending labor supply curve.	185
7.4	Mierle Laderman Ukeles, Touch Sanitation Performanc	е,
	July 24, 1979–June 26, 1980. Citywide performance with	L
	8,500 sanitation workers across all fifty-nine New York	
	City sanitation districts. Date unknown. Sweep 3,	
	Manhattan 3. Photograph by Robin Holland. Courtesy of	
	the artist and Ronald Feldman Gallery, New York.	191
8.1	Performance of retained equity portfolio, from Amy	
	Whitaker and Roman Kräussl (2020). Courtesy of	
	Management Science.	215
9.1	Betty Parsons invoice, forged. Courtesy of Christopher	
	McKeogh and the US Federal Bureau of	
	Investigation.	237
9.2	Jasper Johns and Robert Rauschenberg vs. S&P, from	
	Whitaker and Kräussl (2020). Courtesy of Management	
	Science.	239
10.1	The International Table Tennis Federation Museum,	
	display. Photo by the author.	247

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-70497-7 — Economics of Visual Art Amy Whitaker Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

list of figures xiii

10.2	Narrow and broad definitions of art vs. economic	
	and civic participation.	249
A.1	The four quadrants.	256
A.2	The equation for a line.	256
B.1	Budget line.	259
B.2	Indifference curve with budget line.	260

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-70497-7 — Economics of Visual Art Amy Whitaker Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

Tables

1.1	Horizontal adding	page 31
1.2	Willingness to pay for a museum ticket	32
2.1	Sources of revenue for the artist Camille Pissarro,	
	c.1884	59
2.2	Overhead expenses of the artist Camille Pissarro,	
	c.1884	60
2.3	Pro forma income statement for the artist Camille	
	Pissarro, c.1884	61
3.1	Christie's buyer's premium 1975–2020	97
3.2	Buyer's premium example (\$1 million artwork)	98
5.1	Market concentration analysis for Herfindahl–	
	Hirschman Test, 2018	145
5.2	Summary characteristics of market forms	148
8.1	Membership to international intellectual property	
	treaties, 2019	206
B.1	Purchase of paint tubes and canvases with \$120	
	budget	259
E.1	IRR for Tate Modern according to different	
	investment assumptions	270
E.2	Calculating the buyer's premium to include	
	transaction costs in investment return	271
E.3	Calculating IRR for an art investment	272
E.4	Calculating IRR for an art investment, including	
	carrying costs	273

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

Preface

A Letter to the Reader



FIGURE A Eliza Squibb, *Supply and Demand Quilt Square*, 2011. Courtesy of the artist.

Dear Reader:

No matter the reason you picked up this book – whether it was assigned or freely chosen – I hope you feel warmly invited to pull up a chair to the economics of art, to form your own opinion, and to build your own tools. Although originally written for students in arts administration, this book is also for working artists, practicing managers, and anyone else who is trying to hold space for what the

xv

XVI PREFACE: A LETTER TO THE READER

economics of art represents: the ability to embrace risk, failure, willful inefficiency, beauty, and unquantifiable human work within a world structured as a market economy.

Holding both an MBA and an MFA – in that order – I began teaching business to fellow painters while studying at the Slade School of Fine Art almost twenty years ago. Prior to these studies, I worked in art museums. In 2010, the California College of the Arts asked me to teach economics in their design strategy MBA. I have taught economics and business strategy since.

The picture above depicts an artwork by Eliza Squibb, a student I taught at the Rhode Island School of Design in January 2011. For the final project – in an experimental class in economics as a studio-art practice – Eliza made *Supply and Demand Quilt Squares*. Trained as a textiles artist, Eliza stitched into patchwork form and crocheted a series of mesmerizingly dry economics charts we had found online. When she presented the work, she announced that she had already documented the piece and was giving the quilt squares away to the class. Everyone leaned into the pile of what looked like potholders and took one.

Eliza's project encapsulates the spirit of this book: understanding economics well enough to use it where it is helpful and to disregard it where other values – generosity, art, justice, community – are more important. Although economics is usually presented as a study of scarcity, utility, and profit, it is also, from first principles, a study of resourcefulness, value, and ownership. As with Eliza, to give something away, you must own it first.

It is the aim of this book to impart the tools of economics, so that we can, both collectively and individually, address the precariousness of artistic endeavor – as artist, manager, or organization – with a degree of honesty, curiosity, transparency, and strategy about money. I believe in markets the way that Winston Churchill believed in democracy, as the worst form there is except all the others.³ Markets are powerful but also highly imperfect, demanding of vigilance, knowledge, and even creativity. In this book,

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-70497-7 — Economics of Visual Art Amy Whitaker Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

preface: a letter to the reader xvii

the design principle of markets is not toward profit or price but toward value, in both economic and noneconomic senses. Designing toward value requires risk and vulnerability toward what is not yet known. Economic structures can be especially challenged to support that work. Markets were built to produce and trade known objects efficiently, but they can, with resourcefulness, sustain creative practice.

