

Index

access to effective reparation mechanism, right armed conflict applicable law, 53-5 of, 71-5, 169 Aceh. See Indonesia designing of reparation policies, 163-74 ACHR. See American Convention on Human harms caused by, 55-9 Rights human rights and, 110-14 ad hoc arbitration international conflicts, national benefits of effective, 178 implementation of reparations, 276 common principles of mechanisms, 77-89 nature of, 52-3 establishment of mechanisms, 17, 18, 39-46 non-international conflicts, international financial basis of mechanism, 86-o involvement in post-conflict massive violations of human rights, 176 settlement, 274 operation of mechanisms, 116-26 social causes of, 283 prioritising of claims, 79 State obligation to respect and ensure, 180 processing of claims, 78-81 armed groups submission of claims, 78 legal responsibility of, 280 verification of claims, 81-4 obligation to make reparations, 62-4 victim's choice of mechanism, 84-6 assistance programmes, 173 Additional Protocol I to the Geneva Austria, 101 Conventions 1949 (1977), 52, 55, 103, 104, 105, 280 Baluarte, David C., 219 Additional Protocol II to the Geneva 'Basic Principles' for reparations (UNCHR) Conventions 1949 (1977), 62, 106, 110 (2005), 30, 58, 59, 60, 63, 71, 74, 76, 103, Afghanistan, 63, 276, 280 147, 149, 266, 271, 272, 281 African Charter on Human and Peoples' Bassiouni, M. Cherif, 30 bilateral reparations agreements, 25 Rights, 97, 275 African Commission on Human and Peoples' Borchard, Edwin M., 21 Bosnia and Herzegovina, 81, See also Commission for Real Property Claims of obligation to make reparations, 99 'transformative' reparation, 279 Displaced Persons and Refugees (Bosnia African Court of Human and Peoples' and Herzegovina) Rights, 175 Brazil, 111, 149, 158, 217 aggression, crime of, 55 American Convention on Human Rights, Çalı, Başak, 244 Cambodia. See Extraordinary Chamber in the 97, 274 applicable law as to armed conflict, 53-5 Courts of Cambodia Argentina, 28, 111, 144, 151, 158, 220 Carozza, Paolo, 214



> 286 Index

causation between harm and violation of international law, 58-9

CCDS. See Compensation Commission for international crimes perpetrated in Darfur, Sudan

Chile, 101, 139-41, 144, 147, 156, 157, 158, 167,

China (People's Republic), reparations agreement with Japan, 25, 68

China (Republic). See Taiwan

claims. See ad hoc arbitration

Claims Resolution Tribunal for Dormant Accounts in Switzerland (CRT-I), 40, 65, 75

Claims Resolution Tribunal for Dormant Accounts in Switzerland (CRT-II), 41, 65, 75, 82, 83, 84, 85

Cold War, end of, 28

Colombia, 98, 101, 137-9, 142, 144, 146, 147, 156, 157, 158, 160, 200-6, 209-14, 215, 254, 258

Commission for Real Property Claims of Displaced Persons and Refugees (Bosnia and Herzegovina), 40, 53, 60, 65, 74, 76, 78, 83, 85, 87, 116, 146

Commission for the Resolution of Real Property Disputes in Iraq, 42, 146

compensation, 2, 65

Compensation Commission for international crimes perpetrated in Darfur, Sudan, 42, 53, 56, 72, 87

Congo (Democratic Republic), 45, 53, 61, 64, 112, 267, 271

Correa, Cristián, 13, 259, 265, 268, 269, 270, 272, 273, 276, 277, 278

Costa Rica, 218

Côte d'Ivoire, 153

Council of Europe, membership, 246,

247

CPB. See Cyprus Property Board crime of aggression, 55

CRPC. See Commission for Real Property Claims of Displaced Persons and Refugees

CRRPD. See Commission for the Resolution of Real Property Disputes in Iraq

CRT-I. See Claims Resolution Tribunal for Dormant Accounts in Switzerland

CRT-II. See Claims Resolution Tribunal for Dormant Accounts in Switzerland (CRT-II)

