

ARISTOTLE ON EARLIER GREEK PSYCHOLOGY

This volume is the first in English to provide a full, systematic investigation into Aristotle's criticisms of earlier Greek theories of the soul from the perspective of his theory of scientific explanation. Some interpreters of the *De Anima* have seen Aristotle's criticisms of Presocratic, Platonic, and other views about the soul as unfair or dialectical, but Jason W. Carter argues that Aristotle's criticisms are in fact a justified attempt to test the adequacy of earlier theories in terms of the theory of scientific knowledge he advances in the *Posterior Analytics*. Carter proposes a new interpretation of Aristotle's confrontations with earlier psychology, showing how his reception of other Greek philosophers shaped his own hylomorphic psychology and led him to adopt a novel dualist theory of the soul-body relation. His book will be important for students and scholars of Aristotle, ancient Greek psychology, and the history of the mind-body problem.

JASON W. CARTER is Teaching Fellow in philosophy at the University of Edinburgh. His work has been published in journals including *Phronesis* and the *Journal of the History of Philosophy*.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-70378-9 — Aristotle on Earlier Greek Psychology
Jason W. Carter
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

ARISTOTLE ON EARLIER GREEK PSYCHOLOGY

The Science of Soul

JASON W. CARTER

University of Edinburgh



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-70378-9 — Aristotle on Earlier Greek Psychology
Jason W. Carter
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108703789
DOI: 10.1017/9781108646321

© Jason W. Carter 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019
First paperback edition 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-108-48107-6 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-108-70378-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,
or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-70378-9 — Aristotle on Earlier Greek Psychology
Jason W. Carter
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

*For Beth, who first believed, and Lauren, who
never lost hope, and for Henry, to wonder*

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page ix</i>
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	<i>page xi</i>
Introduction to Hylomorphic Psychology	I
PART I ARISTOTLE’S METHODOLOGY OF PSYCHOLOGICAL INQUIRY	19
1 Definition, Explanation and Psychological Inquiry	21
2 Definition, Explanation and the Soul–Body Relation	47
PART II EARLIER THEORIES OF PSYCHOLOGICAL MOTION	57
3 Plato’s Psychology	59
4 Democritus’ Psychology	79
5 Xenocrates’ Psychology	103
6 Harmonic Psychology	123
PART III EARLIER THEORIES OF PSYCHOLOGICAL COGNITION	141
7 Empedocles’ Psychology	143
8 Anaxagoras’ Psychology	168

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-70378-9 — Aristotle on Earlier Greek Psychology
Jason W. Carter
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

viii	<i>Contents</i>	
	PART IV EARLIER THEORIES AND TWO PSYCHOLOGICAL PUZZLES	191
9	The Puzzle of the Soul’s Uniformity	193
10	The Puzzle of the Soul’s Divisibility	206
	Conclusion: Hylomorphic Psychology as a Dualism	219
	<i>Bibliography</i>	228
	<i>Index Locorum</i>	243
	<i>General Index</i>	252

Acknowledgements

This book would not exist without the encouragement, criticism, and advice of many scholars. Above all, thanks are due to Thomas Johansen and Lindsay Judson, who supervised my doctoral work on Aristotle's criticisms of his predecessors' principles of soul from which the present work developed. Thanks are also due to Christopher Shields, Malcolm Schofield, Michail Peramatzis, Terence Irwin, Gail Fine, Jessica Moss, Paolo Fait, Anna Marmodoro, Ursula Coope, and Cecilia Trifogli for discussing the issues covered here with me over many years.

Many individual chapters of this work were read or heard by various people whose comments and criticisms have improved them. An earlier version of Chapter 1 was first presented in Helsinki in 2015 at the 'Aristotle's Psychology as Natural Philosophy' workshop, funded by the Academy of Finland in association with the Department of Philosophy, History, Culture and Arts Studies, University of Helsinki, and then in Oxford, at a meeting of the Southern Association for Ancient Philosophy in 2015. From the former, I thank Lucas Angioni, Marja-Liisa Kakkuri-Knuuttila, Simo Knuuttila, and Pierre-Marie Morel for their suggestions for improvements. I am especially grateful to Mika Perälä, the organiser of the workshop, who has been a constant source of encouragement. At the latter, for their questions and suggestions, I thank Luca Castagnoli, Jamie Dow, Daniel Graham, Myrto Hatzimichali, David Sedley, Raphael Woolf, and Gábor Betegh. I also received helpful comments on a later version of this chapter from Victor Caston. C.C.W. Taylor and Edward Hussey read an earlier version of Chapter 4, and their combined expertise saved me from a high number of embarrassing errors. An earlier version of Chapter 6 was presented at the Annual Aristotle and Aristotelianism Summer Conference at Marquette University in 2017. I thank the participants who commented on this chapter, and especially Owen Goldin, Richard Taylor, Dirk Baltzly, Thomas Olschewsky, Fr. Ignacio de Ribera-Martin, Jean De Groot, and

Roberto Grasso. Material from Chapter 10 was presented to members of the audience at the Workshop in Ancient Philosophy at Oxford in 2014, and comments from the audience there, especially Lesley Brown, helped to improve its argument. A later version also received helpful suggestions from Ronald Polansky. Thanks are also due to Robert Bolton, Kei Chiba, Jakob Fink, James Lennox, and Oliver Primavesi, who all took the time to discuss with me their views on the nature of Aristotelian dialectic in relation to Aristotle's treatment of earlier Greek thinkers during the conference on 'The Limits of Dialectic' held at Oriel College in September of 2013; and to Caleb Cohoe, who took the time to discuss Aristotle's doctrine of mind with me at a later stage of the book's development. I also wish to thank the Syndics of Cambridge University Press, and especially my anonymous reviewers and Hilary Gaskin, for their suggestions and help in bringing this book to completion. Finally, thanks are due to my wife, Lauren Carter, without whom this book could not have been written. Its contents have not been published elsewhere, with the exception of Chapter 8, which is a revised version of, 'How Aristotle Changes Anaxagoras's Mind', *Apeiron* 52.1 (2019):1–28. I am grateful to the publishers for permission to reprint.