Most questions in the economics of art are political. They are political in the personal sense of your own beliefs about how insulated artistic practice should be from markets. They are also political in the larger sense of income inequality, histories of colonialism, crosscultural understandings of property, and the socioeconomics of diversity, equity, and inclusion in the arts.

The language of economics is also political.⁴ For economists, the term "market" describes the transfer of ownership or other rights to a good or service, usually in exchange for money.⁵ One senior figure in the arts told me I should use "communities of support" instead of "markets" in the pages of this book. It is easy for language to lose people in both directions: to lose artists who see economic language as an admission of capitalistic intent, or to lose economists who are understandably committed to their discipline's defined terms and structures of thought. The spirit of this book is that the real words matter and that mastering economic language is necessary, whether to inhabit markets sustainably or to amass the wherewithal to reimagine and rebuild these systems with care, out of their own parts.

At the risk of sounding normative, the political ethos of this book is one of engagement: that within bounds of justice and human dignity, it does not matter as much *what* you think as it matters *that* you think, that it is more ethical to engage than to retreat into hopes for an ideal world, and that we would all be served by being able to learn – and sometimes fail – in public and with each other. The questions of the arts as a field – and the current questions facing the larger world – are big and complex enough that they take all of us and probably ask everything that we have.

xviii preface: a letter to the reader

Whatever your view of markets at the outset – whether you have been burned by them or conscientiously object to their present forms – I thank you for your patience and curiosity toward the subject, your good faith, and your time. I hope this book repays the effort – that it surpasses the cost–benefit analysis of economics and that, like art, it offers something broader than a purely transactional way of knowing. *Amy Whitaker, New York, 2021*

Acknowledgments

My sincere thanks to the many people who contributed to this book. I am grateful to my editor Phil Good for giving me a chance to write this book and for his guidance throughout and to Erika Walsh for her excellent editorial shepherding of this project. I thank the reviewers, including Victor Ginsburgh, and also Toby Ginsberg and the rest of the team at Cambridge and in production, including Jessica Norman, Abigail Fiddes, Nick Massarelli, Kate Mertes, Jayavel Radhakrishnan, and Anny Mortada.

Many people contributed leads and stories or generously shared their own. These people include: Veronica Roberts, Nina Katchadourian, Lenka Clayton, Eliza Squibb, Anastasia Loginova, Michelle Millar Fisher, Jessica Glaser, Peter Bahr, Tamara Venit-Shelton, Nevenka Šivavec, Megan Chiemezie, Elisabeth Sunday, Damien Davis, Abdiel Lopez, Christopher McKeogh, Priya Parker, Christina Ferando, Heather Nolin, Michelle Yun, Cheryl Finley, Anne Bracegirdle, Corinna Till, Alexandra Tommasini, Adam Glick, Jongho Lee, Dexter Wimberly, Jonathan T. D. Neil, Scott and Marcia Stornetta, Stuart Haber, Sean Moss-Pultz, Agnes Yen, Casey Alt, Michael Nguyen, Mark Waugh, Darby English, Toby Kamps, Rory Riggs, Sunny Bates, Ruby Lerner, Patricia Phillips, Michael Danoff, Michael Mandiberg, William Powhida, Paddy Johnson, Sean Green, Nanne Dekking, Vanessa Hogarty, GiannaLia Cogliandro Beyens, Chaédria LaBouvier, Joy Bloser, Gina Wells, Bilha Bryant, Penny Catterall, Alexi Whitaker, Stewart Campbell, Sophia Belsheim, Matej Tomažin, Andrew Weiner, Angela Green, Theano Siaraferas, Clive Coward, Lisa Cole, Fala Al Urfali, Noah Phillips, Lizzie Conrad, Taylor Curry, Melanie Kimmelman, Maya Addady, Zoe Goetzmann, Jingru Li, Cheng Zhong, April Zhu, Young Zhou, Geena Brown, Lees Romano, Lauren Halilej, Constanza Valenzuela, Jane Sullivan,

xix

XX ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Ricky Manne, Diane Ragsdale, Peter Murphy, Audrey Thier, Fiona Rose Greenland, Jennifer Rubenstein, Victoria Alexander, Gerald Lidstone, Sandra Lang, Rich Maloney, Carlo Lamagna, Erin Sircy, Emily Rubin, Pia Wilson, Heather Bhandari, Caroline Woolard, Pablo Helguera, Hannah Grannemann, Esther Robinson, Kay Takeda, Christa Blatchford, Yayoi Shionoiri, Scott Briscoe, Lena Walker, Gail Andrews, and Angie Kim. I especially thank Alex Beard, Nicholas Serota, and Dennis Stevenson for generously sharing their experiences of the founding days of Tate Modern and for reviewing the draft chapter. I also thank Sandy Nairne, who also helpfully reviewed pages, and Anna Jobson from whom I learned greatly in their own work on Tate Modern and in the arts more broadly.