Customary International Humanitarian Law project, 52

Cyprus, 237, 259

Cyprus Property Board, 41, 53,

Darfur. See Sudan

de Greiff, Pablo, 256

de Vos, Christian, 219

Declaration of International Law Principles on Reparation for Victims of Armed Conflict (ILA) (2010), 56, 58, 65, 280

Declaration of the Basic Principles of Justice for Victims of Crime and Abuse of Power (1985) (Victims Declaration), 29

democracy and violations of human rights, 218-19

discrimination, right to equal treatment without, 76-7, 170

displaced persons, assistance programmes, 173 domestic laws. See national laws

Donald, Alice, 245

Duffy, Helen, 110, 112

ECCC. See Extraordinary Chamber in the Courts of Cambodia

ECHR. See European Convention on Human

ECtHR. See European Court of Human Rights EECC. See Eritrea-Ethiopia Claims

Commission

'effective control' concept, 111

El Salvador, 28, 254

enforced disappearances, 95

Engstrom, Par, 219

equal treatment, non-discrimination and, 76-7

Eritrea-Ethiopia Claims Commission assessment of implementation mechanism, 169, 276

causation standard, 58

choice of arbitration mechanism, 85

claims by juridical persons, 60

design of reparation policies, 158

establishment of, 17, 41, 116

monetary compensation, 58

operation of reparation mechanism, 121-6

processing of claims, 78

registration of victims, 170

restitution, 58

right to be heard, 76



Index 287

seriousness level of human rights violations, 57 European Commission on Human Rights, 246 European Convention on Human Rights, 97, 248, 274 European Court of Human Rights case load, 246-7, 249 changes in approach to subsidiarity, 226-36 co-applicability of human rights and international humanitarian law, 112 examination of large-scale rights violations, 158, 159 'international law test' of national reparation mechanisms, 253-7 inter-state complaints concerning largescale violations during armed conflict, 233-6 jurisprudence on national reparation programmes, 236-44 national implementation of right to reparation, 14, 274, 276 and new Council of Europe Member States, obligation to make reparations, 97 pilot judgment procedure, 227-31 'public policy' test of national reparation mechanisms, 257-9 'qualified deference' to national laws, 14, 159 quasi-pilot judgments, 231-3 rationale for approach to subsidiarity, 244-9 registration of victims, 170 remedial measures, 250-2 right to reparation, 174 standard approach to subsidiarity, 222-6 State responsibility, 111 strengthening of implementation of judgments, 248-9 subsidiarity, 14 testing of national reparation programmes, 252 Evans, Christine, 117 evidence, flexible standards of, 170-2 Extraordinary Chamber in the Courts of Cambodia, 59

Falkland Islands War, 28 'football war' (El Salvador v. Honduras) (1980), 28 forced labour. See German Forced Labour Compensation Programme France

and ICC Statute, 38 right to reparation, 174 Suez Crisis (1956), 27 Furuya, Shuichi, 12, 265, 268, 269, 272, 274, 277, 280 Geneva Conventions 1949, 62, 69, 103, 106, 110, See also Additional Protocol German Forced Labour Compensation Programme, 41, 65, 78, 83, 85, 145, 152, 168, 250 Germany compensation mechanisms, 101 domestic reparation cases, 46, 49, 50 incorporation of international law rules, 10 international rehabilitation after World War Polish reparation claims, 23, 149 post-World War I reparations, 20 post-World War II reparations, 23 recognition of right to reparation, 107 review of reparations procedures, 276 right to reparation, 10, 174 GFLCP. See German Forced Labour

Compensation Programme
Greece, 46
Greenwood, Christopher, 112
guarantees of non-repetition, 2, 65
Guatemala, 53, 129–31, 144, 150, 157, 158, 160, 190–3, 197–200, 204, 206–8, 258, 259, 261, 278
Guillerot, Julie, 221