Abbreviations

Aristotle's Works

<i>APo</i>	<i>Posterior Analytics</i>
<i>APr</i>	<i>Prior Analytics</i>
<i>Ath. Pol.</i>	<i>Constitution of Athens</i>
<i>Cat.</i>	<i>Categories</i>
<i>DA</i>	<i>On the Soul</i>
<i>DC</i>	<i>On the Heavens</i>
<i>DI</i>	<i>On Interpretation</i>
<i>Div.</i>	<i>On Divination in Sleep</i>
<i>GA</i>	<i>On the Generation of Animals</i>
<i>GC</i>	<i>On Generation and Corruption</i>
<i>HA</i>	<i>On the History of Animals</i>
<i>Insomn.</i>	<i>On Sleep</i>
<i>Iuv.</i>	<i>On Youth and Old Age</i>
<i>MA</i>	<i>On the Motion of Animals</i>
<i>Mech.</i>	<i>Mechanics</i>
<i>Metaph.</i>	<i>Metaphysics</i>
<i>Meteor.</i>	<i>Meteorology</i>
<i>NE</i>	<i>Nicomachean Ethics</i>
<i>PA</i>	<i>On the Parts of Animals</i>
<i>Phys.</i>	<i>Physics</i>
<i>Pol.</i>	<i>Politics</i>
<i>Resp.</i>	<i>On Respiration</i>
<i>Rhet.</i>	<i>Rhetoric</i>
<i>SE</i>	<i>On Sophistical Refutations</i>
<i>Sens.</i>	<i>On Sense and Sensible Objects</i>
<i>Spirit.</i>	<i>On Breath</i>
<i>Top.</i>	<i>Topics</i>

Plato's Works

<i>Alcib. I.</i>	<i>Alcibiades I</i>
<i>Crat.</i>	<i>Cratylus</i>
<i>Euthyph.</i>	<i>Euthyphro</i>
<i>Hipp. Maj.</i>	<i>Hippias Major</i>
<i>Leg.</i>	<i>Laws</i>
<i>Men.</i>	<i>Meno</i>
<i>Par.</i>	<i>Parmenides</i>
<i>Phaed.</i>	<i>Phaedo</i>
<i>Phaedr.</i>	<i>Phaedrus</i>
<i>Rep.</i>	<i>Republic</i>
<i>Soph.</i>	<i>Sophist</i>
<i>Theaet.</i>	<i>Theaetetus</i>
<i>Tim.</i>	<i>Timaeus</i>

Ancient Commentators

Alex.	Alexander of Aphrodisias
Philop.	Johannes Philoponus
Simplic.	Simplicius
Sophon.	Sophonias
Themist.	Themistius

Other Ancient Authors

Aesch.	Aeschylus
Aët.	Aëtius
Aristoph.	Aristophanes
August.	Augustine of Hippo
Cic.	Cicero
Epicur.	Epicurus
Eurip.	Euripides
Gal.	Galen
Herod.	Herodotus
Hippoly.	Hippolytus
Hom.	Homer
Plut.	Plutarch of Chaeronea
Sext.	Sextus Empiricus
Tertul.	Tertullian
Theophr.	Theophrastus

Other Abbreviations

Diels	H. Diels, <i>Doxographi Graeci</i> (Berlin: Reimer, 1879).
DK	H. Diels, <i>Die Fragmente der Vorsokratiker</i> , 6th edn, revised by Walter Kranz, 3 vols (Berlin: Weidmann, 1951).
KRS	G. Kirk, J. Raven, and M. Schofield, <i>The Presocratic Philosophers</i> (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983).
LS	A. Long and D. Sedley, <i>The Hellenistic Philosophers</i> , 2 vols (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987).
LSJ	H. Liddell and R. Scott, <i>A Greek-English Lexicon</i> (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1940).
OCT	W.D. Ross, <i>Aristotelis De Anima</i> (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1956).
ROT	J. Barnes, <i>The Complete Works of Aristotle</i> (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1984).
TEGP	D. Graham, <i>The Texts of Early Greek Philosophy: The Complete Fragments and Selected Testimonies of the Major Presocratics</i> , 2 vols (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010).

The Greek texts cited in this book are all from the *Thesaurus Linguae Graecae Canon of Greek Authors and Works* (TLG), 3rd edn (1990), Oxford.

References to Aristotle follow the standard Bekker numbering as found in I. Bekker and C. Brandis (eds.), *Aristotelis Opera* (1831–1870).

References to Plato follow the standard Stephanus pagination of the OCT, J. Burnet (ed.) (1900–1922), *Platonis Opera*, 5 vols., Oxford.

References to the Greek Commentators are to H. Diels (ed.), *Commentaria in Aristotelem Graeca* (1892–1909.)

Citations of the Presocratic fragments and testimonies refer first to the standard collection of Diels and Kranz (= DK). I have also linked them when possible to D.W. Graham's more recent English collection and translation of the complete fragments and selected testimonies of the Presocratics, *The Texts of Early Greek Philosophy* (= TEGP), and sometimes to their original sources when appropriate.