Numerous academic colleagues and others generously shared time and expertise in reading chapters in their area, including: Susan Douglas, Doug Noonan, Michael Rushton, Sandy Lee, Emily Lanza, Lauren van Haaften-Schick, Steve Schindler, Nick Pozek, Mukti Khaire, Joanne Gentile, Valentina Castellani, Wendy Woon, Melissa Rachleff, Paola Antonelli, John Corso-Esquivel, Jeff Whitaker, Scott Montgomery, Susan de Menil, Anne Collins Goodyear, Warren Woodfin, and Anne Young. Barbara Strongin generously shared her auction expertise. I also thank Will Davies, Sahil Dutta, Nick Taylor, Filip Vermeylen, Will Goetzmann, Roman Kräussl, Renée Adams, Patton Hindle, Don Thompson, Finn Brunton, David Yermack, Bruce Altshuler, Jane Anderson, Maui Hudson, and Hans Ulrich Obrist. I am grateful to scholars or reporters whose work I rely on, including Caroline Donnellan, Alison Gerber, Jennifer Lena, Peter Watson, Christopher Mason, and Olav Velthuis. I also thank Helen Hofling for her general editorial read, as well as a few readers, friends, and colleagues who wished to remain anonymous.

This book received support from the New York University Center for the Humanities. I especially thank Molly Rogers, Gwynneth Malin, Denelia Valentin, Ken Castronuovo, Vonetta Moses, Jacob Mandel, Julia Olson, Jamie Sterns, Meghan Wilcox, Charlton McIlwain, Vincent Guilamo-Ramos, Deborah Borisoff, and

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-70497-7 — Economics of Visual Art Amy Whitaker Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS XXI

Marilyn Moffat. I wrote part of this book while a on an NYU Global Research Initiative Fellowship in London, and I thank the program, my fellow researchers, and Chloe Spinks, Ruth Tucker, Catherine Robson, and Jair Kessler. I am grateful to Adam Brandenburger for inviting me to NYU Shanghai as part of my research and to him and his colleagues Lulu Guo, Michelle Ji, Yanyue Yuan, and others. I thank my lovely colleagues in the Department of Art and Art Professions, many of whom are listed above, and also Gerry Pryor, Marlene McCarty, Jesse Bransford, RoseLee Goldberg, Linda Sormin, Kevin McCoy, and Nancy Deihl. Libraries are one of the very best parts of universities, and I thank the research librarians Giana Ricci and the late Tom McNulty, and also Karla Williams and Darwyn Morren, as well as archivists at other research institutions, especially Simon Frost at the Marshall Library, Cambridge University, and Marisa Bourgoin at the Archives of American Art, Washington, DC.

One of the first readers of the book was Kellie Riggs, my teaching assistant for Visual Arts Markets and a writing teacher herself. I thank her for excellent comments, and I also thank all of the students in that class who read the chapters in formation.

I also thank my own teachers and mentors in this field. These people include: John Maeda, who invited me to teach at RISD; Susan Worthman and Nathan Shedroff, who invited me to teach at California College of the Arts, and my other MBA colleagues including Will Hutchinson, Dan Sevall, and Tim Smith, among others; Allan Chochinov and other colleagues at the School of Visual Arts; Meghan Busse, my economics teacher in business school who took time to share her views of the core questions of economics as a discipline when I first started teaching; Sharon Oster and Fiona Scott Morton, for whom I worked as research assistant and case-writer, respectively; the late Paul MacAvoy who hired me as an Olin Fellow in Economics; Gary Jacobsohn, Sam Crane, Mark Reinhardt, and Ted Marmor in political science and Ed Epping, Mike Glier, Amy Podmore, and others in art; James Forcier, who shared 200 pages of his own lecture notes when I started teaching economics; Eva Grudin and

XXII ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Mike Lewis, who sponsored the first course I ever taught, a Williams College Winter Study class which was cross-listed in art and economics; and the countless other artists, designers, managers, and fellow teachers I have gotten to work with and whose wise ethos informs and hopefully lifts this book.

A personal thanks to Beverly Chapin, Louise Mai Newberry, Lisa Kicielinski, Louise Cecil, Beverly Layton, Melinda Hayes, Sabrina Moyle, Julian Abdey, Matt Alsdorf, Mo Mullen, Martha O'Neill, Allison Fones, Charlotte Colvin, Yoko Mikata, Karen Lewis, Pat Winters-Liotta, Alison Rector, Ethan and Sally Kline, Michael Joseph Gross, Steve Roberts, Katy Kline, Bill Ryan, Rosie and Dick Gutman, Paul Gutman, Olivia and Sam Gutman, Jack Whitaker, and many others, especially Ulla Pitha, who gave me a monumental gift of space in which to write; and to my siblings Jeff and Stacey and especially our mother Elaine, who read the first half of this book in draft form with a Taking Care of Business pencil from Elvis Presley's Graceland, lending her retired English professor's precision and her generalist's curiosity to the subject matter. If you get bored or fight the text, she is with you. And if you don't, you have her to thank.