Hague Convention 1907, 21, 48, 52, 62, 104, 110 harm. See victims
Holocaust Victim Assets Programme, 41, 65, 85
Honduras, 28
Housing and Property Claims Commission
(Kosovo), 41, 53, 60, 64, 65, 76, 78, 81, 84, 88, 146, 168
HPCC. See Housing and Property Claims
Commission
human rights

application to armed conflict, 110–14 armed groups, legal responsibility of, 280, 281 backlash against, 282 definition of most serious violations, 165 democracies and violations of, 218–19 focus on individual victim, 13 gross violations and serious violations, 56



288 Index

human rights (cont.) impact on right to reparation, 270-3 and international criminal law, 269 and international humanitarian law, 110, 268-70 interplay of national administrative reparation and regional human rights courts, 158-60, 181 massive violations, 176 neo-Marxist perspective on, 282 obligation to make reparations, 94 post-colonialist perspective on, 282 recognition of individual right to reparation, 92, 179, 268, 271 regional human rights courts. See European Court of Human Rights; Inter-American Court of Human Rights regional instruments, 97 remedies for violations of, 31 right to reparation, 95-102, 110-14, 174 State obligation to respect and ensure, 180 subsidiarity and, 182-7 HVAP. See Holocaust Victim Assets Programme

IACtHR. See Inter-American Court of Human Rights

ICC. See International Criminal Court ICCPR. See International Covenant of Civil and Political Rights

ICHEIC. See International Commission on Holocaust Era Insurance Claims

ICJ. See International Court of Justice ICRC. See International Committee of the Red Cross

ICTR. See International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda

ICTY. See International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia

the former Yugoslavia IHL. See international humanitarian law

IHRL. See human rights ILA. See International Law Association

ILC. See International Law Commission

IMT. See International Military Tribunal (Nuremberg)

IMTFE. See International Military Tribunal for the Far East (Tokyo)

individuals

'humanisation' of international law, 281 'individualisation' of war, 280 obligation to make reparations, 64–5

recognition under human rights law and international law, 92 right to reparation. See right to reparation victims. See victims Indonesia 160 Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, 159, 205, 207, 208, 217 Inter-American Court of Human Rights awards, 168 and change in nature of litigation, 220-2 and change to democracy, 218-19 and changes in types of human rights violations perpetrated, 217-18 compensation measures, 204-9 definition of reparation measures, 147 design of reparation policies, 158 examination of large-scale rights violations, 158 identification of recipients of reparation, 168 implementation of right to reparation, 14, 'international law test' of national reparation mechanisms, 253-7 and national reparation programmes, 197-209 obligation to make reparations, 97 'public policy' test of national reparation mechanisms, 257-9 'qualified deference' to national laws, 14, 206, 214–16 and regional political context, 217-18 rehabilitation measures, 201-4 restitution and development measures, 204 right to reparation, 175, 266 subsidiarity, 14, 190, 209-14, 216-22 testing of national reparation programmes, 252 'transformative' reparation, 278 International Commission on Holocaust Era Insurance Claims, 40, 65, 75, 84, 85 International Committee of the Red Cross commentary to Geneva Conventions 1949 (1952), 70, 103 Customary International Humanitarian Law project, 52, 106 International Court of Justice applicable law, 53 co-applicability of human rights and international humanitarian law, 112

lump sum settlements, 70

recognition of right to reparation, 271



Index 289

right to reparation, 174 remedies for violations of, 31 State responsibility, 112 right to reparation, 103-10 victim-oriented focus, 44 international law international courts harms caused by violations of, 55-9 establishment of, 32 'humanisation' of, 281 'qualified deference' to national laws, 14 incorporation in national laws, 10 recognition of right to reparation, 270 interaction between subfields of, 269 victim-oriented focus, 29-33 'international law test' of national reparation International Covenant of Civil and Political mechanisms, 14, 253-7 interplay with national laws, 265, 273-7 Rights, 53, 95, 113, 274 International Criminal Court limitations of, 283 collective reparations awards, 60 pluralist discourse on, 265 crime of aggression, 55 'proceduralisation' and, 277 defendants, 269 recognition of individual claimants, 92, establishment of, 32 268, 281 State-centred perspective, 21, 22 individual liability, 64 liability for reparations, 280 violation of, 55-7 processing of claims, 80 International Law Association recognition of right to reparation, 108 Declaration of International Law Principles referrals to, 117 on Reparation for Victims of Armed right of access, 74, 76 Conflict (2010), 56, 58, 65, 280 right to equal treatment without obligation to make reparations, 105, discrimination, 76 right to reparation, 266 Procedural Principles for Reparation seriousness level of human rights Mechanisms (2014), 72, 158, 274 violations, 57 registration of victims, 172 Trust Fund for Victims, 7, 60, 61, 88, 270 right to access effective reparation victim-oriented focus, 22, 37-9 mechanism, 169 international criminal law seriousness level of human rights and human rights, 260 violations, 56 types of harm, 58 interaction with other subfields of international law, 269 International Law Commission International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda and ICC Statute, 36 establishment of, 32 obligation to make reparations, 99 victim-oriented focus, 34-7 International Military Tribunal International Criminal Tribunal for the former (Nuremberg), 22 Yugoslavia International Military Tribunal for the Far establishment of, 32 East (Tokyo), 22 victim-oriented focus, 34-7 international organisations. See also interinternational human rights law. See human national courts establishment of ad hoc reparation international humanitarian law mechanisms, 17, 18, 39-46 applicable law as to violations of, 54 testing of national implementation of right armed groups, legal responsibility of, 280 to reparation, 14 human rights and, 110, 268-70 IPCC. See Iraq Property Claims Commission Iraq, 7, 54, 58, 79, 87, 116, See also Commission ICRC Customary International Humanitarian Law project, 52, 106 for the Resolution of Real Property ius ad bellum, 55 Disputes in Iraq recognition of individual claimants, 268 Iraq Property Claims Commission, 42, recognition of individual right to reparation, Israel, 44, 53, 112 94, 268, 271



> Index 290

ius ad bellum. See international humanitarian bilateral reparations agreements, 25 domestic reparation cases, 48 post-World War II reparations, 23, 24 reparations agreement with China, 25, 68 reparations agreement with Korea, 26, 68 right to reparation, 174 and San Francisco, Treaty of (1951), 25 waiver of reparation claims, 25, 68

juridical persons as victims, 60 jus ad bellum. See international humanitarian law

just war. See international humanitarian law

Kenya, 160

Korea, reparations agreement with Japan, 26,68

Kosovo, 143

Kosovo Property Claims Commission, 42, 53, See also Housing and Property Claims Commission (Kosovo)

KPCC. See Kosovo Property Claims Commission

Kuwait, 7, 54, 58, 79, 87, 116

Lauterpacht, Hersch, 283 laws of war. See international humanitarian law limitation of reparations claims, 67 litigation, change in nature of, 220-2 Lubanga, Thomas, 45, 61, 64, 267,

Madsen, Mikael Rask, 246 Magarrell, Lisa, 221 marginalised communities, 160-3, 172-4 Marxist perspective on human rights, 282 Mexico, 279 Morocco, 149, 153, 157, 160, 161

Nairobi Declaration on Women's and Girls' Right to a Remedy and Reparation (2007), 45, 72 national courts reparation mechanisms, 175 review of reparations decisions, 46-51 national laws balance between legal mechanisms and

political mechanisms, 277-9

examples of reparation programmes, 129-41 features of reparation programmes, 141–63 focus on groups of victims, 13 implementation of right to reparation, 13, 14 international law rules as part of, 10 'international law test' of, 14 interplay with international law, 265, 273-7 lump sum reparations settlements before 1990s, 27-8 obstacles to reparation claims, 17 'proceduralisation' and, 277 'public policy' test of national reparation implementation, 14 'public policy' test of national reparation mechanisms, 257-9 'qualified deference' to, 14, 159, 206, 214–16 and regional human right courts, 158-60, 181 reparation mechanisms, 126-63, 175, 278 reparations law before before World War II. 20–2 settlement of World War II reparations claims, 22-7 neo-Marxist perspective on human rights, 282 Nepal, 143 Netherlands, 101 repetition

non-repetition. See guarantees of non-Nuremberg war crimes trials, 22

Palestine, 44, 53, 112 Permanent Court of Arbitration, 116 Permanent Court of International Justice, 67 Peru, 100, 131-5, 142, 144, 147, 151, 154, 156, 157, 158, 160, 162, 168, 171, 173, 193-4, 195-7, 209, 221

Philippines, 53, 63, 280 pilot judgments. See European Court of Human Rights Poland, 149, 237–9, 250, 252, 255, 258

political mechanisms for reparation, 277-9 post-colonialist perspective on human rights, 282

Procedural Principles for Reparation Mechanisms (ILA) (2014), 72, 274 procedure

adequacy of, 12 advantages of comprehensive and large-scale reparation processes, 164-5 definition of procedural mechanisms, 156-8 enhancement of implementation by subsidiarity, 219-20



Index 291

estimation of funding requirements, 166-7 procedural right to reparation, 71-7 'proceduralisation' at international-national law interface, 277 refinement of procedural obligations, 276 registration of victims, 170-2 rules for implementation, 169-70 standardised measures, 167-9 and substantive right to reparation, 18, 19, 90 victim-oriented, 16 'public policy' test of national laws, 14, 257-9 'qualified deference' to national laws, 14, 206, racial discrimination, 95 reconstruction policies, 173 refugees, assistance programmes, 173 regional human rights courts. See European Court of Human Rights; Inter-American Court of Human Rights rehabilitation, 2, 65 reparations bilateral agreements, 25 collective, 60-2, 172-4 definition of, 177 definition of reparation measures, 147-54 denial of, 66 designing of reparation policies, 163-74 establishment of ad hoc reparation mechanisms, 17, 18, 39-46 forms of, 2, 65-7 individual right to. See right to reparation in international law, 1-5 limitation of claims, 67 lump sum settlements before 1990s, 27–8 national mechanisms. See national laws obligation to make, 62-71, 92 settlement of World War II claims, 22-7 State-centred perspective, 21, 27 'transformative' reparation, 278 waiver of claims, 24, 69 Resolution 1988/11, 30 restitution, 2, 65 right to be heard, 75-6 right to reparation academic arguments about, 89 balance between legal mechanisms and political mechanisms, 277-9 collective right, 60-2 content and elements of, 11, 12, 13, 51

developments towards, 5-10, 266 existence of, 10, 12, 13, 174 future prospects for, 280-4 and 'hard law' / 'soft law' (lex feranda/lex lata) distinction, 19, 269 history of, 20-51 human rights impact on, 270-3 human rights law and, 95-102, 110-14, 174 implementation as problem issue, 283 implementation mechanisms, 114 implementation of, 11, 12, 13, 14, 179, See also procedure as individual right, 16, 19, 89, 179, 268, 270, 276, 281 international humanitarian law, 103-10 legal foundations for individual right, 94-114 level of entitlement, 272 limitations of law as to, 283 obstacles to, 17 practical realisation of, 114-74 procedural right, 71-7, See also procedure realisability of individual right, 90 right to access effective reparation mechanism, 71-5, 169 and right to be heard, 75-6 and right to equal treatment without discrimination, 76-7 as social process, 16 substantive right, 12, 16, 18, 19, 90, 180 and transitional justice, 90 victim-oriented focus of, 16, 17, 18, 28-51 Romania, 239-41, 251 rule of law, UN Secretary-General's report (2004), 30, 73, 76 Russia, 249, 261

San Francisco, Treaty of (1951), 25, 68
Sandoval, Clara, 14, 265, 268, 270, 273, 275, 282
satisfaction, 2, 65
SCSL. See Special Court for Sierra Leone
Sierra Leone, 136–7, 143, 152, 155, 156, 157
Slovenia, 241, 252, 275
South Africa, 151, 284
Special Court for Sierra Leone, 62
Speck, Anne Katrin, 245
State laws. See national laws
State responsibility
'effective control' concept, 111
elements of basis of, 111
interaction with other subfields of
international law, 269



292 Index

States	United Kingdom, 28
abuse of subsidiarity, 190	Falkland Islands War, 28
bilateral reparations agreements, 25	and ICC Statute, 39
obligation to make reparations, 62, 92	United Nations
obligation to respect and ensure human	ad hoc reparation mechanisms, 39–46
rights, 180	victim-oriented focus, 29–33
State-centred perspective of international	United Nations Charter, 94
law, 21, 22	United Nations Commission on Human
State-centred perspective on reparations, 20,	Rights. See also 'Basic Principles' for
21, 22, 27	reparations (2005)
subsidiarity. See also European Court of	United Nations Compensation Commission
Human Rights; Inter-American Court of	choice of arbitration mechanism, 85
Human Rights	design of reparation policies, 158
abuse of by States, 190	establishment of, 17, 40, 87, 116
enhancement of implementation of	identification of recipients of reparation,
reparation right, 219–20	168
and human rights, 182–7	and ius ad bellum, 54
importance of, 260–4	monetary compensation, 65
and interplay of international and national	operation of reparation mechanism,
laws, 14, 181	118–21
Sudan, 42, 63	processing of claims, 78, 79
Suez Crisis (1956), 27	property claims, inclusion of, 146
Switzerland	right to be heard, 76
Claims Resolution Tribunal for Dormant	verification of claims, 81, 83
Accounts (CRT-I), 40, 65, 75, 82, 83, 85	United Nations Congresses on the Prevention
Claims Resolution Tribunal for Dormant	of Crime and the Treatment of
Accounts (CRT-II), 41, 65, 75, 83, 84, 85	Offenders, 29
	United Nations Crime Prevention and
Taiwan, reparations agreement with Japan, 25	Criminal Justice Programme, 29
Tokyo war crimes trials, 22	United Nations General Assembly. See also
torture, 95	'Basic Principles' for reparations
'transformative' reparation, 278	(UNCHR) (2005)
transitional justice	Resolution 1988/11, 30
process of, 278	Sub-Commission on the Prevention of
and right to reparation, 90	Discrimination and Protection of
UN Secretary-General's report (2004), 30, 73	Minorities, 30
Trindade, Antônio Cançado, 281	Victims Declaration (1985), 29, 58
Trust Fund for Victims. See International	United Nations Human Rights Committee
Criminal Court	'effective control' concept, 111
Tunisia, 160, 161	recognition of right to reparation,
Turkey, 158, 237, 241–4, 247, 249, 250, 251,	96
259, 261	United Nations Secretary-General, report on
Tuyuc, Rosalina, 150	rule of law and transitional justice in
• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	conflict and post-conflict societies (2004)
Uganda, 112, 271	30, 73, 76
Ukraine, 249	United Nations Security Council
UN. See United Nations	referrals to, 116
UNCC. See United Nations Compensation	resolutions, 86, 87, 116
Commission	United Nations Working Group on Enforced
UNCHR. See United Nations Commission on	Disappearances, 167
Human Rights	United States, right to reparation, 174



Index 293

Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 94, 95
Updated Set of Principles for the Protection
and Promotion of Human Rights through
Action to Combat Impunity (UNCHR)
(2005), 33, 65, 72, 74, 75
claims by juridical persons, 60
competence, 58
and organised armed groups, 63
Uruguay, 111

van Boven, Theo, 30, 104
Venezuela, 218
Versailles, Treaty of (1919), 20
victims
causation between harm and violation of
international law, 58–9
choice of arbitration mechanism, 84–6
collectivity of, 60–2
definition of, 31, 59
elements of definition of, 51–62
harms caused by violations of international
law, 55–9
inclusion in reparation programmes, 142–7

juridical persons, 60
marginalised communities, 160–3
occurrence of harm to, 58
persons to be redressed, 60–2
recognition of right to reparation, 270
registration of, 154–6, 170–2
UN focus on, 29–33
victim-oriented focus of reparation
programmes, 16, 17, 18, 28–51
Victims Declaration (1985), 29, 58, 72, 74, 76
Vietnam War, 27

waiver of reparations claims, 24, 69 war. See also armed conflict 'individualisation' of, 280 laws of. See international humanitarian law World War I, 20 World War II reparation cases in Germany and Japan, 46–51 settlement of reparations claims, 22–7

Zegveld, Liesbeth, 106